



City of Newton, Massachusetts
Community Preservation Committee



David B. Cohen
Mayor

MEMORANDUM

TO: Honorable Board of Aldermen
FROM: Community Preservation Committee
DATE: 30 March 2005
RE: **CPC Recommendation For CPA Funding**

PROJECT TITLE: Civil War Monument Restoration (Design/Study)
CPA PROJECT ID: CPA-FY05-2
CPA CATEGORY: Historic Preservation

PROJECT DESCRIPTION

The applicants, the Commissioner of Public Buildings and the Newton Public Buildings Preservation Task Force, request \$19,800 to secure the services of a structural engineer and a restoration consulting company with expertise in stone restoration and treatment. These services are needed to prepare construction documents for the necessary repairs to the Newton Civil War Monument located in the Newton Cemetery. Completed in 1864, the Civil War Monument is significant in that it was dedicated prior to the end of the war.

In submitting this proposal, the applicants expressed the hope that by combining this project with the War Memorial Staircase design/study project the total cost might be reduced by as much as \$5K each.¹ Therefore, the CPC recommends allocating \$15,000 for the services described above. If this design work is funded, the applicants plan to request additional CPA funds in FY06 for implementation of the necessary repairs. The CPC would consider such an application independently at that time.

FINDINGS

Community Preservation Act (MGL c.44B)

Historic Preservation

MGL c.44B defines an **historic resource** as “a building, structure, vessel or real property that is listed or eligible for listing on the state register of historic places or has been determined by the local historic preservation commission to be significant...” Through a unanimous vote (6-0) on 20 January 2005 the Newton Historical Commission determined that the Civil War Monument is significant to the history and culture of the City of Newton. The monument, therefore, complies with the definition of an historic resource under MGL c.44B. Additionally, the Newton Cemetery is listed on the City’s Historic Resources Survey (see the letter from Lara Kritzer, Preservation Planner, dated 28 January 2005).

In accordance with §5(b)(2), the proposed designs would provide a scope of work required to **preserve** and **restore** the monument. Preparing such designs complies with the *US Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties, Standards for Preservation*. Standard #6 states “The existing condition of historic features will be evaluated to determine the appropriate level of intervention needed...” After the design work is completed, a comprehensive scope of work for the preservation and restoration of the monument will be laid out. This will include structurally securing the retaining wall to the hillside in an effort to prevent further

¹ Proposals for both the Civil War Monument Restoration and the War Memorial Stair Restoration call for the services of a structural engineer as well as a stone conservator. Performing the required tasks of these projects in conjunction with one another will result in a reduced total cost for the combined projects, as stated by the applicants.

deterioration; repairs to the granite cartouche designed to sit atop the retaining wall; and possible measures that can be taken to clean the granite obelisk.

Newton Community Preservation Plan

Overarching Goals

| | |
|--|----------------|
| 1. Contribute to the preservation of Newton's unique character, boost the vitality of the community and enhance the quality of life for its residents. | Yes |
| 2. Serve more than one CPA category. | No |
| 3. Demonstrate the highest cost/benefit value relative to other proposals. | See below |
| 4. Leverage other public and/or private funds. | See below |
| 5. Preserve a resource or opportunity that would otherwise be lost. | Yes |
| 6. Create incentives for other private projects to occur. | No |
| 7. Show that a project is the most reasonable available option to achieve the objective. | Yes, see below |
| 8. Demonstrate strong community support. | See below |
| 9. Serve to equitably distribute CPA funds throughout the City. | Yes, see below |

Additional comments on selected goals:

Goal 3: Projects received during the October funding round included a high CPA request of \$1,000,000 and a low CPA request of \$19,250. Since the CPC is recommending a reduced amount of funding for this project due to the cost-savings anticipated as described above, the CPA cost for this project is \$15,000. The relative benefit for this project is the preservation and restoration of the Civil War Monument located in the Newton Cemetery. This monument is noted as an early example of Civil War memorial statuary, as its dedication occurred prior to the end of the war.

In terms of CPA cost related to all other historic preservation projects previously approved or currently in front of the Board of Aldermen, this project ranks 11th out of 13 total (of those historic preservation projects seeking funds for studies or designs, this project has the lowest cost along with the War Memorial Staircase project). The following table illustrates the comparative costs of historic preservation projects.

