



Ruthanne Fuller
Mayor

City of Newton, Massachusetts
Department of Planning and Development
1000 Commonwealth Avenue Newton, Massachusetts 02459

Telephone
(617) 796-1120
Telefax
(617) 796-1142
TDD/TTY
(617) 796-1089
www.newtonma.gov

Barney S. Heath
Director

**MINUTES OF PUBLIC MEETING AND PUBLIC HEARINGS
NEWTON UPPER FALLS HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION**

DATE: October 8, 2020

PLACE/TIME: Fully Remote
7:00 p.m.

ATTENDING: Jeff Riklin, Chair
Scott Aquilina, Member
Laurie Malcom, Member
Judy Neville, Member
Paul Snyder, Member
Jay Walter, Member
John Wyman, Alternate
Barbara Kurze, Staff

ABSENT: Daphne Romanoff, Member

The meeting was called to order at 7:00 p.m. with Jeff Riklin presiding as Chair. Voting permanent members were S. Aquilina, L. Malcom, J. Neville, P. Snyder, and Jay Walter. Alternate J. Wyman was appointed to vote as a full member. B. Kurze acted as recording secretary and the meeting was recorded on Zoom.

22 Cliff Road – Certificate of Appropriateness

Bob Cicchetti presented an application to extend the existing wood fence approximately 35 feet along the left property line toward Cliff Road.

Materials Reviewed:

Fence Plan
Photographs
MHC Form B

Commission members confirmed that the fence extension would match the existing fence and agreed that the project was appropriate. L. Malcom moved to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness for the application as submitted. P. Snyder seconded the motion. There was a roll call vote and the motion passed unanimously, 7-0.

RECORD OF ACTION:

DATE: October 9, 2020

SUBJECT: 22 Cliff Road - Certificate of Appropriateness

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on October 8, 2020 the Newton Upper Falls Historic District Commission, by roll call vote of 7-0,

RESOLVED to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness for the project as presented at 22 Cliff Road to extend the existing wood fence approximately 35 feet along the left property line toward Cliff Road; the design of the new fence section will match the existing wood fence.

Voting in the Affirmative:

Jeff Riklin, Chair

Scott Aquilina, Member

Laurie Malcom, Member

Judy Neville, Member

Paul Snyder, Member

Jay Walter, Member

John Wyman, Alternate

J. Neville recused herself.

33-35 Sullivan Avenue – Certificate of Appropriateness

Kevin O’Connell presented an application to renovate the three-season porch on the left side of the house. The windows, doors and trim would be replaced, and the porch would be resided. The windows would have black grilles and lite patterns like the existing. They would be a combination of casement and picture windows.

Materials Reviewed:

MHC Form B

Photographs

Product and material information

Information about the front entry porch lattice and stair fascia requirements: the April 2019 minutes and photographs of the lattice and stair fascia conditions in 2019

S. Aquilina said the existing windows were storm windows; casement or double-hung windows would be appropriate. J. Walter said casements would look more porch-like. Picture windows would not be appropriate; paired casements or mullied dead lites could fill the space in the middle. Commission members said the door needed to be like the existing design. There was discussion about the entry porch lattice; Commission members agreed that it needed to be replaced with the appropriate vertical design before work could start on the porch renovation. J. Neville suggested refurbishing the existing door. J. Walter moved to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness with conditions. L. Malcom seconded the motion. There was a roll call vote and the motion passed unanimously, 6-0, with one recusal.

RECORD OF ACTION:

DATE: October 9, 2020

SUBJECT: 33-35 Sullivan Avenue - Certificate of Appropriateness

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on October 8, 2020 the Newton Upper Falls Historic District Commission, by roll call vote of 6-0, with one recusal,

RESOLVED to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness for the project as presented at 33-35 Sullivan Avenue to renovate the three-season porches on the left side of the house. The siding will be replaced, the storm windows will be replaced with mullied paired simulated divided lite casement windows with black spacer bars and factory-applied exterior grids, and the exterior door will be restored or replaced with a door with the same configuration. **The final window plan and door must be submitted to Staff for final review and approval. The final approval will not be issued until the diamond-patterned lattice at the entry porch is replaced with the vertical lattice that was approved.**

Voting in the Affirmative:

Jeff Riklin, Chair

Paul Snyder, Member

Scott Aquilina, Member

Jay Walter, Member

Laurie Malcom, Member

John Wyman, Alternate

Recused:

Judy Neville, Member

959 Chestnut Street – Certificate of Appropriateness (Violation)

This review was continued from the September meeting. In the September meeting, the Commission required trim details for the main house block and left-side bay to be reviewed and approved before other work could start on the main house block and left-side bay. The Commission might also require mock-ups for critical details. Mario Sinani presented drawings for trim details; he planned to source the materials from Anderson & McQuaid.

