

City of Newton



David B. Cohen  
Mayor

## APPLICATION FOR COMMUNITY PRESERVATION FUNDING

Submit to Jennifer Goldson, Community Preservation Planner  
Newton Planning and Development Department  
1000 Commonwealth Avenue, Newton, MA 02459  
jgoldson@ci.newton.ma.us  
617-796-1120 ext. 1131

Name of Applicant<sup>3</sup> A Nicholas Parnell, AIA, Commissioner of Public Buildings

Name of Co-Applicant, if applicable Newton Public Buildings Preservation Task Force

Contact Name A Nicholas Parnell

Mailing Address Public Buildings Department  
52 Elliot Street City Newton State MA Zip 02461

Daytime Phone 617 796 1600 Email nparnell@ci.newton.ma.us

Name of Proposal Design Services for Restoration of Newton Civil War Memorial

Address of Proposal (or assessor's parcel id) Newton Cemetery 791 Walnut Street Newton Centre

CPA Category (circle all that apply):  Open space  Historic preservation  Recreation  Community housing

CPA Funding Requested \$ 19,800.00 Total Cost of Proposed Project \$ 19,800.00

**PROJECT DESCRIPTION:** Attach answers to the following questions. Applications will be returned as incomplete if all requested information is not provided. Include supporting materials as necessary.

1. **Goals:** What are the goals of the proposed project?
2. **Community Need:** Why is this project needed? Does it address needs identified in existing City plans?
3. **Community Support:** What is the nature and level of support for this project? Include letters of support and any petitions.
4. **Timeline:** What is the schedule for project implementation, including a timeline for all critical milestones?
5. **Credentials:** How will the experience of the applicant contribute to the success of this project?
6. **Success Factors:** How will the success of this project will be measured? Be as specific as possible.
7. **Budget:** What is the total budget for the project and how will CPA funds be spent? All items of expenditure must be clearly identified. Distinguish between hard and soft costs and contingencies. (NOTE: CPA funds may NOT be used for maintenance.)
8. **Other Funding:** What additional funding sources are available, committed, or under consideration? Include commitment letters, if available, and describe any other attempts to secure funding for this project.
9. **Maintenance:** If ongoing maintenance is required for your project, how will it be funded?

**ADDITIONAL INFORMATION:** Provide the following additional information, as applicable.

10. Documentation that you have control over the site, such as Purchase and Sale Agreement, option, or deed.

<sup>3</sup> If the proposal is on City-owned land, either the applicant or the co-applicant must be the City Board, Commission, or Department in control of the land.

**City of Newton Massachusetts**  
**Application for Community Preservation Funding**  
**October 15, 2004**

**1. Project Goals**

*A. Historic Importance of Property*

The City's Civil War Memorial Monument is located in a wonderful setting in the Newton Cemetery. The City owns the land and the monument. The Newton Cemetery takes care of the land surrounding the monument. The memorial consists of a granite obelisk about thirty feet high and a wonderful curved granite retaining wall that grows out of the ground to a central wall not unlike an underground tomb front. The central portion of the wall is adorned with three marble tablets with the names of those Newton residents who died in the Civil War. (See accompanying photos). The monuments are set in a large circular lawn area bounded by winding roadways on the top of a small hill in the Newton Cemetery. The circular area is about 150 feet across and is graced with three or four beautiful old trees. This is a beautiful and serene monument to the City's Civil War dead. The base of the obelisk has the date 1864 carved in relief. The cemetery's records and newspaper accounts confirm that the monument was dedicated before the Civil War ended. (See attached pages from unpublished manuscript by Thelma Fleishman.)

*B. Scope of Restoration Work to Be Documented*

The granite obelisk and its base are in excellent condition and aside from light cleaning, need no other preservation work. The wall (which is probably about 40 feet long) has begun to have serious problems. The curved stones of the two rising flanking walls have been pushed forward out of alignment by several inches by the pressure of the earth behind, but have not been otherwise visibly damaged. The pressure of the earth behind the central portion of the monument has caused the wall to lean and various pieces of the granite frame surrounding the three marble tablets have both twisted and moved unevenly. A large granite cartouche carved from a single stone which formerly topped the central frame has been removed and lowered to the ground in front of the monument to prevent its falling and to lessen the pressure on the stones below. A bronze cannon that topped the cartouche has been removed and put in storage. Unequal stress in one of the granite columns has cracked its lower portion and water has begun to disintegrate some of the granite. The marble tablets are still in reasonable shape even though they have weathered somewhat and are badly stained.

