To Newton Historic Commission

From: Jay C. Walter AIA & Russel Feldman AIA Re: Gershom Hyde House, 29 Greenwood Street

Application of the Secretary's Standards for Historic Preservation

As directed by Landmark Preservation Ordinance, Sec. 22-66, the Commission is to consider "the historical and architectural value, and significance" of the original building and any proposed renovation, new construction or addition. Towards this end, we have reviewed "The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Treatment of Historic Properties" to assess what guidance they might provide to the Commission in its review of the proposal for the Gershom Hyde House redevelopment.

The comprehensive document is at <a href="https://www.nps.gov/tps/standards/treatment-guidelines-2017.pdf">https://www.nps.gov/tps/standards/treatment-guidelines-2017.pdf</a>. It provides a great deal of guidance on appropriate measures to take when considering design and construction of projects on historic structures and sites. We encourage you to review it directly.

By way of assessing its relevance to your consideration, we quote from the introduction (p.2): "Under the National Historic Preservation Act (NHPA), the Secretary of the Interior is responsible for establishing professional standards and for providing guidance on the preservation of the nation's historic properties. [These standards] are intended to be applied to a wide variety of resource types, including buildings, sites, structures, objects, and districts. The Standards address four treatments: preservation, rehabilitation, restoration, and reconstruction."

Of the four treatment categories, both *Preservation* and *Rehabilitation* relate to work performed on existing historic fabric. *Preservation* envisions "measures necessary to sustain the existing form, integrity, and materials of an historic property." Similarly, *Rehabilitation* applies to work performed "through repair, alterations, and additions" to historic properties. There is no longer any historic fabric that survives on the exterior of the Gershom Hyde House, so these treatments are not relevant.

This leaves *Restoration* and *Reconstruction*. *Restoration* relates to "depiction of a building at a particular time in its history by preserving materials, features, finishes, and spaces from its period." This generally applies to museums and other facilities intended to evoke a prior age, and does not apply to this proposal, which involves repurposing this structure for contemporary residential use and will not be open to the public.

**Reconstruction** is the most applicable approach. The Secretary's Standards define **Reconstruction** as "...the act or process of depicting, by means of new construction, the form, features,

and detailing of a non-surviving site, landscape, building, structure, or object for the purpose of replicating its appearance at a specific period of time and in its historic location."

**Reconstruction** has the most limited application however "because so few resources that are no longer extant can be documented to the degree necessary to accurately recreate the property in a manner that conveys its appearance at a particular point in history." (p.3)

**Reconstruction** "will be used to depict vanished or non-surviving portions of a property when documentary and physical evidence is available to permit accurate reconstruction with minimal conjecture and such reconstruction is essential to the public understanding of the property." (p.226) The requirement for documentary and physical evidence is not a passing stipulation, rather it is essential. The Standards for Reconstruction state:

"Reconstruction will be based on the accurate duplication of historic features and elements substantiated by documentary or physical evidence rather than on conjectural designs or the availability of different features from other historic properties." (p.226, emphasis added)

"Reconstructing a historic building should only be considered when there is accurate documentation on which to base it. (p.227)

"It is *never appropriate* to base a Reconstruction upon conjectural designs or on features from other buildings." (p.228, emphasis added)

This therefore requires that the Commission assess the documentation employed on this proposed reconstruction. Typical documentation includes measured drawings of existing conditions including plans and elevations accurate at least to the inch, and details including profiles of trim and woodwork, existing construction framing, wall sections, stairs, railings and special features.

It is our understanding that this proposal is based on calculations from Google Earth relative to site and structure including site elevation and eave heights, and inspection of portions of the remaining heavy timber frame and surviving remnants of eaves and windows. Because the demolition was performed before there was any attempt at documenting the existing conditions, the investigations performed by Mr. Lang after the fact was of necessity extremely limited. Ensuing details of windows, doors, siding, eaves and trim were largely taken from other projects designed by Mr. Lang. The resulting proposal is very largely conjectural. As such, it does not meet the standards established by the Secretary of the Interior.

On this basis, we suggest that the Commission is being asked to approve a proposal for recreating a landmark structure that does not meet any of the standards for treatment of an historic property as established by the Department of the Interior and as practiced by architects, builders and preservationists throughout the Commonwealth. If approved, the resulting construction would be of little historic value to the community. In addition, as a precedent for the treatment of a local landmark, it would not advance the cause of historic preservation in Massachusetts.

valence Birmini	J				
From:	David Goodson <dzgoodson@gmail.com></dzgoodson@gmail.com>				
Sent: To:	Tuesday, October 26, 2021 6:27 PM				
Subject:	Valerie Birmingham 29 Greenwood St. violation				
	25 Greenwood St. Woldtiell				
Follow Up Flag:	Flag for follow up				
Flag Status:	Flagged				
[DO NOT OPEN lir	nks/attachments unless you are sure the content is safe. ]				
	October 26, 2021				
Dear Historical Co	mmission Members,				
	the developer who bought and then illegally destroyed the historical home at 29 Greenwood St. will ou a plan to build what he claims will be a replica as remediation for his crime. I ask that you deny				
residence. The devicendition that he pout then the Commof just \$1000—muthe neighborhood	itnessed the illegal demolition of the historic house at 28 Sumner St., which is next door to my veloper had been granted a special permit to build more densely than allowed by zoning on the preserve the 1835 structure. A stop-work order was issued after abutters reported the demolition, missioner of Inspectional Services allowed him to continue the project after imposing a nominal fine ach less than the cost of refurbishing the historic structure to bring it up to code. Complaints from to the mayor's office were ignored and I was told by the chair of the city council's land use here was nothing the city council could do about it.				
promise to restore with no penalty be new developer fro	become standard procedure for greedy developers: Buy an historic structure in need of restoration, it is in your power now to put a stop to this practice by preventing this profiting from the demolition of an historic landmark and thereby putting others on notice that r be able to get away with this.				
Sincerely,					
David Goodson					

20 Sumner St.

**Newton Centre** 

From: Matilda Bruckner <matilda.bruckner@bc.edu>

**Sent:** Wednesday, October 27, 2021 7:38 AM **To:** Valerie Birmingham; rfuller@newtonm.gov

**Cc:** Stephen Farrell **Subject:** 29 Greenwood

Follow Up Flag: Flag for follow up

Flag Status: Flagged

## [DO NOT OPEN links/attachments unless you are sure the content is safe. ]

#### **Dear Commissioners:**

It is my understanding that at the October 28 NHC hearing, the developer who destroyed the Landmark Gershom Hyde House at 29 Greenwood has requested that you review his plans to remediate his violation because he cannot restore the house. I request that you vote to deny his request to build a replica.

I agree with the letter of October 18, 2021 that the Commission received signed by seven distinguished Newton Lawyers which clearly outlines your authority and concludes:

"Mr. Gupta must not be granted authority to rebuild that which he has illegally destroyed. To allow otherwise, would be to gut the language and intent of the Newton Landmarks Ordinance. His conduct in demolishing the 1744 Gershom Hyde house was clearly illegal and this Commission should not allow him to rebuild a replica and profit from his misconduct. Allowing this developer to flagrantly violate the Landmarks Ordinance and then be allowed to build a new "replica" house would create a dangerous precedent to other unscrupulous developers to demolish other Newton Landmarks."

#### **Dear Mayor Fuller:**

I respectfully yet strongly request you immediately and publicly give the City's full and unequivocal commitment that it will support any denial by the Newton Historical Commission against any and all actions taken by the developer to challenge the NHC's decision.

Thank you, Matilda Bruckner 516 Ward St, Newton 02459

From: David Bluestein <davidbluestein@mac.com>

**Sent:** Tuesday, October 26, 2021 10:19 PM **To:** Valerie Birmingham; Ruthanne Fuller

**Cc:** Stephen Farrell **Subject:** 29 Greenwood

Follow Up Flag: Flag for follow up

Flag Status: Flagged

[DO NOT OPEN links/attachments unless you are sure the content is safe. ]

#### **Dear Commissioners:**

It is my understanding that at the October 28 NHC hearing, the developer who destroyed the Landmark Gershom Hyde House at 29 Greenwood has requested that you review his plans to REMEDIATE his violation because he cannot RESTORE the house. I request that you vote to DENY his request to build this REPLICA.

I agree with the letter of October 18, 2021 that the Commission received signed by seven (7) distinguished Newton Lawyers which clearly outlines your authority and concludes:

"Mr. Gupta must not be granted authority to rebuild that which he has illegally destroyed. To allow otherwise, would be to gut the language and intent of the Newton Landmarks Ordinance. His conduct in demolishing the 1744 Gershom Hyde house was clearly illegal and this Commission should not allow him to rebuild a replica and profit from his misconduct. Allowing this developer to flagrantly violate the Landmarks Ordinance and then be allowed to build a new "replica" house would create a dangerous precedent to other unscrupulous developers to demolish other Newton Landmarks."

#### **Dear Mayor Fuller:**

I respectfully yet strongly request you immediately and publicly give the City's full and unequivocal commitment that it will support any denial by the Newton Historical Commission against any and all actions taken by the developer to challenge the NHC's decision.

Thank you,
David Bluestein
74 Larchmont Ave Wahan

P.S. - C'mon, this is pretty awful behavior. Who are we as a city if we allow this kind of behavior? Politically, it's a train wreck for you. Morally and ethically, it's even worse. Developers need to be sent a message that this is simply not tolerated. Please send it.

From: Maureen Kelley <kelleysmyths@gmail.com>

**Sent:** Tuesday, October 26, 2021 9:26 PM **To:** Valerie Birmingham; Ruthanne Fuller

**Cc:** scf7462@gmail.com **Subject:** Gershom Hyde House

Follow Up Flag: Flag for follow up

Flag Status: Flagged

## [DO NOT OPEN links/attachments unless you are sure the content is safe. ]

Dear Commissioners: It is my understanding that at the October 28 NHC hearing, the developer who destroyed the Landmark Gershom Hyde House at 29 Greenwood has requested that you review his plans to REMEDIATE his violation because he cannot RESTORE the house. I request that you vote to DENY his request to build this REPLICA. I agree with the letter of October 18, 2021 that the Commission received signed by seven (7) distinguished Newton Lawyers which clearly outlines your authority and concludes: "Mr. Gupta must not be granted authority to rebuild that which he has illegally destroyed. To allow otherwise, would be to gut the language and intent of the Newton Landmarks Ordinance. His conduct in demolishing the 1744 Gershom Hyde house was clearly illegal and this Commission should not allow him to rebuild a replica and profit from his misconduct. Allowing this developer to flagrantly violate the Landmarks Ordinance and then be allowed to build a new "replica" house would create a dangerous precedent to other unscrupulous developers to demolish other Newton Landmarks." Dear Mayor Fuller: I respectfully yet strongly request you immediately and publicly give the City's full and unequivocal commitment that it will support any denial by the Newton Historical Commission against any and all actions taken by the developer to challenge the NHC's decision. Thank you, Maureen Kelley 105 Hancock Street, Auburndale, MA 02466

From: Aretha Delight Davis <aretha@acpdecisions.org>

**Sent:** Tuesday, October 26, 2021 9:09 PM **To:** Valerie Birmingham; Ruthanne Fuller

**Cc:** scf7462@gmail.com **Subject:** Gershom Hyde House

Follow Up Flag: Flag for follow up

Flag Status: Flagged

## [DO NOT OPEN links/attachments unless you are sure the content is safe. ]

#### **Dear Commissioners:**

It is my understanding that at the October 28 NHC hearing, the developer who destroyed the Landmark Gershom Hyde House at 29 Greenwood has requested that you review his plans to REMEDIATE his violation because he cannot RESTORE the house. I request that you vote to DENY his request to build this REPLICA. I agree with the letter of October 18, 2021 that the Commission received signed by seven (7) distinguished Newton Lawyers which clearly outlines your authority and concludes: Mr. Gupta should not be granted authority to rebuild that which he has illegally destroyed. To allow otherwise, would be to gut the language and intent of the Newton Landmarks Ordinance. His conduct in demolishing the 1744 Gershom Hyde house was clearly illegal and this Commission should not allow him to rebuild a replica and profit from his misconduct. Allowing this developer to flagrantly violate the Landmarks Ordinance and then be allowed to build a new "replica" house would create a dangerous precedent to other unscrupulous developers to demolish other Newton Landmarks." Dear Mayor Fuller:

I respectfully yet strongly request you immediately and publicly give the City's full and unequivocal commitment that it will support any denial by the Newton Historical Commission against any and all actions taken by the developer to challenge the NHC's decision.

