



Zoning & Planning Committee Agenda

City of Newton In City Council

Monday, March 28, 2016

7:30 PM: Room 211 – NOTE EARLY START TIME

7:45 PM: Council Chamber

Items Scheduled for Discussion:

The Zoning & Planning and Finance Committees will meet jointly on this item:

Referred to Zoning & Planning and Finance Committees

#115-16 Funding for Zoning Reform Phase 2

HIS HONOR THE MAYOR requesting authorization to appropriate one hundred twenty five thousand dollars (\$125,000) from Free Cash and authorization to transfer the sum of two hundred thousand dollars (\$200,000) from the Planning Department's Full-time Salaries Account to the Planning Department's Consultants Account for the purpose of funding Zoning Reform Phase 2. [03/15/16 @ 4:52 PM]

A Public hearing will be held on the following item:

#222-13(2) Zoning amendment to regulate front-facing garages in residential zones

THE ZONING AND PLANNING COMMITTEE proposing to amend **Chapter 30**, City of Newton Zoning Ordinances, to regulate the dimensions and setbacks of front facing garages in residential zoning districts. [08/03/15 @ 10:15 AM]

#110-15 Discussion of the Smart Growth Zoning Overlay District Act in Newton

HIS HONOR THE MAYOR requesting discussion of The Smart Growth Zoning Overlay District Act M.G.L. Chapter 40R and its potential application in Newton. [04/24/15 @ 2:38 PM]

Chairman's Note: Following a brief update on the status of the Mayor's Housing Strategy, the Chairman will discuss the committee's calendar and priorities for this year.

The location of this meeting is handicap accessible and reasonable accommodations will be provided to persons requiring assistance. If you need a special accommodation, *please contact Jini Fairley, at least two days in advance of the meeting: jfairley@newtonma.gov, or 617-796-1253. For Telecommunications Relay Service dial 711.*

Items Not Scheduled for Discussion at this meeting:

- #109-15** **Zoning amendment for inclusionary housing provisions from 15% to 20%**
HIS HONOR THE MAYOR requesting consideration of changes to the inclusionary housing provisions of the Zoning Ordinance to increase the required percentage of affordable units to 20% with the additional 5% set aside for middle income households. [04/24/15 @ 2:38 PM]
- #108-15** **Zoning amendment for accessory apartments supportive of seniors**
HIS HONOR THE MAYOR requesting consideration of changes to the Zoning Ordinance that would facilitate the creation of accessory apartment units, supportive of Newton's seniors. [04/24/15 @ 2:38 PM]
- #164-09(2)** **Request for amendments to dimensional requirements for accessory apartments**
ALD. HESS-MAHAN requesting that the Planning Department study the dimensional requirements for lot and building size for accessory apartments and make recommendations for possible amendments to those dimensional requirements to the board of Aldermen that are consistent with the Newton Comprehensive Plan.
- #61-10** **Discussion relative to bringing existing accessory apartment into compliance**
ALD. CICCONE, SWISTON, LINSKY, CROSSLEY AND HESS-MAHAN requesting a discussion relative to various solutions for bringing existing accessory and other apartments that may not meet the legal provisions and requirements of **Chapter 30** into compliance.
- #64-13** **Permitting for conversion of historic barns/carriage houses to accessory apts**
HISTORICAL COMMISSION requesting the creation of an administrative permitting process for converting historic barns and carriage houses into accessory apartments to assist in their preservation.
- #103-16** **Petition to rezone lots on Glen Avenue from MR1 to SR2**
COUNCILORS DANBERG, BLAZAR, SCHWARTZ, SANGIOLO AND YATES petitioning to rezone land known as Section 61, Block 39, Lots 01, 02, 03 and 04 located at 41, 45, 47 and 51 Glen Avenue from MULTI RESIDENCE 1 to SINGLE RESIDENCE 2 [03/17/16 @ 1:50 PM]
- #54-16** **Zoning ordinance amendment relative to Health Club use**
ACTING DIRECTOR OF PLANNING proposing amendments to the Newton Zoning Ordinance to allow the "Health Club" use in Business 1, Business 2 and Business 4 districts; and to clarify the definition of "Personal Service" as it relates to health and fitness uses. [02/09/16 @ 4:24 PM]
ITEM SPLIT INTO PART A AND PART B:
PART A – To allow Health Club use in BU1, BU2 and BU4;

PART B – To clarify the definition of Personal Services as it relates to health and fitness issues.