The services of a structural engineer and a restoration consulting company with expertise in stone restoration and treatment will be needed to prepare construction documents for the necessary repairs. If the CPC funds this project, funding for implementation of the repairs will be requested in the 2005 application round.

The restoration of this monument is critical to the prevention of more costly damage and the preservation of one of the City's most beautiful and important monuments.

## **2. Community Need**

### *A. Why This Project is Needed*

Increasingly severe movement in the retaining-wall-like portion of the Civil War Monument is putting increasing stress on individual stone components of the memorial and creating damage that will be increasingly difficult to repair. It has already been necessary to remove the stone cartouche that is the cap of the central portion of the memorial to prevent even more accelerated deterioration of the supporting components below. One of the granite support columns has begun to shatter under the increasing loads put on its front plane by tipping of the wall. This stone column forms one side of the frame of the right-hand marble panel inscribed with the names of soldiers who sacrificed their lives in the Civil War. It is likely that any additional force may damage the panel itself. Since Quincy granite is no longer quarried, repair materials must come from salvaged stone. Twisting and leaning of the stones are evident throughout the structure, leading to likelihood of further damage if the problem is not corrected soon.

### *B. Addressing Needs Identified in Existing City Plans*

Although visitors to the Newton Cemetery have noted the deterioration to the Civil War Memorial, most have not realized that this is a City property and many have not realized that the large stone resting on the ground in front of the commemorative tablets belongs on the wall above the tablets and that the bronze cannon has been removed from that stone. The ownership and condition of the monument has been brought to the attention of the Public Buildings Preservation Task Force and has become one of its priorities because of the potential for further damage to this important monument and because of the likelihood that the original design of the monument and parts that have been moved or removed to prevent further damage will be lost or their original locations and purposes forgotten..

## **3. Community Support**

The Newton Public Buildings Preservation Task Force, the Newton Historical Commission, the Newton Cemetery Corporation, and the Newton Veteran's Department are all aware of the need for study and repair of this important City monument and support this important first step. Letters of support from these organizations are included with this application.

## **4. Timeline**

Assuming that final approval of CPA funding is received by 1 March 2005, the following timeline will be followed:

<u>Activity</u>	<u>Completion Date</u>
Preparation of RFP	15 April 2005
Advertising for Proposals	15 May 2005
Receipt of Proposals	1 June 2005
Selection of Consultant Team & Preparation & Execution of Contract	1 July 2005
Design of Restoration, Preparation of Construction Documents & Preparation of Cost Estimate for Construction.	1 September 2005

## 5. Credentials

After a trial run with the projects for Lighting, Balustrade and Cupola Painting, and Window Restoration, the Newton Public Buildings Task Force feels that it has ironed out the wrinkles in its process for implementing projects and is familiar with the requirements for City bidding and the timelines that must be expected for the process. The joint experience of the Task Force and the Public Buildings Department has led to the conclusion that outside consultants can best fulfill the needs of this project, limiting the work of the two bodies to preparing the RFP and selecting and working with the consultant team.

## 6. Success Factors

Project success will be measured by the ability of the Public Building Department and Public Building Preservations Task Forces to include a completely ready bid package and cost estimate in its Application for Funding for implementation of the project to the CPC in October 2005, so that implementation of the required stabilization and restoration can take place in a time frame that will prevent more damage to the monument.

## 7. Budget

The budget has been prepared with the input of a structural engineer who has worked on the restoration of several underground tombs which are very similar in nature to the Civil War Memorial and a preservation consulting company with extensive experience in restoration of stone structures and conservation of stone materials.

