



Setti D. Warren  
Mayor

**Newton, Massachusetts Community Preservation Program  
Fy12-13 FUNDING REQUEST**

*(For staff use)*  
date rec'd:  
  
**3 July 2012**

**PRE-PROPOSAL**

**PROPOSAL**

For full instructions, see [www.newtonma.gov/cpa](http://www.newtonma.gov/cpa) or contact:

Community Preservation Program Manager  
Newton Planning and Development Department, 1000 Commonwealth Ave., Newton, MA 02459  
[aingerson@newtonma.gov](mailto:aingerson@newtonma.gov) 617.796.1144

*You may adjust the space for each question, but do not use more than 1 page to answer all questions on this page.*

<b>Project CONTACTS</b>		<i>Name, title, mailing address, email, phone, fax, &amp; website if there is one.</i>	
<p><i>MANAGER - will be responsible for budgets, deadlines &amp; reports</i> Stephanie Gilman, Public Buildings Commissioner 52 Elliot Street, Newton, MA 02461 617-796-1600</p>		<p><i>OTHER CONTACT</i> Josh Morse, Director of Operations 52 Elliot Street, Newton, MA 02461 617-796-1600</p>	
<b>Project TITLE</b>	<b>City Hall Window Replacement/Restoration</b>		
<b>Project LOCATION</b>	<i>Full street address (with zip code) or other precise location.</i> 1000 Commonwealth Avenue, Newton, MA		
<b>Project BUDGET</b>	<b>CP FUNDS TO BE REQUESTED:</b> \$1,093,000	<b>OTHER FUNDS TO BE USED:</b> \$125,000	<b>TOTAL PROJECT COST:</b> \$1,218,000
<b>SUMMARY</b>	<i>Explain project goals &amp; why funds are needed. For multi-project "programs," describe how individual projects were chosen &amp; prioritized.</i>		
<p>Most of the windows at City Hall are original to the building which was constructed in 1931-32. The windows are 80 years old and beyond their useful life. The double hung wood window frames and sills are deteriorated in many locations and many windows are inoperable and/or do not seal properly, creating drafty and uncomfortable conditions and wasting energy. City Hall is one of the most significant buildings in the City of Newton and still functions as a vibrant center of City business and operations. The goal of this project is to thoroughly inventory City Hall windows and develop a whole building approach to restore and/or replace the original windows with properly insulated and historically accurate window units.</p> <p>There have been some past upgrades to the windows. Approximately 10 years ago many of the sashes had thermo pane glazing installed in the original sash using wood quarter round stops.</p> <p>A recent window survey determined that the windows are beyond restoration and will likely need to be replaced with historically accurate units. Though many were re-glazed, the frames and sills are deteriorated to the point that water penetration will continue to put the masonry walls at risk. There are approximately 200 windows in City Hall. This project will improve comfort, save energy, and extend the life of this important civic and historic building.</p> <p>This project was identified as a priority in the City's Five-Year Capital Improvement Plan. The CIP estimated cost has been escalated by 3% per year to the estimated mid-point of construction.</p>			

	HOW WILL CP FUNDS BE USED?	HISTORIC RESOURCES	OPEN SPACE	RECREATION LAND	COMMUNITY HOUSING
Check all that apply.	acquire				Contact staff for separate form..
	create	not allowed			
	preserve	X			
	support	not allowed	not allowed	not allowed	
	rehabilitate/restore	X	allowed only if the resource was originally acquired or created with CP funds		

You may adjust the space for each question, but do not use more than 1 page to answer all questions on this page.

**CITYWIDE PLANS:** List plans by title, year & page(s) where each plan identifies this specific project or its general goals as a priority. See links to plans from: [www.newtonma.gov/cpa/program.htm](http://www.newtonma.gov/cpa/program.htm).

City of Newton FY2013-FY2017 Five-Year Capital Improvement Plan, November 7, 2011

**OTHER FUNDING:** What non-CP funds will you use or are you pursuing? List names of other funders, amounts requested, & expected dates of funding decisions.

The City received \$125,000 from bonded funds to address City hall windows. Through this project, it was determined that the windows, in most cases, are beyond repair and that a more comprehensive repair/restoration/replacement project is needed to properly address the poor condition of the windows.

