



Ruthanne Fuller
Mayor

City of Newton, Massachusetts
Department of Planning and Development
1000 Commonwealth Avenue Newton, Massachusetts 02459

Telephone
(617) 796-1120
Telefax
(617) 796-1142
TDD/TTY
(617) 796-1089
www.newtonma.gov

Barney S. Heath
Director

**MINUTES OF PUBLIC MEETING AND PUBLIC HEARINGS
NEWTON HISTORICAL COMMISSION**

DATE: February 23, 2023

PLACE/TIME: Via Zoom

ATTENDING:

Mark Armstrong, Member
Nancy Grissom, Member
Harvey Schorr, Member
Anne Marie Stein, Alternate
Doug Cornelius, Chair
Mollie Hutchings, Staff
John Rice, Member *(beginning at Item #10)*

RECORDING AVAILABLE [HERE](#)

1. 41 KILBURN RD

Total Demolition of House
[View Application Here](#)

Staff Memo: This 1950 Cape home has retained many of its original footprint and features, including the two dormers and exterior chimney. While the home is in keeping with the neighborhood context, with several other cape homes on the street and more broadly in West Newton, the building does not have any historical designations. The property is in less than ideal-condition on the exterior, with the siding in need of particular repairs. Staff does not recommend preferably preserving, but welcomes further discussion of its historical and neighborhood significance.

Public Comments:

- Neighbors spoke in favor of not finding the house preferably preserved.
- Councilor Malakie asked that the proposed design be in keeping with the neighborhood.

Motion: A.M. Stein moves to find the property preferably preserved. N. Grissom seconds.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative: Abstained: Recused:

M. Armstrong
N. Grissom
H. Schorr
AM. Stein, Alternate
D. Cornelius, Chair

2. 51 MT ALVERNIA RD

Partial Demolition of House

[View Application Here](#)

This property has been Administratively Approved, as it falls under de minimis.

3. 527 WALTHAM ST

Partial Demolition of Building

[View Application Here](#)

This property has been Administratively Approved, as it falls under de minimis.

4. 53 MOSMAN ST

Partial Demolition of House

[View Application Here](#)

Staff Memo: This 1953 cross-gabled ranch has a largely unaltered footprint. There is a strong neighborhood context for this property, with nearly every home on Mosman Street built in a similar style. The proposed design adds a second story to the existing structure that, while a departure from the ranches that characterize the neighborhood, it does retain some of the horizontal nature and forward gable of the original design. The building is listed as contributing to the Mosman Morrill Street Residential District. Staff recommends discussion of the proposed design, particularly in the context of the neighborhood.

Comments:

- Several neighbors spoke out in support of project and addition.
- H. Schorr feels the design retains quality of original house. Suggested that the two-story volume be broken, but supports design.

Motion: N. Grissom moves to find the property preferably preserved. A.M. Stein seconds.

<u>Affirmative:</u>	<u>Negative:</u>	<u>Abstained:</u>	<u>Recused:</u>
N. Grissom	D. Cornelius, Chair		
H. Schorr	M. Armstrong		
A.M. Stein, Alt.			

Motion: N. Grissom moves to approve the design as drawn and waive the demolition delay. H. Schorr seconds.

<u>Affirmative:</u>	<u>Negative:</u>	<u>Abstained:</u>	<u>Recused:</u>
M. Armstrong			
N. Grissom			
H. Schorr			
A.M. Stein, Alt.			
D. Cornelius, Chair			

5. 56 DEARBORN ST

Total Demolition of House

[View Application Here](#)

Staff Memo: This 1955, shingle-sided cape has had a few exterior improvements, including a new garage, a dormer in the rear, and a reroofing project. While it is not listed as a contributing building to the Westland Park Residential District, the buildings which are listed as contributing, including 31 Dearborn St, were constructed in a similar period and style. Staff recommends that the building be preferably preserved.

Motion: A.M. Stein moves to find the property preferably preserved. N. Grissom seconds.

