City of Newton



City of Newton, Massachusetts Community Preservation Committee



David B. Cohen Mayor

TO: Honorable Board of Aldermen

FROM: Community Preservation Committee

DATE: January 13, 2006

RE: CPC Recommendation for Funding

PROJECT TITLE: Crafts Street Stable Historic Preservation Study

CPA PROJECT ID: CPA-FY06-2

CPA CATEGORY: Historic Preservation **RECOMMENDED CPA FUNDING**: \$65,575

PROJECT DESCRIPTION:

The applicants, Department of Public Buildings and Department of Public Works, originally requested CPA funds for the Crafts Street Stable study in FY05. After careful consideration at that time, the CPC asked the applicants to further flesh out their proposal. The applicants resubmitted a more thorough proposal this year. The current request is for \$65,575 for an historic preservation study and design plan of the Crafts Street Stable building, located at 92 Crafts Street in Newtonville. The building is currently used as a hub for Public Works personnel who coordinate daily operations and to store DPW equipment. The Newton History Museum has expressed interest in excess storage space in the facility. The application states it is one of the few remaining Public Works buildings of its time still in use in the region.

The preservation study would produce plans to restore deteriorating exterior features such as masonry, doors and windows. CPA funds, if awarded, would pay for the services of a structural engineer, a preservation/conservation consultant, an energy auditor, a coordinating architect, \$675 of legal fees and a cost consultant (all totaled with a 10% contingency to \$65,575). These individuals would inspect the building for damage and deterioration and prepare plans and estimated costs for restoration. The energy audit would include an analysis of and recommendations for improvements to energy efficiency, indoor air quality and humidity, infiltration and HVAC system performance. If this study is funded, the applicants plan to return to the CPC at a later date to request funding for subsequent phases of work.

FINDINGS/PROJECT EVALUATION:

Community Preservation Act (MGL c.44B)

Historic Preservation

MGL c.44B defines an historic resource as "a building...that is listed or eligible for listing on the state register of historic places or has been determined by the local historic preservation commission to be significant..." Built in 1895, the Crafts Street Stable building is eligible for the State and National Register of Historic Places and Newton's Public Buildings Preservation Task Force has identified the Stable as a building of major significance.

Newton Community Preservation Plan

Overarching Goals

1. Contribute to the preservation of Newton's unique character, boost the vitality of the	Yes
community and enhance the quality of life for its residents.	
2. Serve more than one CPA category.	No
3. Demonstrate the highest cost/benefit value relative to other proposals.	See below
4. Leverage other public and/or private funds.	No, see below
5. Preserve a resource or opportunity that would otherwise be lost.	Yes
6. Show that a project is the most reasonable available option to achieve the objective.	Yes
7. Demonstrate strong community support.	See below
8. Serve to equitably distribute CPA funds throughout the City.	Yes, see below

Additional comments on selected goals:

Goal 3: The following table illustrates the comparative costs of historic preservation projects. The Crafts Street study request is more expensive than previous studies, but the stable is a large, historic building with unique features and masonry.

Project Name	Fiscal	Total CPA Funds (for
	Year	preservation portion only)
Historic Burying Ground		
Restoration – Phase II	05	\$257,395
Newton Corner Library	03	\$236,129
Historic Burying Ground		
Restoration – Phase I	03	\$188,277
YMCA	05	\$160,273
City Hall – Balustrade	03	\$150,660
Washington Park Lighting	05	\$131,035
City Hall – Lighting	03	\$121,200
City Hall – Windows	03	\$119,400
248 Elliot Street/Linden Green	05	\$63,290
Crafts Street Stable Study*	06	\$65,575
Farlow/Chaffin Park*	05	\$51,500
Millhouse Commons	05	\$41,653
City Hall Historic Landscape*	05	\$40,000
Newton Health Department		
Building Study*	06	\$26,425
Brigham House*	03	\$20,000
Civil War Monument*	05	\$15,000
War Memorial Stairs*	05	\$15,000
Historic District Signs	04	\$2,000

^{*}Denotes projects requesting CPA funds to conduct a study in preparation for a larger preservation project.

Goal 4: No additional funding sources are proposed to leverage CPA funds for the design study, however, the application states that additional funding sources "will be pursued vigorously," for the subsequent construction phase of the project.