Structural Engineer	\$ 5,000.00
Preservation/Conservation Consultant	\$ 7,500.00
Cost Consultant	\$ 1,500.00
Coordinating Architect	<u>4,000.00</u>
Total Fees	\$ 18,000.00
Contingency @ 10%	<u>1,800.00</u>
Total Cost	\$ 19,800.00

Combining the Civil War Monument & War Memorial Steps Projects can save considerable money.

## **8. Other Funding**

No other source of funding has been identified for this project.

## **9. Maintenance**

For this portion of the project, maintenance is not applicable. After restoration work on the monument has been undertaken, no maintenance should be required beyond the Newton Cemetery's exceptional care of its grounds and perhaps (if recommended by the preservation/conservation consultant) renewal of any protective measures specified for the marble panels.

## **10. Through 14 – Not Applicable**

## **15. Appropriate Professional Standards**

The RFP will be written so that only consultants with appropriate and extensive experience will be qualified to submit proposals. Experience and recommendations will be carefully checked before a consultant team is chosen.

## **16. Additional Community Benefits**

It is hoped that publicity surrounding the CPC's consideration of funding for this project will elicit the interest of the press and result in more public awareness of this City monument and of the extraordinary beauty of the historic landscape and monuments in the Newton Cemetery which in many respects rivals its more famous sister, Mount Auburn Cemetery in Cambridge.

## **DRAFT # 4**

space for lawn, trees and shrubs. Ross supervised the grading and planting. Lake, Central and Valley avenues were laid out first, followed, after the acquisition of the Collins land on Beacon Street in 1870, by "a new avenue south of the main avenue", that became Cypress Avenue. The mud was removed from the pond and the banks graded "preparatory to sending part of the water running through... to the highest part of the ground from hence to be distributed..." It is not clear whether this, the first irrigation system, ever became a reality.

Most of Ross's time was spent "fitting up" individual lots. This involved grading, sodding or seeding, cutting and planting flower beds and, occasionally terracing and building steps. A few lot plans were drawn by architects or surveyors but for the most part Ross drew them himself in consultation with the owners. Some families elected to have their lots enclosed by a hedge or iron fence or by marble or granite curbing (among those singled out by the Newton Journal was Gardner Colby's which cost \$5000). These enclosures soon ceased to be fashionable. From 1873, already prohibited in some areas, they were subject to approval from Ross and the Trustees. Many were subsequently removed.

In 1861 the Town built a granite receiving tomb with marble doors, which seems to have been done without Ross's involvement. His first special project was the preparation of the site for the Soldiers' Monument.

In the fall of 1863, J. Wiley Edmands, representing a committee set up "informally" by the Town to consider erecting a monument to the soldiers killed in the Civil War, approached the Trustees "relative to a lot". A site near the then entrance was chosen, bounded and conveyed to the Town in exchange for the sixty lots paid for in advance as part of the 1856 agreement. According to Rice, as reported in the Newton Journal (January 1871) the exchange was both "fair to the Town" and "removed a serious difficulty felt by the Trustees" as those lots had been selected in different parts of the cemetery "often every other lot in a range" so that it had not been possible to put in order the areas where they were located.

## **DRAFT # 4**

If not, as is sometimes claimed, the first Civil War monument in the country, it is among the few that were erected while the war was still in progress. The designer of this twenty-eight-foot shaft of Quincy granite has not, as yet, been identified. At least three different marble workers, Jeremiah Leary from Waltham, John J. Horgan, and some-one from the Mitchell Granite Company, cut the lettering in the entablature. The total cost of just over \$5000 was raised by public subscription: 1100 school children gave ten cents each. Perpetual care of the site was promised by the Cemetery.

At the dedication ceremony in July 1864, the opening address was given by Thomas Rice, Chairman of the Board of Selectman, the prayer by the Reverend James Young, Pastor of the Channing Unitarian Church, the "main discourse" by the Reverend Horatio Balch Hackett. The proceedings closed with a hymn written for the occasion by Dr. Samuel F. Smith.

The first military funeral was that of William Benson of the First Massachusetts Infantry who was killed at Williamsburg, Virginia, on May 5, 1862.

