

Ruthanne Fuller

Mayor

City of Newton, Massachusetts

Department of Planning and Development 1000 Commonwealth Avenue Newton, Massachusetts 02459 Telephone (617) 796-1120 Telefax (617) 796-1142 TDD/TTY (617) 796-1089 www.newtonma.gov

Barney S. Heath Director

# MINUTES OF PUBLIC MEETING AND PUBLIC HEARINGS CHESTNUT HILL HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

DATE:	May 21, 2020
PLACE/TIME:	Fully Remote
ATTENDING:	John Wyman, Chair Brett Catlin, Member Robert Imperato, Member Susana Lannik, Member Matthew Montgomery, Member Peter Vieira, FAIA, Vice Chair Barbara Kurze, Commission Staff
ABSENT:	Rick Wetmore, Member Samuel Perry, Alternate Ed Zielinski, Alternate

The fully remote meeting was called to order at 7:00 p.m. with John Wyman presiding as Chair. Voting permanent members were B. Catlin, R. Imperato, S. Lannik, M. Montgomery, and P. Vieira. B. Kurze acted as recording secretary and the meeting was recorded on Zoom.

# 8, 18 and 26 Nancy Road – Certificate of Appropriateness (Violations)

Keisuke Wakao, Michael Simon and Ali and Marina Banuazizi presented applications to get approval for the gravel paths with cobblestone borders, cobblestone aprons, bands and steps, and bluestone paving steps that were installed without Commission review and approval. The owners wanted to have safer sidewalks along Nancy Road and Reservoir Avenue.

<u>Materials Reviewed:</u> Assessors database maps MHC Form Bs Site plans with sketches showing hardscaping Photographs

J. Wyman noted that the Commission had to treat this as a new project. There were many similar pathways already installed on Nancy Road; it was a private way which the City did not maintain, and City sidewalk

standards did not apply. The previous asphalt walkways had greatly deteriorated. Commission members agreed that the walkways made it easier to walk and did not have any major issues with the work. P. Vieira said that the design guidelines encouraged permeable surfaces. M. Montgomery did note that some of the elements like the aprons really stood out, but he could support the work. J. Wyman moved to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness for the applications as submitted. S. Lannik seconded the motion. There was a roll call vote and the motion passed unanimously, 5-0.

## **RECORD OF ACTION:**

DATE: May 26, 2020 SUBJECT: 8, 18 and 26 Nancy Road – Certificate of Appropriateness (Violations)

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on May 21, 2020 the Chestnut Hill Historic District Commission, by roll call vote of <u>5-0</u>,

**RESOLVED** to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness for the applications as submitted for <u>8 Nancy Road</u>, <u>18 Nancy Road</u>, <u>and 26 Nancy Road</u> for the modifications to the sidewalks and driveways.

Voting in the Affirmative:

John Wyman, Chair Brett Catlin, Member Susana Lannik, Member Matthew Montgomery, Member Peter Vieira, Member

## 8 Nancy Road – Renewal of Certificate of Appropriateness

Keisuke Wakao presented an application to renew the Certificate of Appropriateness granted in 2015 for the stone veneer on the front elevation of the house and garage. He showed the previously approved option, and two new options for the veneer.

<u>Materials Reviewed:</u> Photographs 2015 approved project documents

Commission members agreed that the Certificate of Appropriateness could be renewed and preferred the stone veneer sample shown at the top of page 69 of 389 in the packet materials. J. Wyman moved to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness for the application as submitted with requirements. B. Catlin seconded the motion. There was a roll call vote and the motion passed unanimously, 5-0.

## **RECORD OF ACTION:**

DATE: May 22, 2020 SUBJECT: 8 Nancy Road – Renewal of Certificate of Appropriateness

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on May 21, 2020 the Chestnut Hill Historic District Commission, by roll call vote of <u>5-0</u>,

**RESOLVED** to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness for the application as submitted for <u>8 Nancy Road</u> to renew the Certificate of Appropriateness that was granted on November 19, 2015 to apply a stone veneer to the front elevation of the house and garage with the requirement that the stone veneer will be per the top sample shown on page 69 of 389 of the May 2020 meeting packet documents.

Voting in the Affirmative:

John Wyman, Chair Matthew Montgomery, Member

Brett Catlin, Member Peter Vieira, Member

Susana Lannik, Member

## 40 Acacia Avenue – Certificate of Appropriateness (Violation)

Matt Hunt presented an application to use evergreen plantings to screen the HVAC equipment that was in violation. He said it would be difficult to move the equipment without damaging it.