Thank you and good evening.

**Aretha** 

Aretha Delight Davis 195 Carlton Road Waban, MA 02468

The information contained in this electronic message (or attached hereto) is intended only for the individual or entity to which it is addressed and may contain information that is protected by law and confidential. If you are not the intended recipient of this e-mail, use of its contents in any way is prohibited and may be unlawful. If you have received this communication in error, please notify the sender immediately by e-mail or telephone, return the original message by e-mail to the sender or to <a href="mailto:info@acpdecisions.org">info@acpdecisions.org</a> and permanently delete the original message and any attachments to it. Thank you.

From: Janet Sterman <jjsterman@gmail.com>
Sent: Tuesday, October 26, 2021 8:51 PM

To: Valerie Birmingham Cc: scf7462@gmail.com

**Subject:** 29 Greenwood Street, Newton, MA 02459

Follow Up Flag: Flag for follow up

Flag Status: Flagged

## [DO NOT OPEN links/attachments unless you are sure the content is safe. ]

#### **Members of the Newton Historic Commission:**

I understand that the developer who destroyed the Landmark Gershom Hyde House at 29 Greenwood has requested that you review his proposed building reconciliation plans at the October 28, 2021 Newton Historic Commission hearing. This proposal comes on heels of Mr.Gupta's permit violations, destroying the original house which may no longer be restored . I request that you vote to deny this developer's request to build a replica of the original house.

I am in full agreement with the October 18, 2021 letter received by the Newton Historic Commission and acknowledged via signature by seven (7) reputable Newton Lawyers, clearly outlining the authority of the Newton Historic Commission. That letter concluded:

"Mr. Gupta must not be granted authority to rebuild that which he has illegally destroyed. To allow otherwise, would be to gut the language and intent of the Newton Landmarks Ordinance. His conduct in demolishing the 1744 Gershom Hyde house was clearly illegal and this Commission should not allow him to rebuild a replica and profit from his misconduct. Allowing this developer to flagrantly violate the Landmarks Ordinance and then be allowed to build a new "replica" house would create a dangerous precedent to other unscrupulous developers to demolish other Newton Landmarks."

## Thank you, Janet Sterman

janet sterman 120 church street newton, ma 02458 mobile 617.329.1360 @JanetJose

**From:** Gregory Fried <cgregoryfried@gmail.com>

**Sent:** Tuesday, October 26, 2021 8:49 PM **To:** Valerie Birmingham; Ruthanne Fuller

**Cc:** Stephen Farrell

**Subject:** REJECT the Petition to "Remediate" the Decision of the NHS concerning the Gershom Hyde House

Follow Up Flag: Flag for follow up

Flag Status: Flagged

## [DO NOT OPEN links/attachments unless you are sure the content is safe. ]

<u>To the Newton Historical Commission Members</u>: I have been following the developments consequent to the illegal and willful destruction of Gershom Hyde House by a developer, who has now made the request (NHC meeting of Oct. 28) that the Commission review his plans to remediate his violation. He seeks *remediation* of the violation by building a *replica* of the house, because he obviously cannot now *restore* the house, as it no longer exists — due to his own actions.

<u>I would urge the Commission to REJECT this petition</u>. On Oct. 18, 2021, the Commission received a letter signed by seven Newton lawyers that provides a clear explanation of the Commission's legal authority to act on such matters. They conclude as follows:

"Mr. Gupta must not be granted authority to rebuild that which he has illegally destroyed. To allow otherwise, would be to gut the language and intent of the Newton Landmarks Ordinance. His conduct in demolishing the 1744 Gershom Hyde house was clearly illegal and this Commission should not allow him to rebuild a replica and profit from his misconduct. Allowing this developer to flagrantly violate the Landmarks Ordinance and then be allowed to build a new 'replica' house would create a dangerous precedent to other unscrupulous developers to demolish other Newton Landmarks."

I would underline that it is a general principle of the rule of law that a person who willfully violates the law should not be allowed to profit from a situation he himself has created. To allow this would give the nod to arrogant criminal behavior in the future by other developers, and it would make a mockery of Newton's commitment to its own rich historical heritage. Such appeasement would encourage those who seek to profit from Newton's potential for development by ignoring whatever rules and principles they choose, on the assumption that deep pockets will smooth over any past malfeasance. Newton must put its foot down now to ensure a clear message that such predatory conduct will not be tolerated, let alone rewarded.

To Mayor Fuller: I respectfully urge you to announce the City's full and unequivocal commitment to support any denial by the Newton Historical Commission against any and all actions taken by the developer to challenge the NHC's decision. Failure to do so would effectively announce open season for developers to act as scofflaws regarding Newton's longstanding commitment to protect its historical heritage. Newton offers many opportunities for responsible, respectful development, and so responsible governance requires that an atmosphere of lawless impunity, especially among the rich and influential, must be nipped in the bud before it spreads.

Very sincerely,

Gregory Fried 40 Central Terrace Auburndale

From: Eve Bould <evebould@gmail.com>
Sent: Tuesday, October 26, 2021 8:42 PM
To: Valerie Birmingham; Ruthanne Fuller

**Cc:** Stephen Farrell

**Subject:** 29 Greenwood Street - Landmark Gershom Hyde House

Follow Up Flag: Flag for follow up

Flag Status: Flagged

[DO NOT OPEN links/attachments unless you are sure the content is safe. ]

#### **Dear Commissioners:**

It is my understanding that at the October 28 NHC hearing, the developer who destroyed the Landmark Gershom Hyde House at 29 Greenwood has requested that you review his plans to REMEDIATE his violation because he cannot RESTORE the house. I request that you vote to DENY his request to build this REPLICA.

I agree with the letter of October 18, 2021 that the Commission received signed by seven (7) distinguished Newton Lawyers which clearly outlines your authority and concludes:

"Mr. Gupta must not be granted authority to rebuild that which he has illegally destroyed. To allow otherwise, would be to gut the language and intent of the Newton Landmarks Ordinance. His conduct in demolishing the 1744 Gershom Hyde house was clearly illegal and this Commission should not allow him to rebuild a replica and profit from his misconduct. Allowing this developer to flagrantly violate the Landmarks Ordinance and then be allowed to build a new "replica" house would create a dangerous precedent to other unscrupulous developers to demolish other Newton Landmarks."

#### **Dear Mayor Fuller:**

I respectfully yet strongly request you immediately and publicly give the City's full and unequivocal commitment that it will support any denial by the Newton Historical Commission against any and all actions taken by the developer to challenge the NHC's decision.

Thank you, Eve and Chris Bould 667 Chestnut St, Newton, MA 02468

From: Kevin Flint <kevin.flint1@verizon.net>
Sent: Tuesday, October 26, 2021 8:10 PM
To: Valerie Birmingham; Ruthanne Fuller

**Cc:** scf7462@gmail.com

Follow Up Flag: Flag for follow up

Flag Status: Flagged

## [DO NOT OPEN links/attachments unless you are sure the content is safe. ]

Dear Commissioners: It is my understanding that at the October 28 NHC hearing, the developer who destroyed the Landmark Gershom Hyde House at 29 Greenwood has requested that you review his plans to REMEDIATE his violation because he cannot RESTORE the house. I request that you vote to DENY his request to build this REPLICA. I agree with the letter of October 18, 2021 that the Commission received signed by seven (7) distinguished Newton Lawyers which clearly outlines your authority and concludes: "Mr. Gupta must not be granted authority to rebuild that which he has illegally destroyed. To allow otherwise, would be to gut the language and intent of the Newton Landmarks Ordinance. His conduct in demolishing the 1744 Gershom Hyde house was clearly illegal and this Commission should not allow him to rebuild a replica and profit from his misconduct. Allowing this developer to flagrantly violate the Landmarks Ordinance and then be allowed to build a new "replica" house would create a dangerous precedent to other unscrupulous developers to demolish other Newton Landmarks." Dear Mayor Fuller: I respectfully yet strongly request you immediately and publicly give the City's full and unequivocal commitment that it will support any denial by the Newton Historical Commission against any and all actions taken by the developer to challenge the NHC's decision. Thank you, Kevin Flint 807 Chestnut St Waban, MA

From: Robert Mashal <robert.mashal@gmail.com>

Sent: Tuesday, October 26, 2021 8:07 PM

To: Valerie Birmingham Cc: Stephen Farrell

**Subject:** Gershom Hyde House at 29 Greenwood

Follow Up Flag: Flag for follow up

Flag Status: Flagged

[DO NOT OPEN links/attachments unless you are sure the content is safe. ]

#### **Dear Commissioners:**

It is my understanding that at the October 28 NHC hearing, the developer who destroyed the Gershom Hyde House at 29 Greenwood has requested that you review his plans to remediate his violation because he cannot restore the house. I request that you vote to deny his request to build this replica.

To the extent that the allegations that Mr. Gupta's conduct was illegal prove to be true, I support the conclusion of the letter of October 18, 2021 that the Commission received signed by seven (7) distinguished Newton Lawyers. That letter concludes:

"Mr. Gupta must not be granted authority to rebuild that which he has illegally destroyed. To allow otherwise, would be to gut the language and intent of the Newton Landmarks Ordinance. His conduct in demolishing the 1744 Gershom Hyde house was clearly illegal and this Commission should not allow him to rebuild a replica and profit from his misconduct. Allowing this developer to flagrantly violate the Landmarks Ordinance and then be allowed to build a new "replica" house would create a dangerous precedent to other unscrupulous developers to demolish other Newton Landmarks."

Yours sincerely,

Robert Mashal 95 Prince Street Newton, MA 02465

From: Joy Reichling <joy.reichling@gmail.com>
Sent: Tuesday, October 26, 2021 6:25 PM
Valerie Birmingham; Ruthanne Fuller

**Cc:** scf7462@gmail.com **Subject:** Gershom Hyde House

Follow Up Flag: Flag for follow up

Flag Status: Flagged

[DO NOT OPEN links/attachments unless you are sure the content is safe. ]

#### **Dear Commissioners:**

It is my understanding that at the October 28 NHC hearing, the developer who destroyed the Landmark Gershom Hyde House at 29 Greenwood has requested that you review his plans to REMEDIATE his violation because he cannot RESTORE the house. I request that you vote to DENY his request to build this REPLICA.

I agree with the letter of October 18, 2021 that the Commission received signed by seven (7) distinguished Newton Lawyers which clearly outlines your authority and concludes:

"Mr. Gupta must not be granted authority to rebuild that which he has illegally destroyed. To allow otherwise, would be to gut the language and intent of the Newton Landmarks Ordinance. His conduct in demolishing the 1744 Gershom Hyde house was clearly illegal and this Commission should not allow him to rebuild a replica and profit from his misconduct. Allowing this developer to flagrantly violate the Landmarks Ordinance and then be allowed to build a new "replica" house would create a dangerous precedent to other unscrupulous developers to demolish other Newton Landmarks."

#### **Dear Mayor Fuller:**

I respectfully yet strongly request you immediately and publicly give the City's full and unequivocal commitment that it will support any denial by the Newton Historical Commission against any and all actions taken by the developer to challenge the NHC's decision.

Thank you, Joy Reichling 40 Rochester Rd. Newton, MA 02458

--

**From:** triciajop@gmail.com

Sent: Tuesday, October 26, 2021 5:56 PM

**To:** Valerie Birmingham

**Subject:** October 28 hearing / Mr. Gupta

**Follow Up Flag:** Flag for follow up

Flag Status: Flagged

[DO NOT OPEN links/attachments unless you are sure the content is safe.]

