



Ruthanne Fuller  
Mayor

**City of Newton, Massachusetts**  
Department of Planning and Development  
1000 Commonwealth Avenue Newton, Massachusetts 02459

Telephone  
(617) 796-1120  
Telefax  
(617) 796-1142  
TDD/TTY  
(617) 796-1089  
www.newtonma.gov

Barney S. Heath  
Director

**MINUTES OF PUBLIC MEETING AND PUBLIC HEARINGS  
NEWTON HISTORICAL COMMISSION**

**DATE:** November 4, 2021

**PLACE/TIME:** Via Zoom

**ATTENDING:** Peter Dimond, Chairman  
Katie Kubie, Member  
Jennifer Bentley-Houston, Alt  
Valerie Birmingham, Staff  
Doug Cornelius, Member  
Amanda Stauffer Park, Member

**ABSENT:** Nancy Grissom, Member  
Mark Armstrong, Member

The meeting was called to order via Zoom at 7:00 p.m. with Peter Dimond serving as Chair. Voting permanent members were Cornelius and Kubie. Stauffer Park joined after the first item and left during the last item. Bentley-Houston joined during the last item and was designated to vote as an alternate. Valerie Birmingham acted as Zoom host and the meeting was digitally recorded on the Zoom device.

**1. Newton Armory RFP Received Proposals - MOA**

Request for NHC comment on the seven submitted proposals

Barney Heath, Director of Planning and Development, Amanda Berman, Director of Housing and Community Development, and Eamon Bencivengo, Housing Development Planner, presented the submitted proposals and took questions and comments from the Commission. Mr. Heath remarked that each of the proposals retained the headhouse and attached new structures in the rear, which replaced the existing drill hall. Mr. Cornelius asked about the scope of review, to which Mr. Heath commented the Commission should provide comments on the overall project with a focus on the historic aspects. Mr. Dimond asked about changes, specifically to the windows, on the headhouse. Mr. Heath remarked some proposals were making changes, and it appeared to be associated with creating residential units in the headhouse. After Mr. Heath provided a brief overview of each proposal, the Commission went through them one by one. Overall comments included that all met the baseline outlined in the MOA as the headhouse was being retained, the fewer changes to the headhouse the

better and that parking underground was more compatible with the historic building. Mr. Heath reminded the Commission that the proposals were still schematic and would be further refined.

2Life Communities: Mr. Cornelius commented that the integration between the existing structure and new construction did not seem to work; Mr. Dimond remarked it was not particularly appealing and the Commissioners questioned what was happening on the right side of the headhouse.

Caritas: Commissioners remarked that it was in the middle of the group and fine; Mr. Dimond commented that it appeared respectful of the headhouse but did not like the surface parking.

Cruz Development: Mr. Cornelius remarked it was one of the more interesting proposals as it took advantage of the roof space of the headhouse, and it was higher in the ranking for the way it integrated the new and the old; Commissioners discussed the connector piece and Ms. Kubie commented that she did not like it.

Metro West Collaborative Development: Mr. Dimond remarked he prefer the headhouse stand on its own but was fine otherwise. Mr. Cornelius commented he was not bothered by the patio and thought it was fine.

Genesis: Ms. Kubie remarked she liked the new construction, specifically the L shape, the verticality and materials, and thought the proposal had the most going for it; Mr. Dimond remarked the courtyard was valuable and that the new construction complimented the headhouse; Mr. Cornelius remarked that the way the new construction stepped back from the headhouse was nice.

NCDF/Planning Office of Urban Affairs: Mr. Cornelius commented it seemed smaller and did not like the surface parking, and it was one of his least favorites; Mr. Dimond remarked it appeared a building had been stuck on the headhouse.

Onyx: Mr. Dimond remarked he did not like the design and that it detracted from and did not respect the headhouse; Mr. Cornelius agreed it was one of his least favorites and commented on the canopies and awnings.

The item was opened to public comment. Thor Helgason, 872 Watertown St, commented only the Genesis proposal appeared to integrate the headhouse with the new construction while maintaining the historic character and commented on the height. Councilor Malakie remarked she would like additional information on the changes to the windows. Mr. Heath commented that the full proposals were available on the city's website, and Mr. Cornelius stated that the Commission could provide comments but does not give final approval. Further, Councilor Malakie asked about the ownership of the rear space. Mr. Heath answered it belonged to the nursing home. Councilor Wright commented that the Genesis plan integrates the details but is changing the windows as it is using the headhouse for housing. Mr. Dimond commented he took back his positive thinking for the Genesis proposal if the windows in the headhouse are being altered. Jenn Bornstein of Andrew Street commented that she would hope there is a diversity of housing, and the maximum number of people can capitalize on it. Harvey Schorr of Bellevue Street commented on the massing as well as how it would appear next to the Dunstan East project.

