



Ruthanne Fuller  
Mayor

**City of Newton, Massachusetts**  
Department of Planning and Development  
1000 Commonwealth Avenue Newton, Massachusetts 02459

Telephone  
(617) 796-1120  
Telefax  
(617) 796-1142  
TDD/TTY  
(617) 796-1089  
www.newtonma.gov

Barney S. Heath  
Director

---

**MINUTES OF PUBLIC MEETING AND PUBLIC HEARINGS  
NEWTON UPPER FALLS HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION**

**DATE:** May 14, 2020

**PLACE/TIME:** Fully Remote  
7:00 p.m.

**ATTENDING:** Jeff Riklin, Chair  
Laurie Malcom, Member  
Judy Neville, Member  
Daphne Romanoff, Member  
Paul Snyder, Member  
Jay Walter, Member  
Barbara Kurze, Staff

**ABSENT:** John Wyman, Alternate

The meeting was called to order at 7:00 p.m. with Jeff Riklin presiding as Chair. Voting permanent members were L. Malcom, J. Neville, P. Snyder, and J. Walter. B. Kurze acted as recording secretary and the meeting was recorded on Zoom.

**336 Elliot Street/7 Hale Street – Certificate of Appropriateness**

Martin Smargiassi and the owners presented an application to restore the exterior, remove the existing dormer on the main house block and install four new narrow shed dormers, extend the second floor to the back, and add details and an entry overhang on the left side to break up the massing. The existing and new roofs would be CertainTeed Landmark Pro asphalt shingles and the vinyl siding would be replaced with smooth HardieBoard. The aluminum window casings would be removed and Harvey Majesty aluminum-clad wood windows with historic details installed. The historic tall windows at the front would be brought back. The aluminum K-style gutters would be replaced in-kind as required, and all downspouts replaced with round downspouts. The front door, sidelites, and porch railing and columns will be restored, and the porch decking will be replaced with AZEK. All the side entrance doors will be replaced, and new light fixtures will be installed at the entrance doors. The intent was to also replicate historic corner board and trim elements that were uncovered either in wood or PVC.

Materials Reviewed:  
Assessors database map

MHC Form B  
Elevations  
Product and material information

Commission members agreed that the scale and massing of the rear extension and new roof, the restoration of historic details and replacement of inappropriate materials were great improvements. Commission members wanted to the applicants to submit the final window details to Staff for review and approval before installation. The oval window at the rear was not appropriate. D. Romanoff and P. Snyder said the proposed dormers were fine. J. Walter, L. Malcom, and J. Neville said only the driveway side dormers were appropriate. J. Riklin did not think there should be any dormers; skylights might be an option, but the owners would need to submit an application. Abutters spoke in favor of the application. J. Walter moved to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness for the project as presented with exceptions and requirements. L. Malcom seconded the motion. There was a roll call vote and the motion passed, 5-1. J. Riklin voted against the motion as the dormers were not appropriate.

### **RECORD OF ACTION:**

**DATE:** May 15, 2020

**SUBJECT:** 336 Elliot Street/7 Hale Street - Certificate of Appropriateness

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on May 14, 2020 the Newton Upper Falls Historic District Commission, by roll call vote of 5-1,

**RESOLVED to grant** a Certificate of Appropriateness for the project as presented at 336 Elliot Street/7 Hale Street **except for the two dormers on the Hale Street and with the following requirements: 1) the oval window on the rear elevation will be changed to a double-hung window proportional to the other windows at the back of the house; 2) the applicants will submit details of the proposed windows to Staff for final review and approval prior to installation; and 3) the applicants will submit photos and drawings of the window casings, trim and exterior details to Staff for final review and approval prior to installation.** The approved project includes the two dormers on the driveway side, the exterior renovations, the extension of the second floor and new roof at the rear, and the addition of an overhang at the Hale Street entry door. J. Riklin voted against the motion because he did not agree that adding new dormers was appropriate.