Please share this e-mail with all of the members of the Newton Historical Commission:

**Dear Commissioners:** 

I take both historical preservation, and respect for the law very seriously. I hope you do as well.

It is my understanding that at the upcoming October 28 NHC hearing, the developer who destroyed the Landmark Gershom Hyde House at 29 Greenwood has requested that you review his plans to REMEDIATE his violation because he cannot RESTORE the house. I request that you vote to DENY his request to build this replica.

I find his request insulting.

I agree with, and support, the letter sent to the Commission dated October 18, 2021 and signed by seven Newton lawyers which clearly outlines your authority and concluded:

"Mr. Gupta must not be granted authority to rebuild that which he has illegally destroyed. To allow otherwise, would be to gut the language and intent of the Newton Landmarks Ordinance. His conduct in demolishing the 1744 Gershom Hyde house was clearly illegal and this Commission should not allow him to rebuild a replica and profit from his misconduct. Allowing this developer to flagrantly violate the Landmarks Ordinance and then be allowed to build a new "replica" house would create a dangerous precedent to other unscrupulous developers to demolish other Newton Landmarks."

And I might add, encourage him to repeat his actions in the future.

Further, in my opinion, Mr. Gupta, and any company he is associated with, now and in the future, should be BANNED from doing any development in the City of Newton for as long as is legally possible. If it were up to me, he (and any company he is associated with) would be given a lifetime ban.....

Thank you,

Patricia Papa 154 Auburndale Avenue West Newton



From: relsales@aol.com

**Sent:** Tuesday, October 26, 2021 5:39 PM

**To:** Valerie Birmingham **Cc:** scf7462@gmail.com

**Subject:** Newton Historical Commission (NHC): 29 Greenwood

Follow Up Flag: Flag for follow up

Flag Status: Flagged

[DO NOT OPEN links/attachments unless you are sure the content is safe. ]

## **Dear Commissioners:**

It is my understanding that at the October 28 NHC hearing, the developer who destroyed the Landmark Gershom Hyde House at 29 Greenwood has requested that you review his plans to REMEDIATE his violation because he cannot RESTORE the house. I request that you vote to DENY his request to build this REPLICA.

I agree with the letter of October 18, 2021 that the Commission received signed by seven (7) distinguished Newton Lawyers which clearly outlines your authority and concludes:

"Mr. Gupta must not be granted authority to rebuild that which he has illegally destroyed. To allow otherwise, would be to gut the language and intent of the Newton Landmarks Ordinance. His conduct in demolishing the 1744 Gershom Hyde house was clearly illegal and this Commission should not allow him to rebuild a replica and profit from his misconduct. Allowing this developer to flagrantly violate the Landmarks Ordinance and then be allowed to build a new "replica" house would create a dangerous precedent to other unscrupulous developers to demolish other Newton Landmarks."

Thank you, Leon Kadis 7 Clifton Road

From: Carolyn Gabbay <carolyngabbay@gmail.com>

Sent: Tuesday, October 26, 2021 5:31 PM

To: Valerie Birmingham Cc: Stephen Farrell

**Subject:** Gershom Hyde House

Follow Up Flag: Flag for follow up

Flag Status: Flagged

[DO NOT OPEN links/attachments unless you are sure the content is safe. ]

**Dear NHC commissioners:** 

It is my understanding that at the October 28 NHC hearing, the developer who destroyed the landmark Gershom Hyde House at 29 Greenwood has requested that you review his plans to "remediate" his blatant violation because he cannot RESTORE the house. I request that you vote to *DENY* his request to build this REPLICA.

I agree with the letter of October 18, 2021 that the Commission received signed by seven (7) distinguished Newton lawyers which clearly outlines your authority and concludes:

"Mr. Gupta must not be granted authority to rebuild that which he has illegally destroyed. To allow otherwise, would be to gut the language and intent of the Newton Landmarks Ordinance. His conduct in demolishing the 1744 Gershom Hyde house was clearly illegal and this Commission should not allow him to rebuild a replica and profit from his misconduct. Allowing this developer to flagrantly violate the Landmarks Ordinance and then be allowed to build a new "replica" house would create a dangerous precedent to other unscrupulous developers to demolish other Newton Landmarks."

This demolition was a blatant violation and fits a pattern of practice by Mr. Gupta. Please do not let him get away with it here.

Respectfully submitted,

Carolyn Gabbay 11 Doris Circle Newton 02458

[iPhone — iMistype — iApologize]

CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE: This email message, and all attachments to it, is intended for the sole use of the person(s) to whom it is primarily addressed. It may contain information that is privileged, confidential, or legally protected. Any unauthorized review, use, disclosure, or distribution of this information is strictly prohibited. If you have received this information in error, or think (or reasonably

iginal message.	,,	ntact the senaer	., ., .	

From: suzanne cuccurullo.org <suzanne@cuccurullo.org>

Sent: Tuesday, October 26, 2021 4:18 PM

To: Valerie Birmingham
Cc: scf7462@gmail.com
Subject: Gershom Hyde House

Follow Up Flag: Flag for follow up

Flag Status: Flagged

[DO NOT OPEN links/attachments unless you are sure the content is safe. ]

#### **Dear Commissioners:**

It is my understanding that at the October 28 NHC hearing, the developer who destroyed the Landmark Gershom Hyde House at 29 Greenwood has requested that you review his plans to REMEDIATE his violation because he cannot RESTORE the house. I request that you vote to DENY his request to build this REPLICA.

I agree with the letter of October 18, 2021 that the Commission received signed by seven (7) distinguished Newton Lawyers which clearly outlines your authority and concludes:

"Mr. Gupta must not be granted authority to rebuild that which he has illegally destroyed. To allow otherwise, would be to gut the language and intent of the Newton Landmarks Ordinance. His conduct in demolishing the 1744 Gershom Hyde house was clearly illegal and this Commission should not allow him to rebuild a replica and profit from his misconduct. Allowing this developer to flagrantly violate the Landmarks Ordinance and then be allowed to build a new "replica" house would create a dangerous precedent to other unscrupulous developers to demolish other Newton Landmarks."

Thank you, Suzanne Cuccurullo 120 Otis Street Newton, MA 02460

From: Mike Isman <mikeisman@gmail.com>
Sent: Tuesday, October 26, 2021 3:58 PM
To: Valerie Birmingham; Ruthanne Fuller

**Cc:** scf7462@gmail.com **Subject:** Replica at 29 Greenwood

Follow Up Flag: Flag for follow up

Flag Status: Flagged

[DO NOT OPEN links/attachments unless you are sure the content is safe. ]

#### **Dear Commissioners:**

It is my understanding that at the October 28 NHC hearing, the developer who destroyed the Landmark Gershom Hyde House at 29 Greenwood has requested that you review his plans to REMEDIATE his violation because he cannot RESTORE the house. I request that you vote to DENY his request to build this REPLICA.

I agree with the letter of October 18, 2021 that the Commission received signed by seven (7) distinguished Newton Lawyers which clearly outlines your authority and concludes:

"Mr. Gupta must not be granted authority to rebuild that which he has illegally destroyed. To allow otherwise, would be to gut the language and intent of the Newton Landmarks Ordinance. His conduct in demolishing the 1744 Gershom Hyde house was clearly illegal and this Commission should not allow him to rebuild a replica and profit from his misconduct. Allowing this developer to flagrantly violate the Landmarks Ordinance and then be allowed to build a new "replica" house would create a dangerous precedent to other unscrupulous developers to demolish other Newton Landmarks."

#### **Dear Mayor Fuller:**

I respectfully yet strongly request you immediately and publicly give the City's full and unequivocal commitment that it will support any denial by the Newton Historical Commission against any and all actions taken by the developer to challenge the NHC's decision.

Thank you, Mike Isman 99 Osborne Path, Newton

--

Mike Isman pronouns: he/him (617) 767-7992

From: Jonathan Lilienfeld <jonathan.lilienfeld@gmail.com>

**Sent:** Tuesday, October 26, 2021 3:53 PM **To:** Valerie Birmingham; Ruthanne Fuller

**Cc:** scf7462@gmail.com

Follow Up Flag: Flag for follow up

Flag Status: Flagged

[DO NOT OPEN links/attachments unless you are sure the content is safe. ]

#### **Dear Commissioners:**

It is my understanding that at the October 28 NHC hearing, the developer who destroyed the Landmark Gershom Hyde House at 29 Greenwood has requested that you review his plans to REMEDIATE his violation because he cannot RESTORE the house. I request that you vote to DENY his request to build this REPLICA.

I agree with the letter of October 18, 2021 that the Commission received signed by seven (7) distinguished Newton Lawyers which clearly outlines your authority and concludes:

"Mr. Gupta must not be granted authority to rebuild that which he has illegally destroyed. To allow otherwise, would be to gut the language and intent of the Newton Landmarks Ordinance. His conduct in demolishing the 1744 Gershom Hyde house was clearly illegal and this Commission should not allow him to rebuild a replica and profit from his misconduct. Allowing this developer to flagrantly violate the Landmarks Ordinance and then be allowed to build a new "replica" house would create a dangerous precedent to other unscrupulous developers to demolish other Newton Landmarks."

## **Dear Mayor Fuller:**

I respectfully yet strongly request you immediately and publicly give the City's full and unequivocal commitment that it will support any denial by the Newton Historical Commission against any and all actions taken by the developer to challenge the NHC's decision.

Thank you, Jonathan Lilienfeld 14 Parker Ave. Newton, Ma 02459

Jonathan Lilienfeld Cell: 617-592-8897

From: Nhu Vu <nhudvu@gmail.com>
Sent: Tuesday, October 26, 2021 3:25 PM
To: Valerie Birmingham; Ruthanne Fuller

**Cc:** scf7462@gmail.com **Subject:** Gersham Hyde House

Follow Up Flag: Flag for follow up

Flag Status: Flagged

[DO NOT OPEN links/attachments unless you are sure the content is safe. ]

#### **Dear Commissioners:**

It is my understanding that at the October 28 NHC hearing, the developer who destroyed the Landmark Gershom Hyde House at 29 Greenwood has requested that you review his plans to REMEDIATE his violation because he cannot RESTORE the house. I request that you vote to DENY his request to build this REPLICA.

I agree with the letter of October 18, 2021 that the Commission received signed by seven (7) distinguished Newton Lawyers which clearly outlines your authority and concludes:

"Mr. Gupta must not be granted authority to rebuild that which he has illegally destroyed. To allow otherwise, would be to gut the language and intent of the Newton Landmarks Ordinance. His conduct in demolishing the 1744 Gershom Hyde house was clearly illegal and this Commission should not allow him to rebuild a replica and profit from his misconduct. Allowing this developer to flagrantly violate the Landmarks Ordinance and then be allowed to build a new "replica" house would create a dangerous precedent to other unscrupulous developers to demolish other Newton Landmarks."

#### **Dear Mayor Fuller:**

I respectfully yet strongly request you immediately and publicly give the City's full and unequivocal commitment that it will support any denial by the Newton Historical Commission against any and all actions taken by the developer to challenge the NHC's decision.

Thank you,

Nhu Vu 93 West Street Newton, MA 02458

From: Dan Massoff <vethomecalls@gmail.com>
Sent: Tuesday, October 26, 2021 3:17 PM

To: Valerie Birmingham
Cc: Stephen Farrell
Subject: 29 Greenwood

Follow Up Flag: Flag for follow up

Flag Status: Flagged

[DO NOT OPEN links/attachments unless you are sure the content is safe. ]

#### **Dear Commissioners:**

It is my understanding that at the October 28 NHC hearing, the developer who destroyed the Landmark Gershom Hyde House at 29 Greenwood has requested that you review his plans to REMEDIATE his violation because he cannot RESTORE the house. I request that you vote to DENY his request to build this REPLICA.