Materials Reviewed: Photographs

J. Wyman said the Commission had approved different solutions for screening, including evergreen plantings. P. Vieira noted that not every project had a successful outcome. Commission members agreed evergreen plantings that were tall enough to screen the units immediately would be appropriate. J. Wyman moved to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness for the application as submitted with requirements. S. Lannik seconded the motion. There was a roll call vote and the motion passed unanimously, 5-0.

## **RECORD OF ACTION:**

DATE: May 22, 2020 SUBJECT: 40 Acacia Avenue – Certificate of Appropriateness (Violation)

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on May 21, 2020 the Chestnut Hill Historic District Commission, by roll call vote of <u>5-0</u>,

**RESOLVED** to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness for the mitigation plan to screen the two condensers on the left side of the house that are in violation at <u>40 Acacia Avenue</u>. The Certificate of Appropriateness for the condensers that are in violation will be issued only after the plantings have been installed and the Commission has verified that the condensers are screened from the public way. The applicant will notify Staff when the plantings have been installed, the individual commission members will do a site inspection, and the condenser application will be voted on at the following meeting.

Voting in the Affirmative:

John Wyman, Chair Matthew Montgomery, Member Brett Catlin, Member Susana Lannik, Member Peter Vieira, Member

## 40 Acacia Avenue – Certificate of Appropriateness

Matt Hunt presented a project to extend the driveway extension, install a parking area and hardscaping behind the house, and build a shed. The owners also wanted to expand the footprint of the rear deck.

<u>Materials Reviewed:</u> Detailed project description with proposed products and materials Site plan Photographs Floor plan marked to show deck change Elevations marked to show deck change

J. Wyman said the deck expansion and would not change the view of the back of the property. J. Wyman moved to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness for the application as submitted for deck expansion. S. Lannik seconded the motion. There was a roll call vote and the motion passed unanimously, 5-0.

Commission members agreed that the driveway work, patio, and walkways would not be visible. There was discussion about the proposed shed. Commission members wanted a simple shed design with the gable end facing Acacia Avenue and materials and colors to match the house. M. Hunt said he would send an email agreeing to continue the hearing on the shed. J. Wyman moved to grant a Certificate of Non-Applicability for

the application as submitted for driveway extension, patio, and walkways. B. Catlin seconded the motion. There was a roll call vote and the motion passed unanimously, 5-0.

#### **RECORD OF ACTION:**

DATE: May 28, 2020 **SUBJECT:** 40 Acacia Avenue – Certificate of Appropriateness

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on May 21, 2020 the Chestnut Hill Historic District Commission, by roll call vote of 5-0,

RESOLVED to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness for the application as submitted at 40 Acacia Avenue for the expanded deck at the rear of the property.

Voting in the Affirmative:

John Wyman, Chair Matthew Montgomery, Member Brett Catlin, Member Susana Lannik, Member Peter Vieira, Member

**RECORD OF ACTION:** 

DATE: May 28, 2020 SUBJECT: 40 Acacia Avenue – Certificate of Non-Applicability

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on May 21, 2020 the Chestnut Hill Historic District Commission, by roll call vote of 5-0. RESOLVED to grant a Certificate of Non-Applicability for the application as submitted at 40 Acacia Avenue to expand the

driveway and parking area and build walkways.

Voting in the Affirmative:

John Wyman, Chair Matthew Montgomery, Member

Brett Catlin, Member Susana Lannik, Member Peter Vieira, Member

R. Imperato entered the meeting.

## 525 Hammond Street – Certificate of Appropriateness

Sanda Alexandrescu presented an application to remove an existing fence section and add six-foot-tall stockade fencing and gates to close off the backyard.

Materials Reviewed: MHC Form B Assessors database map with aerial view Project description Photographs Fence plan

J. Wyman summarized the history of the existing violations for the driveway move and stockade fencing along Hammond Street and the requirements of the Newton fence ordinances. The existing violations needed to be addressed before new applications could be considered. He commented that the current owners inherited a problem created by the former owner; the Commission had reviewed the issues with the previous owner, but there was no enforcement. There were also unique conditions for this property and the adjacent one; they were the only two properties south of the Riverside MBTA line bridge and had to contend with unique traffic conditions. Commission members supported granting a Certificate of Hardship; however, the current owners needed to submit an application requesting approval of the fencing in violation. The owner agreed to send an

application to Staff. J. Wyman moved to grant a Certificate of Hardship for the violations upon receipt of a signed application. S. Lannik seconded the motion. There was a roll call vote and the motion passed unanimously, 6-0.

