NEWTON PUBLIC BUILDINGS SURVEY
PHASE II – ANALYSIS OF HISTORICAL SIGNIFICANCE

Building Analysis

Crafts Street Stable/Garage

Address: 90 Crafts Street
Year of Construction: 1895

Level of Significance: High
Individually listed building on the National Register of Historic Places, 2009.

Recommended Treatment Level: Preservation.

PART I - Analysis of Historical Significance

Building History

The Crafts Street City Stable is a two and a half story brick L-shaped structure with a steep hipped roof designed in the Colonial Revival Style by the architect William F. Goodwin. The building is the second of two stables constructed by the City of Newton in the mid-1890s to house the horses, wagons and other equipment owned by Newton's Highway Department. The first stable, at 91 Auburndale Avenue, was constructed in 1894, a year earlier than Crafts Street stable and served as the model for the design of the Crafts Street building.

The opening of the Circuit Railroad in 1886 and the resulting residential development in Newton increased the workload of the City's Highway Department (which later became a branch of the Department of Public Works). At the time of the Auburndale Avenue and Craft Street stables' construction the Highway Department employed over 200 men and owned 43 horses. Prior to the 1894 the Department's horses and equipment were scattered across the city, in rented space or with other city departments. Loss of some existing city stables due to the widening of Washington Street, and a desire to end its use of rented space spurred the Highway Department to construct its own facilities. The Auburndale Avenue stable, while accommodating the department's immediate needs, did not contain enough space for storage for all the City's equipment. With the construction of the second stable building on land owned by the Sewer Department on Crafts Street the Highway Department not only had enough room for their own horses and equipment, but also were able to board horses from other departments. In addition to 30 horse stalls and storage space for carriages, harnesses and grain the Crafts Street stable contained offices for the Highway Department and a machine shop. The building had gas and electric lighting and tinned fireproof doors and ceilings.

William F. Goodwin, designer of the Crafts Street building was a Boston architect and Newton resident. Goodwin is most well known for designing 109 East Canton Street in 1891, the fourth of four buildings in the Lawrence Model Lodging complex constructed by a philanthropic organization to house "poor, temperate, and industrious families" (listed on the National Register in 1983). Goodwin also designed multiple residences in the Aberdeen neighborhood of Allston-Brighton in 1892-3 and the Church of the Good Shepherd in Waban in 1896. In 1900 Goodwin formed a practice with Henry E. Siter and maintained an office at 8 Beacon Street.

The Auburndale Avenue and Crafts Street stables were adequate for the Highway Department's needs until the mid-1920s, when the Elliot Street Stable/Garage was built to serve the southern end of the city. At that time the Highway Department had approximately 70 horses, but already anticipated a time when horses would no longer be used and constructed the new building with removable stalls so that it could later be converted into a garage. In 1946 the stalls were removed from the Crafts Street building and that structure was also converted into a garage. The building is still in use by the Department of Public Works as a garage and storage facility

Level of Significance

The Crafts Street Stable was listed on the National Register of Historic Places in 2009 under Criterion A for its association with the municipal development of the City of Newton as well as under Criterion C as a distinctive example of a municipal stable in the Colonial Revival style. The building retains its integrity of location and design and the majority of its significant historic features.

References

Brighton Allston Historical Society. "Aberdeen History". <http://www.bahistory.org/AberdeenHist.html> (visited1, December 2011).

Cornish, Joseph P., Lara Kritzer, Paul Trudeau, and Brian Lever. "National Register of Historic Places Registration Form. Crafts Street City Stable." (2009).

Massachusetts Historical Commission, "Form B NWT.1643—90 Crafts Street" (1997, 1976).

Zaitzevsky, Cynthia. "Housing Boston's Poor: The First Philanthropic Experiments." *Journal of the Society of Architectural Historians* Vol. 42, No. 2, May 1983, 165-166.

PART I - Analysis of Historical Significance: Historic Images

Figure 1: Photograph of the Craft Street Stable in 1906 from the City of Newton Records. (Credit: Historic Newton).

