



Ruthanne Fuller
Mayor

City of Newton, Massachusetts
Department of Planning and Development
1000 Commonwealth Avenue Newton, Massachusetts 02459

Telephone
(617) 796-1120
Telefax
(617) 796-1142
TDD/TTY
(617) 796-1089
www.newtonma.gov

Barney S. Heath
Director

**MINUTES OF PUBLIC MEETING AND PUBLIC HEARINGS
NEWTON HISTORICAL COMMISSION**

DATE: March 25, 2021

PLACE/TIME: Via Zoom

ATTENDING:

| | |
|--------------------------|-------------------------------------|
| Doug Cornelius, Chairman | Peter Dimond, Member |
| Katie Kubie, Member | Amanda Stauffer Park, Mem. |
| Mark Armstrong, Member | Jennifer Bentley-Houston, Alternate |
| Deborah Budd, Alternate | Katy Hax Holmes, Staff |
| See Attendance List | |

ABSENT: Nancy Grissom, Member

The meeting was called to order via Zoom at 7:00 p.m. with Doug Cornelius serving as Chair. Voting permanent members were Dimond, Park, Kubie, and Armstrong. Budd and Bentley-Houston were designated to vote as alternates. Katy Hax Holmes acted as Zoom host and the meeting was digitally recorded on the Zoom device.

1. **Armory Building, 1135-1137 Washington Street – Draft MOA Review (Ward 3)**
Request to review, possibly approve draft Memorandum of Agreement

Barney Heath and members of the Planning Department presented a draft of the Memorandum of Agreement to the Commission for its review and approval.

Staff reported that the Armory building on Washington Street will be acquired by the City for use as affordable housing. To enable a transfer of this property from state ownership to the City, a Memorandum of Agreement is required for signature by the Mayor and the Newton Historical Commission, at a minimum. This document will direct preparation of a Request for Proposals (RFP) for the City to hire a developer of the site that will respect the Armory's status as a historically significant structure.

Armstrong made a motion to approve the Memorandum of Agreement (MOA) as proposed and amended. Bentley-Houston seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on March 25, 2021, the Newton Historical Commission, by a vote of 7-0:

RESOLVED to approve the Memorandum of Agreement (MOA) as proposed and amended.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative: Recusal:

Doug Cornelius, Chair
Katie Kubie, Member
Peter Dimond, Member
Amanda Stauffer Park, Member
Mark Armstrong, Member
Jennifer Bentley-Houston, Alternate
Deb Budd, Alternate

2. **128 Chestnut Street, LL – As-Built Design Revision (Ward 3)**
Request to revise as-built design limiting brackets to front façade

Phil Porter, owner and Peter Sachs, architect, presented their reasoning behind not adding previously approved brackets to the rear façade eaves of the renovated local landmark at 128 Chestnut Street.

Staff reported that in 2016 this property was the subject of an application for full demolition. A delay was imposed by the NHC in that year, and in 2018 the property was subsequently designated a local landmark. The NHC approved moving the house forward on the lot to be closer to Chestnut Street and create a new buildable lot to the rear on Westfield Road. The NHC also approved the addition of a three-car garage to the house on the north side, as well as the preservation of architectural elements that were original to the house at its new location. In a recent request for NHC staff approval of the as-built design for a certificate of occupancy, staff review confirmed that roof-line brackets were not added to the rear façade as was shown in the NHC-approved designs. The owner was contacted about this omission, and the owner stated that this was intended to be a cost-cutting measure. The NHC was asked to approve the as-built house without the NHC-approved brackets on the rear elevation.

Commission members, abutters on Otis Street and Councilor Malakie all spoke in support of retaining the previously approved brackets.

Cornelius made a motion to approve a proposed change to the plans, and the as-built construction, so that previously approved brackets on the rear façade could be removed from the plan and not be added to the new construction. Budd seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on March 25, 2021, the Newton Historical Commission, by a vote of 0-7:

RESOLVED to approve a proposed change to the plans, and the as-built construction, to allow the owner to omit previously approved brackets from the architectural elements on the rear facade.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative: Recusal:

Doug Cornelius, Chair
Katie Kubie, Member
Peter Dimond, Member
Amanda Stauffer Park, Member
Mark Armstrong, Member
Jennifer Bentley-Houston, Alternate
Deb Budd, Alternate

The motion did not pass. The owner is required to add brackets to the rear façade in keeping with the previously approved plans.

