

City of Newton, Massachusetts

Department of Planning and Development 1000 Commonwealth Avenue Newton, Massachusetts 02459

Telephone (617) 796-1120 Telefax (617) 796-1142 TDD/TTY (617) 796-1089 www.newtonma.gov

Barney S. Heath Director

MINUTES OF PUBLIC MEETING AND PUBLIC HEARINGS **NEWTON HISTORICAL COMMISSION**

DATE: March 26, 2020

PLACE/TIME: Via Zoom

ATTENDING: Nancy Grissom, Chairman **Doug Cornelius, Member**

> Peter Dimond, Member Amanda Stauffer Park, Member

Katie Kubie, Member Mark Armstrong, Member Jennifer Bentley-Houston, Alt. Katy Hax Holmes, Staff

See Attendance List

ABSENT: Ellen Klapper, Alternate (did not vote)

Deborah Budd, Alternate (did not vote)

The meeting was called to order via Zoom at 7:11 p.m. with Nancy Grissom serving as Chairman. Voting permanent members were Dimond, Armstrong, Cornelius, Stauffer and Kubie. Katy Hax Holmes acted as Zoom host and the meeting was digitally recorded on the Zoom device.

31 Greenwood Street - Renew CoA (Ward 8) **Request to renew Certificate of Appropriateness**

Richard Linn, architect, and Keith Moscow, owner, presented revised plans for the proposed barn at 31 Greenwood Street.

Staff reported that the house and barn at this address were Newton local landmarks. This property returned to the Commission because the Certificate of Appropriateness for this property expired this month. The Certificate was already extended last year on February 28, 2019 because the Certificate of Appropriateness expired. The Commission was told that the NHC-approved plans for the property had not changed from the Commission's original approval in 2018, so the extension was approved in 2019.

At the February 2019 hearing, staff reported that this Commission issued a Certificate of Appropriateness in 2017 for additions to the house at this address, and a replacement in-kind of the barn. The owners were pursuing a special permit for additional development on the adjacent land but told the Commission they changed their plans and would not pursue a special permit. The resulting lag time in starting the project resulted in the expiration of this Certificate of Appropriateness. The owner requested that it be renewed for another year, and attested that the scope of the project, with respect to the historic landmarked barn, had not changed.

Armstrong made a motion to approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for 31 Greenwood Street based on revised plans. Cornelius seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on March 26, 2020, the Newton Historical Commission, by a vote of 7-0:

RESOLVED to approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for 31 Greenwood Street based on revised plans.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative: Recused:

Nancy Grissom, Chairman
Peter Dimond, Member
Doug Cornelius, Member
Amanda Stauffer Park, Member
Mark Armstrong, Member
Katie Kubie, Member
Jennifer Bentley-Houston, Alternate

9 Inis Circle – Demolition Review Request to demolish buildings

The owner of this house, Amy Sucoff, presented her plan to demolish this house and build a new one at this location.

Staff reported that this house was built in 1954. This Colonial Revival Style house was first owned and constructed by William Stevenson, a local builder, and designed by Albert Kreider of Newtonville. Williamson and Krieder also designed and built the other homes on this cul de sac located at #9, 12 and 18 Inis Circle. Named for Williamson's wife, Inis, the Gaelic word for island, this cul de sac was platted on land located behind a portion of the National Register Historic District located in part on Putnam Street. This house had one owner since its construction: Judith and Sanford Ritter. Sanford worked as an accountant. This house is not an exceptional example of Colonial Revival Style architecture and is not in keeping with the other homes on the cul de sac. For what it's worth, the NHC reviewed the property at 15 Inis Circle for historical significance a few years ago. The Commission discussed the house in relation to other houses on the cul de sac and did not preferably preserve it.

Cornelius made a motion not to preferably preserve the house at 9 Inis Circle. Dimond seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on March 26, 2020, the Newton Historical Commission, by a vote of 7-0:

RESOLVED not to preferably preserve the house at 9 Inis Circle.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative: Recused:

Nancy Grissom, Chairman
Peter Dimond, Member
Doug Cornelius, Member
Amanda Stauffer Park, Member
Mark Armstrong, Member
Katie Kubie, Member
Jennifer Bentley-Houston, Alternate

2. 67-69 Ripley Street – Demolition Review Request to demolish buildings

Michael Saris presented his and his father's plan to demolish this house and build a new two-family house.

