



Ruthanne Fuller
Mayor

City of Newton, Massachusetts
Department of Planning and Development
1000 Commonwealth Avenue Newton, Massachusetts 02459

Telephone
(617) 796-1120
Telefax
(617) 796-1142
TDD/TTY
(617) 796-1089
www.newtonma.gov

Barney S. Heath
Director

**MINUTES OF PUBLIC MEETING AND PUBLIC HEARINGS
NEWTONVILLE HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION**

DATE: October 1, 2020

PLACE/TIME: Full Remote Zoom Meeting
7:30 p.m.

ATTENDING: Jim Gross, Chair
Ralph Abele, Member
Mark Chudy, Member
John Martin, Member
Dave Morton, Member
Barbara Wales, Member
Tarik Lucas, Alternate
Peter Mooradian, Alternate
Barbara Kurze, Commission Staff

ABSENT: Nancy Grissom, Member

The meeting was called to order at 7:30 p.m. with Jim Gross presiding as Chair. Voting permanent members were R. Abele, M. Chudy, J. Martin, D. Morton, and B. Wales. Alternate T. Lucas was appointed to vote as full member. M. Chudy recused himself from the working session for 34 Prescott Street and P. Mooradian was appointed to participate in the working session for 34 Prescott Street. B. Kurze acted as recording secretary and the meeting was digitally recorded on Zoom.

161 Walnut Street – Certificate of Hardship (Violation)

This review was continued from previous meetings. Benny Lu presented an application for a Certificate of Hardship for the enclosure of the second-story three-season porch and the new windows which were in violation as the Commission had not reviewed or approved the project. He explained that it would cost about \$10,000 to change the window program to bring back the appearance of the original porch. He also said that having that many windows was uncomfortable; the room was either too cold or too hot.

Materials Reviewed:

Photographs of Existing
Photographs of Historic
Quote to replace existing enclosure and windows

Staff explained that in order to grant a Certificate of Hardship, the Commission had to find that ALL of the following criteria applied: 1) there was a substantial hardship (for example, financial, safety); and 2) there was no substantial detriment to the public welfare; and 3) there was no substantial derogation from the intent and purposes of the Commission which is to promote the preservation and protection of the distinctive characteristics of buildings and places in the district.

Commission members agreed that the change was inappropriate and altered the historic character of the house; there would be substantial derogation from the intent and purposes of the Commission if the Commission granted a certificate of hardship. There was discussion about the estimate; Commission members did not think there was a case for substantial hardship. B. Wales said the Commission had required other owners to fix windows and other work that was in violation. T. Lucas said that the application did not meet the three conditions required to make the case for hardship. J. Gross moved to grant a Certificate of Hardship for the enclosure of the second-story three-season porch and the new windows. There was no second. J. Gross moved to deny a Certificate of Hardship for the enclosure of the second-story three-season porch and the new windows because the application did not meet the criteria for hardship. D. Morton seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously, 7-0. Commission members said the owner needed to come back to the Commission with an application to bring back the three-season porch or to present a new design that was similar.

RECORD OF ACTION:

DATE: October 2, 2020

SUBJECT: 161 Walnut Street – Certificate of Hardship (Violation)

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on October 1, 2020 the Newtonville Historic District Commission, by roll call vote of 7-0,

RESOLVED to deny a Certificate of Hardship for the work that was done at 161 Walnut Street without Commission approval to enclose the second-story porch on the back left of the house. The criteria for hardship were not met. The case was not made for substantial financial and personal hardship and the Commission would be in derogation of their duties to preserve the historic character of the house. The enclosure substantially reduced the openness of that area and changed the historic character of the house.

Voting in the Affirmative (to deny a Certificate of Hardship):

Jim Gross, Chair	Ralph Abele, Member	Mark Chudy, Member
John Martin, Member	David Morton, Member	Barbara Wales, Member
Tarik Lucas, Alternate		

M. Chudy recused himself and P. Mooradian was appointed to participate in the review as a full member.

34 Prescott Street – Working Session

Terry Morris presented an application for feedback on a project to renovate the carriage house and convert it to a single-family unit.

Materials Reviewed:

Photographs
Plans

The front was very visible from Prescott Street. B. Wales wanted the existing window and door openings to be maintained; the large door openings should have the look of a carriage door. D. Morton wanted the larger

openings to maintain their relationship, but he was fine with smaller elements being moved. J. Martin said that the style of the carriage house was a wonderful example of high Victorian and that the design and materials should not be compromised. He wanted to see the openings preserved; the applicants could be creative in filling them. He proposed either high Victorian elements or more contemporary if it was well done. If new garage structures were proposed, they should use the same high Victorian architectural language. Abutters Marcie Campbell and Andrew Armsby at 16 Prescott Street were in favor of the project but were concerned about privacy. Neighbor Virginia Hinrichsen was in favor of the project and asked that the applicants keep her in the loop as the project moved forward.

Administrative Discussion

Minutes: The August meeting minutes were approved.

The meeting was adjourned at 9:00 p.m.

Recorded by B. Kurze, Senior Preservation Planner