Approved Part A 6-0

Held Part B 6-0

- #55-16** **Ordinance to require fair housing statement and HUD logo on certain meeting notices**
COUNCILOR HESS-MAHAN requesting an ordinance to require that all notices of public hearings and/or meetings concerning permitting and/or funding of any residential development contain a brief statement concerning the City's policy regarding fair housing practices pertaining thereto and HUD's Equal Housing Opportunity logo. [02/03/16 @ 1:51 PM]
- #80-13** **Updates on the zoning reform project**
THE PLANNING DEPARTMENT requesting update discussions of the zoning reform project. [02/25/13 @ 12:31 PM]
- #323-14** **Zoning amendment to require front-facing front doors in residential zones**
ALD. YATES, NORTON, COTE AND SANGIOLO proposing to amend **Chapter 30** to require that the front doors of single-family homes, two-family homes and other residential structures face the street on which their lots are located. [08/25/14 @ 11:42 AM]
- #265-14** **Request to increase several time periods for demolition delays**
ALD. BLAZAR, YATES AND DANBERG requesting:
1. to amend Section 22-50 to increase the time period for determinations of historical significance to 30 days, and to increase the time period for hearings, rulings and written notice on appeals from historical significance determinations to 60 days;
 2. to amend Section 22-50 to increase the time period to hold a public hearing as to whether or not a historically significant building or structure is preferably preserved to 60 days;
 3. to amend Section 22-50 to increase the demolition delay period for buildings and structures on or eligible for listing in the National Register of Historic Places to 30 months;
 1. and to amend Section 22-50 to increase the demolition delay period for all other preferably preserved buildings or structures to 24 months. [7/07/14 @ 12:35 PM]
- #447-14** **Proposing an ordinance to require building plans with demolition applications**
ALD. SANGIOLO proposing an ordinance requiring the submission of building plans with applications for full or partial demolitions. [11/13/14 @ 2:03 PM]

- #169-15 Zoning amendment to require new lot standards after demolition**
ALD. SANGIOLO requesting a zoning amendment which would require any residential structures in Single Residence or Multi Residence zoning districts built after the demolition of an existing structure conform to new lot standards.
[07/02/15 @ 3:20 PM]
- #264-13 Zoning amendment to develop residential districts for small lots**
ALD. YATES requesting that the Zoning Reform Group or its successor consider amending City of Newton Zoning Ordinances **Chapter 30** to develop additional residential districts reflecting the small lots in older sections of the City and map changes to bring the zones of more residential sections of the City into conformity with the existing land uses. [08/15/13 @ 12:28 PM]
- #34-16 Zoning amendment for large house review process**
COUNCILORS SANGIOLO, KALIS AND DANBERG proposing an amendment to Chapter 30 for a large house review ordinance requiring design review and approval of by-right single and multi-residence residential structures exceeding certain dimensional limits. [01/19/16 @ 2:35 PM]
- #142-09(7) Resolution to reconvene Floor Area Ratio working group**
ALD. HESS-MAHAN AND JOHNSON proposing a Resolution to request that the Director of Planning and Development and the Commissioner of Inspectional Services reconvene a Floor Area Ratio working group to review and analyze the definition of “*Floor area, gross*” for residential structures as it is used in the definition and calculation of “*Floor area ratio*” in **Section 30-1** with respect to actual usage, and, if necessary, make recommendations for amendments thereto and in the dimensional regulations contained in **Section 30-15(u)** and *Table A* of **Section 30-15(u)**, the purpose of which is to regulate the size, density and intensity of use in the construction or renovation of, or additions to a residential structure, to more accurately reflect and be compatible with neighborhood character, and to ensure that a proposed residential structure is consistent with and not in derogation of the size, scale and design of other existing structures in the neighborhood, and is not inconsistent with the City’s Comprehensive Plan.
- #238-14 Request for development of Housing Production Plan**
ALD. SANGIOLO requesting the Executive Department and Planning Department work with the Board of Aldermen to develop a Housing Production Plan in accordance with 760 CMR 56.03(4) and guidelines adopted by the Department of Housing and Community Development as soon as possible. [06/09/14 @ 11:55 AM]
- #22-16 Resolution requesting appropriate training of Fair Housing laws**
COUNCILOR HESS-MAHAN proposing a RESOLUTION to the Mayor and City Council requesting that all members of municipal public bodies that have decision-making