Staff reported that this property was built in 1927 in accordance with a subdivision plan produced in 1925 by two civil engineers on behalf of Newton Mortgage Corporation. The owner and builder is O.W. Colpitts, and the architect was D.A. Webber, neither of whom appear in MACRIS searches. This parcel and others adjacent to it on Ripley, east of Knowles, were subdivided from land previously owned by the Andover Theological Seminary. During the 1930s, early renters in the two-family building were salesmen, engineers, and a police officer, none of whom stayed more than a few years. Subsequent owners never owned the property for more than ten years or so. The owner of the building in the 1940s was George J. DiMatteo, president of his own company, who resided in #67. In the 1950s the owner was Bernice C. Burkat, whose husband Phillip was a dentist. In the 1960s and early 1970s the owner was Arthur A. Porter, listed as a carrier in the directories. This property was built as one of many in a row of similar buildings, but this neighborhood was not previously surveyed, and does not represent an excellent example of late 20th century housing in Newton. Staff recommended not preferably preserving this house.

Cornelius made a motion not to preferably preserve the house at 67-69 Ripley Street. Armstrong seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on March 26, 2020, the Newton Historical Commission, by a vote of 6-1:

RESOLVED not to preferably preserve the building at 67-69 Ripley Street.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative: Recused:

Nancy Grissom, Chairman

Peter Dimond, Member

Doug Cornelius, Member Amanda Stauffer Park, Member Mark Armstrong, Member Katie Kubie, Member Jennifer Bentley-Houston, Alternate

227 Cherry Street – Waiver Request Request to waive demo delay

Scott Lewis, architect for this project, presented his client's plan to build a new house at this location.

At the November 2019 hearing, staff reported that this house first appeared in city records on the 1874 atlas as owned by Richard Owens, a gardener. In 1874, this was one of only about 15 houses on Cherry Street between River and Waltham Streets. From 1874 to at least 1899, John M. Quilty, a laborer born in Ireland owned the house but did not live there until c.1900. Before 1900 he lived up the street on Cherry Street. By 1899, Michael McDonald, a stone mason and Irish immigrant, owned the house but appears to have lived elsewhere on Cherry Street as well. From c.1925 to the early 1930s, Cornelius Burns, a gardener/sander and Irish immigrant, rented the house. In 1938 under the ownership of John H. Shannon, an upholsterer/woodworker/USAF member during the war, two small dormers were added to the house. In 1939, he added a stone foundation under a rear unfinished porch as well as five windows, one door and clapboard siding. In 1944, Shannon built a rear piazza. In 1953, he added a front porch to house. In 1960, a carport was added to one side of house. In 1988, Elizabeth A. Shannon obtained a permit for a handicap ramp. In 1997, the Shannons obtained a permit for a new kitchen. The Shannon family appears to have owned this property for at least 60

years. The property has a rich history of early Irish immigrant residency, and the house had fallen into disrepair. It has not been previously surveyed.

Commission members had issues with the rear three-story tower and the overall proposed size of this building; the arched window on the street side and lowering the rear addition to 2.5 stories from three (with possible addition of rear dormer).

Dimond made a motion to require the applicant to return to the Commission with revised plans and a materials list including the following changes: reduce the height of the rear of the building; remove the tower and replace the upper portion with a dormer instead; no arched window; and a plot plan. Armstrong seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on March 26, 2020, the Newton Historical Commission, by a vote of 7-0:

RESOLVED to require the applicant to return to the Commission with revised plans and a materials list including the following changes: reduce the height of the rear of the building; remove the tower and replace the upper portion with a dormer instead; no arched window; and a plot plan.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative: Recused:

Nancy Grissom, Chairman
Peter Dimond, Member
Doug Cornelius, Member
Amanda Stauffer Park, Member
Mark Armstrong, Member
Katie Kubie, Member
Jennifer Bentley-Houston, Alternate

4. 15 Sharon Avenue – Waiver Request Request to waive demo delay

The owner and her attorney, Tammy Arcori, presented their plan to demolish this house and replace it with a new two-family home.

At the November 2019 hearing, staff reported that the Assessors database says 1910, but this house first appears on atlases in 1874 and the directories show a resident living here in 1873. The first owner was George A. Poore, who worked at the B&A railroad wharf and lived there until at least 1879. He was married in 1872. This house was one of three on Sharon Avenue at the time. In 1886 the owner was listed as A. Moore, about whom nothing could be learned from the directories. As of 1907 the owner was Thomas C. Donovan, a salesman, who initially lived on Auburn Street. Subsequent directories listed the Donovan family owning this house through the 1950s. In 1964 Samuel Roberts, carpenter, owned this and a house at 101 Pine Street. By 1970 the owner was Albert Mastroianni, a laborer for the Parks & Rec. Department. This house is an intact example of worker housing more often found in Nonantum but early examples are found in Auburndale as well.