**STEWARDSHIP:** How will the project be maintained and funded once CP funds have been spent? (Hint for City-owned resources: “through the regular operating budget” is seldom a persuasive answer.)

The City has completed an overall assessment of City buildings and the City intends to continue routine assessments in order to track building conditions into the future. In addition, the City is developing a long-range plan that will incorporate both long term needed capital and operational investment in order to properly plan for timely investment in facilities to extend their useful life. Whatever the final window solution, the appropriate replacement/maintenance information will be entered into the City’s facility database to be used for both maintenance and long term capital investment decisions.

**COMMUNITY CONTACTS:** List email addresses and/or phone numbers for at least 3 Newton residents or organizations that can provide feedback on the proposal and its manager’s qualifications. No more than 1 should be a Board member, supervisor, or employee of the project manager.

Susan Albright, Alderman – [salbright@newtonma.gov](mailto:salbright@newtonma.gov)

Brian Lever, City Preservation Planner – [blever@newtonma.gov](mailto:blever@newtonma.gov)

David Olson, City Clerk – [dolson@newtonma.gov](mailto:dolson@newtonma.gov)

Larry Bauer, Architect, Chair of Designer Selection Committee – [lbauer@solomonbauer.com](mailto:lbauer@solomonbauer.com)

TIMELINE				
Project or Program Title: <b>City Hall Window Restoration/Replacement</b>				
Steps (for a project) or Projects (for a multi-project program) <i>For requests over \$300,000, show how funding could be phased over multiple years.</i>	Assistance Required <i>(fundraising, permits, etc.)</i>	Start <i>season/ year</i>	Finish <i>season/ year</i>	Cost <i>estimate</i>
<b>1. Design</b> – Study and Inventory Existing Conditions to Develop Recommended Solution for Repair, Restoration and/or Replacement of City Hall Windows.	Design Review Committee; Newton Historic Commission Approval	Spring 2013	Winter 2013	\$250,000
<b>2. Bidding</b> – Determine options for bidding and constructing the project. Project could be bid as one project and implemented in a phased approach.		Winter 2013	Spring 2014	\$0
<b>3. Construction – Phase I</b> – Phase I may address one or two floors of the building, or a wing. Funds are needed to sign a contract; however, expenditures could be spread out over 18 months.		Spring 2014	Fall 2014	\$843,000
<b>4. Construction – Phase II</b>		Spring 2015	Fall 2015	\$
<b>5. Project Closeout</b>		Winter 2015		\$
<b>6</b>				\$
<b>7</b>				\$
<b>8</b>				\$
<b>9</b>				\$
<b>10</b>				\$

<b>ATTACHMENTS</b>	
<b>TABLE OF CONTENTS</b>	
<b>1.</b>	<b>City Hall – Phase II Historic Building Report, dated May 1, 2012</b>

**NEWTON PUBLIC BUILDINGS SURVEY  
PHASE II – ANALYSIS OF HISTORICAL SIGNIFICANCE**

**Building Analysis**

**City Hall**



Address: 1000 Commonwealth Avenue

Year of Construction: 1931

Level of Significance: High

Individually listed property on the National Register of Historic Places, 1990.

Recommended Treatment Level: Preservation/Rehabilitation.

## **PART I - Analysis of Historical Significance**

### *Building History*

The Newton City Hall and War Memorial is monumental building in the Georgian Revival style designed by the firm of Allen & Collens. The building is set within a park designed by the Olmsted Brothers landscape architects.

Newton Mayor Sinclair Weeks was the driving force behind replacing the old City Hall on Washington Street, originally constructed as the Second Parish Meetinghouse in 1764 with a new building. The new building was conceived of as having a dual function as both a City Hall and a War Memorial to commemorate veterans and soldiers who had perished in World War I. The Board of Aldermen considered a number of potential locations for the building, conducting public hearings in Newton's multiple villages to determine the ultimate location. The present location, a swampy, triangular site in Newton Center, was acquired in 1927, accepted by virtue of being the geographic center of the town and what was imagined to become the center of the population.