authority or an advisory role with respect to land use, zoning or housing issues be required to receive appropriate orientation or training concerning applicable rights and obligations under Fair Housing laws and regulations. [02/07/16 @ 3:01 PM]

#445-14 Update from Newton Fair Housing Committee on housing opportunities
ALD. SANGIOLO requesting an update with members of the Newton Fair Housing Committee on the status of housing opportunities in the City of Newton. [11/13/14 @ 2:03 PM]

#170-15 Discussion of HUD settlement relative to creating 9-12 affordable units
ALD. HESS-MAHAN, JOHNSON, CROSSLEY AND ALBRIGHT requesting a discussion relative to the HUD Settlement with Supporters of Engine 6, the Fair Housing Center of Greater Boston and the Disability Law Center in conjunction with the Law and Planning Departments, to explain the settlement and possible implications for the Zoning Board of Appeals and the Board of Aldermen in terms of the City's obligation to identify sites and facilitate the creation of, and issue permits for, affordable housing for 9-12 chronically homeless persons in Newton. [07/06/15 @ 4:18 PM]

#22-15 Zoning amendment to allow rental voucher program re: inclusionary zoning
ALD. YATES requesting that utilization of the Massachusetts Rental Voucher Program be added as an allowable means of complying with the inclusionary zoning provision in Phase II of Zoning Reform. [01/05/15 @ 9:53 PM]

Referred to Zoning & Planning, Land Use and Finance Committees

#104-15 Qualification of affordable units on Comm Ave, Pearl and Eddy Streets
ALD. JOHNSON, LAREDO, AND GENTILE requesting a report from the Planning Department with the following information: How many of the affordable units developed at Commonwealth Avenue, Pearl Street, and Eddy Street qualify to be included on the State's Subsidized Housing Inventory List. If a property is not currently on the list, what can be done to make it eligible. [04/09/15 @ 12:00 PM]

#107-15 Discussion of middle income housing supportive of City employees
HIS HONOR THE MAYOR requesting discussion of approaches to create middle income housing as a means of allowing City of Newton employees the opportunity to live in the community in which they work. [04/24/15 @ 2:38 PM]

#81-13 Request for naturally affordable compact housing opportunities
DIRECTOR OF PLANNING & DEVELOPMENT on behalf of the Newton Housing Partnership requesting consideration of naturally affordable compact housing opportunities in MR1 zones. [02/22/13 @ 1:13 PM]