I agree with the letter of October 18, 2021 that the Commission received signed by seven (7) distinguished Newton Lawyers which clearly outlines your authority and concludes:

"Mr. Gupta must not be granted authority to rebuild that which he has illegally destroyed. To allow otherwise, would be to gut the language and intent of the Newton Landmarks Ordinance. His conduct in demolishing the 1744 Gershom Hyde house was clearly illegal and this Commission should not allow him to rebuild a replica and profit from his misconduct. Allowing this developer to flagrantly violate the Landmarks Ordinance and then be allowed to build a new "replica" house would create a dangerous precedent to other unscrupulous developers to demolish other Newton Landmarks."

Thank you Respectfully, Daniel Massoff

237 Spiers Rd, Newton

Sent from my iPhone

From: Mara Antigone <marastaylor@gmail.com>

Sent: Tuesday, October 26, 2021 2:56 PM

**To:** Valerie Birmingham

**Subject:** Landmark Gershom Hyde House

**Follow Up Flag:** Flag for follow up

Flag Status: Flagged

[DO NOT OPEN links/attachments unless you are sure the content is safe. ]

#### **Dear Commissioners:**

It is my understanding that at the October 28 NHC hearing, the developer who destroyed the Landmark Gershom Hyde House at 29 Greenwood has requested that you review his plans to REMEDIATE his violation because he cannot RESTORE the house. I request that you vote to DENY his request to build this REPLICA.

I agree with the letter of October 18, 2021 that the Commission received signed by seven (7) distinguished Newton Lawyers which clearly outlines your authority and concludes:

"Mr. Gupta must not be granted authority to rebuild that which he has illegally destroyed. To allow otherwise, would be to gut the language and intent of the Newton Landmarks Ordinance. His conduct in demolishing the 1744 Gershom Hyde house was clearly illegal and this Commission should not allow him to rebuild a replica and profit from his misconduct. Allowing this developer to flagrantly violate the Landmarks Ordinance and then be allowed to build a new "replica" house would create a dangerous precedent to other unscrupulous developers to demolish other Newton Landmarks." Sincerely,

Mara Taylor 53 Gray Cliff Road Newton Centre

**From:** steve g <sgunzburger@gmail.com> **Sent:** Tuesday, October 26, 2021 2:21 PM

**To:** Valerie Birmingham; Ruthanne Fuller; scf7462@gmail.com

**Subject:** Gershom Hyde House

Follow Up Flag: Flag for follow up

Flag Status: Flagged

[DO NOT OPEN links/attachments unless you are sure the content is safe. ]

#### **Dear Commissioners:**

It is my understanding that at the October 28 NHC hearing, the developer who destroyed the Landmark Gershom Hyde House at 29 Greenwood has requested that you review his plans to REMEDIATE his violation because he cannot RESTORE the house. I request that you vote to DENY his request to build this REPLICA.

I agree with the letter of October 18, 2021 that the Commission received signed by seven (7) distinguished Newton Lawyers which clearly outlines your authority and concludes:

"Mr. Gupta must not be granted authority to rebuild that which he has illegally destroyed. To allow otherwise, would be to gut the language and intent of the Newton Landmarks Ordinance. His conduct in demolishing the 1744 Gershom Hyde house was clearly illegal and this Commission should not allow him to rebuild a replica and profit from his misconduct. Allowing this developer to flagrantly violate the Landmarks Ordinance and then be allowed to build a new "replica" house would create a dangerous precedent to other unscrupulous developers to demolish other Newton Landmarks."

#### **Dear Mayor Fuller:**

I respectfully yet strongly request you immediately and publicly give the City's full and unequivocal commitment that it will support any denial by the Newton Historical Commission against any and all actions taken by the developer to challenge the NHC's decision.

Thank you, Stephen Gunzburger 29 Frederick st Newton, MA

From: Sandra Swanson <swanson1810@hotmail.com>

**Sent:** Tuesday, October 26, 2021 1:52 PM **To:** Valerie Birmingham; Ruthanne Fuller

**Cc:** scf7462@gmail.com

**Subject:** Support to DENY 29 Greenwood Developer

Follow Up Flag: Flag for follow up

Flag Status: Flagged

[DO NOT OPEN links/attachments unless you are sure the content is safe. ]

Dear Commissioners,

It is my understanding that at the October 28 NHC hearing, the developer who destroyed the Landmark Gershom Hyde House at 29 Greenwood has requested that you review his plan to remediate his violation because he cannot restore the home. I request that you vote to DENY his request to build this replica.

I agree with the letter of October 19, 2021 that the Commission received signed by seven (7) Newton lawyers which clearly outlines your authority and concludes:

"Mr. Gupta must not be granted authority to rebuild that which he has illegally destroyed. To allow otherwise, would be to gut the language and intent of the Newton Landmarks Ordinance. His conduct in demolishing the 1744 Gershom Hyde House was clearly illegal and this Commission should not allow him to rebuild a replica and profit from his misconduct. Allowing this developer to flagrantly violate the Landmarks Ordinance and then be allowed to build a 'replica' house would create a dangerous precedent to other unscrupulous developers to demolish other Newton Landmarks."

Dear Mayor Fuller,

I respectfully yet strongly request that you immediately and publicly give the City's full and unequivocal support any denial by the Newton Historical Commission against any and all actions taken by the developer to challenge the NHC's decision.

Thank you, Sandra L. Swanson 6 Johnson Place Newton, MA 02466

From: Katie Conroy <katie.evelyn.conroy@gmail.com>

Sent: Tuesday, October 26, 2021 1:41 PM

**To:** Valerie Birmingham; Ruthanne Fuller; Stephen Farrell

**Subject:** NHC hearing - Gershom Hyde House vote

**Follow Up Flag:** Flag for follow up

Flag Status: Flagged

[DO NOT OPEN links/attachments unless you are sure the content is safe. ]

## **Dear Commissioners:**

It is my understanding that at the October 28 NHC hearing, the developer who destroyed the Landmark Gershom Hyde House at 29 Greenwood has requested that you review his plans to REMEDIATE his violation because he cannot RESTORE the house. I request that you vote to DENY his request to build this <u>REPLICA</u>.

I agree with the letter of October 18, 2021 that the Commission received signed by seven (7) distinguished Newton Lawyers which clearly outlines your authority and concludes:

"Mr. Gupta must not be granted authority to rebuild that which he has illegally destroyed. To allow otherwise, would be to gut the language and intent of the Newton Landmarks Ordinance. His conduct in demolishing the 1744 Gershom Hyde house was clearly illegal and this Commission should not allow him to rebuild a replica and profit from his misconduct. Allowing this developer to flagrantly violate the Landmarks Ordinance and then be allowed to build a new "replica" house would create a dangerous precedent to other unscrupulous developers to demolish other Newton Landmarks."

## **Dear Mayor Fuller:**

I respectfully yet strongly request you immediately and publicly give the City's full and unequivocal commitment that it will support any denial by the Newton Historical Commission against any and all actions taken by the developer to challenge the NHC's decision.

Thank you, Katie Conroy Newton Resident 183 Allerton Road, Apt 1

From: Nancy Greenberg <nancy.greenberg@oracle.com>

**Sent:** Tuesday, October 26, 2021 1:22 PM **To:** Valerie Birmingham; Ruthanne Fuller

**Cc:** Stephen Farrell

**Subject:** NHC hearing, on the developer who destroyed the Landmark Gershom Hyde House at 29

Greenwood

**Follow Up Flag:** Flag for follow up

Flag Status: Flagged

[DO NOT OPEN links/attachments unless you are sure the content is safe. ]

#### **Dear Commissioners:**

It is my understanding that at the October 28 NHC hearing, the developer who destroyed the Landmark Gershom Hyde House at 29 Greenwood has requested that you review his plans to REMEDIATE his violation because he cannot RESTORE the house. I request that you vote to DENY his request to build this REPLICA.

I agree with the letter of October 18, 2021 that the Commission received signed by seven (7) distinguished Newton Lawyers which clearly outlines your authority and concludes:

"Mr. Gupta must not be granted authority to rebuild that which he has illegally destroyed. To allow otherwise, would be to gut the language and intent of the Newton Landmarks Ordinance. His conduct in demolishing the 1744 Gershom Hyde house was clearly illegal and this Commission should not allow him to rebuild a replica and profit from his misconduct. Allowing this developer to flagrantly violate the Landmarks Ordinance and then be allowed to build a new "replica" house would create a dangerous precedent to other unscrupulous developers to demolish other Newton Landmarks."

#### **Dear Mayor Fuller:**

I respectfully yet strongly request you immediately and publicly give the City's full and unequivocal commitment that it will support any denial by the Newton Historical Commission against any and all actions taken by the developer to challenge the NHC's decision.

Thank you,

**Nancy Greenberg** 

175 Mount Vernon Street

# ORACLE

Nancy Greenberg, Director, User Assistance Development

Mobile: 617 512 9958

https://oracle.zoom.us/j/5844037909?pwd=ZVJudWdJT0V6amJhYlIrYU1ibTZHdz09

**Oracle Database** 

175 Mount Vernon Street, Newton, Massachusetts 02465

From: Richard Levey <rblarchitect@gmail.com>
Sent: Tuesday, October 26, 2021 1:20 PM
To: Valerie Birmingham; Ruthanne Fuller

**Subject:** 29 Greenwood

Follow Up Flag: Flag for follow up

Flag Status: Flagged

[DO NOT OPEN links/attachments unless you are sure the content is safe. ]

## **Dear Commissioners:**

It is my understanding that at the October 28 NHC hearing, the developer who destroyed the Landmark Gershom Hyde House at 29 Greenwood has requested that you review his plans to REMEDIATE his violation because he cannot RESTORE the house. I request that you vote to DENY his request to build this replica.

I agree with the letter of October 18, 2021 that the Commission received signed by seven (7) distinguished Newton Lawyers which clearly outlines your authority and concludes:

"Mr. Gupta must not be granted authority to rebuild that which he has illegally destroyed. To allow otherwise, would be to gut the language and intent of the Newton Landmarks Ordinance. His conduct in demolishing the 1744 Gershom Hyde house was clearly illegal and this Commission should not allow him to rebuild a replica and profit from his misconduct. Allowing this developer to flagrantly violate the Landmarks Ordinance and then be allowed to build a new "replica" house would create a dangerous precedent to other unscrupulous developers to demolish other Newton Landmarks."

#### **Dear Mayor Fuller:**

I respectfully yet strongly request you immediately and publicly give the City's full and unequivocal commitment that it will support any denial by the Newton Historical Commission against any and all actions taken by the developer to challenge the NHC's decision.

\_\_

Richard Levey
RBL Architects
30 Jacobs Terr., Newton MA 02459
617-527-5300
www.rblarchitects.com
rblarchitect@gmail.com

**From:** Jennifer Bornstein < jenhbornstein@gmail.com>

**Sent:** Tuesday, October 26, 2021 1:09 PM **To:** Valerie Birmingham; Ruthanne Fuller

**Subject:** No replica house please

Follow Up Flag: Flag for follow up

Flag Status: Flagged

## [DO NOT OPEN links/attachments unless you are sure the content is safe. ]

Please do not allow the developer to build a replica house at 29 Greenwood. It's not the same as a historical home dating back to the 1700s and establishes a terrible precedent.

Best, Jennifer Bornstein 130 Andrew St, Newton, MA 02461

Written on the run...

From: Karen Bottar <krbottar@comcast.net>
Sent: Tuesday, October 26, 2021 1:03 PM

**To:** Valerie Birmingham **Cc:** scf7462@gmail.com

**Subject:** 29 Greenwood Street- Gershom Hyde House

Follow Up Flag: Flag for follow up

Flag Status: Flagged

## [DO NOT OPEN links/attachments unless you are sure the content is safe. ]

## **Dear Commissioners**:

It is my understanding that at the October 28 NHC hearing, the developer who destroyed the Landmark Gershom Hyde House at 29 Greenwood has requested that you review his plans to REMEDIATE his violation because he cannot RESTORE the house. I request that you vote to DENY his request to build this **REPLICA**.

