



Ruthanne Fuller
Mayor

City of Newton, Massachusetts
Department of Planning and Development
1000 Commonwealth Avenue Newton, Massachusetts 02459

Telephone
(617) 796-1120
Telefax
(617) 796-1142
TDD/TTY
(617) 796-1089
www.newtonma.gov

Barney S. Heath
Director

**MINUTES OF PUBLIC MEETING AND PUBLIC HEARINGS
NEWTON HISTORICAL COMMISSION**

DATE: July 23, 2020

PLACE/TIME: Via Zoom

| | | |
|-------------------|---------------------------------|--|
| ATTENDING: | Nancy Grissom, Chairman | Doug Cornelius, Member |
| | Peter Dimond, Member | Mark Armstrong, Member |
| | Katie Kubie, Member | Jennifer Bentley-Houston, Alternate |
| | Ellen Klapper, Alternate | Katy Hax Holmes, Staff |
| | See Attendance List | |

ABSENT: Amanda Stauffer Park, Member
Deborah Budd, Alternate

The meeting was called to order via Zoom at 7:00 p.m. with Nancy Grissom serving as Chairman. Voting permanent members were Dimond, Cornelius, Armstrong, and Kubie. Bentley-Houston and Klapper were designated to vote as alternates. Katy Hax Holmes acted as Zoom host and the meeting was digitally recorded on the Zoom device.

1. **57 Cherry Place – Demolition Review (Ward 3)**
Request to demolish buildings

Omar Youseff presented his plan to demolish this house and build a new single-family home in its place. He defined the architectural deficiencies in the house, and listed the number of other homes in the immediate vicinity that had been let go by the commission.

Staff reported that this two-story shingled cottage was built c.1850 and was likely constructed by James H. Gaw, a laborer and Irish immigrant. The house appears as a dot at this location on an 1856 map of Newton, and Gaw appears in the 1868 Newton directory as living at this location. He continued to live here until at least 1901, when he is shown as living at 260 Adams Avenue, but many other Gaw family members continued to live on this cul de sac at numbers 48, 45, and 18 Cherry Place. James Gaw died in 1903. Patrick J. Mullins, a plasterer, bought the house in 1905 but lived at 220 Cherry Street and likely rented it. Gaw family members continued to reside on Cherry Place, with the last one appearing in the 1911 directory at #48. By that year the owner was Llewellyn W. Chase, an engineer.

John S. Shaughnessy, a carpenter, bought the property by 1925 and his family lived here for over 40 years. Three owners have lived at this address since that time. The imbricated shingling is a later alteration. The house had a rear addition when it was surveyed for water service in 1887, and smaller ones have been added since. Windows have been replaced throughout, some with windows of different sizes. This is a very old street, and many of the homes from the mid to late-19th century are still in evidence; but there is also evidence of new construction on Cherry Place. This house is historically, but not necessarily architecturally significant. Staff recommended preferably preserving the property for historic context.

Commission members discussed whether this was a notable c.1850 candidate for preservation. Abutters at 62 Cherry Place, 58 Cherry Place, and 61 Cherry Place spoke in support of letting the house go.

Cornelius made a motion to preferably preserve the property at 57 Cherry Place. Dimond seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on July 23rd, 2020, the Newton Historical Commission, by a vote of 0-7:

RESOLVED to preferably preserve the property at 57 Cherry Place.

| <u>Voting in the Affirmative:</u> | <u>Voting in the Negative:</u> | <u>Did not vote:</u> |
|-----------------------------------|-------------------------------------|----------------------|
| | Nancy Grissom, Chairman | |
| | Peter Dimond, Member | |
| | Doug Cornelius, Member | |
| | Katie Kubie, Member | |
| | Mark Armstrong, Member | |
| | Ellen Klapper, Alternate | |
| | Jennifer Bentley-Houston, Alternate | |

The motion did not pass. The property at 57 Cherry Place is not preferably preserved.

2. **575 Boylston Street, PR – Partial Demolition Review (Ward 6)**
Request to construct addition. Preservation Restriction

Amit Shah, architect, described the proposed addition on this building.