- #86-15** **Discussion and review of CDBG fund expenditures and citywide goals**
ALD. CROSSLEY, ALBRIGHT, HESS-MAHAN, & JOHNSON requesting a review and discussion of Community Development Block Grant expenditures and past years' accounting to assess progress in meeting citywide program goals as adopted in the consolidated plan, including creating and sustaining affordable housing, as well as facilities improvements in approved neighborhood districts. [03/30/15 @ 6:02 PM]
- #427-13** **Discussion of CDBG, HOME and ESG funds and fair housing**
ALD. HESS-MAHAN requesting discussion and periodic updates of steps the City of Newton is taking to ensure that its implementation of the Consolidated Plan, Annual Action Plan and Citizen Participation Plan and use of CDBG, HOME and ESG funds comply with federal and state fair housing and anti-discrimination laws and regulations, and its duty to affirmatively further fair housing. [12/06/13 @ 9:51 AM]
- #308-12** **Discussion of policies relative to CDBG fund expenditures**
ALD. HESS-MAHAN & ALBRIGHT requesting a discussion with the Mayor's office and the Planning & Development Department of policies, procedures, and criteria relating to determinations concerning expenditures of Community Development Block Grant (CDBG) funds. [10/09/12 @ 3:59 PM]
- Referred to Zoning & Planning and Finance Committees**
- #315-14** **Ordinance amendment for procurement requirements for non-profits**
ALD. HESS-MAHAN, ALBRIGHT, CROSSLEY AND DANBERG proposing an amendment to Chapter 2 of the City of Newton Ordinances setting forth requirements for procurement of materials and services by non-governmental recipients of federal, state or local funds administered by the City, such as CDBG and CPA funds. In order to encourage non-profit and other private organizations to participate in affordable housing, cultural and other public-private collaborations, such procurement requirements should accommodate the needs of non-governmental recipients for flexibility given the multiple public and private sources of funds necessary for any project by not placing undue or unreasonable burdens on them.
 [08/04/14 @ 5:08 PM] Finance voted NAN
- #446-14** **Discussion with Commission on Disability regarding the City's ADA compliance**
ALD. SANGIOLLO requesting a discussion with the Commission on Disability regarding the status of City compliance with ADA regulations. [11/13/14 @ 2:03 PM]
- #140-14** **Zoning amendment for lodging house ordinance**
ALD. CROSSLEY AND HESS-MAHAN requesting to amend **Chapter 30**, City of Newton Zoning Ordinances, to include a "lodging house" ordinance to promulgate rules requiring annual fire, safety and health inspections and licensing of buildings providing single room occupancy and/or congregate living arrangements.
 [04/04/14 @ 6:29 PM]

- #429-13 Zoning amendment for Congregate Living Facility parking requirements**
ALD. HESS-MAHAN requesting repeal and/or amendment of Zoning Ordinances **Section 30-1**, Definitions, 30-8(b)(2), Special Permits in Single Family Residential Districts, and 30-10(d)(4), Number of Parking Stalls, concerning “Congregate Living Facility”, as required by federal and state anti-discrimination and fair housing laws and regulations. [12/06/13 @ 9:51 AM]
- #35-16 Creation of policy to require posting of materials of boards/commissions**
COUNCILOR SANGIOLO requesting a discussion with the Planning Department relative to creating a policy to require audio recordings of all meetings of boards and commissions and posting of same to the City’s website, as well as posting of all documentation that is reviewed by boards and commissions and/or by their designated City staff member. [01/19/16 @ 2:35 PM]
- #129-13 Zoning amendment for special permits for attached dwellings**
ALD. HESS-MAHAN proposing to amend and/or clarify definition and provisions for granting a special permit for “attached dwellings” in the City of Newton Zoning Ordinances, **Chapter 30-1, 30-8(b)(13) and 30-9(b)(5)**. [05/25/13 @ 5:14 PM]
- #65-13 Zoning amendment to require special permit for major topographic changes**
ALD. YATES, FISCHMAN, KALIS requesting that **Chapter 30** be amended to require a special permit for major topographic changes.]
- #139-14 Zoning amendment to clarify rules for retaining walls**
ALD. ALBRIGHT requesting to amend **Chapter 30**, City of Newton Zoning Ordinances, to clarify rules relative to retaining walls.
- #391-09 Zoning amendment to allow payments-in-lieu of parking spaces: special permits**
ALD. DANBERG, MANSFIELD, VANCE AND HESS-MAHAN requesting an amendment to **§30-19** to allow payments-in-lieu of providing required off-street parking spaces when parking spaces are waived as part of a special permit application. [09/09/09 @ 3:53 PM]
- #152-10 Zoning amendment to clarify parking requirements for colleges and universities**
ALD. BAKER, FULLER, SCHNIPPER, SHAPIRO, FISCHMAN, YATES AND DANBERG recommending discussion of possible amendments to **Section 30-19** of the City of Newton Ordinances to clarify parking requirements applicable to colleges and universities.
- #153-11 Zoning amendment for Retail Overlay Districts around village centers**
ALD. DANBERG, ALBRIGHT, HESS-MAHAN, JOHNSON requesting that **Chapter 30** be amended by adding a new **Sec. 30-14** creating certain Retail Overlay Districts around selected village centers in order to encourage vibrant pedestrian-oriented