Figure 2: Photograph of the Craft Street Stable in 1925 from the City of Newton Records. (Credit: Historic Newton).

Part 2 – Description of Historically Significant Features

Exterior Visual Character

Setting

- The building is set within a larger complex of Department of Public Work buildings.
- The site slopes down on either side of the building away from the street. This makes the street elevation appear a story shorter than the rest of the building.

Shape

- Two and a half story structure with an irregular "L" shaped footprint. A lower two-story ell structure (the former machine shop) is located at the center formed by the taller "L" shape. A small one-story extension (originally used for manure storage) is located at the west elevation.
- Elevations are non-symmetrical, with irregularly-spaced window bays.

Roof and Related Features

- Hipped slate roof with hipped dormers and an offset end-gable wall dormer over the original stable door at the street elevation.
- A truncated cupola is located at the roof of the rear leg of the "L".
- The roof has copper flashing, gutters and leaders and a copper soffit and fascia.
- A low chimney penetrates the roof of the west wing
- The machine shop ell structure has a flat roof and a narrow masonry chimney

Openings

- Original wood sashes are present at most openings.
- Windows at the first floor (and basement at rear and sides) are typically single rectangular openings with 9 or 12-over-2 wood sashes
- Second floor and dormer windows are typically 12 light wood hopper sashes.
- An oval window is set within the gable end at the street elevation.
- A large opening at the second floor level over the original stable door once allowed access to the hayloft. The original double doors (still present) have been covered with plywood.
- Door openings at the ground floor of the street elevation have been extensively modified. One of the two large openings has been infilled with plywood and stucco and a window opening with a concrete sill has been added within the infill. The other large opening has been enlarged and provided with a roll-down garage door. An original small door opening has been infilled with a double-hung window and an aluminum door adjacent to the roll-down door has been set into an enlarged original window opening. The "main" entrance door at the street elevation has also been inserted into an enlarged original window opening and has a wood door and transom.
- Retrofit garage doors are present at side and rear elevations.

Projections:

- A small non-original bracketed wood entrance canopy with an asphalt shingle roof is located over the street-side "main" door.
- A wood beam extends from the building just above the original hayloft door (below the oval window). A flagpole is installed on the beam
- A concrete ramp with modern railings leads to the garage door.

Trim and Secondary Features:

- The building has cut granite window sills and other granite trim.
- A stone tablet carved with "City Stable" is set into a brick frame on the wall over the infilled first floor entrance.

Materials

- Walls are brick that extends to grade except at the street elevation which has a granite foundation. Brick piers at the side elevations have granite caps.

Craft Details.

- The entire perimeter of the "L" shaped building has ornamental dentil brickwork at the top of the brick walls. The machine shop ell structure has a corbelled brick fascia.

Interior Visual Character

Individually Important Spaces

Office Wing and Ell Structure (Basement and Ground Floor)

- The office areas occupy the short leg of the "L"-shaped plan. The ell structure (the original machine shop) is located at the junction between the office and garage wings at the rear of the building.
- The ground floor and basement levels of the office wing have been extensively altered. Most materials at the ground floor are non-original and non-significant. It is possible some original finishes or features may be present under more modern finishes.
- Some of the exterior brick walls and interior brick bearing walls are exposed in the basement. The exposed brick has been painted.

Garage Wing (Basement and Ground Floor)

- Tongue and groove wood siding is visible at exterior walls and ceiling of ground floor garage space.
- Exposed wood structural elements are visible at the basement and ground floor. There are also many additional added steel structural elements, particularly at the basement level.

Attic

- The attic is primarily used for storage and remains largely unaltered from its original configuration. Significant remaining elements include:
    - Wide planked wood flooring.
    - Platform lift and associated hoist mechanisms set into the floor of the office wing and numerous trap doors set into the floor of the garage wing.
    - Exposed timber roof framing and wide wood plank roof sheathing.
    - Original rolling metal clad fire door at the brick wall between the attic space over the office wing and the attic space over the garage wing.
    - Original wood casings and chain hardware at the hopper windows.