Later in 1864, planning began for the so-called catacomb tombs. The first was for Governor, then Lieutenant Governor, William Claflin. ("The Old Elms" his Newtonville home, where he entertained the well-known in political, literary and artistic circles, was once part of the Hull estate, and is now the High School's Claflin Field). Governor and Mrs. Claflin lost two children in the '60s and there is more than one description of the profusion of flowers in the tomb's ante-room visible through the openwork of the door to the vault. Also deemed worthy of mention in The Newton Journal were the Mason and Wardwell tombs. Built in 1869 and '70 with Ross as contractor, they netted a profit of \$700 for the Corporation at a time when finances were low.

From the beginning, flooding was a problem in what was known as the Fountain Valley (a storm in 1868 left two feet of water in the Claflin tomb), and devising a satisfactory



# CITY OF NEWTON, MASSACHUSETTS

Department of Planning and Development  
Michael J. Kruse, Director

Telephone  
(617)-796-1120  
Telefax  
(617) 796-1142

David B. Cohen  
Mayor

October 14, 2004

Community Preservation Committee  
c/o Planning and Development Department  
1000 Commonwealth Avenue  
Newton, MA 02459

RE: Engineering and Restoration Design for Preservation of the Newton Civil War Memorial in the Newton Cemetery

Dear Community Preservation Committee Members:

The Newton Historical Commission would like to express its strong support for the Newton Public Buildings Preservation Task Force's application for funding to complete the engineering and restoration design for the Newton Civil War Memorial located in the Newton Cemetery. The Newton Civil War Memorial was dedicated in 1864 and is one of the few Civil War memorials completed before the end of the Civil War. Comprised of a carved granite obelisk and a curved granite retaining wall, the design of which grows out of the ground not unlike an underground tomb front, it is located on a circular lawn on the side of a small hill. The City owned memorial is also adorned with the names of those Newton residents who died in the War, and is a beautiful and serene monument to the City's Civil War Veterans.

The Commission understands that this is a phased project, and that the ultimate goal of the current design work is to restore this important monument to its original form. While the obelisk portion of the monument have survived in good condition, the pressure of the hillside on the curved wall has begun to cause serious problems requiring the removal of several important design elements to prevent any further damage. As a result, it is not currently possible to view the monument as originally designed, and the continued pressure on the granite wall will only cause further deterioration if it is not addressed.

The Newton Civil War Memorial is a community resource which the City cannot afford to lose. It's preservation and restoration to its original form is important to ensuring that the memorial survives for future generations. With this in mind, the Newton Historical Commission reiterates their support for this project and hopes that you will look favorably upon this grant application.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "John Rodman".

John Rodman, Chairman  
Newton Historical Commission

Newton Historical Commission  
1000 Commonwealth Avenue, Newton, Massachusetts 02459  
Email: lkritzer@ci.newton.ma.us  
www.ci.newton.ma.us



OCT 15 2004

City of Newton



DEPARTMENT OF VETERANS' SERVICES

Alfred R. Guzzi, Jr., Agent  
1000 Commonwealth Avenue  
Newton Centre, MA 02459-1449

Telephone  
617- 796-1090  
Facsimile  
617- 796-1094

David B. Cohen  
Mayor

October 15, 2004

Community Preservation Committee  
C/O Planning & Development Department  
Newton City Hall  
1000 Commonwealth Ave.  
Newton Centre, MA 02459

Re: Engineering and Restoration Design for  
Newton Civil War Memorial

Dear Members:

The Public Buildings Task Force would like to solicit your Commission's support for its application for Community Preservation funding for the above project.

The City's Civil War Memorial Monument at Newton Cemetery is in need of repair. The wall is being pushed forward by the earth and will eventually cave in.


The need is apparent for a company with expertise to prepare construction documents for the needed repairs.

This monument is a wonderful tribute to the people in Newton who were killed in the Civil War and is in a very key setting in a beautiful cemetery.

The veterans buried at Newton Cemetery are never forgotten during Memorial Day week when over 2500 grave flags are placed on graves of veterans as well as surrounding the Civil War Monument.

I strongly support this project.