Staff reported that this Greek Revival Style house, constructed c.1850, stands at what was once the main route from Boston to Worcester, now Boylston Street, and is notable as one of the few agricultural farmsteads from this period still standing in Newton. A Preservation Restriction was signed in 1992 by the owner and the City to preserve key features of the historic building, which appear in Exhibit B and described here. Key Features outlined in the Preservation Restriction must be reviewed by the Newton Historical Commission before any building permit is issued. Proposed alterations will be made to the north side of the building to accommodate an additional office, exam room and a storage room, and will require relocating the ADA ramp.

Exhibit B: (historical and architectural description of key features that describe the Premises)

“The five-bay, two and one-half story Greek Revival building is situated on a triangle bordered by Route 9 on the south, Parker Street on the west, and Jackson Street on the north. The building is domestic in scale recalling its early history as a ca. 1850 dwelling or farmhouse situated on what was the main route from Boston to Worcester, Boylston Street so named in 1809. It is one of only a few extant examples of mid-nineteenth century farmhouse architecture in Newton. The dwelling was converted to a small neighborhood store in the early 1900s.

The former Greek Revival farmhouse, which has been rehabilitated, retains its domestic scale and symmetry on the two prominent facades facing south and west. The recent additions on the east and north sides are in keeping with the mid-nineteenth century building in scale and style. Built on a granite block foundation and concrete foundation for the additions, the building is sheathed in wood shingles and has unadorned wood trim including window frames, corner boards and wide cornice. All windows have flat wood frames and one-over-one sash.

The main or west five-bay facade is marked by the hipped roof porch which wraps to the north side. The porch is supported by plain square wood posts and has a simple balustrade. The center entrance is flanked by full side lights and narrow fluted pilasters with molded capitals supporting a plain entablature with center key design.

The south side facing Route 9 displays the templar gable end of the original structure and a two-story rear ell all on granite foundation and a two-bay, one-story ell addition that has two pediment dormers. The marked feature of the south side is the hipped roof open entrance porch supported by heavy fluted tapered columns with narrow square bases and caps. The entrance porch leads to a wood paneled door with four-light transom.

On the north side, parallel to the wrap porch, is a newly constructed architectural access for people with disabilities. At the rear on the north side is a square addition projecting from the corner of the two-story rear ell of the buildings. This square tower-like section has a hipped roof and an entrance similar to the main structure with a six-panel door and fluted pilasters supporting a simple entablature.

The east side, which is not visible from the public way, displays the end of the additions and has entrance doors similar to the one in the square addition visible on the north side. There is one large round window in the second story of the east end of the building.”

Commission members asked about setbacks and dimensions of the addition. Architectural details were also discussed, and a request was made to remove the circular windows that were proposed.

Armstrong made a motion to approve the addition as proposed, with the exception of the circular windows. These may be replaced by rectangular or square windows. A materials list must be provided and approved by staff. Klapper seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on July 23rd, 2020, the Newton Historical Commission, by a vote of 7-0:

RESOLVED to approve the addition as proposed, with the exception of the circular windows. These may be replaced by rectangular or square windows. A materials list must be provided and approved by staff.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative: Did not vote:

Nancy Grissom, Chairman
Peter Dimond, Member
Doug Cornelius, Member
Katie Kubie, Member
Mark Armstrong, Member
Ellen Klapper, Alternate
Jennifer Bentley-Houston, Alternate

3. **55 Rosalie Road – Demolition Review (Ward 8)**

Request to demolish buildings

Anita Rubin, current owner of this property, presented her plan to sell it to someone who would then tear it down. She told the commission her house needed work and that she didn't think it was special.

Staff reported that this house was built in 1928 by Donald Duffie and designed by a relative, Harold R. Duffie, an architect who worked prolifically in Boston in the early 1900s designing Colonial Revival and Craftsman-esque single-family, multi-family and apartment buildings. Harold Duffie served in WWI and was a life-long resident of the Boston area. The original owner was Arnold Hartmann, who in the early 1900s was largely responsible for creating house lots in the vicinity of Oak Hill and Brown Middle Schools. One other Duffie-designed house is known to exist in Newton, at 20 Acacia Avenue in the Chestnut Hill Local Historic District. In Brookline, there are two, at 91 Crowninshield Road and 220 Wolcott Road. MACRIS shows 36 others, most of which are in Boston.

