

Ruthanne Fuller Mayor

Barney S. Heath Director Planning & Development

#### Members

Doug Cornelius, Chairman
Mark Armstrong
Nancy Grissom
Peter Dimond
Katie Kubie
Alan Mayer
Amanda Stauffer Park
Deborah Budd, Alternate
Jennifer Bentley-Houston, Alt.

1000 Commonwealth Ave. Newton, MA 02459 T 617-796-1120 F 617-796-1142

www.newtonma.gov

# \* AGENDA \*

Date: October 22, 2020

Time: 7:00 p.m.

Place: <a href="https://us02web.zoom.us/j/87399657261">https://us02web.zoom.us/j/87399657261</a>

or +13017158592,,87399657261#

# 1135-1137 Washington Street, Armory Building – Working session (Ward 3) Request to review possible options

This building was constructed in 1910 for use as the Newton Armory and was designed in the English Revival Style for this purpose by Mulcahy and McLaughlin Architects. This property has a survey form on file with the state with noted historical significance in the categories of architecture and military history. Its style was first incorporated into a building for military use in Boston in 1895, when it was used in the William Gibbons Preston First Cadet Corps Armory. The symmetrical, crenellated appearance of the building, along with narrow slits for windows, contribute to the appearance of these buildings as fortresses of sorts.

In Newton, the armory movement began in 1870 with the founding of the Claflin Guard, named for Newton resident William Claflin who was governor of Massachusetts at that time. The Guard was first housed in Newton Corner but moved to Washington Street after this building was dedicated in 1911 and renamed itself Company C of the 5<sup>th</sup> Massachusetts Regiment of the Volunteer Militia. The building is now in the process of being decommissioned as a state property in preparation for sale, possibly to the City of Newton.

A Joint Advisory Planning Group (JAPG), which consists of nine Newton residents who were appointed by the Mayor, was assembled to assess possible reuse scenarios for the building and it continues to work on a final report. The Newton armory is not listed on the National Register of Historic Places, but the Massachusetts Historical Commission is on record for determining that identical armory buildings located in Hingham, Lynn, Methuen, New Bedford, Hyannis, and Newburyport, at a minimum, meet the criteria for eligibility for listing on the National Register of Historic Places. Affirmative Investments, a consulting firm, was hired to assess proposed uses of the structure and has requested thoughts from the NHC about this property.

286 Waverley Avenue, Durant Kenrick House – Certificate of Appropriateness (Ward 7)
Request approval to repair windows and replace wood gutters

Built in 1732, the Durant-Kenrick House is listed on the National Register of Historic Places and is a Local Landmark. The site is owned by the Newton Historical Society and operates as a museum. The Society proposes to use CPC funds to replace the gutter system and repair six original windows on the eastern face of the 1732 Durant-Kenrick House. The National Register nomination form describes three areas of note in the property's significance: "Four rooms have stencil-decorated floors, c.1790, among the earliest extant in New England. The window seats and interior shutters in the "North Room" are another rarity. Finally, the survival of a portion of the original roof, including weatherboards, shingles, and flashing, represents a major document in the history of 18th century construction." Historic Newton wants to address the water infiltration issues on the eastern facing portion of the house by replacing the defective wooden gutter and restoring the windows to water-tight condition. The six windows were compromised by a leak in the fire suppression system inside that portion of the building as well as by excess rainwater not controlled by the gutter and downspout. These repairs will also prevent water infiltration from harming the collections housed in the museum and help to ensure the structure's longevity.

#### 1253 Washington Street – Landmark designation hearing (Ward 3)

Request to designate local landmark

Frank Stearns, attorney for the owner, and Erin Doherty of Epsilon Associates, will present a brief summary of their report conclusions, followed by a public hearing on designating this property a local landmark. Reports prepared by them, the Planning Board, and staff of this commission were presented at the September 2020 NHC hearing for presentation purposes only. There was no vote on the designation at that hearing because it was not advertised as a public hearing.

