

 * REVISED AGENDA *
November 4, 2021
7:00 p.m.
<u>https://us02web.zoom.us/j/81979094794</u> or +16465588656,,81979094794#

Newton Armory RFP Received Proposals - MOA Request for NHC comment on the seven submitted proposals

Representatives from the Planning Department will present seven received proposals in response to the Newton Armory RFP. NHC comment on the proposals is required for completion of the MOA approval process. NHC reviewed and approved an initial draft of the MOA at its March 25, 2021, hearing. At its June 2, 2021, hearing, NHC commented on proposed language in the MOA and a marketing plan and asked that a fifth criteria for evaluation be added: that plans by the project proponent seek to preserve the existing structure.

The proposals can be seen here: <u>https://apps2.newtonma.gov/APPS/newtonFF/</u>

2. Determination of local historical significance of 144 Bridge St (Nonantum Library), 330 Homer Street (Newton Free Library), 12 Hawthorn Street (Pellegrini Field House), 1750 Commonwealth Avenue (Fire Station #2), 246 Dudley Street (Recreation Headquarters), 241 Church Street (Fire Station #1) and 136 Park Street (Burr Park Field House). This item has been withdrawn Request by Public Buildings Department to determine if buildings will be eligible for inclusion in a proposed CPA funded studies of city buildings; and request for comment on the pre application and proposal to the CPC

The city's Public Buildings Department has submitted a request to the CPC for Historic Resource funds to complete exterior building envelope studies of (15) municipal buildings. The purpose is to gain an understanding of existing conditions and to be provided recommendations for future work. A representative from DPW will be present to explain the proposal and seek feedback on the overall request by the NHC

According to Lara Kritzer, Community Preservation Program Manager, to be eligible for CPA funding as an Historic Resource project, the building or site must be listed on the State or National Register of Historic Places or found by the Newton Historical Commission to be of Local Significance. Currently, (8) of the (15) buildings meet these criteria. The remaining (7) do not, and the NHC has been asked to determine if those buildings are of local significance. Any buildings deemed not to have local significance by NHC, would need to be removed from the CPC request.

For additional background on the (7) buildings in which a determination needs to be made, in a previous CPA funded survey of the city's historic buildings, (3) of the (7), including Burr Park Field House, Nonantum Library, and Recreation Headquarters/Kennard Estate, were rated 2 with moderate significance. (3) of the remaining (4), including Fire Station #1, Fire Station #2 and Pellegrini Field House were rated 3 with low significance. The final building, the Main Library, was also rated 3 with low significance, but was noted in the report to also potentially be of architectural or civic interest in the future.

For additional information on the project and individual buildings, Lara Kritzer has put together a comprehensive website page for the request to CPC. If you scroll to the bottom, you will find links to information about each of the (15) individual buildings included in the request, including the (7) the NHC needs to determine if there are of any local significance, as well as previous studies conducted on the buildings. <u>https://www.newtonma.gov/government/planning/community-preservation-program/proposals-projects/exterior-building-envelope-study#!/</u>

In determining local significance, staff recommends looking at the definition of historically significant building or structure in the Demolition Delay Ordinance, which includes:

- a) Importantly associated with one or more historic persons or events, or with the architectural, cultural, political, economic or social history of the City of Newton, the Commonwealth of Massachusetts or the United States of America.
- b) Historically or architecturally important by reason of period, style, method of building construction or association with a particular architect or builder, either by itself or in the context of a group of buildings or structures.

3. 49-51 Louise Road – Waiver Request (Ward 8)

Request to waive demo delay

Alex Kogan, owner of this property, will present his revised plans for a replacement structure at this location. Plans presented at the September 2 and 23, 2021 hearing were not approved for a waiver.

At the April hearing, staff reported that this two-family building of wood frame and brick veneer was constructed in 1955 as part of a larger surveyed development designed by Joseph Selwyn of Belmont and constructed by Nardelli Construction Co. of Brighton. A concrete-block garage was constructed a year later. This property is in a surveyed neighborhood of like buildings and was deemed significant under the category of Community Planning. The survey form for the Louise Road-Florence Street-Craftsland Road area describes it as a visually cohesive streetscape of two-family houses that as a group are relatively uncommon in Newton for their architectural form.