Goal 7: There is support for this project by the Commissioner of Public Works and the Public Buildings Preservation Task Force, which includes representatives from the Board of Aldermen, the Chair of the Historical Commission, the Executive Director of the Newton History Museum and the City's Preservation Planner.

Goal 8: The FY06 applications include funding requests for projects in Nonantum, West Newton, Newtonville, Oak Hill, Newton Centre, Newton Highlands, Auburndale as well as citywide projects. The Crafts Street Stable is located in Newtonville.

Historic Preservation Goals

1. Support the preservation and/or restoration of municipally owned resources that are on the	Yes
National or State Historic Registers, or that have been landmarked, found to be "preferably	
preserved" or historically significant by the Newton Historical Commission.	
2. Support the preservation and restoration of privately owned properties that are on the National	No
or State Historic Registers, or that have been landmarked, found to be "preferably preserved" or	
historically significant by the Newton Historical Commission.	
3. Encourage protection of resources that retain their historical integrity, in terms of location,	Yes, see below
context, design, style, workmanship and materials.	
4. Enable access to the resource by the public, including access by disabled residents.	See below
5. Support the objectives and priorities of local historic preservation organizations, such as the	Yes
Newton Historical Society, the Newton History Museum, local historic districts and other such	
organizations within the City of Newton.	
6. Where appropriate, address the issues and goals raised in the forthcoming Citywide	See below
Preservation Plan, which is scheduled to be finalized in Fall 2005.	

Additional comments on selected goals:

Goal 3: The Crafts Street Stable is a historic structure that contains many historic features from its day, including a horse elevator. The building's windows and doors, including its overhead and passage ones, are typical of 1890s architecture. The original masonry retains its original character, but needs to be repointed and protected and waterproofed.

Goal 4: Presently, both the first floor and the basement of the Crafts Street Stable are accessible to the City's disabled residents. The building's second floor is not accessible. The current funding request would make no change in overall accessibility.

Goal 6: The City's Preservation Plan has not yet been finalized.

CPC RECOMMENDATION

The proposal is consistent with the CPA criteria and many of the Plan's goals, as outlined above. Therefore, the Community Preservation Committee voted unanimously to recommend funding the Crafts Street Stable Historic Preservation Study. The study would prepare a study and design plan to restore the building and improve energy-efficiency. The CPC recommends the requested \$65,575 be appropriated, transferred and expended under the direction and control of the Director of Planning and Development for the purposes of funding the Crafts Street Stable Historic Preservation Study as detailed in the application dated October 15, 2005, subject to the following conditions:

- 1. Prior to appropriation of any CPA funds, the Public Buildings Department shall identify a City project manager who will be responsible to issue the request for proposals and consultant contracts, authorize payments of invoices and generally oversee the project.
- 2. The City project manager shall submit a status report to the CPC on a quarterly basis that describes work that is complete, work remaining, expenditures and target completion date.
- 3. The design and restoration plans shall incorporate improved energy efficiency based on the results of an energy audit and shall account for the City's capacity to effectively maintain the facility over the long-term.
- 4. Prior to submitting an application requesting CPA funds for the restoration project, a legally enforceable mechanism protecting the CPA investment must be in place (e.g., a Preservation Ordinance for City-owned

- properties that requires the Newton Historical Commission to approve all major alterations or any demolition).
- 5. Prior to submitting a subsequent application for CPA funds for the restoration project, the plans shall be reviewed and approved by the Public Buildings Preservation Task Force.
- 6. Consideration of CPA funds for future phases will require the demonstration of a good-faith effort on the part of the applicant to substantially leverage other funding sources; provided, however, the applicant understands and agrees that CPC's recommendation of funding for this design plan does not imply any CPC support for, or any applicant expectation of, a further CPC recommendation for the funding of future project design or construction phases.
- 7. Work shall commence no later than December 31, 2006 and shall be completed no later than December 31, 2007 or such other date(s) as may be approved in writing by the Director of Planning and Development. In the event of failure to meet the project start or completion dates as stated herein or as approved by the Director of Planning and Development, any remaining funds in the project account shall be returned to the Newton Community Preservation Fund.
- 8. Promptly after substantial completion of the design work, the applicant shall submit to the Community Preservation Committee a final project development cost statement. Any portion of the grant not used for the purposes stated herein shall be returned to the Newton Community Preservation Fund.