I agree with the letter of October 18, 2021 that the Commission received signed by seven (7) distinguished Newton Lawyers which clearly outlines your authority and concludes:

"Mr. Gupta must not be granted authority to rebuild that which he has illegally destroyed. To allow otherwise, would be to gut the language and intent of the Newton Landmarks Ordinance. His conduct in demolishing the 1744 Gershom Hyde house was clearly illegal and this Commission should not allow him to rebuild a replica and profit from his misconduct. Allowing this developer to flagrantly violate the Landmarks Ordinance and then be allowed to build a new "replica" house would create a dangerous precedent to other unscrupulous developers to demolish other Newton Landmarks."

Thank you, Karen Bottar 172 Cotton Street, Newton

**From:** Jennifer Gistrak <jqistrak@psychologyofbalance.com>

Sent: Tuesday, October 26, 2021 1:03 PM

**To:** Valerie Birmingham **Subject:** Gershom Hyde House

**Follow Up Flag:** Flag for follow up

Flag Status: Flagged

[DO NOT OPEN links/attachments unless you are sure the content is safe. ]

## **Dear Commissioners:**

It is my understanding that at the October 28 NHC hearing, the developer who destroyed the Landmark Gershom Hyde House at 29 Greenwood has requested that you review his plans to REMEDIATE his violation because he cannot RESTORE the house. I request that you vote to DENY his request to build this REPLICA.

I agree with the letter of October 18, 2021 that the Commission received signed by seven (7) distinguished Newton Lawyers which clearly outlines your authority and concludes:

"Mr. Gupta must not be granted authority to rebuild that which he has illegally destroyed. To allow otherwise, would be to gut the language and intent of the Newton Landmarks Ordinance. His conduct in demolishing the 1744 Gershom Hyde house was clearly illegal and this Commission should not allow him to rebuild a replica and profit from his misconduct. Allowing this developer to flagrantly violate the Landmarks Ordinance and then be allowed to build a new "replica" house would create a dangerous precedent to other unscrupulous developers to demolish other Newton Landmarks."

Sincerely,

Jennifer Gistrak 19 Arlington Street Newton, MA 02458

From: rrcexec@regulatoryresearch.com
Sent: Tuesday, October 26, 2021 12:45 PM

To: Valerie Birmingham
Cc: scf7462@gmail.com
Subject: 29 Greenwood

Follow Up Flag: Flag for follow up

Flag Status: Flagged

[DO NOT OPEN links/attachments unless you are sure the content is safe. ]

Newton Historical Commission Newton, MA

October 26, 2021

#### **Dear Commissioners:**

It is my understanding that at the October 28 NHC hearing, the developer who destroyed the Landmark Gershom Hyde House at 29 Greenwood has requested that you review his plans to REMEDIATE his violation because he cannot RESTORE the house. I request that you vote to DENY his request to build this REPLICA.

I agree with the letter of October 18, 2021 that the Commission received signed by seven (7) distinguished Newton Lawyers which clearly outlines your authority and concludes:

"Mr. Gupta must not be granted authority to rebuild that which he has illegally destroyed. To allow otherwise, would be to gut the language and intent of the Newton Landmarks Ordinance. His conduct in demolishing the 1744 Gershom Hyde house was clearly illegal and this Commission should not allow him to rebuild a replica and profit from his misconduct. Allowing this developer to flagrantly violate the Landmarks Ordinance and then be allowed to build a new "replica" house would create a dangerous precedent to other unscrupulous developers to demolish other Newton Landmarks."

Please exercise the muscle that the law provides you to protect our few remaining landmarked properties.

Thank you,

Sallee Lipshutz 24 Radcliff Road Waban, MA 02468

From: Laura Tavares < lauraanntavares@gmail.com>

Sent:Tuesday, October 26, 2021 12:28 PMTo:Valerie Birmingham; Ruthanne FullerCc:scf7462@gmail.com; David Garrett

**Subject:** 29 Greenwood St

Follow Up Flag: Flag for follow up

Flag Status: Flagged

[DO NOT OPEN links/attachments unless you are sure the content is safe. ]

#### **Dear Commissioners:**

As a local neighborhood resident, I've been following with interest the NHC's response to developer Ty Gupta's illegal destruction of the historic Gershom Hyde House at 29 Greenwood Street, and his subsequent attempts to revive the project.

It is my understanding that at the October 28 NHC hearing, Mr. Gupta has requested that you review his plans to REMEDIATE his violation because he cannot RESTORE the house. I request that you vote to DENY his request to build a replica of the house he destroyed.

I agree with the letter of October 18, 2021 that the Commission received signed by seven (7) distinguished Newton Lawyers which clearly outlines your authority and concludes:

"Mr. Gupta must not be granted authority to rebuild that which he has illegally destroyed. To allow otherwise, would be to gut the language and intent of the Newton Landmarks Ordinance. His conduct in demolishing the 1744 Gershom Hyde house was clearly illegal and this Commission should not allow him to rebuild a replica and profit from his misconduct. Allowing this developer to flagrantly violate the Landmarks Ordinance and then be allowed to build a new "replica" house would create a dangerous precedent to other unscrupulous developers to demolish other Newton Landmarks."

## **Dear Mayor Fuller:**

I respectfully yet strongly request you immediately and publicly give the City's full and unequivocal commitment that it will support any denial by the Newton Historical Commission against any and all actions taken by the developer to challenge the NHC's decision.

I hope that the NHC and the Mayor will take this opportunity to stand up for local residents and for the historic fabric of our shared city. Thank you for your consideration.

Sincerely, Laura Tavares David Garrett 116 Arnold Rd

From: David Persampieri <dapersy@gmail.com>
Sent: Tuesday, October 26, 2021 12:26 PM

To: Valerie Birmingham
Cc: Stephen Farrell
Subject: 29 Greenwood

Follow Up Flag: Flag for follow up

Flag Status: Flagged

[DO NOT OPEN links/attachments unless you are sure the content is safe. ]

### **Dear Commissioners:**

It is my understanding that at the October 28 NHC hearing, the developer who destroyed the Landmark Gershom Hyde House at 29 Greenwood has requested that you review his plans to REMEDIATE his violation because he cannot RESTORE the house. I request that you vote to DENY his request to build this REPLICA.

I agree with the letter of October 18, 2021 that the Commission received signed by seven (7) distinguished Newton Lawyers which clearly outlines your authority and concludes:

"Mr. Gupta must not be granted authority to rebuild that which he has illegally destroyed. To allow otherwise, would be to gut the language and intent of the Newton Landmarks Ordinance. His conduct in demolishing the 1744 Gershom Hyde house was clearly illegal and this Commission should not allow him to rebuild a replica and profit from his misconduct. Allowing this developer to flagrantly violate the Landmarks Ordinance and then be allowed to build a new "replica" house would create a dangerous precedent to other unscrupulous developers to demolish other Newton Landmarks."

As I am sure you are aware, this unscrupulous developer has a long history of disregarding the law and then asking for forgiveness. In this case, he clearly determined, unsurprisingly, that it would be less costly to simply demolish the historic structure and rebuild a new one than it would have been to preserve and restore the historic structure. As this situation is not unusual, I urge you to act forcibly to prevent him from realizing the excess profits from this illegal, greedy action. He cannot be allowed to continue to profit from the behavior. I urge you to deny his request.

Respectfully,

Dave Persampieri 19 Fairmont Ave Newton, MA 02458

From: Susan Tornheim <sftornheim@gmail.com>

**Sent:** Tuesday, October 26, 2021 12:23 PM **To:** Ruthanne Fuller; Valerie Birmingham

**Cc:** Stephen Farrell

**Subject:** 1744 Gershom Hyde house

Follow Up Flag: Flag for follow up

Flag Status: Flagged

## [DO NOT OPEN links/attachments unless you are sure the content is safe. ]

### To the Newton Historical Commission:

At the upcoming commission meeting on 10/28, the developer who demolished the Gershom Hyde house at 29 Greenwood Street will ask, I understand, to be allowed to build a replica of the landmarked historic house since he has already knocked it down and can't restore it. I strongly and most sincerely request that you firmly deny him permission to build a replica.

This developer has flagrantly and illegally destroyed a landmarked Newton house dating from 1744, the fourth-oldest house in Newton, despite it being under the protection of the Newton Landmarks Ordinance as well as a Stop Work order from the city. He has thumbed his nose at the commission, the Newton Landmarks Ordinance, and the city. If you allow him to build his replica and profit from his misdeeds, it will justify his underhanded actions and give a green light to other developers to ignore city authority and protections. Some logical consequences are in order here. Please firmly and unequivocally deny Mr. Gupta permission to build a replica of the Gershom Hyde house.

### To Mayor Fuller:

I respectfully and strongly ask you to immediately and publicly give the city's full commitment that it will support any denial by the Newton Historical Commission against any and all actions taken by the developer to challenge the NHC's decision.

Thank you, Susan F. Tornheim 120 Hyde Street Newton Highlands

From: Jonathan Beit-Aharon < yonatanbeitaharon@gmail.com>

**Sent:** Tuesday, October 26, 2021 12:23 PM **To:** Ruthanne Fuller; Valerie Birmingham

**Cc:** Stephen Farrell **Subject:** 29 Greenwood street

Follow Up Flag: Flag for follow up

Flag Status: Flagged

## [DO NOT OPEN links/attachments unless you are sure the content is safe. ]

**Dear Mayor Fuller and Commissioners,** 

I hear that at the October 28 NHC hearing, the developer who destroyed the Landmark Gershom Hyde House at 29 Greenwood has requested that you review his plans to remediate his violation because he cannot restore the house.

Remediation is acceptable if and only if it comes with guarantees that the transgressor will be not derive benefit / profit from whatever you approve. The penalties for the wonton destruction must include significant financial loss, lest others might choose to similarly flaunt the law and the wishes of our community.

Sincerely Jonathan Beit-Aharon 566 Centre Street Newton, MA 02458

From: Michael H. Riley <rileymh@sprynet.com>
Sent: Tuesday, October 26, 2021 12:20 PM
To: Valerie Birmingham; Ruthanne Fuller

**Cc:** scf7462@gmail.com **Subject:** 29 Greenwood Street

Follow Up Flag: Flag for follow up

Flag Status: Flagged

## [DO NOT OPEN links/attachments unless you are sure the content is safe. ]

#### **Dear Commissioners:**

It is my understanding that at the October 28 NHC hearing, the developer who destroyed the Landmark Gershom Hyde House at 29 Greenwood has requested that you review his plans to REMEDIATE his violation because he cannot RESTORE the house. I request that you vote to DENY his request to build this REPLICA.

I agree with the letter of October 18, 2021 that the Commission received signed by seven (7) Newton lawyers which clearly outlines your authority and concludes:

"Mr. Gupta must not be granted authority to rebuild that which he has illegally destroyed. To allow otherwise, would be to gut the language and intent of the Newton Landmarks Ordinance. His conduct in demolishing the 1744 Gershom Hyde house was clearly illegal and this Commission should not allow him to rebuild a replica and profit from his misconduct. Allowing this developer to flagrantly violate the Landmarks Ordinance and then be allowed to build a new "replica" house would create a dangerous precedent to other unscrupulous developers to demolish other Newton Landmarks."

### **Dear Mayor Fuller:**

I respectfully yet strongly request you immediately and publicly give the City's full and unequivocal commitment that it will support any denial by the Newton Historical Commission against any and all actions taken by the developer to challenge the NHC's decision.

### Thank you.

Michael H. Riley Attorney at Law 83 Grove Hill Avenue Newton, MA 02460 617-332-0362 rileymh@sprynet.com

### **CONFIDENTIALITY NOTE:**

This e-mail and any attachments are confidential and may be protected by legal privilege. If you are not the intended recipient, be aware that any disclosure, copying, distribution, or use of this e-mail or any attachment is prohibited. If you have received this e-mail in error, please notify us immediately of the

delivery error by replying to the sender, and then delete this message from your system. The your cooperation.	ank you for
2	

From: David Ohanian <dohanian45@gmail.com>
Sent: Tuesday, October 26, 2021 12:17 PM

**To:** Valerie Birmingham

**Subject:** hearing

Follow Up Flag: Flag for follow up

Flag Status: Flagged

[DO NOT OPEN links/attachments unless you are sure the content is safe. ]

## **Dear Commissioners:**

It is my understanding that at the October 28 NHC hearing, the developer who destroyed the Landmark Gershom Hyde House at 29 Greenwood has requested that you review his plans to REMEDIATE his violation because he cannot RESTORE the house. I request that you vote to DENY his request to build this REPLICA.

