

Ruthanne Fuller Mayor

Barney S. Heath Director Planning & Development

Members
Doug Cornelius, Chair
Mark Armstrong
Nancy Grissom
Peter Dimond
Katie Kubie

Amanda Stauffer Park

Deborah Budd, Alternate

Jennifer Bentley-Houston, Alt.

1000 Commonwealth Ave. Newton, MA 02459 T 617-796-1120 F 617-796-1142

www.newtonma.gov

* AGENDA *

Date: July 22, 2021 Time: 7:00 p.m.

Place: https://us02web.zoom.us/j/85663852867 or

+16465588656,,85663852867#

18 Station Avenue, Newton Highland Station Accessibility Project (Ward 6)
Request to make accessibility alterations to MBTA Station property

A team of MBTA staff and their consultants will return to the NHC to present a revised presentation to the NHC for its review of proposed accessibility alterations to the Newton Highlands MBTA station land.

On May 27th, 2021, Leo Murphy, Stephen Farr, and Virginia Adams, consultant, presented on behalf of the MBTA to add ramping, canopies, and walls to the grounds surrounding the Highlands T Station building that are protected under a Preservation Restriction.

At that hearing, staff reported that representatives from the MBTA would present their plan to make accessibility alterations to the Newton Highlands T Station on land that is protected under a Preservation Easement. The improvements would begin at sidewalk-level and descend to the train platform. This and all other Newton T station buildings also have architectural protections under a covenant with the Massachusetts Historical Commission.

At the May hearing, the MBTA presented its plan to use steel construction and beaming, since wood and stone did not meet the goals of this project. Commission members commented that the design and materials proposed were incompatible with the historic train station. Several abutters, including Marty Friedman, Serge, Patricia Riggin, and Rena Goetz, told the MBTA the proposed ramp proposal was not in keeping with the Secretary of Interior standards; that canopies over all the ramping space were not visually cohesive with the train station building; that it may not be necessary to have every entrance to the station accessible, since other stations in Newton did not provide accessibility at every entrance; that abutters should trust their intuition in viewing this proposed project, and see it as a 'monstrosity' that will look worse as it ages; and that the presentation contained false information, since many trees in the vicinity would likely come down for this project.

The MBTA told the assembled that canopies were required over every ramp in accordance with its board standards.

The NHC unanimously approved a motion to request that the MBTA prepare 3-D images showing the areas affected by the two proposed ramps, not at street level, and include rocks and swale in the imagery to give the NHC a better sense of scale of the proposed project.

31 Greenwood Street, LL – Request for Certificate of Appropriateness (Ward 8)
Request to install new hardscaping, porch, mailbox

The barn at this address is a local landmark in partnership with the house next door at 29 Greenwood Street. In 2017, an in-kind replication of the historic barn was approved by the Newton Historical Commission, and a Certificate of Occupancy was issued last month for the completed project. The new owner of the property wishes to install fencing, new hardscaping, a screened porch, and a mailbox on the property. Plans for the proposed work will be presented by the new owners.

3. 60 Esty Farm Road – Demolition Review (Ward 8)

Request to demolish buildings

Built in 1958 by Sunny Lane Homes, this home was designed by Ralph I. Williams of Wollaston as the team architect. Along with June Road, this is a surveyed neighborhood of Contemporary, split level and ranch style homes. According to the area form for this surveyed district, 60 Esty Farm Road is cited as an example of William's architectural contributions to the neighborhood: "architect R. I. Williams introduced a third form of split-level to the area in 1958, with over one dozen examples of the form built along Esty Farm Road in 1958 and 1959. Among these "flying wing" splits,is 60 Esty Farm Road [1959, photo 7)... A major feature of this house form is the asymmetrical, front-gable roof with exposed beams; the peak of the roof is centered above the entry-garage-bedroom stack, and the long slope sweeps down over the living room-basement stack. Exterior end-wall chimneys are narrow and deep in footprint and pierce the overhanging eaves on the living room side of the houses." The only permit on file for this property is the original one. The original owner was Zolman Helfand, a surgeon, and his family. Williams is noted for designs of buildings in Brookline but is most noted for his association with this development company and the post-war aesthetic of large swaths of buildings in Newton. Staff recommends preferably preserving this property.

4. 34 Esty Farm Road – Demolition Review (Ward 8)

Request to demolish buildings

This house was also constructed in 1959 by Sunny Lane Homes of Newton and designed by Ralph I. Williams of Wollaston. Clearly a planned development aesthetic was the overall goal for the neighborhood in keeping with the architectural design tenets mentioned in the previous narrative. In 1976 under the ownership of Bernard Gitlin, a rear living-room/bedroom addition and sundeck was designed by Stanley Myers of 21 Manet Circle. Bernard Gitlin, listed in directories as an engineer, lived here with his family for decades and well into the 2000s. Staff recommends preferably preserving this property.