Known locally as the Brezniak-Rodman Funeral Home, this property was placed on an 18-month demo delay on May 23, 2019 in response to a proposal for full demolition. On January 2, 2020 this property was subsequently nominated by Councilor Julia Malakie for designation as a local landmark. A staff report was prepared that documented the historical significance of this property and made recommendations to the Commission with respect to landmarking it. The Local Landmark ordinance was revised and adopted in July 2020 and the recommendations in the report correspond to the revised criteria for significance.

At the May 2019 hearing, staff reported that formerly known as 1251 Washington Street, this property was a contributing building to the West Newton National Register-listed historic district. By 1871 there were two stables, an office and three sheds at this location owned by Stephen Francis Cate (1837-1896), but business ads in Newton Directories show the Cate family running this business as early as 1861. Born in Massachusetts, Cate worked in stables located in Lower Falls before becoming owner of this property. Cate continued to operate his livery and undertaker businesses until at least 1893, likely until his death in 1896. In the late 1890s it was Henry F. Cate who ran the two businesses. A 1903 advertisement also showed embalming as an added service. Repairs to a building on this site after a fire were permitted in 1915.

The (now-painted) brick façade on the building was designed by Lewis H. Bacon and added in 1926. In that year an 'old barn in the rear' was also replaced. A new garage door to the building was added in 1932, and in 1937, a new side door to the funeral parlor was added. In 1959, Albert Kreider, architect, was hired to redesign the first floor into a chapel. Henry F. Cate was still associated with this business in 1968 and the address was still 1251 Washington Street. By 1980 the business was called Cate & Pratt Funeral Services, and after over 130 years of ownership of this building the name changed to Brezniak-Rodman Funeral Services. This building was included in the NR nomination after the exterior changes outlined above were made.

# 4. 176 River Street – Demolition Review (Ward 3) Request to demolish buildings

Built in 1883 according to the Assessors database, this cottage style house was constructed closer to 1870 as a two-story, single room-deep house with bay windows on either side and a farmers' porch in front. The property has not been surveyed. The 1874 atlas shows a house on this lot owned by William B. Taffe, a mason, with a large attached rear ell. He was still residing here in 1895. By 1897, another mason named James R. Gallagher resided here, and he obtained a building permit in 1916 for an addition on a barn wagon shed, which no longer appears to be standing. In 1920, he constructed a rear ell on the house (which must have replaced an earlier one). In 1949, a concrete block detached garage was constructed behind the house under the ownership of Pasquale Persico, listed as a gardener. Two years prior, Persico constructed a cold frame on the side of the tool shed, which also appears to be gone.

A plot plan from 1947 shows that behind the house there were three outbuildings: the tool house (built 1939), an outbuilding 'to be removed,' and a henhouse. None are currently standing. On his building permit for the concrete block garage, Mr. Persico listed the date of construction of this house as approximately 1870. This appears to be correct. In the early 1870s, there were dozens of homes built along the south side of River Street in this neighborhood, including this one. This was clearly part of a larger residential neighborhood of similarly massed and scaled homes. The exact construction dates of the bay windows and roof dormers are not known, but appear to date to 1880 and c.1925, respectively. Staff recommends this property preferably preserved for historic context.

# 5. 37 Stratford Road - Demolition Review (Ward 3)

Request to demolish buildings

This house was built in 1939 by owner/builder Clarence Chamberlain and designed by W.M. Haines in a neighborhood of similar homes in the Cape Style. A year prior, Percy MacCallum of Cochituate listed Haines as the architect of the house he intended to build, but it looks like a different owner finally constructed it. This street is largely still intact, with alterations limited to single-story additions. Haines designed three other homes in Newton that appear in MACRIS, and two of them are included in National Register districts (43 Arapahoe Road and 9 Regent Street). In 1943, the owner, Delina C. Vallee, enclosed the side porch. In 1959, she converted the original garage to a den and constructed a concrete block garage. In 2002, this house was the subject of an appeal before the city because when these lots were originally developed, they were zoned multi-residence. The City changed the zoning to single residence in that year, and the owner at that time wished to retain the MR zoning designation. Due to the intact nature of this neighborhood and its consistency with respect to style, scale, and massing, staff recommends preferably preserving this property for historic context.