I agree with the letter of October 18, 2021 that the Commission received signed by seven (7) distinguished Newton Lawyers which clearly outlines your authority and concludes:

"Mr. Gupta must not be granted authority to rebuild that which he has illegally destroyed. To allow otherwise, would be to gut the language and intent of the Newton Landmarks Ordinance. His conduct in demolishing the 1744 Gershom Hyde house was clearly illegal and this Commission should not allow him to rebuild a replica and profit from his misconduct. Allowing this developer to flagrantly violate the Landmarks Ordinance and then be allowed to build a new "replica" house would create a dangerous precedent to other unscrupulous developers to demolish other Newton Landmarks." Sincerely, David Ohanian

28 Columbia Avenue NUF 02464

From: Suzanne Nelsen <br/>
Sent: Tuesday, October 26, 2021 12:16 PM<br/>
Valerie Birmingham; Ruthanne Fuller

**Cc:** scf7462@gmail.com

**Subject:** Please

Follow Up Flag: Flag for follow up

Flag Status: Flagged

[DO NOT OPEN links/attachments unless you are sure the content is safe. ]

### **Dear Commissioners:**

It is my understanding that at the October 28 NHC hearing, the developer who destroyed the Landmark Gershom Hyde House at 29 Greenwood has requested that you review his plans to REMEDIATE his violation because he cannot RESTORE the house. I request that you vote to DENY his request to build this REPLICA.

I agree with the letter of October 18, 2021 that the Commission received signed by seven (7) distinguished Newton Lawyers which clearly outlines your authority and concludes:

"Mr. Gupta must not be granted authority to rebuild that which he has illegally destroyed. To allow otherwise, would be to gut the language and intent of the Newton Landmarks Ordinance. His conduct in demolishing the 1744 Gershom Hyde house was clearly illegal and this Commission should not allow him to rebuild a replica and profit from his misconduct. Allowing this developer to flagrantly violate the Landmarks Ordinance and then be allowed to build a new "replica" house would create a dangerous precedent to other unscrupulous developers to demolish other Newton Landmarks."

#### **Dear Mayor Fuller:**

I respectfully yet strongly request you immediately and publicly give the City's full and unequivocal commitment that it will support any denial by the Newton Historical Commission against any and all actions taken by the developer to challenge the NHC's decision.

Thank you, Suzanne Nelsen 28 Columbia Ave. Newton, MA 02464

From: Leslie Zebrowitz <zebrowit@brandeis.edu>

**Sent:** Tuesday, October 26, 2021 12:04 PM **To:** Valerie Birmingham; Ruthanne Fuller

**Cc:** scf7462@gmail.com **Subject:** Gershom Hyde House

Follow Up Flag: Flag for follow up

Flag Status: Flagged

[DO NOT OPEN links/attachments unless you are sure the content is safe. ]

### **Dear Commissioners:**

It is my understanding that at the October 28 NHC hearing, the developer who destroyed the Landmark Gershom Hyde House at 29 Greenwood has requested that you review his plans to REMEDIATE his violation because he cannot RESTORE the house. I request that you vote to DENY his request to build this REPLICA.

I agree with the letter of October 18, 2021 that the Commission received signed by seven (7) distinguished Newton Lawyers which clearly outlines your authority and concludes:

"Mr. Gupta must not be granted authority to rebuild that which he has illegally destroyed. To allow otherwise, would be to gut the language and intent of the Newton Landmarks Ordinance. His conduct in demolishing the 1744 Gershom Hyde house was clearly illegal and this Commission should not allow him to rebuild a replica and profit from his misconduct. Allowing this developer to flagrantly violate the Landmarks Ordinance and then be allowed to build a new "replica" house would create a dangerous precedent to other unscrupulous developers to demolish other Newton Landmarks."

#### **Dear Mayor Fuller:**

I respectfully yet strongly request you immediately and publicly give the City's full and unequivocal commitment that it will support any denial by the Newton Historical Commission against any and all actions taken by the developer to challenge the NHC's decision.

Thank you.

Leslie Zebrowitz 62 Pine Crest Rd Newton 02459

-

From: Ron Sheklin <ron@sheklin.com>
Sent: Tuesday, October 26, 2021 11:51 AM
To: Valerie Birmingham; Ruthanne Fuller

Cc: scf7462@gmail.com

**Subject:** 29 Greenwood

Follow Up Flag: Flag for follow up

Flag Status: Flagged

[DO NOT OPEN links/attachments unless you are sure the content is safe. ]

#### **Dear Commissioners:**

It is my understanding that at the October 28 NHC hearing, the developer who destroyed the Landmark Gershom Hyde House at 29 Greenwood has requested that you review his plans to REMEDIATE his violation because he cannot RESTORE the house. I request that you vote to DENY his request to build this REPLICA.

I agree with the letter of October 18, 2021 that the Commission received signed by seven (7) distinguished Newton Lawyers which clearly outlines your authority and concludes:

"Mr. Gupta must not be granted authority to rebuild that which he has illegally destroyed. To allow otherwise, would be to gut the language and intent of the Newton Landmarks Ordinance. His conduct in demolishing the 1744 Gershom Hyde house was clearly illegal and this Commission should not allow him to rebuild a replica and profit from his misconduct. Allowing this developer to flagrantly violate the Landmarks Ordinance and then be allowed to build a new "replica" house would create a dangerous precedent to other unscrupulous developers to demolish other Newton Landmarks."

#### **Dear Mayor Fuller:**

I respectfully yet strongly request you immediately and publicly give the City's full and unequivocal commitment that it will support any denial by the Newton Historical Commission against any and all actions taken by the developer to challenge the NHC's decision.

Thank you,

Ron Sheklin 48 Palmer Rd Waban, MA 02468 617-939-4372 ron@sheklin.com

**Sent:** Tuesday, October 26, 2021 11:56 AM **To:** Valerie Birmingham; Ruthanne Fuller

**Subject:** Do not reward the unlawful destruction of a Newton historic building

**Follow Up Flag:** Flag for follow up

Flag Status: Flagged

[DO NOT OPEN links/attachments unless you are sure the content is safe. ]

### **Dear Commissioners:**

It is my understanding that at the October 28 NHC hearing, the developer who destroyed the Landmark Gershom Hyde House at 29 Greenwood has requested that you review his plans to REMEDIATE his violation because he cannot RESTORE the house. I request that you vote to DENY his request to build this REPLICA.

I agree with the letter of October 18, 2021 that the Commission received signed by seven (7) distinguished Newton Lawyers which clearly outlines your authority and concludes:

"Mr. Gupta must not be granted authority to rebuild that which he has illegally destroyed. To allow otherwise, would be to gut the language and intent of the Newton Landmarks Ordinance. His conduct in demolishing the 1744 Gershom Hyde house was clearly illegal and this Commission should not allow him to rebuild a replica and profit from his misconduct. Allowing this developer to flagrantly violate the Landmarks Ordinance and then be allowed to build a new "replica" house would create a dangerous precedent to other unscrupulous developers to demolish other Newton Landmarks."

### **Dear Mayor Fuller:**

I respectfully yet strongly request you immediately and publicly give the City's full and unequivocal commitment that it will support any denial by the Newton Historical Commission against any and all actions taken by the developer to challenge the NHC's decision.

Thank you, Theodore Orenstein

29 Ricker Rd.

From: Susan Waldman < shwaldman27@aol.com>

**Sent:** Tuesday, October 26, 2021 11:56 AM **To:** Ruthanne Fuller; Valerie Birmingham

**Cc:** Stephen Farrell

**Subject:** The Gershom Hyde House

Follow Up Flag: Flag for follow up

Flag Status: Flagged

[DO NOT OPEN links/attachments unless you are sure the content is safe. ]

### **Dear Commissioners:**

It is my understanding that at the October 28 NHC hearing, the developer who destroyed the Landmark Gershom Hyde House at 29 Greenwood has requested that you review his plans to REMEDIATE his violation because he cannot RESTORE the house. I request that you vote to DENY his request to build this REPLICA.

I agree with the letter of October 18, 2021 that the Commission received signed by seven (7) distinguished Newton Lawyers which clearly outlines your authority and concludes:

"Mr. Gupta must not be granted authority to rebuild that which he has illegally destroyed. To allow otherwise, would be to gut the language and intent of the Newton Landmarks Ordinance. His conduct in demolishing the 1744 Gershom Hyde house was clearly illegal and this Commission should not allow him to rebuild a replica and profit from his misconduct. Allowing this developer to flagrantly violate the Landmarks Ordinance and then be allowed to build a new "replica" house would create a dangerous precedent to other unscrupulous developers to demolish other Newton Landmarks."

#### **Dear Mayor Fuller:**

I respectfully yet strongly request you immediately and publicly give the City's full and unequivocal commitment that it will support any denial by the Newton Historical Commission against any and all actions taken by the developer to challenge the NHC's decision.

Thank you,

Susan Waldman 62 Windsor Road, Waban

Sent from my iPad

From: Emily Honig <emily.honig@gmail.com>
Sent: Tuesday, October 26, 2021 11:52 AM
To: Valerie Birmingham; Ruthanne Fuller

**Cc:** Stephen Farrell

**Subject:** Gershon Hyde House/29 Greenwood

Follow Up Flag: Flag for follow up

Flag Status: Flagged

[DO NOT OPEN links/attachments unless you are sure the content is safe. ]

### **Dear Commissioners:**

It is my understanding that at the October 28 NHC hearing, the developer who destroyed the Landmark Gershom Hyde House at 29 Greenwood has requested that you review his plans to "remediate" his violation because he cannot actually resture the house. I request that you vote to DENY his request to build a replica house.

I am myself a lawyer, and I agree with the letter of October 18, 2021 that the Commission received signed by seven distinguished and accomplished Newton lawyers, which clearly outlines your authority and concludes:

"Mr. Gupta must not be granted authority to rebuild that which he has illegally destroyed. To allow otherwise, would be to gut the language and intent of the Newton Landmarks Ordinance. His conduct in demolishing the 1744 Gershom Hyde house was clearly illegal and this Commission should not allow him to rebuild a replica and profit from his misconduct. Allowing this developer to flagrantly violate the Landmarks Ordinance and then be allowed to build a new "replica" house would create a dangerous precedent to other unscrupulous developers to demolish other Newton Landmarks."

### **Dear Mayor Fuller:**

I respectfully yet strongly request you immediately and publicly give the City's full and unequivocal commitment that it will support any denial by the Newton Historical Commission against any and all actions taken by the developer to challenge the NHC's decision.

Thank you, Emily Honig 889 Watertown St.
 Best,
Emily

**From:** Sharon Gorberg <sharon.gorberg@gmail.com>

**Sent:** Tuesday, October 26, 2021 11:51 AM

To: Valerie Birmingham
Cc: Stephen Farrell
Subject: Historic Preservation

Follow Up Flag: Flag for follow up

Flag Status: Flagged

[DO NOT OPEN links/attachments unless you are sure the content is safe. ]

### **Dear Commissioners:**

It is my understanding that at the October 28 NHC hearing, the developer who destroyed the Landmark Gershom Hyde House at 29 Greenwood has requested that you review his plans to REMEDIATE his violation because he cannot RESTORE the house. I request that you vote to DENY his request to build this REPLICA.