In 1930 the Aldermen voted to petition the Legislature to give the City the authority to borrow outside the debt limit to finance the building. The Mayor justified this expenditure on construction during the Depression as a way to employ Newton residents. In June of 1930 the Aldermen appropriated money to permit the Mayor to engage the services of an architect. The selected architects were Charles Collens and Harold B. Willis of the firm Allen & Collens. Allen & Collens was a nationally prominent firm, known primarily for their work in the Gothic revival style. Important works included Riverside Church, Union Theological Seminary and the Cloisters Museum in New York; the Second Church in Newton; and numerous collegiate works including twelve buildings at Vassar College constructed between 1893 and 1937. The design of the grounds was by Henry Vincent Hubbard, a partner at the landscape architecture firm of the Olmsted Brothers. Hubbard joined the Olmsted Brothers in 1901. He left to start his own firm, Pray, Hubbard and White, but returned when World War I ended his business and became a partner in 1920. He also taught at Harvard from 1906-1939 where he was the Chair of the City Planning Department.

Between June 1930 and March 1931 the Aldermen considered twenty-four separate plans for the building before accepting the final design. Construction began in 1931, with two cornerstones (one for City Hall and one for the War Memorial) laid on November 11. The building was dedicated a year later with a military parade attended by many thousands. The Boston Society of Architects awarded the building the J. Harleston Parker Medal in 1936. This award recognizes "the most beautiful piece of architecture, building, monument or structure within the limits of the City of Boston or of the Metropolitan District Commission."

### *Level of Significance*

Newton City Hall is significant under National Register Criteria A and C. It possesses integrity of location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling and association. Its construction in the early 1930s is a significant reflection of Newton's civic pride and growth. Designed by the noted firm of Allen & Collens and set in an Olmsted Brothers-designed landscape, the award-winning building is also architecturally significant.

### *References*

- Dempsey, James. "Newton's Civic Centre is Tribute to Hero Dead" in *The Official Dedication Program of the Newton City Hall and War Memorial*. Newton, MA: 1932.
- Newton Historical Commission. "Discover Historic West Newton". Newton, MA, 2002.
- "City Hall and War Memorial Building, Newton, Massachusetts". *American Architect and Architecture* 143 (July 1933): 55-62.
- Massachusetts Historical Commission, "Form B NWT.2891—1000 Commonwealth Ave." (1988).
- Pressley Associates, "Newton City Hall and War Memorial Grounds: Historic Landscape Preservation Master Plan", September 2006.
- Van Lengen, Karen and Lisa A. Reilly. *Vassar College: An Architectural Tour*. New York: Princeton Architectural Press, 2004.

**PART I - Analysis of Historical Significance: Historic Images**



Figure 1: City Hall entry (east elevation), c.1940s. The landscape plan was designed so that the building would be mirrored in the reflecting ponds, with the reflection visible from the front steps of City Hall (Credit: Historic Newton).



AERIAL VIEW  
Helen & Collins, Architects      Olmsted Bros., Landscape Architects      Curtis-Wright, Planners

Figure 2: Aerial view of City Hall and landscape after construction (Credit: Historic Newton).

## **Part 2 – Description of Historically Significant Features**

### **Exterior Visual Character**

#### *Setting*

- The building is located within a park-like setting designed by the Olmsted Brothers. The organically shaped ponds to the east, now obscured by trees and undergrowth, were intended to serve as reflecting pools for the building.

#### *Shape*

- The building is roughly “T”-shaped in plan with protruding wings at each side of the long end (the section containing City Hall). The rear walls of the long end curve back to the short leg of the “T”, which is the location of the War Memorial.

#### *Roof and Related Features*

- A slate gable roof with arched dormers and raised brick gable ends is located at the center section of City Hall. Slate hipped roofs are present at the side wings.
- The City Hall roof has a small painted copper-clad cupola and low wooden balustrade at the roof edge.
- The War Memorial has a slate gable roof and a large painted copper-clad tower on a square brick base protruding from the roof.

#### *Openings*

- Windows are typically single double-hungs with 12-over-12 wood sashes. Some second floor level windows are 33/20 with arched upper sashes.
  - Most of the original wood windows are still present at the building. Some vinyl replacement windows are at the basement level. The windows above the non-original elevator entrance have been bricked in.
- There are multiple entrances at the front and sides of City Hall and the War Memorial, typically contained within elaborate limestone surrounds with pediments. Reflective glass has been installed at the panels of the exterior doors.