TABLE 1: CPA Project Costs (Historic Preservation)

| <i>Project Name</i> | <i>Fiscal Year</i> | <i>Total CPA Funds (for preservation portion only)</i> |
|---|--------------------|--|
| Historic Burying Ground Restoration – Phase IIa | 05 | \$257,395 |
| Newton Corner Library | 03 | \$236,129 |
| Historic Burying Ground Restoration – Phase I | 03 | \$188,277 |
| YMCA | 05 | \$160,273 |
| City Hall – Balustrade | 03 | \$150,660 |
| Washington Park Lighting | 05 | \$131,035 |
| City Hall – Lighting | 03 | \$121,200 |
| City Hall – Windows | 03 | \$119,400 |
| 248 Elliot Street/Linden Green | 05 | \$63,290 |
| Brigham House – Phase I* | 03 | \$20,000 |
| Civil War Monument* | 05 | \$15,000 |
| War Memorial Stairs* | 05 | \$15,000 |
| Historic District Signs | 04 | \$2,000 |

*Denotes projects requesting CPA funds to conduct a study or produce design documents in preparation for a larger preservation project.

Goal 4: Although this portion of the project (the design/engineering portion) does not include matching funds, other funding will be sought in addition to CPA funding for the construction phase, as outlined in the conditions the CPC recommended (see conditions below).

Goal 7: Combining this design work with the applicants' request to prepare designs for the preservation and restoration of the War Memorial Stair will save considerable money, as the specialists required to create both designs are the same. As such, the proposal represents the most reasonable available option to achieve the goals described in the application.

Goal 8: At the 16 November 2004 Public Hearing held by the CPC, no objections were expressed. The Newton Public Buildings Preservation Task Force includes members from the general public representing the historic preservation interests of the community. Charged with identifying Newton's preservation priorities, a certain level of community support is implied in projects the Task Force earmarks for funding.

Goal 9: The FY05 applications include funding requests for projects in Nonantum, Newton Corner, West Newton, Newtonville, Newton Upper Falls, Newton Center, Newton Highlands and Waban, as well as city-wide projects. The Civil War Monument is located in the Newton Cemetery, situated on the corner of Beacon and Walnut Streets in Newton Centre.

Historic Preservation Goals

| | |
|---|----------------|
| 1. Support the preservation and restoration of privately-owned properties that are on the National or State Historic Registers, or that have been landmarked or found to be "preferably preserved" by the Newton Historical Commission. | No |
| 2. Support the preservation and/or restoration of municipally-owned resources that are on the National or State Historic Registers, or that have been landmarked or found to be "preferably preserved" by the Newton Historical Commission. | No, see below |
| 3. Encourage protection of resources that retain their historic integrity, in terms of location, context, design, style, workmanship, and materials. | Yes |
| 4. Enable access to the resource by the public. | No |
| 5. Support the objectives and priorities of local historic preservation organizations, such as the Newton Historical Society, the Jackson Homestead, local historic districts, and other such organizations within the City of Newton. | Yes, see below |

Additional comments on selected goals:

Goal 2: While the Newton Cemetery is a private corporation, the City of Newton owns the land on which the City-owned Monument is sited. Although the Monument does not currently possess a specific historic designation, a determination of eligibility for the National Register of Historic Places must be sought before any subsequent applications requesting CPA funds for construction work will be considered, per the conditions of the CPC vote (see conditions below).

Goal 5: The Newton Public Buildings Preservation Task Force is comprised of individuals representing the interests and concerns of various historic preservation organizations throughout the City of Newton, including the Newton Historical Commission and the Newton History Museum. The Task Force has identified the Civil War Monument Restoration as one of its priorities because of the potential for further significant damage to this monument.

CPC RECOMMENDATION

The proposal is consistent with the CPA criteria and many of the Plan's goals, as described above. Therefore, the Community Preservation Committee voted unanimously to recommend funding this application to support the preservation and restoration of the Civil War Monument by appropriating and transferring \$15,000 to be expended under the direction and control of the Commissioner of Public Buildings for purposes of this project as detailed in the application (dated 15 October 2004), subject to the following conditions:

1. Prior to submitting an application requesting CPA funds for the restoration project, a legally enforceable mechanism protecting the CPA investment must be in place (e.g., a Preservation Ordinance for City-owned properties that requires the Newton Historical Commission to approve all major alterations or any demolition).
2. Prior to submitting an application requesting CPA funds for the restoration project, the Civil War Monument must be determined eligible for listing on the National Register of Historic Places.
3. Consideration of CPA funds for future work on the Civil War Monument will require the demonstration of a good-faith effort on the part of the applicants to substantially leverage other funding sources.
4. Work shall commence no later than 31 December 2005 and shall be completed no later than 31 December 2006 or such other date(s) as may be approved in writing by the Director of Planning and Development. In the event of failure to meet the project start or completion dates as stated herein or as approved by the Director of Planning and Development, any remaining funds in the project account shall be returned to the Newton Community Preservation Fund.
5. The funding recipient shall submit a status report to the CPC on a quarterly basis that describes work that is complete, work remaining, expenditures, and target completion date.
6. Any portion of the grant not used for the purposes stated herein shall be returned to the Newton Community Preservation Fund.