# 6. 27 Linda Lane – Waiver Request (Ward 8)

Request to waive demo delay

The owners of this house will return to the Commission this month with revised plans for their second-story addition. Comments regarding this project were provided by NHC at the August and September hearings. At the September hearing, Commission members told the owners it had requested a front hipped roof on the revised plans and did not see one. Members also asked to see 3-D renderings to better depict the proposed overall massing of the addition.

At the August hearing, staff reported that this house was built in 1953 and was constructed as part of a planned development in the Oak Hill neighborhood of Truman Road, Selwyn, Linda Lane, and Mildred Road. This property was Lot 21 on Section 5 of the Plan of Parkwood Manor. The owner was J.D. Builders, Inc., designed by Walter Greymont and built by Jacob Ditch, all of Newton. Greymont was a well-known local architect who designed many post war, Ranch Style homes in Newton.

This is a well-preserved neighborhood of capes and ranches and encompasses Selwyn Road, Truman Road, Linda Lane, and Mildred Road and includes eighty-six properties in a subdivision known as Parkwood Manor, first laid out in 1949 and developed over the next nine years. The predominant form of architecture on Selwyn and Truman Roads is the ranch, with both hipped and side-gable examples. The neighborhood occupies a low-lying area where Newton Highlands meets the Oak Hill neighborhood west of Parker Street. Architecturally and historically, the area is separate from earlier (and previously inventoried) neighborhoods to the north and west, and from earlier linear residential development along Parker Street to the east.

J.D. Builders sold this house to Joseph and Rose Gordon in 1953, and their heirs owned it well into the 1980s.

# 7. 137 Baldpate Hill Road – Demolition Review (Ward 8)

Request to demolish buildings

This house was constructed in 1958 and designed and built by George Nelson, an architect/builder who lived at 23 Selwyn Road in a house he also designed. He appears in MACRIS as also having designed the split-level/raised Ranch at 19 Selwyn Road, both of which contribute to that surveyed neighborhood. Though this house has a single-story appearance facing the street, it follows the rear downslope of the house in a split-level design. Building permits for this house are limited to the original one from 1958, and the house appears to retain its original architectural features.

According to the survey form for the Baldpate Hill Road, this neighborhood occupies the highest elevation (315 feet) in Newton and at one time encompassed perhaps the largest concentration of architect-designed custom homes from the 1940-1960 period in the city. Baldpate Hill Road was owned and platted into house

lots by Arnold Hartmann, a German émigré who has the distinction of being the first real estate developer in Newton to develop a major new residential subdivision after the city adopted its first zoning ordinance (1922), the first developer to offer a subdivision in the Great South Meadow (drainage and filling of which took nearly thirty years, beginning in the 1890s), and the first developer to offer a major subdivision in an area that was considered inaccessible by public transportation. He resided in this house in his later years.

Since 2006, ISD records show that eleven have been demolished. Due to the hilltop location of most of the homes on the street, the exceptional views and value of the building lots, houses on Baldpate Hill Road were found to have been among the most susceptible to redevelopment of Newton's single-family dwellings. Building permit applications suggest that many lots were purchased by individuals from the Boston area who contracted with an architect and builder to construct custom houses. Other firms whose work is represented on Baldpate Hill Road include Stanley Myers, Salsberg & LeBlanc, Lester Lechter, and Hoover & Hill. Staff recommends preferably preserving this property for architectural integrity and historic context as a rapidly disappearing example of architect-designed 1950s architecture on Baldpate Hill in Newton.