2. **Determination of local historical of 144 Bridge St (Nonantum Library), 330 Homer St (Newton Free Library), 12 Hawthorn St (Pellegrini Field House), 1750 Commonwealth Ave (Fire Station #2), 246 Dudley St (Recreation Headquarters), 241 Church St (Fire Station #1) and 136 Park St (Burr Field House). This item was withdrawn prior to the hearing**

Request by Public Buildings Department to determine if buildings will be eligible for inclusion in a proposed CPA funded study of city buildings; and request for comment on the pre application and proposal to the CPC.

Ms. Stauffer-Park joined the hearing.

3. **49-51 Louise Road – Waiver Request (Ward 8)**

Request to waive demo delay

Staff reported that plans presented at the September 2 and 23, 2021 hearing were not approved for a waiver. At the September 2, 2021, hearing, Commission members reviewed the proposed replacement plans and had concerns that the garages were forward of the main body of the house and should be pushed back and deemphasized; additionally, a question was raised regarding the rationale of the use of the brick veneer. At the September 23, 2021, hearing, Commission members reviewed a revised plan and raised additional concerns regarding the lack of windows on the side of the house. No vote was taken, and the delay was not waived.

Alex Kogan, applicant, presented revised plans to the Commission. Mr. Dimond asked if the garages would be stepped back, to which Mr. Kogan replied that they would be. Mr. Cornelius asked about the front door and commented that it was an odd street. Mr. Kogan stated the design of the front door was due to the FAR.

Mr. Dimond made a motion to waive the demo delay based on plans as presented. Mr. Cornelius seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on November 4, 2021, the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 3-0-1:

RESOLVED to waive the demo delay on 49-51 Louise Road based on plans as presented.

Voting in the Affirmative:    Voting in the Negative:    Recusal:

Peter Dimond, Chair

Doug Cornelius, Member

Katie Kubie, Member

Amanda Stauffer-Park, Member

The applicant for 1818 Beacon Street had technical difficulties and the item went after 9 the Ledges Road.

4. **9 The Ledges, NR - Partial Demolition Review (Ward 7)**

## Request to construct additions

Staff reported that the Colonial Revival single-family house was constructed in 1915 for owner Edward P Bosson and designed by Edward B. Stratton. Stratton was born in Chelsea in 1870 and studied architecture at MIT and in Paris, and designed Hotel Puritan and Hotel Somerset in Boston. Additionally, Stratton designed the West Newton Library (25 Chestnut Street) and the Newton Highlands Woman Club (72 Columbus Street), which is the site of a recent local landmark nomination. According to the property's form on file with the state, Edward Bosson was born in Chelsea in 1864 and entered business in Boston, eventually heading the firm of Bosson & Lane, manufacturers of chemical products for the textile trade. Further, after taking up residence in Newton in 1892, he became a member of the Board of Aldermen, now City Council, for four years beginning in 1905.

The street and area, which was laid out between 1906 and 1912, is named after its topography and was included in an extension of the Gray Cliff National Register Historic District in 1990, which listed 9 The Ledges as a contributing structure. A green house was added in 1986, and subsequently removed in 2009 to bring back the house to its original condition. The applicant received approval this year for the demolition and rebuilding of the terrace, as well as the in-kind replacement of the doors and windows, and miscellaneous repairs. Staff recommended preferably preserving the building as a contributing resource to the Gray Cliff NRHD.

Ruth Bennett, architect for the project, agreed that the property should be preferably preserved as it contributed to the character of the neighborhood, and remarked they were requesting to demolish a portion of the house not part of the original design.