I agree with the letter of October 18, 2021 that the Commission received signed by seven (7) distinguished Newton Lawyers which clearly outlines your authority and concludes:

"Mr. Gupta must not be granted authority to rebuild that which he has illegally destroyed. To allow otherwise, would be to gut the language and intent of the Newton Landmarks Ordinance. His conduct in demolishing the 1744 Gershom Hyde house was clearly illegal and this Commission should not allow him to rebuild a replica and profit from his misconduct. Allowing this developer to flagrantly violate the Landmarks Ordinance and then be allowed to build a new "replica" house would create a dangerous precedent to other unscrupulous developers to demolish other Newton Landmarks."

John Holohan 26 Walnut Hill Rd Newton Centre

**From:** rankovic@articulation.com

**Sent:** Tuesday, October 26, 2021 11:48 AM **To:** Valerie Birmingham; Ruthanne Fuller

Cc: ""CC"

**Subject:** Preservation: October 28 NHC hearing

Follow Up Flag: Flag for follow up

Flag Status: Flagged

[DO NOT OPEN links/attachments unless you are sure the content is safe. ]

### **Dear Commissioners:**

It is my understanding that at the October 28 NHC hearing, the developer who destroyed the Landmark Gershom Hyde House at 29 Greenwood has requested that you review his plans to REMEDIATE his violation because he cannot RESTORE the house. I request that you vote to DENY his request to build this REPLICA.

I agree with the letter of October 18, 2021 that the Commission received signed by seven (7) distinguished Newton Lawyers which clearly outlines your authority and concludes:

"Mr. Gupta must not be granted authority to rebuild that which he has illegally destroyed. To allow otherwise, would be to gut the language and intent of the Newton Landmarks Ordinance. His conduct in demolishing the 1744 Gershom Hyde house was clearly illegal and this Commission should not allow him to rebuild a replica and profit from his misconduct. Allowing this developer to flagrantly violate the Landmarks Ordinance and then be allowed to build a new "replica" house would create a dangerous precedent to other unscrupulous developers to demolish other Newton Landmarks."

### **Dear Mayor Fuller:**

I respectfully yet strongly request you immediately and publicly give the City's full and unequivocal commitment that it will support any denial by the Newton Historical Commission against any and all actions taken by the developer to challenge the NHC's decision.

Thank you, Christine Rankovic 94 Berkshire Rd. Newton, MA 02460

From: Lynn Slobodin <lynn.slobodin@gmail.com>

**Sent:** Tuesday, October 26, 2021 11:46 AM **To:** Ruthanne Fuller; Valerie Birmingham

**Cc:** Stephen Farrell **Subject:** 29 Greenwood

Follow Up Flag: Flag for follow up

Flag Status: Flagged

[DO NOT OPEN links/attachments unless you are sure the content is safe. ]

### **Dear Commissioners:**

It is my understanding that at the October 28 NHC hearing, the developer who destroyed the Landmark Gershom Hyde House at 29 Greenwood has requested that you review his plans to REMEDIATE his violation because he cannot RESTORE the house. I request that you vote to DENY his request to build this REPLICA.

I agree with the letter of October 18, 2021 that the Commission received signed by seven (7) distinguished Newton Lawyers which clearly outlines your authority and concludes:

"Mr. Gupta must not be granted authority to rebuild that which he has illegally destroyed. To allow otherwise, would be to gut the language and intent of the Newton Landmarks Ordinance. His conduct in demolishing the 1744 Gershom Hyde house was clearly illegal and this Commission should not allow him to rebuild a replica and profit from his misconduct. Allowing this developer to flagrantly violate the Landmarks Ordinance and then be allowed to build a new "replica" house would create a dangerous precedent to other unscrupulous developers to demolish other Newton Landmarks."

### **Dear Mayor Fuller:**

I respectfully yet strongly request you immediately and publicly give the City's full and unequivocal commitment that it will support any denial by the Newton Historical Commission against any and all actions taken by the developer to challenge the NHC's decision.

Thank you, Lynn Slobodin 61 Washburn Avenue Auburndale, MA 02466

**From:** Sharon Gorberg <sharon.gorberg@gmail.com>

**Sent:** Tuesday, October 26, 2021 11:45 AM

To: Valerie Birmingham
Cc: Stephen Farrell
Subject: Historic Preservation

Follow Up Flag: Flag for follow up

Flag Status: Flagged

[DO NOT OPEN links/attachments unless you are sure the content is safe. ]

### **Dear Commissioners:**

It is my understanding that at the October 28 NHC hearing, the developer who destroyed the Landmark Gershom Hyde House at 29 Greenwood has requested that you review his plans to REMEDIATE his violation because he cannot RESTORE the house. I request that you vote to DENY his request to build this REPLICA.

I agree with the letter of October 18, 2021 that the Commission received signed by seven (7) distinguished Newton Lawyers which clearly outlines your authority and concludes:

"Mr. Gupta must not be granted authority to rebuild that which he has illegally destroyed. To allow otherwise, would be to gut the language and intent of the Newton Landmarks Ordinance. His conduct in demolishing the 1744 Gershom Hyde house was clearly illegal and this Commission should not allow him to rebuild a replica and profit from his misconduct. Allowing this developer to flagrantly violate the Landmarks Ordinance and then be allowed to build a new "replica" house would create a dangerous precedent to other unscrupulous developers to demolish other Newton Landmarks."

Sharon Gorberg 26 Walnut Hill Rd. Newton Centre

**From:** AnisFam <anisfam@rcn.com>

**Sent:** Tuesday, October 26, 2021 11:44 AM **To:** Valerie Birmingham; Ruthanne Fuller

**Subject:** 29 Greenwood decision

Follow Up Flag: Flag for follow up

Flag Status: Flagged

## [DO NOT OPEN links/attachments unless you are sure the content is safe.]

### **Dear Commissioners and Mayor Fuller:**

It is my understanding that at the October 28 NHC hearing, the developer who destroyed the Landmark Gershom Hyde House at 29 Greenwood intends to ask NHC to review his plans to REMEDIATE his violation because he cannot RESTORE the house. I request that you vote to DENY his request to build this REPLICA.

I agree with the letter of October 18, 2021 that the Commission received signed by seven distinguished Newton Lawyers which clearly outlines your authority and concludes:

"Mr. Gupta must not be granted authority to rebuild that which he has illegally destroyed. To allow otherwise, would be to gut the language and intent of the Newton Landmarks Ordinance. His conduct in demolishing the 1744 Gershom Hyde house was clearly illegal and this Commission should not allow him to rebuild a replica and profit from his misconduct. Allowing this developer to flagrantly violate the Landmarks Ordinance and then be allowed to build a new "replica" house would create a dangerous precedent to other unscrupulous developers to demolish other Newton Landmarks."

Mayor Fuller, I respectfully yet strongly request that you immediately and publicly give the City's full and unequivocal commitment that it will support any denial by the Newton Historical Commission against any and all actions taken by the developer to challenge the NHC's decision.

Thank you,
Barbara Silver
70 Elgin Street, Newton Centre

From: Iles, Debra <debra\_iles@hks.harvard.edu>
Sent: Tuesday, October 26, 2021 11:44 AM
To: Valerie Birmingham; Ruthanne Fuller

**Cc:** scf7462@gmail.com

**Subject:** 29 Greenwood - Gershom Hyde House

Follow Up Flag: Flag for follow up

Flag Status: Flagged

[DO NOT OPEN links/attachments unless you are sure the content is safe. ]

### **Dear Commissioners:**

It is my understanding that at the October 28 NHC hearing, the developer who destroyed the Landmark Gershom Hyde House at 29 Greenwood has requested that you review his plans to REMEDIATE his violation because he cannot RESTORE the house. I request that you vote to DENY his request. I have reviewed the public plans on file and the proposed house is nothing like the original.

I agree with the letter of October 18, 2021 that the Commission received signed by seven (7) distinguished Newton Lawyers which clearly outlines your authority and concludes:

"Mr. Gupta must not be granted authority to rebuild that which he has illegally destroyed. To allow otherwise, would be to gut the language and intent of the Newton Landmarks Ordinance. His conduct in demolishing the 1744 Gershom Hyde house was clearly illegal and this Commission should not allow him to rebuild a replica and profit from his misconduct. Allowing this developer to flagrantly violate the Landmarks Ordinance and then be allowed to build a new "replica" house would create a dangerous precedent to other unscrupulous developers to demolish other Newton Landmarks."

### **Dear Mayor Fuller:**

I respectfully yet strongly request you immediately and publicly give the City's full and unequivocal commitment that it will support any denial by the Newton Historical Commission against any and all actions taken by the developer to challenge the NHC's decision.

Thank you,

Debra Iles 23 Norman Road Newton, MA

From: Megan Meirav <meganmeirav@gmail.com>

**Sent:** Tuesday, October 26, 2021 11:41 AM

To: Valerie Birmingham; Stephen Farrell; rfuller@newton.gov

**Subject:** Jail Time not Financial Gain - ATTENTION NHC

**Follow Up Flag:** Flag for follow up

Flag Status: Flagged

[DO NOT OPEN links/attachments unless you are sure the content is safe. ]

## **Dear Commissioners:**

In the face of such a crime, Mr Gupta should have jail time, not given financial opportunity.

It is my understanding that at the October 28 NHC hearing, the developer who destroyed the Landmark Gershom Hyde House at 29 Greenwood has requested that you review his plans to REMEDIATE his violation because he cannot RESTORE the house. I request that you vote to DENY his request to build this REPLICA.

I agree with the letter of October 18, 2021 that the Commission received signed by seven (7) distinguished Newton Lawyers which clearly outlines your authority and concludes:

"Mr. Gupta must not be granted authority to rebuild that which he has illegally destroyed. To allow otherwise, would be to gut the language and intent of the Newton Landmarks Ordinance. His conduct in demolishing the 1744 Gershom Hyde house was clearly illegal and this Commission should not allow him to rebuild a replica and profit from his misconduct. Allowing this developer to flagrantly violate the Landmarks Ordinance and then be allowed to build a new "replica" house would create a dangerous precedent to other unscrupulous developers to demolish other Newton Landmarks."

#### **Dear Mayor Fuller:**

I respectfully yet strongly request you immediately and publicly give the City's full and unequivocal commitment that it will support any denial by the Newton Historical Commission against any and all actions taken by the developer to challenge the NHC's decision.

Thank you, Megan Meirav 19 Ridge Rd, 02468

From: Peter Lee <langstonandryansdad@gmail.com>

**Sent:** Tuesday, October 26, 2021 11:39 AM **To:** Valerie Birmingham; Ruthanne Fuller

**Cc:** scf7462@gmail.com

**Subject:** 1744 Gershom Hyde Illegal Demolition

Follow Up Flag: Flag for follow up

Flag Status: Flagged

[DO NOT OPEN links/attachments unless you are sure the content is safe. ]

#### **Dear Commissioners:**

It is my understanding that at the October 28NHC hearing, the developer who destroyed the Landmark Gershom Hyde House at 29 Greenwood has requested that you review his plans to REMEDIATE his violation because he cannot RESTORE the house. I request that you vote to DENY his request to build this REPLICA.

I agree with the letter of October 18, 2021 that the Commission received signed by seven (7) distinguished Newton Lawyers which clearly outlines your authority and concludes:

"Mr. Gupta must not be granted authority to rebuild that which he has illegally destroyed. To allow otherwise, would be to gut the language and intent of the Newton Landmarks Ordinance. His conduct in demolishing the 1744 Gershom Hyde house was clearly illegal and this Commission should not allow him to rebuild a replica and profit from his misconduct. Allowing this developer to flagrantly violate the Landmarks Ordinance and then be allowed to build a new "replica" house would create a dangerous precedent to other unscrupulous developers to demolish other Newton Landmarks."

### **Dear Mayor Fuller:**

I respectfully yet strongly request you immediately and publicly give the City's full and unequivocal commitment that it will support any denial by the Newton Historical Commission against any and all actions taken by the developer to challenge the NHC's decision.