<u>Affirmative:</u>	<u>Negative:</u>	<u>Abstained:</u>	<u>Recused:</u>
	M. Armstrong		
	N. Grissom		
H. Schorr	A.M. Stein, Alt.		
	D. Cornelius, Chair		

6. 58 PARKER ST

Partial Demolition of House

[View Application Here](#)

Staff Memo: This Colonial Revival home was constructed in 1920 by builder and owner L.G. Bishop and designed by architect Keith McAdams. The matching garage, later reconstructed

after a fire, was also built in 1920 and a mudroom addition was constructed in 1990. The building is not inventoried, either individually or as part of a larger historic area, but is immediately adjacent to the Newton Theological Institution National Register District. The proposed design would construct a two-story addition in place of the one-story mudroom addition that currently exists. Staff recommends finding the building preferably preserved and approving the design.

Comment:

- Applicant expressed intention to restore windows and siding.

Motion: M. Armstrong moves to find the property preferably preserved. N. Grissom seconds.

Affirmative:

M. Armstrong

N. Grissom

H. Schorr

D. Cornelius, Chair

Negative:

A.M. Stein, Alt.

Abstained:

Recused:

Motion: N. Grissom moves to approve the design and waive the demolition delay. M. Armstrong seconds.

Affirmative:

M. Armstrong

N. Grissom

H. Schorr

A.M. Stein, Alt.

D. Cornelius, Chair

Negative:

Abstained:

Recused:

7. 73 PURITAN RD

Partial Demolition of House

[View Application Here](#)

Staff Memo: This 1938 shingle-sided dwelling was built the E William and Merrill C Nutting Company, and designed by architect W. J. Freethy. Despite an addition in 2014, the home retains the traditional character and footprint of a traditional Cape style home. The proposed design would transform the home from a Cape into a more transitional style, but would retain much of the New England vernacular. The double gable over the front entry and the bay window on the addition are particularly striking features. Staff recommends finding the property preferably preserved and approving the proposed design.

Motion: To find the property preferably preserved.

Affirmative:

M. Armstrong

N. Grissom

Negative:

Abstained:

Recused:

H. Schorr
A.M. Stein, Alt.
D. Cornelius, Chair

Motion: To approve the design and waive the demolition delay

<u>Affirmative:</u>	<u>Negative:</u>	<u>Abstained:</u>	<u>Recused:</u>
M. Armstrong			
N. Grissom			
H. Schorr			
A.M. Stein, Alt.			
D. Cornelius, Chair			

8. 872 CHESTNUT ST

Partial Demolition of House and Total Demolition of Garage

[View Application Here](#)

Staff Memo: This 1930 eclectic style home includes elements of both Tudor and Colonial Revival style. The high-pitched gabled entry is a notable character-defining feature that is repeated on other buildings on Chestnut St and Oliver Rd. While not listed as a contributing building, it is within the Howard Park Residential District and is similar in style to its neighbors, including 186 Oliver Rd on the corner. The proposed design would add a two-story side addition, which has taken care to match existing finishes and mimic some of the existing rooflines. Staff recommends finding the home preferably preserved and approving the proposed design, though welcomes discussion on the proposed windows. Staff recommends finding the garage not preferably preserved.

Public Comment:

- M. Armstrong expresses interest in seeing 3D renderings.
- D. Cornelius agrees, especially noting that as most of the design is in the rear and not visible from the street.

Motion: N Grissom moves to preferably preserve the house, but not preferably preserve the garage. A.M. Stein seconds.

<u>Affirmative:</u>	<u>Negative:</u>	<u>Abstained:</u>	<u>Recused:</u>
M. Armstrong			
N. Grissom			
H. Schorr			
A.M. Stein, Alt.			
D. Cornelius, Chair			

Motion: M. Armstrong moves to approve the design and waive the demolition delay. N. Grissom seconds.