From recent research conducted on 220 Wolcott Road in Brookline, Harold Duffie (1894-1977) was a long-term resident of Boston and graduated from the Longfellow School. He was practicing architecture by 1918. After Duffie returned from the first World War, where he served in France, Duffie became active as a residential and commercial architect, mostly in the rapidly growing communities of Roslindale, West Roxbury and Jamaica Plain. Among his work are dozens of houses in the neighborhoods around the Arnold Arboretum and in Woodbourne, multiple two-family houses on Manthorne Road, Weld Street, and Savin Hill Avenue and Wachusett Street. Most of his designs were

for modest houses in Colonial Revival and Craftsman styles. Duffie was elected as a state representative and served from 1927 to 1932. He re-entered military service during World War II, when he was promoted to colonel and then major general.

On the 1928 permit, this house is described as a brick veneer dwelling and had an attached porch and garage. In 1955, then-owner Sidney Rosenberg changed the garage door to an overhead style door and renovated the kitchen. In 1956, under the ownership of Irving Wexler, the porch was enclosed for use as a den. Storm damage was repaired in a 1984 permit filed by owners Anita and Roy Rubin. Mrs. Rubin is still listed as the owner. This somewhat unique stucco house in the neighborhood, with its symmetrical gabled dormers and fluted portico roof, is otherwise typical in its massing and Colonial Revival Style presence on a street. Some post-war housing is located at the southern end of the street, but Rosalie Road appears to largely retain its 1920s aesthetic. Staff recommended preferably preserving this house for architectural integrity and historic context.

Commission members agreed with the staff report, and that additions to the house were possible.

Armstrong made a motion to preferably preserve the property at 55 Rosalie Road for architectural integrity and historic context. Dimond seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on July 23rd, 2020, the Newton Historical Commission, by a vote of 6-0-1:

RESOLVED to preferably preserve the property at 55 Rosalie Road for architectural integrity and historic context.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative: Recused:

Nancy Grissom, Chairman

Peter Dimond, Member

Doug Cornelius, Member

Katie Kubie, Member

Mark Armstrong, Member

Ellen Klapper, Alternate

Jennifer Bentley-Houston, Alternate

Administrative Discussion:

a) Minutes from the June hearing were unanimously approved by those who attended that meeting (5-0-2)

b) **Annual election of NHC Chair.** Doug Cornelius told the Commission he had spoken to Nancy previously to announce his intention to run for Chair of the NHC. At the hearing, Nancy said she was still interested in serving if no one else stepped up to serve.

Cornelius nominated himself to serve as the new Chair of the NHC. Armstrong seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on July 23rd, 2020, the Newton Historical Commission, by a vote of 7-0:

RESOLVED to elect Doug Cornelius the new Chair of the NHC.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative: Recused:

Nancy Grissom, Chairman
Peter Dimond, Member
Doug Cornelius, Member
Katie Kubie, Member
Mark Armstrong, Member
Ellen Klapper, Alternate
Jennifer Bentley-Houston, Alternate

The meeting adjourned unanimously at 8:15 pm.

Administrative Approvals this month:

Key:

Partial demos (PD)
Full demo (D)
Garage (G)
Accessory Apartment (AA)

Addresses

| | |
|------------------------------------|------------|
| 63-65 Broadway | PD |
| 28 Brewster Road | PD |
| 17 Shamrock Road | PDG |
| 18 Walter Street | PD |
| 93 Woodlawn Drive | PD |
| 1671 Beacon Street | PD |
| 59-61 Highland Avenue | PD |
| 266 Spiers Road | D |
| 65 Gray Cliff Road | AA |
| 30 Keller Path | D |
| 93 Floral Street garage | AA |
| 59 Judkins Street | PD |
| 216 Highland Street | PD |
| 55 Colella Road | D |
| 430 Centre Street | PD |
| 35 Hunnewell | PD |
| 148 Lexington Street | D |
| 91-93 Halcyon Road | PD |

Respectfully,

Katy Hax Holmes, NHC

Katy Hax Holmes, Staff