3. **Westfield Residence (128 Chestnut rear lot), LL – Design Amendment (Ward 3)**
Request to approve new windows, siding, porch, pool, walls and other features

Treff LeFleche, architect for this project, presented his firm's plans to revise plans for a previously approved single-family residence at this location. Proposed revisions included windows (muntins to single-pane casements), moving the chimney from a central location to the south side, covering the poured concrete foundation with tile, adding a rear canopy, changing a section of vertical trim to zinc-coated copper paneling, and adding hardscape and a pool to the landscape.

Staff reported that owners of this property wish to return to the Commission with amended plans from those that were approved by the Commission at a previous hearing. As was referenced in the item above, this lot was subdivided from the larger lot at 128 Chestnut Street, which became a local landmark in 2018, and became a portion of the Landmark Site. Any development on new parcel comes under review by the NHC. Plans were previously approved by the NHC for a new single-family dwelling on the newly created lot, which showed muntin dividers on the windows, an enclosed rear porch, and a different siding material. The revised plans showed changes to all the above as well as the addition of a pool and hardscaping.

Discussion ensued as to the nature, scope and location of the revisions. Abutters commented on the proposed change in window design, the hardscape, and the proposed pool.

After an initial vote to approve all proposed changes to the house failed 2-4-1, the architect proposed separating out the proposed elements and the Commission agreed to hold a new vote.

Armstrong made a motion to approve the following proposed changes: the exterior sheathing materials as presented, the changed location of the chimney to the south side, the rear canopy, adding finished tile at the basement level, and a standing seam metal roof. This motion did not include the proposed changes to the windows, the pool and hardscaping, or fencing. Kubie seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on March 25, 2021, the Newton Historical Commission, by a vote of 5-1-1:

RESOLVED to approve the following proposed changes: the exterior sheathing materials as presented, the changed location of the chimney to the south side, the rear canopy, adding finished tile at the basement level, and a standing seam metal roof. This motion did not include the proposed changes to the windows.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative: Abstained:

Doug Cornelius, Chair

Katie Kubie, Member

Peter Dimond, Member

Amanda Stauffer Park, Member

Mark Armstrong, Member

Jennifer Bentley-Houston, Alternate

Deb Budd, Alternate

The Chair then proposed a motion to approve the hardscape and pool as proposed. There was no second to the motion, so the motion did not pass.

4. **94-96 Webster Street – Waiver Request (Ward 3)**
Request to waive demo delay

Ralph Kilfoyle, architect for this property, returned with revised replacement plans for the house with the hope of obtaining a waiver of the demo delay. This property was preferably preserved in October 2020 and the minimum four-month period elapsed. At the February hearing, Kilfoyle presented the proposed replacement plan. Commission members took issue with the projecting front garage and its prominence compared to that of the front entrance. Members were in support of the uneven fenestration and the two-story window element on the west front side. Members asked that more attention be given to the front entrance, and more of an effort made to reduce the prominence of the garage element.

In October, staff reported that the house at 96 Webster Street (now 94-96) was built on a lot from the “Webster Place” plan mapped by Alexander Wadsworth for William F. Porter in September 1844. The plan contained 83 lots in an area bounded by Pine Street (now Auburndale Ave.) and River Street on the north and Cherry Street in the east, and including lots on both sides of Webster Street on the south and Grove Street (now Webster Park) on the west. The National Register District boundary for the Webster Park Historic District ends two lots west of this one. This property is not included in the district, likely because the house was asphalt-shingled when the property was surveyed in the 1980s.

