

Ruthanne Fuller Mayor

Barney S. Heath
Director
Planning & Development

Valerie Birmingham Chief Preservation Planner

Members
Peter Dimond, Chair
Doug Cornelius
Mark Armstrong
Nancy Grissom
Katie Kubie
Amanda Stauffer Park
John Rice
Harvey Schorr, Alternate

1000 Commonwealth Ave. Newton, MA 02459 T 617-796-1120 F 617-796-1142

www.newtonma.gov

REVISED

* AGENDA *

Date: March 7, 2022 Time: 7:00 p.m.

Place: <u>https://us02web.zoom.us/j/89513367781</u> or

+16465588656,,89513367781#

8 Central Avenue, NR – Violation of Demolition Delay Ordinance (Ward 2)
 Determination by NHC if a violation of the Demolition Delay Ordinance has occurred by the unauthorized demolition of two chimneys

On December 28, 2021, staff was alerted that two chimneys had been demolished at this property, which exceeded the scope of building permits to do work on the interior. Since that time, staff, the Law Department, ISD and the owner have been communicating about the correct process for this work. The owner has submitted documents regarding the chimneys and slate roof, which are included in the packet documents, however the Law Department has advised that a plan of action should follow the Demolition Delay Ordinance's Section 22-57 Non-Compliance and Enforcement and prior practice for resolution of violations caused by unauthorized demolitions. Assistant City Solicitor, Andrew Lee, will be present at Monday's meeting to go over this section with the Commission and a proposed course of action. At this meeting the Commission should first vote whether the building is historically significant, and then whether or not a violation of the Demolition Delay Ordinance occurred. The house is individually listed on the National Register of Historic Places, and the definition of partial demolition extends to "...the removal of architectural elements which define or contribute to the historic character of the building or structure."

Two chimneys remain today, and two were demolished. Of the two that were demolished, one was a large brick chimney centered on the left side slope of the hipped slate roof, facing Crafts Street. Its size and design appeared to mimic those of the two remaining chimneys. The other demolished chimney was a smaller, more utilitarian in nature, brick chimney that was located in the very rear of the house.





Photographs of the chimneys prior to their demolition

Amos C. Judkins (1838-1906), a native of Maine, built this large Queen Anne style residence in 1884. He moved to this large corner lot from a house in the same neighborhood at Lowell and Watertown streets. Judkins was in the railroad car wheel manufacturing business in Boston for much of his life, but in his retirement, he played a key role in the development of this section of Newtonville. With John H. Lothrop, who also lived on Central Avenue, he bought large tracts of land in the

Crafts/Watertown streets area, which were subdivided into house lots during the late 1880s and 1890s. Judkins Street, located directly across from his home off Crafts Street, was named after him. After his death in 1906, the house reverted to his widow, Mary F. Judkins. Staff recommends that the Commission find this house to be historically significant.

2. 150 Jackson Road (also known as 55 Walnut Pk) – Partial Demolition Review (Ward 1)
Request to demolish attached convent and chapel structures to construct additions

The brick school building was permitted for construction in November 1964 for the Sisters of Saint Joseph for \$2,000,000 with an attached chapel and convent. The architectural firm is listed as Maginnis, Walsh and Kennedy, located at 126 Newbury Street in Boston. The firm's predecessor, Maginnis and Walsh was created in 1905 by Charles Maginnis and Timothy Walsh, and they were well known as the architects for the new campus for Boston College which began construction in 1908. Eugene F. Kennedy Jr. joined the firm in 1926 and became a senior partner in 1941. The firm continued to design educational and religious buildings into the mid-20th century including Marion Hall (1954), Saint Ann Hall (1961) and Loretto Hall (1963) at Emmanuel College and Sacred Heart Roman Catholic School (1953) in Boston. The successor firm's design style evolved throughout the decades as their mid-century minimalist contemporary designs contradicts the Gothic Revival style designed buildings of the predecessor firm. The contemporary 3-4 story brick building rises from a concrete foundation to a flat roof and encompasses multiple components. Consistently evident are flat covered entries, most supported by rounded columns. Window design ranges from their location, including individual sashes, groups of three with 1-2 vertical panes with a transom, and pairs of three vertical panes, and are mostly aligned vertically and horizontally and some incorporate hopper sash. The former Aquinas College was purchased by the city in 2015, and in 2016, all of the exterior curtain wall and windows were replaced on the classroom, and auditorium/cafeteria wings. Staff recommends preferably preserving the building as a fine example of a mid-century educational structure in Newton designed by a notable firm.

3. 148 Church Street, NR – Partial Demolition Review (Ward 1) Request to construct additions

This surveyed ca. 1868 Gothic Revival style house is known as the John Benton and Anna Louisa Goodrich house and was built by architect Charles Brigham of Brigham and Sturgis. According to the survey form on file with the state, John Benton Goodrich was born in Fitchburg in 1836. Graduating from Dartmouth College in 1857, he continued his education and earned his law degree in 1859. He married Anna Louisa Woodward of Newton and they moved to Newton with the construction of this house in 1868. Later, Goodrich served as a State Representative from this district in 1869 and 1870 and was the Middlesex County District Attorney from 1872 to 1875. The form goes on to note that this house was designed in the early phase of Charles Brigham's career. He entered into practice with English-trained John Hubbard Sturgis in July, 1866. Brigham believed that Newton would offer many opportunities for architects. Ruminating in April, 1868, Brigham notes that "I want to get a foothold this year in Newton which is a thriving place and would be a profitable field." Of the Goodrich commission, Brigham remarked that it is "a house to cost 6 or 7,000 dollars at Newton for a young lawyer, Mr. Goodrich." The house was completed in about March, 1868 for a total fee charged of \$250. In a letter from January, 1871, almost three years since the completion of the house, Brigham notes that he has written to Goodrich about the long-standing debt of \$125 that was still due. It's unclear whether this debt was ever paid.