# 8. 187 Park Street, NR – Partial Demolition Review (Ward 7)

Request to remove attached garage and replace with addition

This property, known as the Bailey House, is a contributing element to the Farlow and Kenrick Park National Register Historic District. Built c. 1868 in a cottage example of the Second Empire Style, this house stands at the corner of Park and Franklin Streets overlooking the Park Street Oval, which was known historically as Kenrick Park. The survey form for this property, prepared in 1977, noted that stone buildings were a rarity in Newton Corner where wood frame and brick construction predominated. The mansard roof was also noted to be an unusually pronounced example along with its shallow dormers, ashlar stone walls and dramatic front entrance. The house was owned by the Bailey family in the 1870s and later by Elestus M. Springer, a cloak manufacturer, who owned the property through the early 1900s. An etching of this house can be found on p.115 of the Kings Handbook of Newton (1889).

The Farlow-Kenrick Parks Historic District lies just south of the original railroad route in Newton Corner and was at the center of Newton's early growth as a suburb. Speculative real estate development occurred here shortly after introduction of the railroad, which resulted in one of Newton's first residential parks. Kenrick Park which was laid out in 1845 at the request of William Kenrick, of the Durant-Kenrick property, a well-known nurseryman, horticulturist and later, land speculator. The park was designed by Alexander Wadsworth, who was well known for his work on Mt. Auburn Cemetery nearby in Cambridge. This park development was slow to take hold until after the railroad came through, as evidenced by architectural styles in the Farlow and Kenrick Parks Historic District dating from 1870 and 1910. There is no known architect for this house.

Elestus M. Springer still lived there in 1905 but had moved by 1911. By 1917 the owner was Eugene Carpenter, an electrical engineer at an ice machine factory. Samuel N. Braman, an engineer, bought the property by 1922. A permit from that year for a new garage appears in the file for this property but there no longer appears to be a detached garage. In 1957 a garage was attached to the rear of the house under the ownership of Samuel D. Bell, Jr., a physician. Also listed on the permit was a roof constructed over an outdoor porch over the garage. Blair Brown was the most recent longtime owner, who in 1977 renovated the kitchen and created access to the outdoor porch over the attached garage. Staff recommends preferably preserving this property for architectural integrity and historic context with an 18-month delay imposed.

#### 9. 154 Lincoln Street, NR – Partial Demolition Review (Ward 6)

Request to add garage ell to side

Known as the William E.B. Ryder House for its first owner, this property is a contributing resource to the Newton Highlands National Register Historic District. The house was built in 1874 in the Second Empire Style and faces north on Lincoln Street.

The nomination for this district states: "The Newton Highlands Historic District represents the earliest suburban development in Newton Highlands, laid out in 1870 as a direct response to the availability of suburban rail service. It is the earliest such development on the Highland Branch, and its promoters and builders played leading roles in the formation of the village. Many of its Lincoln Street residences are local interpretations of high-style designs although designed for modest incomes. The district thus meets criteria A, B, and C of the National Register of Historic Places."

Ryder was a post office clerk and lived at this address until his death in 1908. By 1921, Isaac Goddard, listed alternately as instructor and master, appears in directories as living here until well into the 1960s. In 1931, three windows were added to the kitchen. A 1938 permit allowed for the removal of a hipped roof over the kitchen and was replaced with a flat roof, and a window and French door were added on the second story. In 1965, a mudroom was added to the rear side off the kitchen. In 2013, the front deck was rebuilt to wrap around the house. Staff recommends preferably preserving this house for architectural integrity and historic context, with an 18-month delay imposed.

#### 10. 667 Boylston Street - Demolition Review (Ward 6)

Request to demolish buildings

Built in 1930, this house was designed in the Dutch Colonial Style during a period when this style was ubiquitous in Newton and communities nearby. The owner at that time was Charles Farah of Wollaston, and Dix Lumber was listed as architect. There are no other permits in the file. In 1936 the owner was Joseph DeMaio, a janitor, whose parents immigrated to Newton from Italy. The DeMaio family continued to live here through the 1960s. The new owners of this property are planning a project for which a special permit will be needed. Due to the number of houses in this style in Newton in better states of preservation, staff recommends not preferably preserving this property.