Thank you, Peter Lee 1863 Commonwealth Ave Newton, Ma 02466

From: John Otis <drjohnotis@gmail.com>
Sent: Tuesday, October 26, 2021 11:37 AM
To: Valerie Birmingham; Ruthanne Fuller

**Cc:** scf7462@gmail.com

**Subject:** Landmark Gershom Hyde House

### **Dear Commissioners:**

It is my understanding that at the October 28 NHC hearing, the developer who destroyed the Landmark Gershom Hyde House at 29 Greenwood has requested that you review his plans to remediate his violation because he cannot restore the house. I request that you vote to DENY his request to build a replica.

I agree with the letter of October 18, 2021 that the Commission received signed by seven (7) distinguished Newton Lawyers which clearly outlines your authority and concludes:

"Mr. Gupta must not be granted authority to rebuild that which he has illegally destroyed. To allow otherwise, would be to gut the language and intent of the Newton Landmarks Ordinance. His conduct in demolishing the 1744 Gershom Hyde house was clearly illegal and this Commission should not allow him to rebuild a replica and profit from his misconduct. Allowing this developer to flagrantly violate the Landmarks Ordinance and then be allowed to build a new "replica" house would create a dangerous precedent to other unscrupulous developers to demolish other Newton Landmarks."

## Dear Mayor Fuller:

I respectfully yet strongly request you immediately and publicly give the City's full and unequivocal commitment that it will support any denial by the Newton Historical Commission against any and all actions taken by the developer to challenge the NHC's decision.

Thank you, John Otis 64 High Rock Terrace, Newton MA

From: Deborah Portnoy <deborahsportnoy@gmail.com>

**Sent:** Tuesday, October 26, 2021 11:37 AM

**To:** Stephen Farrell; Ruthanne Fuller; Valerie Birmingham

**Subject:** 29 Greenwood Street

**Follow Up Flag:** Flag for follow up

Flag Status: Flagged

### [DO NOT OPEN links/attachments unless you are sure the content is safe. ]

### **Dear Commissioners:**

It is my understanding that at the October 28 NHC hearing, the developer who destroyed the Landmark Gershom Hyde House at 29 Greenwood has requested that you review his plans to REMEDIATE his violation because he cannot RESTORE the house. I request that you vote to DENY his request to build this REPLICA.

I agree with the letter of October 18, 2021 that the Commission received signed by seven (7) distinguished Newton Lawyers which clearly outlines your authority and concludes:

"Mr. Gupta must not be granted authority to rebuild that which he has illegally destroyed. To allow otherwise, would be to gut the language and intent of the Newton Landmarks Ordinance. His conduct in demolishing the 1744 Gershom Hyde house was clearly illegal and this Commission should not allow him to rebuild a replica and profit from his misconduct. Allowing this developer to flagrantly violate the Landmarks Ordinance and then be allowed to build a new "replica" house would create a dangerous precedent to other unscrupulous developers to demolish other Newton Landmarks."

### **Dear Mayor Fuller:**

I respectfully yet strongly request you immediately and publicly give the City's full and unequivocal commitment that it will support any denial by the Newton Historical Commission against any and all actions taken by the developer to challenge the NHC's decision.

Thank you, Deborah Portnoy 60 Burdean Rd Newton, MA

From: Melinda Conroy <melinda.j.conroy@gmail.com>

**Sent:** Tuesday, October 26, 2021 11:37 AM **To:** Valerie Birmingham; Ruthanne Fuller

**Cc:** Stephen Farrell

**Subject:** NHC hearing - Gershom Hyde House vote

Follow Up Flag: Flag for follow up

Flag Status: Flagged

[DO NOT OPEN links/attachments unless you are sure the content is safe. ]

### **Dear Commissioners:**

It is my understanding that at the October 28 NHC hearing, the developer who destroyed the Landmark Gershom Hyde House at 29 Greenwood has requested that you review his plans to REMEDIATE his violation because he cannot RESTORE the house. I request that you vote to DENY his request to build this <u>REPLICA</u>.

I agree with the letter of October 18, 2021 that the Commission received signed by seven (7) distinguished Newton Lawyers which clearly outlines your authority and concludes:

"Mr. Gupta must not be granted authority to rebuild that which he has illegally destroyed. To allow otherwise, would be to gut the language and intent of the Newton Landmarks Ordinance. His conduct in demolishing the 1744 Gershom Hyde house was clearly illegal and this Commission should not allow him to rebuild a replica and profit from his misconduct. Allowing this developer to flagrantly violate the Landmarks Ordinance and then be allowed to build a new "replica" house would create a dangerous precedent to other unscrupulous developers to demolish other Newton Landmarks."

### **Dear Mayor Fuller:**

I respectfully yet strongly request you immediately and publicly give the City's full and unequivocal commitment that it will support any denial by the Newton Historical Commission against any and all actions taken by the developer to challenge the NHC's decision.

Thank you, Melinda Conroy Newton Resident 306 Langley Road

From: Sharan leventhal <sharanleventhal@gmail.com>

**Sent:** Tuesday, October 26, 2021 11:31 AM **To:** Valerie Birmingham; Ruthanne Fuller

**Cc:** scf7462@gmail.com **Subject:** Gershom Hyde House

Follow Up Flag: Flag for follow up

Flag Status: Flagged

[DO NOT OPEN links/attachments unless you are sure the content is safe. ]

### **Dear Commissioners:**

It is my understanding that at the October 28 NHC hearing, the developer who destroyed the Landmark Gershom Hyde House at 29 Greenwood has requested that you review his plans to REMEDIATE his violation because he cannot RESTORE the house. I request that you vote to DENY his request to build this REPLICA.

I agree with the letter of October 18, 2021 that the Commission received signed by seven (7) distinguished Newton Lawyers which clearly outlines your authority and concludes:

"Mr. Gupta must not be granted authority to rebuild that which he has illegally destroyed. To allow otherwise, would be to gut the language and intent of the Newton Landmarks Ordinance. His conduct in demolishing the 1744 Gershom Hyde house was clearly illegal and this Commission should not allow him to rebuild a replica and profit from his misconduct. Allowing this developer to flagrantly violate the Landmarks Ordinance and then be allowed to build a new "replica" house would create a dangerous precedent to other unscrupulous developers to demolish other Newton Landmarks."

### **Dear Mayor Fuller:**

I respectfully yet strongly request you immediately and publicly give the City's full and unequivocal commitment that it will support any denial by the Newton Historical Commission against any and all actions taken by the developer to challenge the NHC's decision.

Thank you,

Sharan Leventhal 3 Newbury Terrace Newton, MA 02459

From: Tracy Fischer <tracy@tracyfischermediation.com>

**Sent:** Tuesday, October 26, 2021 11:26 AM **To:** Valerie Birmingham; Ruthanne Fuller

**Cc:** Stephen Farrell

**Subject:** 29 GREENWOOD STREET

Follow Up Flag: Flag for follow up

Flag Status: Flagged

[DO NOT OPEN links/attachments unless you are sure the content is safe. ]

### **Dear Commissioners:**

It is my understanding that at the October 28 NHC hearing, the developer who destroyed the Landmark Gershom Hyde House at 29 Greenwood has requested that you review his plans to REMEDIATE his violation because he cannot RESTORE the house. I request that you vote to DENY his request to build this REPLICA.

I agree with the letter of October 18, 2021 that the Commission received signed by seven (7) distinguished Newton Lawyers which clearly outlines your authority and concludes:

"Mr. Gupta must not be granted authority to rebuild that which he has illegally destroyed. To allow otherwise, would be to gut the language and intent of the Newton Landmarks Ordinance. His conduct in demolishing the 1744 Gershom Hyde house was clearly illegal and this Commission should not allow him to rebuild a replica and profit from his misconduct. Allowing this developer to flagrantly violate the Landmarks Ordinance and then be allowed to build a new "replica" house would create a dangerous precedent to other unscrupulous developers to demolish other Newton Landmarks."

#### **Dear Mayor Fuller:**

I respectfully yet strongly request you immediately and publicly give the City's full and unequivocal commitment that it will support any denial by the Newton Historical Commission against any and all actions taken by the developer to challenge the NHC's decision.

Thank you, Tracy Fischer 120 Cynthia Road Newton





S. Tracy Fischer, Esq.
Certified Divorce Mediator, MCFM, Lawyer and Mediator

617-477-5877 | tracy@tracyfischermediation.com tracyfischermediation.com

PO Box 590375 Newton MA 02459



IMPORTANT: The contents of this email and any attachments are confidential. They are intended for the named recipient(s) only. If you have received this email by mistake, please notify the sender immediately and do not disclose the contents to anyone or make copies thereof.



From: Connie DeVol <cgd@devolfinancial.com>
Sent: Tuesday, October 26, 2021 11:27 AM

**To:** Valerie Birmingham **Cc:** scf7462@gmail.com

**Subject:** FW: Preservation: October 28, CALL TO ACTION

Follow Up Flag: Flag for follow up

Flag Status: Flagged

[DO NOT OPEN links/attachments unless you are sure the content is safe. ]

### **Dear Commissioners:**

It is my understanding that at the October 28 NHC hearing, the developer who destroyed the Landmark Gershom Hyde House at 29 Greenwood has requested that you review his plans to REMEDIATE his violation because he cannot RESTORE the house. I request that you vote to DENY his request to build this REPLICA.

I agree with the letter of October 18, 2021 that the Commission received signed by seven (7) distinguished Newton Lawyers which clearly outlines your authority and concludes:

"Mr. Gupta must not be granted authority to rebuild that which he has illegally destroyed. To allow otherwise, would be to gut the language and intent of the Newton Landmarks Ordinance. His conduct in demolishing the 1744 Gershom Hyde house was clearly illegal and this Commission should not allow him to rebuild a replica and profit from his misconduct. Allowing this developer to flagrantly violate the Landmarks Ordinance and then be allowed to build a new "replica" house would create a dangerous precedent to other unscrupulous developers to demolish other Newton Landmarks."

Thank you,

**Connie DeVol** 

62 Harding St. Newton

Securities offered through Parkland Securities, LLC, member FINRA/SIPC.

From: wortri@aol.com

**Sent:** Tuesday, October 26, 2021 11:25 AM

**To:** Valerie Birmingham

Follow Up Flag: Flag for follow up

Flag Status: Flagged

### [DO NOT OPEN links/attachments unless you are sure the content is safe.]

#### **Dear Commissioners:**

It is my understanding that at the October 28 NHC hearing, the developer who destroyed the Landmark Gershom Hyde House at 29 Greenwood has requested that you review his plans to REMEDIATE his violation because he cannot RESTORE the house. I request that you vote to DENY his request to build this replica.

I agree with the letter of October 18, 2021 that the Commission received signed by seven (7) distinguished Newton Lawyers which clearly outlines your authority and concludes:

"Mr. Gupta must not be granted authority to rebuild that which he has illegally destroyed. To allow otherwise, would be to gut the language and intent of the Newton Landmarks Ordinance. His conduct in demolishing the 1744 Gershom Hyde house was clearly illegal and this Commission should not allow him to rebuild a replica and profit from his misconduct. Allowing this developer to flagrantly violate the Landmarks Ordinance and then be allowed to build a new "replica" house would create a dangerous precedent to other unscrupulous developers to demolish other Newton Landmarks."

Sincerely,

**Charles Farrell** 

From: <u>Joseph Dyer</u>

To: <u>Valerie Birmingham; Ruthanne Fuller</u>

Cc: <u>Stephen Farrell</u>

Subject: (former) Gershom Hyde House

Date: Tuesday, October 26, 2021 1:13:58 PM

### [DO NOT OPEN links/attachments unless you are sure the content is safe.]

Mayor Fuller and Members of the Newton Historical Commission:

A replica of anything is <u>not</u> the thing itself. Once the original is gone—and in this case willfully reduced to a heap of rubble—it makes no sense whatever to build a "replica." Is Newton going to turn into a Disneyworld?

Many of you have seen artists in museums copying Old Masters. Such paintings are replicas. To pass them off as the original would be attempted fraud. If Mr. Gupta gets away with his demolition, is any property in Newton safe?

Why not a dignified stone marker, perhaps in conjunction with some plantings, that memorializes a historical structure destroyed by the hand of man?

Sincerely, Joseph Dyer Newton Highlands