This worker cottage house shows a construction date of 1845 on the city’s GIS maps. Maps and documentary research take this house back to at least c.1850, and Engineering records show evidence of the house standing by 1844. In 1868 and 1874, this parcel, which backed onto Cheese Cake Brook, was owned by Dr. Leonard M. Fitch, a dentist who worked in Boston. Fitch was still the owner in 1880, when the house had a front porch and an attached hennery at the rear. By 1886, the property was owned by C.H. and Annie L. Jennison. Charles H. appears in directories as working in the ‘express.’ Annie continued to live there through at least 1897. The ISD permit file for this property is missing, so permitted work to the house is not known. By 1915, the owner was Fuge Woodward, wire chief. By 1929 the Crescitelli family was the owner, because in that year they sold the property to Pasquale Leumbruno. The Leumbruno family sold it to the Frederick J. Johnson family in 1946, who continued to own it through at least 2017. This house is one of four on this street that appear on an 1848 map of Newton. This house appears to have asbestos siding, replacement windows, and the loss of the front porch (and likely the rear hennery) but is an extant example of architecture from the 1840s in a micro-neighborhood of similarly aged homes.

Mr. Kilfoyle presented the revised plans, and Commission members agreed that the entrance was now the more prominent element on the front façade.

Armstrong made a motion to waive the demo delay on 94-96 Webster Street based on revised plans as requested by the Commission. Cornelius seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on March 25, 2021, the Newton Historical Commission, by a vote of 6-0-1:

RESOLVED to waive the demo delay on 94-96 Webster Street based on revised plans as requested by the Commission.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative: Abstained:

Doug Cornelius, Chair
Katie Kubie, Member
Peter Dimond, Member

Amanda Stauffer Park, Member

Mark Armstrong, Member
Jennifer Bentley-Houston, Alternate
Deb Budd, Alternate

5. **38 Richardson Street, NR – Full/Partial Demolition Review (Ward 1)**
Request to demolish garage/barn, add to rear of house

Terry Morris, attorney for the owner, told the Commission the owner intended to preserve the house by adding on, and in doing so needed to demolish the rear barn.

Staff reported that built in 1851 and known as the Andrew Cole House, this Italianate-Style property contributes to the Farlow and Kenrick Parks National Register Historic District in Newton Corner. According to the nomination for this property, the barn was an c.1851 original element. The owner provided photos of the interior of the barn. Bay windows on the east side of the house, and the rear addition, are believed to have been added c.1910. The owner proposed to demolish the barn and add onto the house at the rear.

Andrew Cole was a Boston merchant who sold East India Co. goods. He married in 1827 and is believed to have lived elsewhere in Newton before moving into this house. Richardson Street was named for John H. Richardson of Watertown, who owned and subdivided these house lots in 1844. The surveyor for this and neighboring properties was Alexander Wadsworth, who is best known for his pocket-park subdivisions in Newton and for surveying Mount Auburn Cemetery in Cambridge, which was emblematic of the Parks Movement in both housing and rural cemeteries. This street was originally named Elm Street on Richardson's plan. Both Richardson and Cole were founding directors of Newton National Bank. In the 1870s William Garrett, a piano tuner, lived here with his family and his wife taught music lessons. In 1885 the owner was Robert F. Cummings, manager of a bookstore in Boston. Subsequent owners can be found in the NR-nomination for this property. Staff recommended the barn and house preferably preserved for architectural integrity and historic context with an 18-month demo delay imposed.

Staff asked the applicant to show photos taken of the interior of the barn and told the Commission she did not believe this barn was constructed in 1851. Commission members agreed that the balloon framing evidenced in the photos suggested a later date of construction.

Cornelius made a motion to preferably preserve the barn at 38 Richardson Street. Dimond seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on March 25, 2021, the Newton Historical Commission, by a vote of 2-5:

RESOLVED to preferably preserve the barn at 38 Richardson Street.

| <u>Voting in the Affirmative:</u> | <u>Voting in the Negative:</u> | <u>Abstained:</u> |
|-------------------------------------|--------------------------------|-------------------|
| | Doug Cornelius, Chair | |
| | Katie Kubie, Member | |
| Peter Dimond, Member | Amanda Stauffer Park, Member | |
| | Mark Armstrong, Member | |
| Jennifer Bentley-Houston, Alternate | Deb Budd, Alternate | |

The vote to preserve the barn did not pass. The barn is not preferably preserved.