Materials Reviewed:

September 2020 decision

Drawings

Photographs

There was discussion about the aluminum gutters that were called out in the drawings; Staff confirmed that fiberglass was approved in October 2019. There was discussion about the elevation drawings and whether there could be issues with what was built if the drawings were not to scale. J. Walter talked about the left-side bay drawing and the issues with how the panels were drawn; the elevation drawings did not appear to show the correct panel proportions and details. He noted that the rake board and crown molding drawings also needed to match the existing proportions and details; a sample of the crown molding should be provided. The point of the elevations was to verify that what was submitted was built and to attach details to scale. There was discussion about verifying that the main house block dimensions – footprint, height, spacing between floors, roof proportions, window locations and openings, etc. – matched the existing and what the Commission approved. J. Riklin noted that a surveyor would provide spot elevations and confirm that the as-built dimensions matched. S. Aquilina said the elevation drawings should clarify the placement of the elements and that detailed drawings of the elements were required. He agreed that a sample of the crown molding needed to be provided.

There was discussion about the front porch details; M. Sinani noted that the replacement of the existing porch was approved in October 2019. J. Neville said that the historic stone wall along the sidewalk needed to be preserved. Abutter Lee Fisher requested that a mason repoint and repair the wall which would cost less than replacing it. Neighbor Sheila Purdy appreciated the safety measures that were put in place to direct traffic. Abutters Xiaobo Bai and Allison Park were concerned that the as-built addition and garage might exceed what was approved; they wanted the owner to confirm that the as-built dimensions matched what was approved.

P. Snyder stated that because of the unapproved demolition of the main house block, the Commission needed to treat the application as a new submission and needed a comprehensive and detailed view of the project. J. Neville understood the owner's desire to be able to move in, but the unapproved demolition complicated the project. J. Walter moved to require resubmission of the trim details and sample of the crown molding. J. Neville seconded the motion. There was a roll call vote and the motion passed unanimously, 7-0.

RECORD OF ACTION:**DATE:** October 9, 2020**SUBJECT:** 959 Chestnut Street – Requirement to Resubmit Trim Details and Sample

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on October 8, 2020 the Newton Upper Falls Historic District Commission, by roll call vote of 7-0,

RESOLVED to require the resubmission of the trim detail drawings to match the existing historic details as required in the September 10, 2020 decision at 959 Chestnut Street. The trim details for the left-side bay shown in drawing 8/A-9 need to be revised to match the existing historic details and the porch details need to be corrected to show the fiberglass gutters which were previously approved. A sample of the crown molding at the rake matching the existing historic details needs to be submitted for Commission review.

Voting in the Affirmative:

Jeff Riklin, Chair

Scott Aquilina, Member

Laurie Malcom, Member

Judy Neville, Member

Daphne Romanoff, Member

Paul Snyder, Member

Jay Walter, Member

14 Ellis Street – Certificate of Appropriateness (Violation)

Taha Rakhshandehroo presented an application to demolish the existing chimney and raise the rear roof to create a flat roof at the back. The vinyl windows and siding would match existing. The contractor started work on the property without approvals or permits.

Materials Reviewed:

Assessors database map

Photographs

Product and material information

MHC Form B

Drawings

Plans

January 2019 meeting minutes

Commission members agreed that the gable ends were visible. J. Neville noted that it was a small worker cottage and the changes needed to fit in. J. Walter said that the project should read as a dormer addition which would be appropriate for a cottage; J. Riklin and J. Wyman agreed. J. Wyman said he would only vote for the proposed project as a hardship. S. Aquilina said he would be in favor of the project as the house would still present as a cottage from the front. J. Walter proposed moving the ends in three feet from the sides, bringing the roof edge 10 inches above the window head and continuing the eave at the base. Abutter Ben Kahn supported the project. Neighbor Melissa Brown confirmed that the footprint of the house and the ridge line would not change. P. Snyder moved to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness for the application as submitted. J. Neville seconded the motion. There was a roll call vote of 2-5 and the motion was denied. J. Walter moved to grant a Certificate of Hardship for the application as submitted except for the chimney and with design changes. L. Malcom seconded the motion. There was a roll call vote of 6-0 with one abstention and the motion passed.