Commission members were in support of the project generally but had issue with the prominent front garage. Discussion ensued about the overall design, garage doors, and siding.

Cornelius made a motion to approve the project with the condition that the siding be clapboard instead of stucco. Armstrong seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on March 26, 2020, the Newton Historical Commission, by a vote of 5-2:

RESOLVED to approve the project with the condition that the siding be clapboard instead of stucco.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative: Recused:

Nancy Grissom, Chairman Peter Dimond, Member Doug Cornelius, Member Amanda Stauffer Park, Member Mark Armstrong, Member

> Katie Kubie, Member Jennifer Bentley-Houston, Alternate

5. 56 Pratt Drive – Waiver Request Request to waive demo delay

Ralph Kilfoyle, archtiect and his client presented their plan to replace this house with a two-story structure.

At the July 2019 hearing, staff reported that this house was built in 1953 in a planned development of post-World War II homes by Campanelli Homes, Inc. and designed by Ralph I. Williams. This neighborhood was surveyed as part of the Maynard-Mosman-Morrill historic district and includes this house as a contributing element (NWT.714). The single-story, ell-entry, contemporary Ranch Style house pattern with an attached garage is repeated on Pratt Drive where there is little evidence of tear-down activity. The first owner of record in 1955 was Leonard Grover, a dentist. In 1959 under his ownership, the garage door was removed, and windows were added to create living space. In 1969 under the ownership of Lois and Norman Morse, an existing screened porch was enclosed. Norman was a manager at Guardian Manufacturing. Though alterations have been made to the interior spaces of the house, it retains its massing, scale, and single-story presentation in a neighborhood of similarly designed homes.

Commission members were not in support of the proposed design in this surveyed neighborhood of Ranch Style homes. Members cited the visually jarring side elevation with broken roof lines; the front facing garage; and the emphasis on the height of the structure in a neighborhood of horizontally oriented homes. Members also asked that the gable over the roof of the garage be removed. The owner agreed to return to a future meeting with a revised design.

Cornelius made a motion to continue this item until the architect could address the concerns of the Commission. Armstrong seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on March 26, 2020, the Newton Historical Commission, by a vote of 7-0:

RESOLVED to continue this item until the owner could address the concerns of the Commission.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative: Recused

Nancy Grissom, Chairman
Peter Dimond, Member
Doug Cornelius, Member
Amanda Stauffer Park, Member
Mark Armstrong, Member
Katie Kubie, Member
Jennifer Bentley-Houston, Alternate

19 Garland Road – Partial Demolition Review Request to remove roof, side, rear, and alter front façade

The owner presented his plan to add a second story, attached garage, and rear addition to the house, and demolish the front detached garage.

This house was built in 1951 by John J. Mackintosh, a carpenter, who was the owner and builder and who lived at 12 Garland Road (across the street). Mackintosh also lived at various other addresses in Newton Center. Albert Kreider was the architect for this house. Albert M. Kreider (1890-1966) was a graduate of the Boston Architectural Center and worked for many local firms including Brainerd & Leeds, and Cram & Ferguson before 1935, when he established his own practice in Newtonville. Other examples of Kreider's work include the Franklin School in West Newton, the Day School in Newtonville, the Post Office in Newton Upper Falls, and Christ Lutheran Church at 597 Belmont Street in Belmont, as well as banks and residences. Kreider also designed an interior renovation at the nominated landmark property at 1253 Washington Street. This lot is 20,300 square feet in size. The property was owned by Diane and Arthur Patz, who married in 1967 and are documented as living at this address through the 1980s and 1990s, and whose names are still on the Assessors Database as owners. This house was constructed during a similar post-war period on Garland Road, but it not representative of the house styles in the neighborhood, nor is it a unique example of Ranch Style design. Staff recommended not preferably preserving this house and detached garage.

Armstrong made a motion not to preferably preserve this house and garage. Cornelius seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on March 26, 2020, the Newton Historical Commission, by a vote of 7-0:

RESOLVED not to preferably preserve this house and garage.

<u>Voting in the Affirmative:</u> <u>Voting in the Negative:</u> <u>Recused:</u>

Nancy Grissom, Chairman
Peter Dimond, Member
Doug Cornelius, Member
Amanda Stauffer Park, Member
Mark Armstrong, Member
Katie Kubie, Member
Jennifer Bentley-Houston, Alternate

7. 40-42 Athelstane Road – Waiver Request Request to waive demo delay

The owner presented his plan to demolish this house and build a new two-family in a similar style and massing.