#### *Projections:*

- The War Memorial side has a monumental pedimented stone portico supported by Tuscan columns.
- The City Hall side has a smaller pedimented stone portico supported by Corinthian columns.

#### *Trim and Secondary Features:*

- Numerous decorative elements, including a stone frieze at the perimeter of the building, an arcade with brick arches and decorative metal railings at the second floor of the areas of curved walls and wood balustrades at the steeples.

#### *Materials*

- Waterstruck brick with limestone trim, granite base.

#### *Craft Details*

- The pediment at the War Memorial Entrance is carved with a Symbolic Pediment Group, designed by Charles Collens. The three figures represent Patriotism, History and the Spirit of Sacrifice.



### **Interior Visual Character**

City Hall-General (in significant spaces, unless otherwise noted)

- Terrazzo floors (white/light gray in tan cement) and borders (black in tan cement)
- Plain painted plaster walls

Memorial Building-General (in significant spaces, unless otherwise noted)

- Tan/gray veined marble tile floors with black marble borders

#### *Individually Important Spaces*

City Hall-Entry Lobby

- Elliptical space with an airlock vestibule of two sets of double doors. 12-paneled exterior doors with a 5-light transom; two panels on each door are now reflective glass. The interior doors have 12 lights each, sidelights and a transom.
- Ceiling- ornamental, fluted plaster pattern radiating out from a cast plaster rosette
- Walls- eight marble-clad pilasters and their corresponding piers
- Floor- cast bronze city seal within an ornamental, multi-colored terrazzo pattern

City Hall-Aldermanic Chamber

- Ceiling- coffered with acoustic tiles added. Decorative panels on the beams
- Walls- pilasters between windows; frieze with triglyphs. In the space remaining the walls have defined panels and are painted, originally pale red. At the west wall, a recess is defined with pilasters and two columns
- Windows- tall, arched operable windows
- Floor- the plain white oak in the original bid set was upgraded to Burma teak-wood in a herringbone pattern.
- Four multi-armed chandelier light fixtures are present, centered in the ceiling coffers

Memorial Building-Memorial Hall

- Barrel-vaulted, symmetrical space; Ionic colonnade side aisles; west balcony with solid, paneled wood guardrail
- Half-dome ceiling of apse originally had gold stars painted on the field of light blue
- Walls- flat plaster surfaces, pilasters, wainscot, chair rail, two cornices
- Original lighting concealed within vault springline; a chandelier is centered on each window

Memorial Building-War Museum

- Four dioramas of battle scenes and corresponding weaponry displays
- The ceiling is painted flat plaster with a shallow vault at the crossing. Wood cornice.
- Walls are painted wood paneling. The room has fluted square wood pilasters at the corners
- Doorways- three different styles: two rectangular, one elliptical arch, one segmental arch
- Ceiling-mounted light fixture, likely original, with metal eagles around the perimeter

Memorial Building-Hall of Flags

- Two-story tall space with an octagonal footprint at the first floor and balcony hallway at the second floor.
- The ceiling is vaulted with painted plaster. Cornice at springline
- Walls at the first floor have rusticated cast stone courses. At the second floor, the walls are plaster with balustrades, pedestals, columns and trim
- Window- one arched window matching those in the Memorial Hall
- Floor- 17" marble tiles, diagonally laid, with a black marble tile border and star pattern
- Lighting- 10-armed chandelier
- Registry of Newton fallen soldiers, flags, war artifacts including cannonballs lodged in tree trunks

*Related Spaces*

Memorial Building-Stair Hall

- Ceiling- flat plaster cross-groin vault
- Walls- paneled wood at first floor, up to a wood wainscot at second floor. A large mural is located in a niche on the second floor
- Stairs- marble with a wood balustrade
- Lighting- single ceiling mounted fixture

City Hall-Corridors

- The ceiling is painted, textured plaster with a cornice. In the north and south wings three intermediate beams divide the long surfaces; the ceiling in the west wing is uninterrupted.
- The walls are clad with a 43" tall marble wainscot
- Lighting- ceiling-mounted fixtures centered in spaces between beams
- The north and south wings end at a stair well. The stair is separated from the corridor by a pair of 12-light glass doors, 12-light sidelights, and transom with 21-light fanlight. The doorways to many rooms are wide, shallow-arched openings with rounded edges and no trim. Most have been filled in with wood and glass panels. Other doorways are rectangular with painted metal trim with wood panel doors

City Hall-Stairs (adjacent to Entry Lobby)

- Marble treads, risers, wainscot; ornamental wrought iron balustrade and handrail

*References*

"Newton Civic Centre a Model of Municipal Planning." Edison Service News, December 1932.  
Vol. 2, No. 12.