Sincerely,

  
Alfred R. Guzzi, Jr.  
Veterans' Service Officer

E-Mail [aguzzi@ci.newton.ma.us](mailto:aguzzi@ci.newton.ma.us)



# Newton Cemetery Corporation

*A Beautiful Garden Cemetery Serving Greater Boston*

October 13, 2004

Community Preservation Committee  
c/o Planning and Development Department  
Newton City Hall  
1000 Commonwealth Avenue  
Newton Centre, MA 02459

RE: **Preservation of the Newton Civil War Memorial**

Dear Community Preservation Committee Members:

I am very pleased to hear of the plans of the Newton Public Buildings Preservation Task Force to request funding from the Community Preservation Committee for design services for the restoration of the referenced memorial.

This magnificent granite memorial, consisting of a large obelisk and ornate retaining wall, has graced this garden Cemetery since 1864 when it was erected and dedicated to Newton's Civil War Veterans. Unfortunately, over time the retaining wall portion of the memorial has become unstable and unsafe requiring the upper ornamental cap to be dismantled and stabilized nearby.

The Newton Civil War Memorial provides a permanent tribute honoring those who have served while contributing greatly to the historic value of this community and the Cemetery.

On behalf of this Corporation, I would like to express my full support for this funding application and my hope that the Committee will approve funding for this important restoration project.

Thank you.

Sincerely,

Michael V. Keblin, Sr.  
President and Treasurer



# CITY OF NEWTON, MASSACHUSETTS

Department of Planning and Development

Michael J. Kruse, Director

Telephone

(617)-796-1120

Telefax

(617) 796-1142

David B. Cohen  
Mayor

January 28, 2005

Doug Dickson, Chairman  
Community Preservation Committee  
1000 Commonwealth Avenue  
Newton, MA 02459

RE: Designation of Local Significance – Newton Civil War Monument

Dear Mr. Dickson:

On behalf of the Newton Historical Commission, I am writing to tell you that the Commission has found the Newton Civil War Monument, located in the Newton Cemetery, 791 Walnut Street, to be an historic resource which is significant to the history and culture of the City of Newton as defined under the Community Preservation Ordinance, Chapter 44B, Section 2. The Newton Civil War Memorial was dedicated in 1864 and is one of the few Civil War memorials in the country completed before the end of the Civil War. Comprised of a carved granite obelisk and a curved granite retaining wall, the design of which grows out of the ground not unlike an underground tomb front, it is located on a circular lawn on the side of a small hill. The City owned memorial is adorned with the names of those Newton residents who died in the War, and is a beautiful and serene monument to the City's Civil War Veterans which is listed on the City's Historic Resource Survey.

At their meeting on Thursday, January 27, 2005, the Newton Historical Commission reviewed the proposed project and determined, by a vote of 6 to 0, that this property constitutes a historic resource which is worthy for consideration under the Community Preservation Act. The Commission had previously indicated to the CPC their enthusiastic support for the proposed restoration of the monument and has resolved to provide this follow-up letter to facilitate the consideration of funding to restore this locally significant historic resource.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in cursive script, appearing to read "Lara Kritzer".

Lara Kritzer  
Preservation Planner

Newton Historical Commission  
1000 Commonwealth Avenue, Newton, Massachusetts 02459  
Email: [lkritzer@ci.newton.ma.us](mailto:lkritzer@ci.newton.ma.us)  
[www.ci.newton.ma.us](http://www.ci.newton.ma.us)

Newton Massachusetts  
Community Preservation Funding Application

15 October 2004



Engineering and Restoration Design  
for  
Preservation of the Newton Civil War Monument

Newton Cemetery  
791 Walnut Street  
Newton Centre Massachusetts 02458

2004 OCT 15 PM 4:50





**Photo A – Central Portion of Retaining Wall with Obelisk in Background and Cartouche from Top of Monument on Ground in Front of Monument**



**Photo B – Detail of Obelisk**





**Photo C - Overall Photo of Curved Retaining Wall Showing Tilt of Central Portion, Displacement of Curved Stones & Cartouche from Top of Monument on Ground in Front of Monument**



**Photo D - Stress Crack in Granite Post & Staining of Marble Tablet**





**Photo E - Twisting of Posts and Displacement of Cap**



**Photo F - Gaps Left by Differential Movement of Various Pieces of the Monument**