# 11. 125 Lincoln Street, NR – Waiver Request (Ward 6)

Request to waive demo delay

At the June 2020 hearing, Dan Powdermaker, owner, presented his plan to demolish and rebuild a single-family house at this location. Mr. Powdermaker told the Commission he owned other property in the neighborhood, and currently owned 61 Bowdoin Street. He is returning to the Commission with plans to replace this house with a new single-family home, as the minimum four-month waiting period has elapsed.

Staff reported that this house was constructed in 1927 and designed by W.J. Pendergast for its first owner, Winthrop Tirell, a private school teacher and his family. The two-story house is somewhat Federal in appearance with no detailing around the front entrance, and Craftsman-esque exposed rafter tails along the main roof line and the attached porch. When the National Register district was created in Newton Highlands in the late 1970s, this property, and the few other Colonial Revival style buildings in the vicinity, were deemed to be non-contributing to the historic district. When the nomination was revised in 1988 to include properties constructed post-1907 and into the 1920s, this property was redefined as a contributing resource to the district. Two other Colonial Revival properties in its vicinity also became contributing resources: 126 Lincoln Street (1910), and 130 Lincoln Street (1911).

Reportedly the last house to be built on Lincoln Street before #99 was built in 2003, this is one of the few Colonial Revival style homes from the 1920s in the district, and it was completed just after the Post Office building at 55-65 Lincoln Street was constructed (also a contributing resource to the district). All but four houses on the street were built between 1874 and 1889. The Robert Perlman family resided here from 1962 until this year. Perlman submitted a petition for a variance to change the house from one-family to two, but

it was withdrawn a month later. Staff recommended preferably preserving this property as a contributing resource to the Newton Highlands National Register Historic District.

# 12. 40 Canterbury Road - Demolition Review (Ward 5)

Request to demolish buildings

Built in 1915 by owner/builder Hugh C. Moses, a carpenter, this house was designed by architect John E. Titus of Upper Falls in a neighborhood of Bungalow style homes. GIS shows the construction date as 1925, but the actual construction date is 1918. This duo also designed and built the houses at 30 and 36 Canterbury on the same side of the street, which all depict a steep gable roof, oversized central dormer, and a side-front entrance to an enclosed porch. Titus appears in MACRIS as also designing 72 Stedman Street in Brookline, in the Colonial Revival Style, which is in a surveyed neighborhood. In 1918, Richard M. Davis, owner, and a treasurer, had a hen house built to house six hens. In 1919, the same owner obtained a second permit to construct a bigger hen house. Neither appear to be still standing. In 1921, the same owner had a garage constructed. Davis sold the property in 1923, to Edward W. Hunter, an assistant treasurer, who owned the property from 1923 to 1959. The original deed is mentioned in every transaction of this property, which required that dwellings and outbuildings be constructed on these lots but "no low class tenements" (Moses Crafts to George H. Williams, 1872) (1205/512) were allowed. There is no permit for the side porch treatment, but the house clearly retains the Bungalow aesthetic in the neighborhood. Staff recommends preferably preserving this property for historic context.

#### 13. 3 Bradford Road - Demolition Review (Ward 5)

Request to demolish garage, partial demo house

This Colonial Revival Style house was constructed c.1890, and the property has not been surveyed. The actual construction date is closer to 1905. The 1895 atlas shows this neighborhood as platted but there were no houses constructed at that time. An engineering survey for this street was completed in 1900, and by 1907 the house and a detached garage were standing here. By 1914, Herbert S. Virtue, who worked at Commercial Chemical Company, obtained a permit for a portable steel garage. An exterior chimney was added the same year. The Virtue family owned the property well in to the 1940s. At that point, the property had multiple owners who changed every year. There are no building permits in the file between 1914 and this year. The house was built at the same time as surrounding homes, in the same Colonial Revival Style, massing, and scale. At some point aluminum siding was added and the windows were replaced. Staff recommends the house preferably preserved for historic context.