**Part 2 – Images**



Figure 3: View of Memorial Hall, looking east. The light blue half-dome was originally painted with gold stars.



Figure 4: View of Aldermanic Chamber, looking west.



Figure 5: Portico at the main entrance to the War Memorial. Note the figures at the pediment, representing Patriotism, History and the Spirit of Sacrifice, designed by Charles Collins.



Figure 6: View of the exterior, from the southwest.

### **Part 3 – Treatment Recommendations**

#### **Preservation Treatment Level**

City Hall is a significant building within the City of Newton, and it continues to serve its original functions, both as City Hall and as a War Memorial. Overall it is in very good condition. It is recommended that any work on the exterior and in the significant spaces on the interior be performed according to the “Preservation” level of treatment, as outlined in the U.S. Secretary of the Interior’s *Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties*. The Preservation treatment level places a premium on the retention of all historic fabric through conservation, maintenance and repair.

In typical office and ancillary spaces not directly contributing to the historic character, the “Rehabilitation” level of treatment may be more appropriate. At this level, the emphasis is placed on protecting and maintaining historic building material and significant features while providing an efficient contemporary use of the building.

The following bulleted list contains an analysis of existing conditions and recommended treatments for the significant features catalogued in Part 2 of this report.

#### **Exterior Recommendations**

Critical/Urgent (Timeframe: As soon as possible)

- The Roof was not accessible for survey, including cupola and balustrade. Investigate roof and gutter conditions at locations above spalling limestone eaves. Repair. Replace leaking gutters.
- Investigate source of water damage at interior surfaces of War Memorial tower (peeling paint and rusting are present at interior surfaces.) Repair.
- Investigate the source of water damage at the spalling limestone eave on the north elevation. Repair.

First Priority (Timeframe: 1-3 years)

- There is a large vertical crack along the edge of the quoins on the east elevation. Investigate the cause and determine if it is still active. Recommendation dependent upon cause.
- Seal exposed, drilled holes in the water table and perform dutchman repairs.
- Repair spalling stone, including the stairs and cheek walls of the War Memorial and the limestone eave at the north elevation
- Conduct a thorough survey of window conditions, including sash, frame, lintel and hardware. Repair all window sash and frames where necessary and repaint. Replace the UV film if necessary- some streaking was observed at the tall arched windows of the War Memorial Building. Consider replacing the vinyl windows with new wood windows to match the originals.
- Repair cracks in concrete, including at the service entrance site wall.

Second Priority (Timeframe: 3-5 years)

- Reset and repoint the granite stairs and cheek walls at the entrances.
- Repair the exterior sconces and fit with historically appropriate energy efficient lamps.
- Clean building exterior, including:
  - Staining- various locations
  - Biological growth- various locations, including service entrance
  - Ivy growth- various locations
  - Graffiti- service entrance

Maintenance (Timeframe: Ongoing)

- Monitor the erosion at the column bases at both porticos for further damage.
- Continue regular maintenance of character-defining features.
- Maintain all gutters, leaders and drains to keep clog-free.

### **Interior Recommendations**

#### Critical/Urgent (Timeframe: As soon as possible)

- Investigate the source of water damage at the ceilings and walls of the Hall of Flags and Memorial Building Stair Hall. Determine the cause and if it is still active. Repair the damage at the source.

#### First Priority (Timeframe: 1-3 years)

- The general office spaces originally had asphalt-asbestos composition tile flooring; investigate the current flooring in these spaces. Encapsulate or remove if still extant.

#### Second Priority (Timeframe: 3-5 years)

- Patch plaster as required and repaint at the ceilings of the Hall of Flags and Memorial Building Stair Hall.
- Clean efflorescence from the cast stone walls of the Hall of Flags.
- Repair and repaint the balustrade and pedestals of the Hall of Flags.

#### Maintenance (Timeframe: Ongoing)

- The character-defining features are generally in good condition. Continue regular maintenance.