There was discussion about removing the chimney. J. Neville said it was a feature and wanted to see it rebuilt. J. Walter and S. Aquilina said it was a minor element and did not contribute to the architecture. J. Neville

moved to require the owner to maintain the exterior chimney feature. J. Riklin seconded the motion. There was a roll call vote of 3-4 and the motion was denied, so the owner was approved to remove the chimney.

RECORD OF ACTION:

DATE: October 9, 2020

SUBJECT: 14 Ellis Street - Certificate of Appropriateness (Violation)

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on October 8, 2020 the Newton Upper Falls Historic District Commission, by roll call vote of 5-2,

RESOLVED to deny a Certificate of Appropriateness for the project as submitted for 14 Ellis Street to raise the roof across the entire back of the house because the change to the gable ends and massing was not appropriate for the house; a design that read as a dormer would be appropriate.

Voting in the Affirmative (to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness):

Scott Aquilina, Member Paul Snyder, Member

Voting in the Negative (to deny a Certificate of Appropriateness):

Jeff Riklin, Chair Laurie Malcom, Member Judy Neville, Member
Jay Walter, Member John Wyman, Alternate

RECORD OF ACTION:

DATE: October 9, 2020

SUBJECT: 14 Ellis Street - Certificate of Hardship (Violation)

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on October 8, 2020 the Newton Upper Falls Historic District Commission, by roll call vote of 6-0, with one abstention

RESOLVED to grant a Certificate of Hardship for the project at 14 Ellis Street to raise the roof at the back of the house to provide more living space and make the house habitable **with the following required design changes to have the back read as a dormer: 1) a three-foot setback on both sides; 2) bring the roof edge down to approximately 10 inches above the window head; and 3) the eave condition will be continued across the base of the new dormer to divide the first story from the dormer. The revised design must be submitted to Staff for review and approval by the Commission architect.**

Voting in the Affirmative:

Jeff Riklin, Chair Scott Aquilina, Member Laurie Malcom, Member
Judy Neville, Member Jay Walter, Member John Wyman, Alternate

Abstaining:

Paul Snyder, Member

RECORD OF ACTION:

DATE: October 9, 2020

SUBJECT: 14 Ellis Street - Certificate of Appropriateness (Violation)

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on October 8, 2020 the Newton Upper Falls Historic District Commission, by roll call vote of 4-3,

RESOLVED to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness for the project as submitted for 14 Ellis Street to remove the existing chimney.

Voting in the Affirmative (to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness):

Jay Walter, Member John Wyman, Alternate
Scott Aquilina, Member Paul Snyder, Member

Voting in the Negative (to deny a Certificate of Appropriateness):

Jeff Riklin, Chair Laurie Malcom, Member Judy Neville, Member

Administrative Discussion

Minutes: The August and September meeting minutes were approved.

The meeting was adjourned at 10:00 p.m.

Recorded by Barbara Kurze, Senior Preservation Planner

22 Cliff Road – Certificate of Appropriateness

33-35 Sullivan Avenue – Certificate of Appropriateness

Note: Sullivan Avenue is a private street; the Commission has jurisdiction over elements that are visible from the surrounding public ways.

Note: At the April 2019 meeting, the owners were required to replace the diamond front entry porch lattice with vertical lattice per what the Commission approved, and to change the entry stair fascia and trim. Staff asked the owners to provide an update on those changes. If the changes have not been addressed, the Commission may deny new applications pending resolution and the owners can resubmit the current application once they comply.

959 Chestnut Street – Certificate of Appropriateness (Violation)

14 Ellis Street – Certificate of Appropriateness (Violation)

Note: When determining what is visible, the Commission does not take vegetation into account.

Note: In the January 2019 working session with the previous owner, Commission members indicated that raising the roof on the existing house could be considered depending on whether the design was appropriate.