# 14. 728 Walnut Street - Demolition Review (Ward 2)

Request to demolish buildings

This house was constructed in 1929 in a vernacular Colonial Revival Style. Full demolition is proposed as part of a possible special permit project for a new house. Thomas G. Wagner of Crafts Street was listed as the builder in 1929, and Susan Fennelley was listed as owner. No architect name is listed. In 1959, Ms. Fennelly sold the property to Julius Pactavas, who enclosed the front porch and in 1965 added a one-story vestibule off the left side of the house. When Pactavas sold the house in 1984, there were at least six subsequent owners preceding the current ones. This house is located at the corner of Walnut Street and Fenno Road, across the street from City Hall in a neighborhood of a mix of pre- and post-war, single-family residences. This neighborhood was not previously surveyed, and this house is not an exemplary example of Colonial Revival architecture. Staff recommends not preferably preserving this house.

### 15. 61 Walker Street - Partial Demolition Review (Ward 2)

Request to restore and add on second unit

Built in 1897, this house combines elements of the Colonial Revival and Queen Anne styles. This house has a survey form on file with the state but has no historical name associated with it. The house was constructed as a single-family residence but was converted to apartments over time. Architectural details that were cited as significant on the survey form include the columned verandah, deep gable roofs with pedimented cornices and pent eaves, and picturesque Queen Anne style elements including an inset balcony on the street facade, stained glass windows, and several prominent bay windows. At the turn of the century the owner was Sydney H. Hobson, a salesman, who emigrated from England in 1878 and lived here with his family until at least 1915. By 1925, the house was home to four boarders. By 1934, there were five, among them widows,

a maid, and clerks. By 1945, the women were gone, and two male boarders resided here. By 1955, there was one of each. In the 1960s there were three boarders. Though as a rental property the house was intensively used for many years, the style, massing and scale are consistent with its original design and continues to be in keeping with the scale and age of the neighborhood. Staff recommends preferably preserving this house for architectural integrity and historic context.

#### 16. 73 North Street - Demolition Review (Ward 2)

Request to demolish buildings

According to records held in the Engineering Division, this house was constructed in 1835. Original ownership of the house is difficult to determine, but in 1856 it was one of three houses on what is now North Street. This date of construction precedes the influx of Irish immigrants that took place from 1840-60, and may have been associated with the leather and chemical factory to the south in what is now Newton Cemetery. In 1899 the property was owned by longtime owner James Cummings, a laborer, who was born in Ireland in 1862. He was still living here in 1940. The 1886 atlas calls this neighborhood Cold Spring City, but colloquially it was known as Cork City, and both North Street and Cummings Road are visible with several houses along each. This house was built as a very simple rectangle, as seen on a survey map from 1886. By 1913 the house had a small front foyer, and two outbuildings were located at the northwest corner of the lot. One was labeled the hen house, and another wasn't labeled. Cummings received a permit for a new detached garage in 1924, which was torn down and replaced with NHC permission in 2008. By 1945, Carl Oscar Hallgren, a mason, owned this property, but he died in 1950. It appears his family owned it for quite some time after. In 1966, Herbert O.W. Hallgren, who served in the Navy, and likely a descendant, obtained a permit to rebuild and enclose the existing porch in front of building, and erect a dormer on the rear roof slope. At that time, he and family were living in Newton Highlands. Herbert O. Hallgren, another descendant, is recorded in directories as living here in 1993-94.

In 1990 the house underwent some structural work, such as reinforcing the floors on the first story; adding lally columns and support beams in the basement to support the first floor; the roof was reshingled, and carpenter-ant damage was treated throughout. This is one of the oldest homes on the street and staff is recommending that it be preferably preserved.

**Administrative Discussion:** 

- a) Minutes from September hearing
- b) Farm Commission needs an NHC rep