streetscapes which would allow certain uses at street level, including but not limited to financial institutions, professional offices, and salons, by special permit only and require minimum transparency standards for street-level windows for all commercial uses within the proposed overlay districts.

#168-15 **Discussion of Metropolitan Area Planning Council's Wells Avenue Market Study**
THE NEWTON-NEEDHAM CHAMBER OF COMMERCE requesting a discussion of the Metropolitan Area Planning Council's 2015 Wells Avenue Market Study.
[07/06/15 @ 5:34 PM]

#95-15 **Discussion to consider mix of uses at Wells Avenue Office Park**
ALD. CROSSLEY, JOHNSON, LEARY, HESS-MAHAN, DANBERG, ALBRIGHT AND BLAZAR requesting a discussion with the Planning Department to consider the mix of uses in the Wells Avenue Office Park, with and without a second egress to the site, pursuant to the recent MAPC study recommending a strategic introduction of retail and restaurant uses to attract and sustain healthy commercial uses, and some number of residential units sufficient to support an economically viable and vibrant mixed use environment. [04/13/15 @ 2:46 PM]

Referred to Finance and Appropriate Committees

#288-15 **Submittal by the Mayor of the FY17 Capital Improvement Plan**
HIS HONOR THE MAYOR submitting the FY 2017-FY 2021 Capital Improvement Plan pursuant to section 5-3 of the Newton City Charter. [10/01/15 @ 1:53 PM]

Referred to Zoning & Planning, Land Use and Finance Committees

#273-12 **Request to restructure and increase of fees for various permits**
ALD. CROSSLEY & HESS-MAHAN requesting a restructuring and increase in fees for permits charged by the Inspectional Services Department and fees charged by the Planning Department and City Clerk to assure that fees are both sufficient to fund related services provided and simple to administer. [09/10/12 @ 1:17 PM]
Finance and Land Use voted NAN

Referred to Finance and Appropriate Committees

#257-12 **Review of fees in Chapter 17 and Chapter 20**
RECODIFICATION COMMITTEE recommending (1) review of the Fees, Civil Fines/Non-Criminal Disposition contained in Chapter 17 LICENSING AND PERMITS GENERALLY and Chapter 20 CIVIL FINES/NON-CRIMINAL DISPOSITION CIVIL FINES to ensure they are in accordance with what is being charged and (2) review of the acceptance of G.L. c. 40 §22F, accepted on July 9, 2001, which allows certain municipal boards and officers to fix reasonable fees for the issuance of certain licenses, permits, or certificates. Finance voted NAN

#195-15(3) Request to acquire land at 300 Hammond Pond Parkway

ALD. ALBRIGHT, BAKER, BLAZAR, BROUSAL-GLASER, CICCONE, COTE, CROSSLEY, DANBERG, FULLER, GENTILE, HESS-MAHAN, JOHNSON, KALIS, LAPPIN, LEARY, LAREDO, LENNON, LIPOF, NORTON, RICE, SANGIOLO, SCHWARTZ, AND YATES

requesting that, in order to preserve the conservation and recreation values of the land, and to protect existing adjacent public open spaces, the Board of Aldermen vote to acquire for the City of Newton either the undeveloped portion of the land at 300 Hammond Pond Parkway or a conservation restriction on such land.