Related Spaces

- Thick masonry walls separate the office wing, ell structure and garage wings from one another.

Other Significant Interior Features

- In addition to the significant architectural features many artifacts from the building's history such as old wheels, poles, shovels, etc. are still being stored in the attic space.

Part 2 – Images

Figure 3: Typical dormer: hip roof and walls clad in slate shingles with copper flashing. Note the two 12-light wood hopper windows

Figure 4: Attic interior. Note large platform lift set into the attic floor.

Figure 5: Oval window in brick frame at gable end. Note ornamental dentil brickwork at eave.

Figure 6: "City Stable" carved into a granite tablet surrounded by a brick frame

Part 3 – Treatment Recommendations

Preservation Treatment Level

The exterior of the Crafts Street Stable/Garage retains most of its original character-defining material, much of which is in fair condition. The interior, while more extensively altered, also retains a large amount of historic material, particularly at the attic level. As the overall degree of integrity for the building is high and the building is still being used for its original purpose the "Preservation" level of treatment outlined in the U. S. Secretary of the Interior's *Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties* is most appropriate. While acknowledging the need for work as required to meet building codes, accommodate existing uses and improve energy efficiency, the emphasis of this treatment is to protect significant historic elements through maintenance and repair and replacement of materials is minimized. Significant features listed in Part 2 should be protected as much as possible.

The following bulleted list contains an analysis of existing conditions and recommended treatments for the significant features catalogued in Part 2 of this report.

Exterior Recommendations

Critical/Urgent (Timeframe: As soon as possible)

- Inspect the condition of the roof and flashing. Repair broken slates at roof and dormer sidewalls and repair or replace damaged copper flashing elements. Repair the detached flashing over the shed roof at the street elevation entrance
- Address the condition of the extremely deteriorated concrete roof structure of the one-story extension at the rear elevation.

First Priority (Timeframe: 1-3 years)

- Conduct a thorough survey of window conditions, including sash, frame and hardware. The original windows should be retained to the largest extent possible, repaired and made weathertight. Deteriorated elements such as the sills should be replaced in kind and areas of minor deterioration should be repaired with dutchmen or through consolidation. Glazing putty will need to be replaced. The wood should be stripped and repainted in a color matching the original color. Windows that are too deteriorated to repair should be replaced in kind.
- Repair areas of damaged copper at the cupola and remove mastic that has been applied to the slate below.
- Repair areas of damaged copper at the soffit and fascia at the building perimeter.
- Modify the slope of the concrete landing adjacent to the main entrance door at the street elevation so that it drains away from the building wall. Clean the large amounts of efflorescence present at base of brick wall at that location.
- Rebuild areas of damaged brick at rear corners of building.
- Clean and repoint the masonry at all elevations 100%.

Second Priority (Timeframe: 3-5 years)

- Replace deteriorated roll-down garage doors with doors with a more historically appropriate design.
- Remove cementitious patches and re-patch spalled areas at the granite foundation adjacent to concrete ramp at the east elevation with composite patching mortar.

Maintenance (Timeframe: Ongoing)

- Continue regular maintenance of character-defining features. Elements that become deteriorated should be repaired or replaced in kind.
- Maintain all gutters, leaders and drains to keep clog-free.

Interior Recommendations

Critical/Urgent (Timeframe: As soon as possible)

First Priority (Timeframe: 1-3 years)

Second Priority (Timeframe: 3-5 years)

- As alterations are required investigate if additional historic features or materials are present below the existing contemporary finishes. As the space is renovated consider how these features can be retained or preserved. Alterations should be sensitive to the original design and should strive to retain as much of the original material still present as possible.

Maintenance (Timeframe: Ongoing)

- Continue regular maintenance of character-defining features. Elements that become deteriorated should be repaired or replaced in kind.