5. 18 Annawan Road – Demolition Review (Ward 5)

Request to demolish buildings

Built in 1911, this house was owned by Helen P. and Fred S. Gourley, sales manager and copper broker, and designed in the Craftsman Style by James G. Hutchison of 101 Tremont Street in Boston. Two of Hutchison's later projects can be found in Newton at 150 and 1452 Beacon Street, built in 1925 and 1915, respectively. The property at 150 Beacon Street is listed on the State Register and is included in the Chestnut Hill Historic District, and the house at 1452 Beacon was also designed in the Craftsman Style. Hutchison practiced in the Boston area from 1898 to the 1920s. Alterations to the property included a new garage in 1922; a side porch was removed and replaced in 1923; a screened porch was added in 1961 under the ownership of Abraham J. Goldberg, an architect; a rear addition was constructed in 1996, and a kitchen addition in 2004; and various windows were replaced over time. The Gourley family resided here from 1911 to the late 1950s, followed by the Goldberg family in the 1960s and 70s. This is a well-preserved and high-style example of Craftsman Style architecture in Waban and staff recommends preferably preserving the property.

6. 172 Pearl Street - Demolition Review (Ward 1)

Request to demolish buildings

According to the Engineering Division, this house was constructed in the 1840s. Known as the Benjamin Seward House, a recent survey form attributed a c.1850 date to this house and drew the following conclusion about this property: "The house at 172 Pearl Street, built in ca. 1850, is an altered example of domestic architecture built in Newton during its early suburban period. Although built as an independent house, for many years it was associated with the Benjamin Sewall House at 105 Waban Street."

Benjamin Sewall came to Newton from Maine in the 1850s and first settled at 105 Waban Street. This house was occupied by renters until the property was sold to Sewall in 1865. Sewell was an entrepreneur who became interested in the cordage business in the 1830s and ran a successful company well into the 1870s until he left Newton for Boston. The house was made available to renters again in the 1870s and continued

to be so until 1910 when an Irish immigrant, William F, Boucher, a carpenter, bought the property. The Boucher family and his descendants lived here through at least the 1960s. The survey form for this property goes into greater detail about the tenants of this property.

Most of the additions appear to have been constructed during the Boucher family ownership and were likely done so by Boucher. In 1913 Boucher constructed a two-story addition with a pitch roof. In 1915, Boucher built a shed. In 1923, he pulled a permit to rebuild and widen the piazza on a concrete foundation. A concrete block garage was constructed a year earlier at the back of the lot. This is a very earlier property in Nonantum but one which, unsurprisingly, has undergone numerous changes over time. Staff recommends not preferably preserving this house.

7. 56 Littlefield Road – Demolition Review (Ward 8)

Request to demolish buildings

Built in 1947, this Ranch Style house was constructed by Waverley Construction Company of Dorchester and designed by J. William Greymount of Newtonville. Greymount designed other pre- and post-war suburban homes in Boston and Quincy as well as homes in Newton from 1935 to about 1955. This Ranch Style house was described as a brick and wood single family dwelling. In 1960 under the ownership of Ida Isgur, whose spouse worked in oil (and died in 1951), a rear addition was constructed. This house is in a neighborhood of other similarly designed post-war homes, many single-family, and exterior changes to it appear to be limited to the rear addition from 1960. Staff recommends this property preferably preserved.

8. 4 Clarendon Street – Partial Demolition Review (Ward 2)

Request to add second story

Built in 1926 in the Bungalow Style, this house was constructed by Rufus Rogers and designed by W. M. Haines, both of Waltham. Haines was known locally for his institutional designs such as Waltham High School; for single-story commercial structures in Waltham; and homes in Brookline, Newton, Waltham, Wellesley and Weston. Of the 14 that were previously surveyed, three are listed on the State Register. This appears to be the only Bungalow Style home he designed. In 1928, under the ownership of J.W. Limric, an insurance broker, an outside chimney was constructed for a fireplace. A detached garage was constructed the same year by the same design team, and in 1957 was extended "to accommodate modern car." The proposed project at this address is to add a second story. Staff recommends preferably preserving this property.

9. 6 Brush Hill Road – Partial Demolition Review (Ward 8)

Request to construct additions

This house was built in 1935 and owned, designed and built by Davis & Vaughn Realty Trust of 237 Dedham Street in Newton Highlands. Commission members may recall this team also designed and built the house at 20 Bound Brook Road in 1934, which this Commission preferably preserved at the May 2021 NHC hearing. Victor H. Vaughn lived at 69 Commonwealth Park in Newton in a house designed by the two, and owned several lots in the Day Street area, which were also developed by them. Davis appears in census info as a designer and architect who lived at one time in Newtonville.

The house had one owner through the 1940s, 50s and 60s: Alex J. McFarland, a lawyer, who moved here with his family from Glen Avenue in Newton Center. As with other Depression-era homes in Newton, the design incorporated Colonial Revival elements into an architecturally simplified interpretation. Staff recommends preferably preserving this property.