Mr. Dimond made a motion to preferably preserve the house at 9 the Ledges Road. Ms. Kubie seconded the motion

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on November 4, 2021, the Newton Historical Commission, by a vote of 4-0:

RESOLVED to preferably preserve the house at 9 the Ledges Road

Voting in the Affirmative: \_\_\_\_\_ Voting in the Negative: \_\_\_\_\_ Recusal: \_\_\_\_\_

Peter Dimond, Chair

Doug Cornelius, Member

Katie Kubie, Member

Amanda Stauffer-Park, Member

Ms. Bennett went over the proposed plans with the Commission. Commissioners inquired about the materials, size of the addition and visibility. Ms. Bennett commented that the materials would match the existing and it would be visible once one gets to the driveway. Ms. Kubie remarked that she had concerns about the addition and the placement of the proposed garage in front of the house. Mr. Cornelius commented it was a thoughtful design. Ms. Stauffer-Park stated it was the kind of addition the Commission liked.

Mr. Dimond made a motion to waive the demo delay based on plans as presented. Mr. Cornelius seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on November 4, 2021, the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 3-1-0:

RESOLVED to waive the demo delay on 9 the Ledges Road based on plans as presented.

Voting in the Affirmative:    Voting in the Negative:    Recusal:

Peter Dimond, Chair

Doug Cornelius, Member

Katie Kubie, Member

Amanda Stauffer-Park, Member

5. **1818 Beacon Street – Waiver Request (Ward 5)**

Request to waive demo delay

Staff reported that this property was preferably preserved on June 24, 2021, and the minimum four-month waiting period has elapsed.

Robert Murray, owner, went over the proposed plans with the Commission. Mr. Cornelius commented that he liked the reorientation of the garage. Ms. Kubie and Mr. Dimond commented on the loss of the historic house, and that the new design paid no reference to it.

Mr. Murray remarked that the street is a mixed bag and the existing house's design was non-descriptive. Ms. Kubie disagreed and remarked about the architect, Royal Barry Wills, a well-known 20<sup>th</sup> century architect. Ms. Stauffer-Park agreed with Ms. Kubie. Mr. Dimond reiterated that the new design did not reference the existing house, and he was not happy with the design. Mr. Cornelius stated he did not particularly love the new design.

The item was opened to public comment. Rena Getz of Waban, commented about the architect and remarked about other houses in the area, including those across the street that are still standing with new additions after being deemed preferably preserved. Councilor Kalis remarked that the design seemed ultra-modern. Isabelle Albeck, Windsor Road, stated that the new house was closer to the street than the existing, and that the new design had nothing to do with the existing beautiful brick house.

Ms. Kubie remarked that another Royal Barry Wills house had previously come before the Commission and the owner did not demolish it.

No vote was taken and the demolition-delay on the property was not waived.

6. **77 Morton Street, NR – Partial Demolition Review (Ward 2)**

Request to construct additions on the house and detached garage

Staff reported that the unique Craftsman style house and detached garage at 77 Morton Street is part of the Morton Road Historic District, which was included on the National Register of Historic Places in 1990. Both structures are listed as contributing buildings on the area form. While the building permit could not be located, the area form states that the house, as well as 71 and 89 Morton Street, were all built in 1915 and designed by Gilbert Miles Ramsey. Ramsey drew the subdivision plan for the area, which was developed by Newton Associates beginning in 1915, with most of the houses constructed between 1915 and 1925. The detached garage at 77 Morton Street was constructed in 1921 for owner Lois A. Hartley. Harley and her husband, Harry Hartley, an auto supply dealer, are listed as living here in 1920 with their children, however by 1930 Philip Dowst, a lawyer, is listed as residing in the dwelling with his wife Vivian. Dowst continued to own and occupy 77 Morton St until his death in 1969.

Gilbert Miles Ramsey earned his undergraduate degree in architecture from Harvard in 1910, and his graduate from Columbia University in 1912. While his known designs seem concentrated in the greater Boston area, it is unclear how Ramsey got involved with this project. In 2011 a right-side one-story addition was constructed at 77 Morton St. More recently, staff gave approval for the in-kind replacement of the flat section of rubber roofing. Staff recommended preferably preserving both the house and detached garage as contributing buildings to the Morton Road NRHD.

Peter Sachs, architect for the project, agreed that it should be preferably preserved.

Mr. Dimond made a motion to preferably preserve the house and garage at 77 Morton Street. Ms. Kubie seconded the motion

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on November 4, 2021, the Newton Historical Commission, by a vote of 4-0:

RESOLVED to preferably preserve the house and garage at 77 Morton Street

Voting in the Affirmative:                      Voting in the Negative:                      Recusal:

Peter Dimond, Chair

Doug Cornelius, Member

Katie Kubie, Member

Amanda Stauffer-Park, Member

Mr. Sachs remarked the owners were interested in preserving the house and garage. Federico Arellano, architect for the project, went over the plans with the Commission. Mr. Sachs commented that the materials would match the existing, and that the roof would be synthetic slate.