Staff reported that built in 1926 by Daniel A. Hagen as a two-family house, this is one of several two-family homes on this block that were owned, designed, and constructed by Hagen. Initially living in Dorchester and later at 92 Athelstane, Hagen was a widower and builder from Canada who immigrated to the US in 1922. This typical 1920s architecture is blocky in appearance and is in a relatively unchanged section of Athelstane Road. Occupants in the house over time were a patent lawyer, salesmen, widows, a buyer, and more. Occupancy of the units often changed every ten years or so. The house, and its immediate neighborhood, retains the same massing, scale and general appearance as it did when these two -family homes were constructed in the mid-to-late 1920s.

Commission members commended the owner for designing a building that worked well in the neighborhood but asked that he deepen the proposed eave line to be more in keeping with the existing buildings in the neighborhood.

Dimond made a motion to approve this design with deeper eaves, and on the condition that Armstrong approve the final designs. Kubie seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on March 26, 2020, the Newton Historical Commission, by a vote of 7-0:

RESOLVED to approve this design with deeper eaves, and on the condition that Armstrong and staff approve the final designs.

<u>Voting in the Affirmative:</u> <u>Voting in the Negative:</u> <u>Recused:</u>

Nancy Grissom, Chairman
Peter Dimond, Member
Doug Cornelius, Member
Amanda Stauffer Park, Member
Mark Armstrong, Member
Katie Kubie, Member
Jennifer Bentley-Houston, Alternate

58-60 Allison Road – Waiver Request Request to waive demo delay

Ron Jarek, Mariana Dagatti and owner Doug Quinn presented their plan to replace this house with a new two-family structure.

At the October 2019 hearing, Ron Jarek, architect for this property, and the owner Doug Quinn, told the Commission that this house was similar in massing and design to many other worker cottages in the neighborhood but that this one was not in terrific shape. The owner said this house was too simple in design to be historically significant.

Staff reported that built c.1895 and known historically as the Martin Fahey House, this property was still owned by a member of the Fahey family in 1976, over 80 years later. By 1897 Martin Fahey, an immigrant from Ireland and a starchmaker, also listed as an expressman, occupied one side of this two-family house and rented out the other half. In 1925, Michael Deagle, an immigrant from Nova Scotia and a carpenter, lived at #58 and Martin's widow and family occupied #60. In subsequent years, the Deagle family resided in #58 until well into the 1950s, and the Fahey family rented out their side. The house has replacement windows and aluminum siding but is otherwise unchanged in its setting, massing, scale, and relationship to other similar buildings on Allison Street.

Commission members thought the asymmetry of the design was a plus but that the overall massing was too complicated and were concerned that the driveways and garages faced front. Discussion ensued as to how to de-emphasize the garages on the facades of the building by the possible use of porches and alternate roofing. The owner agreed to return to a future meeting with a revised design.

Dimond made a motion to continue this item to a future hearing when revised plans could be presented. Bentley-Houston seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on March 26, 2020, the Newton Historical Commission, by a vote of 7-0:

RESOLVED to continue this item to a future hearing when revised plans could be presented.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative: Recused:

Nancy Grissom, Chairman Peter Dimond, Member Doug Cornelius, Member Amanda Stauffer Park, Member Mark Armstrong, Member Katie Kubie, Member Jennifer Bentley-Houston, Alternate

Minutes from the February meeting were approved by four members who attended the February hearing with the condition that Cornelius be shown as recused from the vote on 67 Bourne Street. The revised minutes will be posted online this morning.

Administrative Approvals this month:

Key:

Partial demos (PD) Full demo (D)

Garage (G)

Accessory Apartment (AA)

<u>Addresses</u>

47 Park Street (PD)

265 Upland Avenue (AA)

449 Commonwealth Ave (PD)

258 Mount Vernon street (solar)

57 Lawmarissa (PD)

3 Prospect Street (PD)

2 Cannon Street (AA)

64 Larchmont Avenue (PD)

35 Bothfeld Road (solar)

50 Gould Road (D)

Bapst Library, Boston College (PD)

16 Marlboro Street (PD)

832 Dedham Street (D)

19 Thurston Road (D)

41 Lombard Street (PD)

20 Oxford Road (PD)

38 Westland Avenue (PD)

115 Adams Avenue (PD)

35 Church Street, NR (PD)

Respectfully,