10. 46-48 Athelstane Road - Waiver Request (Ward 6)

Request to waive demo delay

Reid Diamond, owner of this property, will present his revised plan to demolish the house and replace it with a different one than he built next door. Plans presented at the June 2021 hearing were not approved for a waiver.

At the February 25th hearing, staff reported that built in 1927 by Daniel A. Hagen as a two-family house, this is one of several two-family homes on this block that were owned, designed, and constructed by Hagen. Initially living in Dorchester and later at 92 Athelstane, Hagen was a widower and builder from Canada who immigrated to the US in 1922. This typical 1920s architecture is blocky in appearance and is in a relatively unchanged section of Athelstane Road. Early occupants in the house were renters, but by 1946 the unit at #46 was owner-occupied by families headed by engineers, accountants, treasurers, and insurance agents. The house, and its immediate neighborhood, retains the same massing, scale and general appearance as it did when these two -family homes were constructed in the mid-to-late 1920s.

At the June 2021 hearing, Commission members reviewed the proposed replacement plans and found them wanting. Areas that were identified as needing further work: the side-pediment needed a window; the plans were not depicted in relation to the recently completed project next door; there were windowless walls for no apparent reason; and the building had no architectural cohesion. The owner agreed to revise the plans and attend a future hearing. No vote was taken and the demo-delay on the property was not waived.

11. 134 Fairway Drive – Waiver Request (Ward 3)

Request to waive demo delay

Stephen Eastman, owner of this property, will present his plan to demolish the house and replace it with a new one. He told the Commission he lived in this house with his family for eight years and it was time to replace it. The required minimum four-month period after the demo delay was imposed has elapsed.

At the March 25th hearing, staff reported that the owner wished to demolish this house. Built in 1940, this house appears to have been a Cape Style house that was converted to its current appearance, which would have matched the Cape aesthetic on the street prior to the dormers that were added to both roof slopes. The first owner of this house is listed as Margaret M. Fitzgerald of Medford, with her husband Thomas listed as architect and builder, and they do not appear to have lived here. This is the only permit in the ISD file for this property. This property has been involved in land court and ownership history has been difficult to determine, except that current owners bought this house in 2013 from Eric and Debra Hill. There has been some development activity on the street, and other capes have been added onto and/or converted to different styles. This house has been altered enough that it no longer fits the aesthetic of the street.

12. 1917-1919 Commonwealth Avenue – Waiver Request (Ward 4)

Request to waive demo delay

The owner is returning to the Commission to present a proposed plan in the hope of obtaining a waiver. This property was preferably preserved in February 2021 and the minimum required four- month period has elapsed.

At the February hearing, staff reported that built in 1930, this house was owned by M.J. Toohy and designed and built by W.E. Toohy, both of Weston, MA as a two-family dwelling among four very similar two-family homes on this block of Commonwealth Avenue. Building permits for work to this Colonial Revival-Style building are limited to a rear stair in 1967 under the ownership of Phillip Erlich, and replacement of 12 windows in 2012. In 1932 one side was vacant and the other side was occupied by Jules P. Chartrand, a Canadian immigrant and salesman, and family. They continued to live there in 1934, and by that year Edwin H. Dyer, who worked in insurance, resided in #1919. Recent owners have been the Rossi family from at least the 1980s, and tenants over time did not contribute to the significance of Newton. This house is vinyl sided and is not representative of an architectural style or designer with significance to Newton. Staff recommended not preferably preserving this structure.

13. Westfield Road, LL – Request for Certificate of Appropriateness (Ward 3)

Request to install hardscaping, landscaping, pool

At the March 2021 NHC hearing, Treff LeFleche, architect for this project, presented a Certificate of Appropriateness application for revisions to the approved house design and hardscape at this location. Plans

for a new house at this location came under NHC review because this site was preserved as a Landmark Preservation Site when it was subdivided from the landmarked lot at 128 Chestnut Street. By a vote of 5-1-1, the NHC approved a motion at the March 25th hearing to allow the following proposed changes to the house design under the previously issued Certificate of Appropriateness: the exterior sheathing materials as presented, the changed location of the chimney to the south side, the rear canopy, adding finished tile at the basement level, and a standing seam metal roof. This motion did not include the proposed changes to the windows, the pool and hardscaping, or fencing. The Chair then proposed a motion to approve the hardscape and pool as proposed. There was no second to the motion, so the motion did not pass.

The owner and design team plan to return to the Commission with a revised plan for hardscaping, fencing, and a pool.

Administrative Items

Annual election of NHC Chair

From the Rules and Regs: "There shall be one organizational meeting per year on the fourth Thursday in July at which a Chair shall be elected **from the permanent members**. The City Clerk shall be notified of the elections." (bold type is mine – Katy)

Discussion re: fines