[10/23/15 @ 2:55 PM]

#404-13 Request for rezoning in Newton Centre

NATASHA STALLER et al. requesting a revision to the zoning District boundary Lines so as to transfer from Multi-Residence 1 District to a Single Residence 3 District the following properties:

Assessors' parcels SBL nos. 61-037-0004 through 61-037-0013; 61-042-0007 through 61-042-0023; 65-019-0001; 65-019-0007 through 65-019-0012; 65-019-0014 through 65-019-0022; 65-019-0009A; 65-019-0017B and 65-019-0022A. Also requesting transfer from a Single Residence 2 District to a Single Residence 3 District SBL no. 65-019-0015A.

Respectfully Submitted,

Ted Hess-Mahan, Chair



SETTI D. WARREN
MAYOR

City of Newton, Massachusetts
Office of the Mayor

#115-16

Telephone
(617) 796-1100

Facsimile
(617) 796-1113

TDD/TTY
(617) 796-1089

E-mail
swarren@newtonma.gov

March 14, 2016

Honorable City Council
Newton City Hall
1000 Commonwealth Avenue
Newton, MA 02459

Ladies and Gentlemen:

I write to request that your Honorable Council docket for consideration a request to transfer the sum of \$200,000 from Acct # 0111401-511001 Full time Salaries to Acct # 0111401-5301 Consultants and authorize the transfer and appropriation of \$125,000 from June 30, 2015 Certified Free Cash to Acct # 0111401-5301 Consultants for the purpose of funding Zoning Reform Phase 2.

Thank you for your consideration of this matter.

Very truly yours,

Setti D. Warren
Mayor

RECEIVED
Newton City Office
2016 MAR 15 AM 4:52
David A. Olson, ONC
Newton, MA 02459

1000 Commonwealth Avenue Newton, Massachusetts 02459

www.newtonma.gov



DEDICATED TO COMMUNITY EXCELLENCE



Setti D. Warren
Mayor

City of Newton, Massachusetts
Department of Planning and Development
1000 Commonwealth Avenue Newton, Massachusetts 02459

~~#145-16~~
(617) 796-1120
Telefax
(617) 796-1142
TDD/TTY
(617) 796-1089
www.newtonma.gov

James Freas
Acting Director

MEMORANDUM

DATE: March 14, 2016
TO: Maureen Lemieux, Chief Financial Officer
FROM: James Freas, Acting Director
SUBJECT: Zoning Reform – Phase 2

The Zoning Reform project was initiated as a result of the 2011 Zoning Reform Group report, which recommended a two-phase process to reform Newton’s Zoning Ordinance and bring it into greater consistency with the *2007 Newton Comprehensive Plan*. Phase 1 of this project was completed in November 2015 with the adoption of a reformatted and modernized zoning ordinance document. This phase of work did not deal with substantive changes to Newton’s Zoning Ordinance that would help to address the systematic problems around issues of development activity and development project review that currently exist. Zoning Reform Phase 2 will address these more challenging issues and funding in the amount of \$325,000 is requested to support this project.

Zoning Reform Phase 2 has essentially a two-part scope of work to produce a “context based” zoning ordinance for the City and will be completed with the support of a consultant team. The first part of the project will be to collect quantitative and qualitative data about the City as it exists today, answering such questions as what are the patterns of development, what are the varying densities and land uses across the City, and where should additional growth occur? The second part is to take the maps, lot and building data, and policy information that results from part 1 and codify that into a draft zoning ordinance. Both parts of this project will depend on robust community engagement.