The Commission then voted on whether to preferably preserve the house.

Cornelius made a motion to preferably preserve the house at 38 Richardson Street. Armstrong seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on March 25, 2021, the Newton Historical Commission, by a vote of 7-0:

RESOLVED to preferably preserve the house at 38 Richardson Street.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative: Abstained:

Doug Cornelius, Chair
Katie Kubie, Member
Peter Dimond, Member
Amanda Stauffer Park, Member
Mark Armstrong, Member
Jennifer Bentley-Houston, Alternate
Deb Budd, Alternate

The owner told the Commission he would repair and stabilize the foundation of the house in place and had no plans to lift it off the foundation to pour a new one. The brackets would also be preserved in place, and the rear addition would use the same vocabulary as the main house. The windows would be replaced with SDLs with interior spacer bars and exterior mounted muntins. The siding would also be replaced with clapboard.

Armstrong made a motion to waive the demo delay on 38 Richardson Street based on approved plans for a rear addition. Bentley-Houston seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on March 25, 2021, the Newton Historical Commission, by a vote of 7-0:

RESOLVED to waive the demo delay on 38 Richardson Street based on approved plans for a rear addition.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative: Abstained:

Doug Cornelius, Chair
Katie Kubie, Member
Peter Dimond, Member
Amanda Stauffer Park, Member
Mark Armstrong, Member
Jennifer Bentley-Houston, Alternate
Deb Budd, Alternate

6. **424 Cherry Street, LL - Design Revision Review (Ward 3)**
Request to amend NHC approval of design for new building on site

Terry Morris, attorney representing the owner, presented the owner's plan to re-grade the previously approved site. No changes to the new building on the site were proposed, as it turned out.

Staff reported that the owner of this landmarked property came before this Commission for review in August 2017 with plans to add a second structure to the parcel. The architect for the project, Ron Jarek, presented on behalf of the owner. The owner had originally planned to amend the approved plans for the new structure.

At the August 2017 hearing, staff reported that this property was listed as one of Newton's 21 designated Local Landmarks, and that this building is located at the corner of Washington and Cherry Streets and was constructed c.1716. The landmarks report for this property is enclosed in your packets. The current owners are proposing to add dormers to the west side of the roof of the landmarked property and renovate the interior for use as housing units. A new detached building for more housing units is proposed for the north side of the lot, where a historic home once stood years ago. As a Landmark Preservation Site, the Commission had review over the design of the proposed new construction as well as the dormers on the landmarked structure.

In August, Mr. Jarek emphasized that the building on this site was moved here in the 1800s and had been added to and modified over time. The Commission discussed the proposal for both existing and new structures and reviewed the proposed schematics for each. Both the dormer and the new house were presented in multiple possible schemes. The Commission stated that the new building should be subordinate to the historic one and generally not try to replicate its architectural detail. The Commission was told that both buildings would be the same height. The Commission also stated that the proportional relationship between the new and old buildings was more important than the architectural detail of the new structure. The Commission asked that detailed schematics be presented for both buildings and streetscape views of the site to show the proposed viewsheds from all angles. The Commission said it also wanted to see 12/12 window configurations used in the landmarked structure. This project came back before the Commission in November 2017, but there was no approval. A design for the new building was finally approved in 2018.

Dimond made a motion to amend the Certificate of Appropriateness previously issued for work at 424-423 Cherry Street based on the revised grading plan as presented. Armstrong seconded the motion. Budd left the meeting and did not vote on this item.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on March 25, 2021, the Newton Historical Commission, by a vote of 6-0:

RESOLVED to amend the Certificate of Appropriateness previously issued for work at 424-423 Cherry Street based on the revised grading plan as presented.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative: Abstained:

Doug Cornelius, Chair
Katie Kubie, Member
Peter Dimond, Member
Amanda Stauffer Park, Member
Mark Armstrong, Member
Jennifer Bentley-Houston, Alternate

7. **219 Mill Street – Partial Demolition Review (Ward 2)**
Request to add to side, rear

The owner of this property, Josh Mandel, presented his plan to add onto the side porch and the rear façade with new additions.