There was discussion about the proposed new fencing along the back of the property. Visible tall closed board fencing was not appropriate; one of the characteristics of the district was the open space and a lower, open picket fence that did not obstruct views would be appropriate. Commission members wanted to see examples of what would be proposed. The owner would send an email to Staff agreeing to continue the review to a future meeting.

## **RECORD OF ACTION:**

**DATE:** May 28, 2020 **SUBJECT:** 525 Hammond Street – Approval to Issue a Certificate of Hardship Upon Receipt of Application

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on May 21, 2020 the Chestnut Hill Historic District Commission, by roll call vote of <u>6-0</u>,

**RESOLVED** to issue a Certificate of Hardship for the stockade fence and relocated driveway at <u>525 Hammond Street</u> upon receipt of a signed application from the current owners. The current owners had no knowledge of the violation until after they had completed the purchase of the property. The Commission did have knowledge of the violation as early as 2007 and dealt with the previous owner, but no action was taken by the Commission or the City to enforce the fence ordinance or mitigate the violation.

Voting in the Affirmative:

John Wyman, ChairBrett Catlin, MemberSusana Lannik, MemberMatthew Montgomery, Member

Robert Imperato, Member Peter Vieira, Member

## 521 Hammond Street – Certificate of Appropriateness

The review was continued from previous meetings. Sam Reiche presented an application to build a two-car garage and a new asphalt driveway with an 18-foot by 18-foot parking area and a cobblestone circle. Hardscaping would be installed, including a granite stone terrace by the garage, a granite wall, and steps, and three granite step stone paths. The owners also wanted to install new windows in the existing garage window openings, and new lights at the entry porch.

Materials Reviewed: Assessors database map MHC Form B Photographs Site plans Elevations Details Exterior views Product and material specifications

Commission members agreed that the garage was appropriate except for the steel garage doors and the white screens on the windows. They were concerned about the amount of hardscaping on a property that had a rural character, some of the design elements, and the proposed asphalt. The owner agreed to stake out the property for a site visit and to continue the review for the garage door and hardscaping. Commission members agreed that the new windows and exterior lights were appropriate. J. Wyman moved to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness for the two-car garage except for the steel garage doors and with conditions for the new windows. M. Montgomery seconded the motion. There was a roll call vote and the motion passed

unanimously, 6-0. J. Wyman moved to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness for the asphalt driveway and parking area. M. Montgomery seconded the motion. There was a roll call vote and the motion was denied, 0-5, with one abstention. J. Wyman moved to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness for the new windows and exterior lights. B. Catlin seconded the motion. There was a roll call vote and the motion passed unanimously, 6-0.

## **RECORD OF ACTION:**

DATE: May 29, 2020 SUBJECT: 521 Hammond Street – Certificate of Appropriateness

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on May 21, 2020 the Chestnut Hill Historic District Commission, by roll call vote of 6-0,

RESOLVED to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness for the application as submitted at 521 Hammond Street to build a two-car garage with the exception of the steel garage doors and the white window screens which are not appropriate, and to install new light fixtures on the east entry. The window screens for the new windows are required to be a dark color. The applicants must submit an amendment for wood garage doors to the Commission for review and approval.

Voting in the Affirmative:

John Wyman, Chair	Brett Catlin, Member
Susana Lannik, Member	Matthew Montgomery, Member

Robert Imperato, Member Peter Vieira, Member

## **OF ACTION:**

DATE: May 29, 2020 **SUBJECT:** 521 Hammond Street – Certificate of Appropriateness

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on May 21, 2020 the Chestnut Hill Historic District Commission, by roll call vote of 0-5 with one abstention, voted against approving the application to install an asphalt driveway, turnaround, and parking area,

RESOLVED to deny a Certificate of Appropriateness for the application as submitted at 521 Hammond Street to install an asphalt driveway, turnaround, and parking area. Commission members said that there was not enough information provided to confirm that the long driveway and amount of paved area was appropriate and was the best option.

## Voting in the Negative (against approving the application and for denving a Certificate of

Appropriateness):

John Wyman, Chair Brett Catlin, Member Susana Lannik, Member Peter Vieira. Member Robert Imperato, Member

#### Abstained: Matthew Montgomery, Member

# **RECORD OF ACTION:**

DATE: May 29, 2020 **SUBJECT:** 521 Hammond Street – Certificate of Appropriateness

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on May 21, 2020 the Chestnut Hill Historic District Commission, by roll call vote of 6-0,

**RESOLVED** to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness for the application as submitted at 521 Hammond Street to add windows to the former attached garage and house as set forth in drawing A1.05.