At the September 2, 2021, hearing, Commission members reviewed the proposed replacement plans and had concerns that the garages were forward of the main body of the house and should be pushed back and deemphasized; additionally, a question was raised regarding the rationale of the use of the brick veneer. At the September 23, 2021, hearing, Commission members reviewed a revised plan and raised additional concerns regarding the lack of windows on the side of the house. No vote was taken, and the delay was not waived.

4. 1818 Beacon Street – Waiver Request (Ward 5)

Request to waive demo delay

The owner of this property will present plans for a replacement structure at this location. This property was preferably preserved on June 24, 2021, and the minimum four-month waiting period has elapsed.

At the June hearing, staff reported that this Colonial Revival Style house with attached garage was built in 1945 and designed by Royal Barry Wills of Boston. The house was owned and built by J.R. and Helen C. Duggan of Milford, MA. The attached garage was an original element. A rear addition and porch were constructed in 1978. According to city atlases and directories, there was a large Victorian house at this location 1945, which is clearly no longer there. The next owner of record of this house in 1953 is Elmer L. Tewksbury, treasurer, who lived here with his family through the 1960s. Harry A. Holzwasser was the owner in the 1970s when the rear additions were constructed. This is a somewhat unusual design for Wills, who was known for his architecturally diminutive postwar examples of Colonial Revival architecture where garages were not a central feature. Wills graduated from MIT and became a registered architect in 1925, opening his own Boston office on Beacon Street the same year. His firm did well and moved to Beacon Hill, and in 1954, he was elected a fellow of the American Institute of Architects. His work was noted at the time as a traditional counterpoint to that of Frank Lloyd Wright, who was a contemporary. Proportionality was also a hallmark of Will's designs, which makes this example of his work all the more confounding.

5. 9 The Ledges, NR – Partial Demolition Review (Ward 7)

Request to construct additions

The Colonial Revival single-family house was constructed in 1915 for owner Edward P Bosson and designed by Edward B. Stratton. Stratton was born in Chelsea in 1870 and studied architecture at MIT and in Paris, and designed Hotel Puritan and Hotel Somerset in Boston. Additionally, Stratton designed the West Newton Library (25 Chestnut Street) and the Newton Highlands Woman Club (72 Columbus Street), which is the site of a recent local landmark nomination. According to the property's form on file with the state, Edward Bosson was born in Chelsea in 1864 and entered business in Boston, eventually heading the firm of Bosson & Lane, manufacturers of chemical products for the textile trade. Further, after taking up residence in Newton in 1892, he became a member of the Board of Aldermen, now City Council, for four years beginning in 1905.

The street and area, which was laid out between 1906 and 1912, is named after its topography and was included in an extension of the Gray Cliff National Register Historic District in 1990, which listed 9 The Ledges as a contributing structure. A green house was added in 1986, and subsequently removed in 2009 to bring back the house to its original condition. The applicant received approval this year for the demolition and rebuilding of the terrace, as well as the in-kind replacement of the doors and windows, and miscellaneous repairs. Staff recommends preferably preserving the building as a contributing resource to the Gray Cliff NRHD.

In the event that the NHC votes to preferably preserve the house, the applicant will present plans which include the extension of the terraces, and on the left side, a new two-story addition for a garage with living space above, the raising of the roof, and a new secondary entrance on the façade.

6. 77 Morton Street, NR – Partial Demolition Review (Ward 2)

Request to construct additions on the house and detached garage

The unique Craftsman style house and detached garage at 77 Morton Street is part of the Morton Road Historic District, which was included on the National Register of Historic Places in 1990. Both structures are listed as contributing buildings on the area form. While the building permit could not be located, the area form states that the house, as well as 71 and 89 Morton Street, were all built in 1915 and designed by Gilbert Miles Ramsey. Ramsey drew the subdivision plan for the area, which was developed by Newton Associates beginning in 1915, with most of the houses constructed between 1915 and 1925. The detached garage at 77 Morton Street was constructed in 1921 for owner Lois A. Hartley. Harley and her husband, Harry Hartley, an auto supply dealer, are listed as living here in 1920 with their children, however by 1930 Philip Dowst, a lawyer, is listed as residing in the dwelling with his wife Vivian. Dowst continued to own and occupy 77 Morton St until his death in 1969.