Staff reported that the current owners of the house wished to remove the side porch and the rear façade for new additions. Built in 1922, this Colonial Revival house was owned, designed and constructed by Vincent E.

Squires, a builder who lived on Bellingham Street in Newton Highlands. He was originally from Vermont. A year later, Squires obtained a permit to add a dormer on the third floor (perhaps at the rear?) and enclosed the side porch on the first floor, and sold the house to Harold H. Ellis, listed in census records as a manager, and his family. In 1926, Ellis sold the property to Helen S. Ranney, a secretary and widow who lived at this address for five years before selling it to Harold H. Lounsberry, a salesman who lived here with his family for 35 years, the longest period of time of any of its owners. The house was built on spec during an intensive period of housing growth in Newton and is located in a neighborhood of similarly aged and designed homes. Staff recommended preferably preserving this house for historic context.

Cornelius made a motion to preferably preserve the property at 219 Mill Street. Dimond seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on March 25, 2021, the Newton Historical Commission, by a vote of 5-1:

RESOLVED to preferably preserve the property at 219 Mill Street.

| <u>Voting in the Affirmative:</u> | <u>Voting in the Negative:</u> | <u>Abstained:</u> |
|-----------------------------------|--------------------------------|-------------------|
| | Doug Cornelius, Chair | |

Katie Kubie, Member
Peter Dimond, Member
Amanda Stauffer Park, Member
Mark Armstrong, Member
Jennifer Bentley-Houston, Alternate

The owner described his project, and discussion ensued as to the proposed window styles and size of the additions.

Armstrong made a motion to waive the demo delay at 219 Mill Street based on approved plans. Cornelius seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on March 25, 2021, the Newton Historical Commission, by a vote of 5-1:

RESOLVED to waive the demo delay at 219 Mill Street based on approved plans.

| <u>Voting in the Affirmative:</u> | <u>Voting in the Negative:</u> | <u>Abstained:</u> |
|-----------------------------------|-------------------------------------|-------------------|
| Doug Cornelius, Chair | | |
| Katie Kubie, Member | | |
| Peter Dimond, Member | | |
| Amanda Stauffer Park, Member | | |
| Mark Armstrong, Member | | |
| | Jennifer Bentley-Houston, Alternate | |

8. **134 Fairway Drive – Demolition Review (Ward 3)**
Request to demolish buildings

Stephen Eastman, owner of this property, presented his plan to demolish the house and replace it with a new one. He told the Commission he lived in this house with his family for eight years and it was time to replace it.

Staff reported that the owner wished to demolish this house. Built in 1940, this house appears to have been a Cape Style house that was converted to its current appearance, which would have matched the Cape aesthetic on the street prior to the dormers that were added to both roof slopes. The first owner of this house is listed as Margaret M. Fitzgerald of Medford, with her husband Thomas listed as architect and builder, and they do not appear to have lived here. This is the only permit in the ISD file for this property. This property has been involved in land court and ownership history has been difficult to determine, except that current owners bought this house in 2013 from Eric and Debra Hill. There has been some development activity on the street, and other capes have been added onto and/or converted to different styles. This house has been altered enough that it no longer fits the aesthetic of the street. Staff recommended not preferably preserving this house.

Discussion ensued amongst Commission members as to whether this house conformed with the historic context of this neighborhood.

Cornelius made a motion to preferably preserve the property at 134 Fairway Drive for historic context. Kubie seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on March 25, 2021, the Newton Historical Commission, by a vote of 4-2:

RESOLVED to preferably preserve the property at 134 Fairway Drive for historic context.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative: Abstained:

Doug Cornelius, Chair

Katie Kubie, Member

Peter Dimond, Member

Amanda Stauffer Park, Member

Mark Armstrong, Member

Jennifer Bentley-Houston, Alternate

The motion passed. This property is preferably preserved for one year.

9. **33 Cragmore Road – Demolition Review (Ward 5)**
Request to demolish buildings

The owner of this property presented his plan to demolish the house at this location and replace it with a new one.