### **Voting in the Affirmative:**

Laurie Malcom, Member

Judy Neville, Member

Daphne Romanoff, Member

Paul Snyder, Member

Jay Walter, Member

### **Voting in the Negative:**

Jeff Riklin, Chair

### **56 Rockland Place – Certificate of Appropriateness**

Jamaal Siddiqui, Joe Wood, and the owners presented an application to replace the existing rear addition with a new rear addition more in keeping with the historic home. The intent was to create accessible living space.

### **Materials Reviewed:**

Assessors database map

MHC Form B

Concept boards

Site plan

Plans

Elevations

Details

## Product and material information

Most Commission members thought the overall design was appropriate. P. Snyder did not think the deck area was a traditional configuration. There was discussion about the rear gable roof pitch, the picture window, the foundation with the proposed lattice covering, and the railing system. Abutters were in favor of the application. J. Walter moved to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness for the project as presented with exceptions and requirements. J. Neville seconded the motion. There was a roll call vote and the motion passed, 5-1. P. Snyder voted against the motion as the deck design was not appropriate.

**RECORD OF ACTION:****DATE:** May 15, 2020**SUBJECT:** 56 Rockland Place - Certificate of Appropriateness

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on May 14, 2020 the Newton Upper Falls Historic District Commission, by roll call vote of 5-1,

**RESOLVED to grant** a Certificate of Appropriateness for the project as presented at 56 Rockland Place to replace the existing rear addition with a new addition and build a deck and stair **with the following requirements: 1) the addition will have a solid foundation with a masonry veneer of stucco, stone or brick; 2) the picture window will be replaced with three double-hung windows which can be ganged together; 3) gutters will be fiberglass with a historic profile; 4) the roof ridge will be raised to change the pitch and the width of the rake boards will be reduced to six to eight inches; 5) five-quarter trim will be used; 6) more details will be provided on the railing system design; information will be provided on the downspouts; and 7) the applicants will submit the relevant materials and details for these requirements to Staff for final review and approval prior to installation.** P. Snyder voted against the motion because the configuration of the addition and deck was not appropriate for the age and style of the house.

**Voting in the Affirmative:**

Jeff Riklin, Chair

Laurie Malcom, Member Judy Neville, Member

Daphne Romanoff, Member

Jay Walter, Member

**Voting in the Negative:**

Paul Snyder, Member

**18 Cliff Road – Certificate of Appropriateness (Violation)**

Michel Beaudry and the owner presented an application for the work that was done to replace the rear deck and stair and for the remaining work to complete the project.

**Materials Reviewed:**

Assessors database map

MHC Form B

Construction plan

Photographs

Commission members said that it was not appropriate to enlarge an already large and inappropriate structure; they recommended replacing the deck and stairs with an egress stair that was appropriate and was built close to the building. There was discussion whether the Commission had approved the original deck and stair. J. Walter moved to deny a Certificate of Appropriateness for the project as proposed. L. Malcom seconded the motion. There was a roll call vote and the motion passed, 6-0.

**RECORD OF ACTION:****DATE:** May 22, 2020

**SUBJECT:** 18 Cliff Road - Certificate of Appropriateness (Violation)

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on May 14, 2020 the Newton Upper Falls Historic District Commission, by roll call vote of 6-0,

**RESOLVED to deny** a Certificate of Appropriateness for the project as built and as proposed at 18 Cliff Road to replace the rear deck and stair because the design enlarged the size of the deck and the footprint of the structure. The railing design was also not appropriate. The Commission encourages the owner to resubmit an application for an appropriately designed stair that functions strictly for egress, that is close to the side of the building, and has an appropriate railing system.

**Voting in the Affirmative:**

Jeff Riklin, Chair

Laurie Malcom, Member

Judy Neville, Member

Daphne Romanoff, Member

Paul Snyder, Member

Jay Walter, Member

**Administrative Discussion**

**Minutes:** The November and December minutes were approved.

The meeting was adjourned at 10:00 p.m.

Recorded by Barbara Kurze, Senior Preservation Planner