Gilbert Miles Ramsey earned his undergraduate degree in architecture from Harvard in 1910, and his graduate from Columbia University in 1912. While his known designs seem concentrated in the greater Boston area, it is unclear how Ramsey got involved with this project. In 2011 a right-side one-story addition was constructed at 77 Morton St. More recently, staff gave approval for the in-kind replacement of the flat section of rubber roofing. Staff recommends preferably preserving both the house and detached garage as contributing buildings to the Morton Road NRHD. If the buildings are deemed preferably preserved the applicant will present plans to construct second story additions on either side of the house, as well as the detached garage.

7. 100 Andrew Street – Demolition Review (Ward 8)

Request to demolish building

The Postwar Traditional Style dwelling was constructed in 1960 by architect/builder Solomon Siegel and is consistent in design for the surrounding neighborhood. The owner is listed as Countryside Estates of Newton Inc. No other exterior permit aside from its initial construction was located in the ISD records, though it is possible the siding for the projecting portion over the garage has been replaced. The split-level house is

noted in the Area Form for the Andrew-Dedham Streets Area, a subdivision of (33) Contemporary and Postwar Traditional houses. According to the area form, consultants examined (14) houses in the subdivision, and except for one, all listed Solomon Siegel as the owner, architect, and builder. For the one property, R.I. Williams is listed as the architect, with Siegel as the builder/owner; the survey form notes that it was not uncommon practice for the developer of a subdivision to be listed as all three, even though the actual house plans may have been obtained elsewhere.

In 2015, the NHC deemed 44 Andrew Street preferably preserved, and issued the same determination for 19 Andrew Street in 2019. Staff recommends preferably preserving the dwelling as part of a mostly intact subdivision of a substantial number of similarly designed post war split level and contemporary style houses all built between 1959-1960 by the same developer.

8. 194 Otis Street – Demolition and Partial Demolition Review (Ward 2)

Request to construct additions on the house and demolish detached garage

The single-family dwelling at 194 Otis Street was permitted for construction in 1927 for \$30,000 for Lorenzo D. Baker, a real estate trustee. The architect is listed as Henry F. Keyes and the builder is William Kellar & Sons. The following year, the detached two car garage was permitted, also designed by Keyes to match the new house. No other building permits were located, except for a recent interior demolition permit. Keyes graduated from Harvard in 1901 and MIT in 1904 and returned to Boston in 1907 after practicing in New York. Keyes is perhaps best known as the architect of Commonwealth Pier in Boston in 1914, which is individually listed on the National Register of Historic Places. Later in his career, Keyes designed a number of large English revival dwellings including this one, 142 Adams Street (1930) in Quincy, 34 Tyler Rd (1930) in Belmont and 16 Clyde Street (1926) in Brookline.

The Tudor style dwelling and matching detached garage retain its steeply pitched slate roof and wood shingle siding. A large prominent chimney remains a feature to the right of entrance, and an overhanging second story gable with hanging pendants is evident to the entrance's left. Staff recommends preferably preserving the house for architectural integrity, and not preferably preserving the detached garage. The NHC should keep in mind that they should vote on the house and detached garage separately. In the event that the house is found to be preferably preserved, the applicants will show their plans which include a change in the siding material according to the rendering, alterations to the front entry and additions to the right side and rear. In the event that the garage is found preferably preserved, a plan which includes its demolition cannot be voted on for a waiver for 4 months. If the garage is not found preferably preserved, the proposed plans which can be reviewed show its demolition and a construction of a new attached garage.

Administrative Discussion:

a) Discussion of changing language of the Rules and Regulations regarding determinations of historically significant in regard to the Local Landmark Ordinance

Staff has discussed this administrative discussion item with the Law Department and the Law Department recommended including a step in the process to notify the owner of record and allow them a certain number of days prior to any administrative determination of historical significance to provide comments.

The location of this meeting/event is wheelchair accessible and Reasonable Accommodations will be provided to persons with disabilities who require assistance. If you need a Reasonable Accommodation, please contact the city of Newton's ADA/Section 504 Coordinator, Jini Fairley, at least two business days in advance (2 weeks for ASL or CART) of the meeting/event: <u>jfairley@newtonma.gov</u> or (617) 796-1253. The city's TTY/TDD direct line is: 617-796-1089. For the Telecommunications Relay Service (TRS), please dial 711.