The Commission discussed the front dormers and reviewed the aerial views. Mr. Dimond asked about the materials, to which Mr. Sachs went over. Mr. Cornelius and Ms. Kubie commented that it seemed like a great way to preserve the house. Ms. Stauffer-Park commented that she was conflicted, and was having a difficult time seeing the character of the house in the plans as it had much more horizontality.

The item was opened to public comment. Harvey Schorr, Bellevue Street, commented that the architects did a great job but commented on the slight asymmetry, and remarked that by dropping the roofline of the additions slightly could help reinforce the distinction between the historic house and new additions.

The Commission and the architects discussed the height suggestion. Ms. Stauffer-Park commented that it was a step in the right direction, but that she still had concerns. Mr. Cornelius remarked that he was fine with the design.

Mr. Dimond made a motion to waive the demo delay on the house with final approval of the design, which would include lowering the roof lines of the addition, by staff. Ms. Kubie seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on November 4, 2021, the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 4-0-0:

RESOLVED to waive the demo delay on the house at 77 Morton Street with the condition that staff review final plans.

Voting in the Affirmative:      Voting in the Negative:      Recusal:

Peter Dimond, Chair  
Doug Cornelius, Member  
Katie Kubie, Member  
Amanda Stauffer-Park, Member

Mr. Arellano went over the plans for the detached garage. Mr. Cornelius remarked that he thought it looked great and the Commission should approve the plans.

Mr. Cornelius made a motion to waive the demo delay on the garage based on plans as presented. Ms. Kubie seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on November 4, 2021, the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 4-0-0:

RESOLVED to waive the demo delay on the garage at 77 Morton Street based on plans as presented

Voting in the Affirmative:      Voting in the Negative:      Recusal:

Peter Dimond, Chair  
Doug Cornelius, Member  
Katie Kubie, Member  
Amanda Stauffer-Park, Member

7. **100 Andrew Street – Demolition Review (Ward 8)**  
Request to demolish building

Staff reported that the Postwar Traditional Style dwelling was constructed in 1960 by architect/builder Solomon Siegel and is consistent in design for the surrounding neighborhood. The owner is listed as Countryside Estates of Newton Inc. No other exterior permit aside from its initial construction was located in the ISD records, though it is possible the siding for the projecting portion over the garage has been replaced. The split-level house is noted in the Area Form for the Andrew-Dedham Streets Area, a subdivision of (33) Contemporary and Postwar Traditional houses. According to the area form, consultants examined (14) houses in the subdivision, and except for one, all listed Solomon Siegel as the owner, architect, and builder. For the one property, R.I. Williams is listed as the architect, with Siegel as the builder/owner; the survey form notes that it was not uncommon practice for the developer of a subdivision to be listed as all three, even though the actual house plans may have been obtained elsewhere.

In 2015, the NHC deemed 44 Andrew Street preferably preserved, and issued the same determination for 19 Andrew Street in 2019. Staff recommended preferably preserving the dwelling as part of a mostly intact subdivision of a substantial number of similarly designed post war split level and contemporary style houses all built between 1959-1960 by the same developer.

The item was opened to public comment. Rona Hamada, 58 Andrew St, commented that Andrew Street was a community and she would hate to see it ruined by the destruction of the house. Ben Waltuck, 133 Andrew Street, remarked that the preservation of the area and a local historic district should be considered, and commented on a mid 20<sup>th</sup> century survey that was conducted which calls out Andrew Street as being on the few remaining intact neighborhoods of this period. Further Mr. Waltuck commented that the one year delay would have little effect, and the demolition would have a negative impact on the environment. Doug Clark, 39 Andrew Street, commented that he agreed with others and supported the preservation of the house. David Nguyen, 50 Andrew Street, commented on the mid 20<sup>th</sup> century survey, and how it stated that Andrew Street was remarkably intact, and that the character of the neighborhood should be retained. Further, Mr. Nguyen remarked that the house could be an example of a starter house, and that he agreed with the preservation of the neighborhood. Jenn Bornstein, 130 Andrew Street, commented that the owner of the property owns and worked on another house on the street. Further, Ms. Bornstein expressed concern as to the design and height of a new structure due to the floodplain. Lauren Lookner, 20 Andrew Street, remarked that Andrew Street is a community and remarked it was unclear if the owner's intentions are to maintain the integrity of the neighborhood. Councilor Kalis remarked that he would follow up with the community.

