

# City of Newton, Massachusetts

Department of Planning and Development 1000 Commonwealth Avenue Newton, Massachusetts 02459

Telephone (617) 796-1120 Telefax (617) 796-1142 TDD/TTY (617) 796-1089 www.newtonma.gov

Barney S. Heath Director

Ruthanne Fuller Mayor

## MINUTES OF PUBLIC MEETING AND PUBLIC HEARINGS CHESTNUT HILL HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

DATE: March 21, 2024

PLACE/TIME: **Fully Remote** 

ATTENDING:

Peter Vieira, FAIA, Chair Scott Aquilina, Member **Robert Imperato, Member** Susana Lannik, Member Matthew Montgomery, Member **Rick Wetmore, Member Barbara Kurze, Commission Staff** 

The fully remote meeting was called to order at 7:00 p.m. with Peter Vieira presiding as Chair. Voting permanent members were S. Aquilina, R. Imperato, S. Lannik, M. Montgomery, and R. Wetmore. B. Kurze acted as recording secretary and the meeting was recorded on Zoom.

## 70 Suffolk Road – Renewal of Certificate of Appropriateness

N. Marchio presented the application to renew the Certificate of Appropriateness that was granted in February 2023 to replace a one-story addition with a two-story addition; build new pool and pool house, attached single-car garage addition, addition to existing garage and three rear dormers; reconfigure driveway and parking areas; and install hardscaping. In addition to the plans approved in 2023, he submitted the revised drawings for the brick piers which the commission had required to be lowered by eight inches.

Materials Reviewed: Application: https://newtonma.viewpointcloud.com/records/817827 PDF File: Compiled 70 Suffolk 2-16-2023 Certificate of Appropriateness Rendering showing reduced pier height Rendering showing pier height submitted at the February 2023 meeting Previously approved plans

Commissioners agreed that it was appropriate to renew the Certificate of Appropriateness and to include the drawings of the piers with the reduced heights. P. Vieira moved to renew the Certificate of Appropriateness

with the revised piers. M. Montgomery seconded the motion. There was a roll call vote, and the motion was passed, 5-0 with one recusal. S. Lannik was recused.

**RECORD OF ACTION:** DATE: March 22, 2024 **SUBJECT:** 70 SUFFOLK RD - Certificate of Appropriateness

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on March 21, 2024 the Chestnut Hill Historic District Commission, by roll call vote of 5-0 with one recusal,

**RESOLVED** to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness for the project as submitted at <u>70 SUFFOLK</u> <u>RD</u> to renew the Certificate of Appropriateness that was issued in February 2023 to replace a one-story addition with a two-story addition; build a new pool and pool house, attached single-car garage addition, addition to existing garage and three rear dormers; reconfigure the driveway and parking areas; and install hardscaping with the revised design of the brick piers which show the reduced heights required by the commission in the February 2023 decision.

Voting in the Affirmative:	Voting in the Negative:	Abstained:	Recused:
• Peter Vieira, Chair,			
FAIA			
<ul> <li>Robert Imperato,</li> </ul>			
Member			
Matthew			Cusana Lanaik
Montgomery, Vice			• Susana Lannik,
Chair			Member
Rick Wetmore,			
Member			
• Scott Aquilina,			
Member			

## 12 Acacia Avenue – Certificate of Appropriateness

Richie Yu and Kyle Xue presented an application to install cedar decking and a cedar railing system on the roof of the left side addition. The railing would be painted white.

Materials Reviewed: Application: https://newtonma.viewpointcloud.com/records/819903 PDF File: Compiled 12 Acacia railings Assessors database map Photos Plan Elevations Details Product and material information MHC Form B

S. Aquilina confirmed that the handrail would be shaped. P. Vieira noted that the dentils did not continue down the entire driveway side; adding that detail would unify the design. He also wanted to see the posts on the back align with the ones on the front. P. Vieira noted that there were different grades of cedar with Spanish cedar being the most durable. Decking could be Ipe or Douglas fir. P. Vieira moved to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness for the application as submitted with requirements. S. Lannik seconded the motion. There was a roll call vote, and the motion was passed, 6-0.

#### **RECORD OF ACTION: DATE:** March 22, 2024 **SUBJECT:** 12 ACACIA AVE - Certificate of Appropriateness

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on March 21, 2024 the Chestnut Hill Historic District Commission, by roll call vote of <u>6-0</u>,

**RESOLVED** to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness for the project as submitted at <u>12 ACACIA AVE</u> to install cedar decking and a cedar railing system on the roof of the left side addition with the following requirements: 1) the railing will be painted white; 2) the bottom rail will have the profile shown on drawing A003; 3) dentils will be added to the long driveway facade as shown in drawing A004; and 4) the posts on the side of the deck that connects to the back of the house will be shifted to line up with the posts on the long driveway side.

Abstained:

Voting in the Negative:

Voting in the Affirmative:

- Peter Vieira. Chair. FAIA
- Robert Imperato, Member
- Matthew Montgomery, Vice Chair
- Rick Wetmore, Member
- Scott Aquilina, Member
- Susana Lannik, Member

## <u>46 Woodman Road – Final Project Approval</u>

Marc Kantrowitz and Franklin Schwarzer presented the open items that required commission review and approval: the work that was done to remove the stone veneer from the brick chimney, the balustrade installed on the rear second-story porch, and the columns supporting the rear second-story porch.

Materials Reviewed: Application: https://newtonma.viewpointcloud.com/records/755522 PDF File: 46 Woodman Final Project Assessors database map Chimney photos and drawings 2014 photo of brick chimney 2019 photo of brick chimney covered with stone veneer 2019 drawing showing brick chimney dimensions 2024 photos of brick chimney after stone veneer was removed Photos showing conditions as stone veneer was removed Balustrade photos and drawings Photos of existing conditions 2014 photo of the columns 2019 drawings of the columns and balustrade 2019 detail drawing and as-built photo of the balustrade

Recused:

P. Vieira said that the balustrade did not match the drawings – the corner posts and the balusters were different from what was shown in the drawings and the installed balustrade looked very heavy. The columns supporting the second-story porch were not properly finished, for example, several were missing capitals. The commission expected that the project to be appropriately finished with high-quality architectural details and elements and that was not achieved. S. Aquilina stated that the execution of the approved plans was sloppy and not complete. M. Montgomery noted that the commission spent a lot of time reviewing plans and designs and reviewing issues resulting from plans not being followed. R. Wetmore said that the commission recently reviewed a balustrade project on Suffolk Road and the applicant was expected to meet the required standards; that should be the precedent. S. Lannik agreed that there were issues with the work that was done and that the project should meet required standards.

S. Aquilina and P. Vieira said either the work should match the approved drawings, or the applicants needed to present an executable design for commission review and approval. Another option would be to build a field mock-up for review and approval. S. Lannik commented that there also appeared to be issues with the lower part. S. Aquilina thought that the lower part did not stand out as much as the issues with the second story. Commissioners agreed that the review of the final project work could go on the April meeting agenda so that the applicants could at least provide an update.

#### Administrative discussion

The January and February 2024 minutes were approved.

The meeting was adjourned at 8:40 p.m.

Recorded by Barbara Kurze, Senior Preservation Planner