A selection committee representing Planning, ISD, Law, and the Zoning and Planning Committee of the City Council reviewed the two respondents to the Zoning Reform RFP. Sasaki Associates was selected (see attached). The \$325,000 identified above is the consultant fee for this project. The scope of work calls for an 18-month process at the end of which a draft Zoning Ordinance document will be submitted to the City Council.

City of Newton
Purchasing
Department

To: File
From: N. Read, Chief Procurement Officer
Date: January 28, 2016
Re: Comprehensive Zoning Reform—Phase 2 RFP 16-24

On 10/15/15 the city released RFP 16-24 for vendors to provide expertise and assistance to the City of Newton Planning and Development Department, Law Department, and Board of Aldermen in developing a context-based zoning ordinance. One Addendum was issued. Proposals were to be submitted by 11/12/15, and 2 vendors duly submitted proposals:

Town Planning & Urban Design Collaborative LLC (TPUDC)
Sasaki Associates, Inc. (Sasaki)

An evaluation committee made up of 4 persons¹ reviewed the technical proposals. Under the terms of the RFP, the proposers ranked Highly Advantageous and Advantageous are to be invited to interview and make a presentation. The evaluations ranking proposers on the Minimum Criteria and the first 4 Comparative Criteria were delivered to the Purchasing Department on 3/6/15.

¹ J. Freas, J. Lojak, T. Hess-Mahan & M Lawlor.

The Minimum Criteria ratings (deficiencies only noted) are as follows.

	TPUDC	Sasaki
The project team combined shall have the following: (1) a Master's degree in Planning, Architecture, or a closely related field; (2) a Juris Doctor degree with admission to the Massachusetts Bar or comparable credentials; and (3) five years of professional experience in planning and zoning.		
Resumes are provided for all project personnel including those listed above.		
Completed Bidder's Qualifications and References Form		
Certification of Tax Compliance		
Completed Certificate of Non-Collusion		
Completed Debarment Letter		
Completed IRS W-9 Form		

No proposers were disqualified so both were evaluated.

Sasaki Associates, Inc.

	JF	JL	TH-M	ML
1. Quality of work proposal	HA	HA	HA	HA
2. Quality and depth of project experience	No Ranking Given	HA	HA	HA
3. Experience in Community Engagement	HA	A	HA	HA
4. Qualifications of the Proposer Based on Submitted Resume(s)	HA	HA	HA	HA
5. Completeness and quality of proposal package	HA	HA	HA	HA
6. Quality of the presentation*	HA	A	HA/A	HA
7. References ²	HA			
Final Composite Ranking				

² James Freas ranked references on behalf of all evaluators.

Town Planning & Urban Design Collaborative LLC

	JF	JL	TH-M	ML
1. Quality of work proposal	HA	HA	HA	HA
2. Quality and depth of project experience	HA	HA	HA	HA
3. Experience in Community Engagement	HA	HA	HA	HA+
4. Qualifications of the Proposer Based on Submitted Resume(s)	HA	HA	HA	HA
5. Completeness and quality of proposal package	HA	HA	HA	HA
6. Quality of the presentation*	HA	HA	HA	HA
7. References ³	HA			

When the evaluation results tabulated, the price proposals were opened. The results (with each proposer's aggregate composite ranking) are as follows:

³ James Freas ranked references on behalf of all evaluators.

	Task 1	Task 2	Task 3	Task 4	Task 5	Task 6	Task 7	Total	Ranking
Sasaki Associates	10,000	10,000	35,000	125,000	65,000	50,000	30,000	325,000	HA
TPUDC	56,360	23,600	16,600	101,400	83,900	188,200	27,600	497,660	HA

The two proposers received identical qualitative rankings of HA and, though there some minor variations in the evaluations, these were not material. Both prices exceed the project estimate of \$150,000, and TPUDC's price is \$172,660 more (53%) than Sasaki's.

Given identical rankings and the substantial difference in price I recommend that Sasaki be awarded the contract as it is the most advantageous proposer based on price and non-price proposals.