Staff reported that the owner wished to demolish this house. This Cape Style house was constructed post-war in 1946 in a small grouping of other capes on the south side of Cragmore Road. There has been some development activity closer to Route 9, but the capes appear to remain intact. The original permit for this house is the only building permit in the file. Harry Yarros of Dorchester, a builder, is listed on the 1946 permit as the original owner, architect and builder. Ashton Realty Co. sold the property in 1947 to its first occupants, Sheldon C. St. John, a captain in the US Navy, and his wife Margaret. In 1968 they sold the property to the Ryder family. With the exception of replacement windows and new siding, this property appears to have changed little since it was built. Staff recommended preferably preserving this house for historic context.

Cornelius made a motion to preferably preserve the property at 33 Cragmore Road for historic context. Bentley-Houston seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on March 25, 2021, the Newton Historical Commission, by a vote of 3-3:

RESOLVED to preferably preserve the property at 33 Cragmore Road for historic context.

| | | |
|-----------------------------------|--------------------------------|-------------------|
| <u>Voting in the Affirmative:</u> | <u>Voting in the Negative:</u> | <u>Abstained:</u> |
|-----------------------------------|--------------------------------|-------------------|

| | | |
|-------------------------------------|------------------------------|--|
| | Doug Cornelius, Chair | |
| | Katie Kubie, Member | |
| Peter Dimond, Member | | |
| | Amanda Stauffer Park, Member | |
| Mark Armstrong, Member | | |
| Jennifer Bentley-Houston, Alternate | | |

The vote was tied, so the motion did not pass. This property is not preferably preserved.

10. **53 Morton Street – Demolition Review (Ward 2)**
Request to demolish buildings

No owner was present for this item.

Staff reported that the owner wished to demolish this house. Built in 1915, this property was owned by C.C. Streeter and C.D. Young, of Streeter & Young, who owned the subdivided land in a portion of this neighborhood. The house was designed and built by S.H. Leary of Winthrop, MA. The name 'Leary' does not come up on MACRIS as an architect of note. The only other permit in the file was for a metal garage to stand at the southwest corner of the property in 1945, but clearly work was done to enclose the front porch, add a large front dormer, and replace all the windows. This property was not previously surveyed and stands in a neighborhood of other late-teens and early 1920s homes. There has been little in the way of demolition activity in the immediate vicinity of this property.

By 1918, the first owner was Marion C. Eichorn, who did not live there, and sold it to Michael McMullen, an Irish immigrant and retail broker and his family. Four years later they sold the property to Waldo C. Peebles, a professor, who lived at this address for the next 26 years with his family. Ralph W. Freeman, listed as a president-treasurer, bought the property and in 1961 sold it to Norman and Esther Hartstone, listed as treasurer, who continued to live here until at least the 2000s. This house is not of a unique architectural style, nor was it designed by an architect or inhabited by persons of note in Newton, was constructed in similar style and period to others in the immediate neighborhood. Staff recommended preferably preserving this property for historic context.

Cornelius made a motion to preferably preserve the property at 53 Morton Road for historic context. There was no second for the motion, so the motion did not pass. This property is not preferably preserved.

Administrative Discussion:

a) Minutes from February hearing.

Minutes from the February hearing were unanimously approved by those in attendance at the February hearing.

Applications for full demolition that were found to be clearly not historically significant and not brought to the hearing:

- None

The meeting was adjourned by unanimous vote at 10:05 p.m.

Administrative Approvals this month:

Key:

Partial demos (PD)

Full demo (D)

Garage (G)

Accessory Apartment (AA)

Waiver (W)

Addresses

| | | |
|---------------------------|------------------|-----------|
| 10 Burdean Road | 3/5/2021 | PD |
| 775 Dedham Street | 2/19/2021 | PD |
| 6 Brush Hill Road | 3/22/2021 | PD |
| 120 Bigelow Road | 2/22/2021 | PD |
| 30 Shady Hill Road | 3/1/2021 | PD |
| 125 Winslow Road | 3/4/2021 | PD |

Respectfully,

Katy Hax Holmes, NHC