Affirmative:

M. Armstrong
N. Grissom
H. Schorr
A.M. Stein, Alt.
D. Cornelius, Chair

Negative:

Abstained:

Recused:

9. 236 CHAPEL ST

Waiver of Demolition Delay

[View Application Here](#)

Staff Memo: This two-story, single-family Colonial Revival house was built c. 1875. It is inventoried as the Hennessy-Scrocco House (NWT.1400). There are no particular character-defining features to render it a strong example of its architectural style, though it is in keeping with the style and period of other Nonantum homes. The design team has updated the proposed design from the last meeting, having received feedback from the commission. Staff welcomes discussion of the proposed design.

Public Comment:

The Applicant elected to be heard at the next meeting.

10. 10-12 ELLIOT TER

Waiver of Demolition Delay

[View Application Here](#)

Staff Memo: This two-story, multifamily Colonial Revival was constructed in 1900. The character-defining large front porches are somewhat atypical of this variety of two-family in New England and set it apart as possibly inspired by the sleeping porches characteristic of colonial and classic revivals. Later alterations and maintenance have preserved the more unique features of the building, and the matching railings and balusters along the side entry. It has not been inventoried on the Historic Resources Survey. The proposed design is interesting in how it mimics some Colonial Revival finishes and elements on the front façade, while still creating a more contemporary style of two-family dwelling. Staff recommends approving the proposed design.

Public Comment:

- Discussion of entries and division of units. H. Schorr asked for explanation of site plan.
- A.M. also believes that the use of space is not in keeping with neighborhood.
- M. Armstrong and D. Cornelius spoke in support of site plan configuration.

Motion: M. Armstrong moves to approve the design and waive the demolition delay. N. Grissom seconds.

Affirmative:

M. Armstrong
N. Grissom
J. Rice
D. Cornelius, Chair

Negative:

H. Schorr

Abstained:

A.M. Stein, Alt.

Recused:

11. 61 ESTY FARM RD

Waiver of Demolition Delay

[View Application Here](#)

Staff Memo: 61 Esty Farm Rd is a one-and-a half story midcentury split level, constructed in 1959, and has been inventoried as part of the June Lane Esty Farm Road area. The neighborhood is a mix of new construction and similar midcentury split levels, which were constructed between 1958-1959 by Sunny Lane Homes Inc. and Creative Builders and designed by Ralph I. Williams. The split levels are all constructed in the asymmetrical “flying wing” design. The proposed design does not seem to relate to the existing building or its neighboring split-levels. Staff welcomes discussion of the proposed design.

Public Comment:

- General sentiment from the commissioners that the design was out of place in a neighborhood that has retained its character.
- Specific conversation (and comments from A.M. Stein) about midcentury houses, and whether the design reflected the character.
- Discussion of the garage being upfront, and the size of the garage in comparison to the house.

No motion was made to approve the design at this time.

12. 6 FERNCROFT RD

Waiver of Demolition Delay

[View Application Here](#)

Staff Memo: This two-story, eclectic home draws mostly on the Gothic Revival styles, as characterized by the brick construction, narrow windows and the high-pitched gable roof. The property is a noncontributing property within the Gordon and Evelyn Road Residential District, which contains an eclectic mix of Tudor revivals and post-war split levels, mostly built between 1930 and 1950. The proposed addition would include the replacement of the large garage on the front of the façade and a new family room addition on the rear façade. The design team is returning, having made adjustments to

the design based on the Commission's feedback. Staff recommends that the building be preferably preserved and the design be approved.

Comments:

- Applicant responded to Commissioner's previous comments in changing the pitch of the garage roof, the footprint of the garage to be narrower, and the shape of the dormer.
- N. Grissom asks about casement windows. Applicant confirms they are a single lite.
- M. Armstrong believes this is a vast improvement over previous design.

Motion: M. Armstrong moves to approve the design and waive the demolition delay. N. Grissom seconds.

Affirmative:

M. Armstrong
N. Grissom
J. Rice
H. Schorr
A.M. Stein, Alt
D. Cornelius, Chair

Negative:

Abstained:

Recused:

Respectfully,



, NHC