Mr. Cornelius commented that he appreciated the neighborhood, and he is not typically a fan of preserving this era of architecture, unless it is an intact community such as this one that has also been surveyed.

Mr. Dimond made a motion to preferably preserve the house at 100 Andrew Street. Mr. Cornelius seconded the motion

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on November 4, 2021, the Newton Historical Commission, by a vote of 4-0:

RESOLVED to preferably preserve the house at 100 Andrew Street



Voting in the Affirmative:                      Voting in the Negative:                      Recusal:

Peter Dimond, Chair  
Doug Cornelius, Member  
Katie Kubie, Member  
Amanda Stauffer-Park, Member

8. **194 Otis Street – Demolition and Partial Demolition Review (Ward 2)**

Request to construct additions on the house and demolish detached garage

Staff reported that the single-family dwelling at 194 Otis Street was permitted for construction in 1927 for \$30,000 for Lorenzo D. Baker, a real estate trustee. The architect is listed as Henry F. Keyes and the builder is William Kellar & Sons. The following year, the detached two car garage was permitted, also designed by Keyes to match the new house. No other building permits were located, except for a recent interior demolition permit. Keyes graduated from Harvard in 1901 and MIT in 1904 and returned to Boston in 1907 after practicing in New York. Keyes is perhaps best known as the architect of Commonwealth Pier in Boston in 1914, which is individually listed on the National Register of Historic Places. Later in his career, Keyes designed a number of large English revival dwellings including this one, 142 Adams Street (1930) in Quincy, 34 Tyler Rd (1930) in Belmont and 16 Clyde Street (1926) in Brookline.

The Tudor style dwelling and matching detached garage retain its steeply pitched slate roof and wood shingle siding. A large prominent chimney remains a feature to the right of entrance, and an overhanging second story gable with hanging pendants is evident to the entrance's left. Staff recommended preferably preserving the house for architectural integrity, and not preferably preserving the detached garage.

Mariana Dagatti, architect for the project, commented that the garage is hardly seen from street, does not relate well to its context, and cannot easily accommodate two cars. Mr. Cornelius remarked that the garage had a couple of interesting elements but was not worthy of being preserved. Ms. Kubie agreed

At a Newton Historical Commission scheduled meeting on November 4, 2021, Mr. Dimond made a motion to preferably preserve the detached garage 194 Otis Street. There was no motion to second, so the garage was not preferably preserved.

Ms. Dagatti remarked that the intention was to preserve as many features as possible on the house with the construction of additions.

Mr. Dimond made a motion to preferably preserve the house at 194 Otis Street. Ms. Kubie seconded the motion

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on November 4, 2021, the Newton Historical Commission, by a vote of 4-0:

RESOLVED to preferably preserve the house at 194 Otis Street

Voting in the Affirmative:      Voting in the Negative:      Abstained:

Peter Dimond, Chair  
Doug Cornelius, Member  
Katie Kubie, Member  
Amanda Stauffer Park, Member

Ms. Bentley Houston joined the hearing, and Ms. Stauffer Park left shortly thereafter.

Ms. Dagatti went over the proposed plans with the Commission. Mr. Dimond inquired about the location of the proposed attached garage. Ms. Dagatti clarified its location and commented that the driveway was proposed to be moved from Otis Street to Forest Avenue so that it was not so close to the intersection. Ms. Kubie remarked that she liked the relocation of the driveway and thought the plan worked well with the house. Mr. Cornelius agreed and commented it was a thoughtful design, and the neighborhood could support the additional square footage. Mr. Dimond asked about the connector and the proposed materials. Ms. Dagatti remarked that they felt there should be a transition piece between the house and proposed three car garage and went over the new materials on both the existing house and the proposed additions.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on November 4, 2021, the Newton Historical Commission, by a vote of 4-0:

RESOLVED to waive the demo delay on 194 Otis Street based on approved plans for a right side and rear addition to the house

Voting in the Affirmative:      Voting in the Negative:      Abstained:

Peter Dimond, Chair  
Doug Cornelius, Member  
Katie Kubie, Member  
Jennifer Bentley-Houston, Alt.

The meeting was adjourned by unanimous vote.

Respectfully,

 , NHC