#### Voting in the Affirmative:

John Wyman, Chair Brett Catlin, Member Robert Imperato, Member

Susana Lannik, Member Matthew Montgomery, Member Peter Vieira, Member

## 190 Chestnut Hill Road – Working Session

Richard Streetman presented an application to renovate the carriage house and convert it to a dwelling.

Materials Reviewed: Assessors database map MHC Form B **Project description** Plans Elevations Views Photographs

The Commission only had jurisdiction over exterior features visible from the public way for this property. Commission members agreed that the project was appropriate but not visible from the public way; they were also in favor of creating accessory apartments. J. Wyman said traditional doors were more appropriate than the deck entry sliders. P. Vieira thought a large shed roof would be better. J. Wyman moved to grant a Certificate of Non-Applicability for the project as submitted. M. Montgomery seconded the motion. There was a roll call vote and the motion passed unanimously, 6-0. J. Wyman moved to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness for the asphalt driveway and parking area. M. Montgomery seconded the motion. There was a roll call vote and the motion passed unanimously, 6-0.

## **RECORD OF ACTION:**

DATE: May 29, 2020 SUBJECT: 190 Chestnut Hill Road – Certificate of Non-Applicability

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on May 21, 2020 the Chestnut Hill Historic District Commission, by roll call vote of 6-0,

RESOLVED to grant a Certificate of Non-Applicability for the application as submitted at 190 Chestnut Hill Road to convert the carriage house to a dwelling unit. The project would not be visible from a public way and the Commission can only make non-binding recommendations for this property for changes that are only visible from the private ways. Voting in the Affirmative:

John Wyman, Chair Brett Catlin, Member Susana Lannik, Member Matthew Montgomery, Member Robert Imperato, Member Peter Vieira, Member

# 152 Suffolk Road – Certificate of Appropriateness (Violations)

Alexander Bushoy, Alexander Zalfond and Brad Broderick presented two applications to address existing violations. The reviews were continued from the April meeting. They presented the proposed stain for the fence sections between 152 and 100 Suffolk Road. The proposed stain was a semi-transparent Cabot 16306 neutral base Dark Slate color, and the fence section farthest away from Suffolk Road had been stained as a sample for Commission members to review. They also presented the revised design to rebuild the balustrade and change the trim on the single-car garage bay.

Materials Reviewed: Fence photographs Sample section on the existing fence Drawing of garage balustrade Photograph with mock-up of proposed balustrade

Commission members agreed that the darker stain color was an improvement and recommended a second coat to make sure the orange color was covered. J. Wyman moved to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness for the stain color for the entire fence to remove the violation. S. Lannik seconded the motion. There was a roll call vote and the motion passed unanimously, 6-0. Commission members agreed that the revised design for the balustrade and trim were appropriate. J. Wyman moved to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness for the revised design. S. Lannik seconded the motion. There was a roll call vote and the motion passed unanimously, 6-0.

#### **RECORD OF ACTION:**

**DATE:** June 15, 2020 **SUBJECT:** 152 Suffolk Road – Certificate of Appropriateness (Violation)

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on May 21, 2020 the Chestnut Hill Historic District Commission, by roll call vote of <u>6-0</u>,

**RESOLVED** to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness for the mitigation plan at <u>152 Suffolk Road</u> to apply the semitransparent stain on the entire fence on the left side of the property between 100 Suffolk Road and 152 Suffolk Road to remove the violation.

Voting in the Affirmative:

John Wyman, ChairBrett Catlin, MemberSusana Lannik, MemberMatthew Montgomery, Member

Robert Imperato, Member Peter Vieira, Member

## **RECORD OF ACTION:**

**DATE:** June 15, 2020 **SUBJECT:** 152 Suffolk Road – Certificate of Appropriateness (Violation)

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on May 21, 2020 the Chestnut Hill Historic District Commission, by roll call vote of <u>6-0</u>,

**RESOLVED** to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness for the mitigation plan at <u>152 Suffolk Road</u> to modify the as-built balustrade and trim on the single-car garage bay per drawing A.107 dated May 6, 2020 to remove the violation.

Voting in the Affirmative:

John Wyman, ChairBrett Catlin, MemberSusana Lannik, MemberMatthew Montgomery, Member

Robert Imperato, Member Peter Vieira, Member

#### **Administrative Discussion**

Minutes: The March 19<sup>th</sup> and March 25<sup>th</sup> meeting minutes were approved.

<u>Commission election</u>: J. Wyman announced that he was stepping down as Chair after over 26 years; he would continue on the Commission as a member. Commission members needed to vote for Chair, Vice Chair, and Secretary at the July meeting.

The meeting was adjourned at 11:30 p.m.

Recorded by Barbara Kurze, Senior Preservation Planner