Atlases show that additions have been constructed to the wood framed house over time, and at one point there was a front piazza that ran partially along the center and right side of the façade. In 1926, then owner, Warren Marston, permitted the construction of the two-story flat roofed left side addition. Five years later Marston removed the piazza and constructed a 6' x 8'6" vestibule. In 1986 the house was converted from a single to a two-family dwelling, and interior alterations occurred to satisfy the new use. The house continued to be altered throughout the decades including a new gable dormer and roof extension in 2001, and a chimney redesign and roof deck in 2002. The house is part of the Farlow and Kenrick Parks Historic District, which was listed on the National Register of Historic Places in 1982. Even with the alterations, staff recommends preferably preserving the house for its inclusion in a National Register Historic District and evidence of remaining features. In the event that the Commission preferably preserves the house, the applicant will show plans for a rear addition and alterations to the house, such as the removal of a chimney.

4. 70 Bigelow Road – Demolition Review (Ward 2)

Request to demolish house

This c. 1957 Cape Cod style two-story single-family home is constructed in a curved shape with the house facing into the intersection of Crestwood and Bigelow Road and attached two car garage facing Bigelow Road. Designed by Clifford Allbright, the house's original owner is listed as Winifred Robinson, a widow. Allbright trained at MIT before opening his own Boston firm in 1919 which he maintained until he retired in 1953. He is known for his suburban residential work in Weston, Brookline, Newton and Wellesley and for his commercial buildings in Andover and Brookline, as well as a townhouse in Boston at 100 Beacon Street. Allbright also designed churches, including St. Peters Episcopal Church in Weston and was a member of the BAC. In 1965, Ms. Robinson permitted the construction of a bow window to the existing kitchen, as well as the installation of a larger window in the living room and dormer. No other building permits were located in the ISD file. The Robinson family continued to own the property until December of last year. Staff recommends preferably preserving the house as a nice example of a 1950s cape in Newton, that was designed to be centrally sited on the lot with consideration to its landscape.

5. 29 Levbert Road – Demolition Review (Ward 8)

Request to demolish house

This single-family house was permitted for construction in 1960, and the application lists the owner, architect, and builder as Nardone Brothers. It appears that the Nardone Brothers began construction at the beginning on the street and worked there way around the bend as they are also listed on the building permits for #s 11-57 Levbert Road from 1959 through 1962. The first known owner of the house was Herman Tritter, who worked in real estate. By 1969, the owner is listed as Alan Grover a dentist, whose family continued to own the property until 1980. In 1990 an addition in the rear right side corner was constructed for a family and dining room. The house does still retain its low slopped asphalt cross roof and faux stone veneer, though on its own, is not an exceptional example of midcentury. However, while Levbert Road has endured changes, this specific part of the road appears to have remained contextually intact as an example of a midcentury subdivision with the houses featuring a similar split level influenced type design. For this reason, staff recommends preferably preserving the house.

6. 74 Rachel Road - Demolition Review (Ward 8)

Request to demolish house

The mid-century ranch was constructed in 1964 for \$20,000 by Countryside Estates and was designed by local architect, R.I. Williams. The owner of Countryside Estates was Solomon Siegel of Newton Highlands, who also developed nearby 53, 62 and Rachel Road as well as the Andrew Street neighborhood. The first known owner of the house was Erwin Germaise, a manager at Tile Setting. By 1975, the house was occupied by Elio lannuzzi, an anesthesiologist. The only permitted exterior change was the construction of a rear porch in 1983. The house has retained its original design and massing, including its low pitched cross gabled asphalt roof with moderate overhangs and open front entry covered by the slope of the main roof. Even with the few changes, staff does not think on its own it is a great example of a contemporary style residence and recommends not preferably preserving the house.

7. 18 Bonnybrook Road – Waiver Request (Ward 5)

Request to waive demolition delay

The owner of this property will present plans for a replacement structure at this location. This property was preferably preserved on October 28, 2021, and the minimum four-month waiting period has elapsed.

Staff reported at the October hearing that the single-family house with an attached two car garage at 18 Bonnybrook Road was permitted for construction in 1939 for \$16,000. The owner is listed as Frederick Morley and the architect and builder is Joseph Morley. The brothers also teamed up to construct #s 31 and 36 Bonnybrook Road the same year. Bonnybrook Road was constructed sometime between 1929 and 1939 on land formerly belonging to Margaret B. Gorham.

The Colonial Revival style dwelling features elements typical of its style such as an accentuated front entrance supported by pilasters and with a broken pediment, large double hung multi pane windows flanked by shutters, and decorative modillions below the eave. In 1961 the rear of the house was extended for a porch and den by owner Richard Silverman. Silverman later had a rear solarium and pool house addition to the right side constructed in 1981. Staff recommends the house preferably preserved for architectural integrity.

8. 17 Brandeis Road – Demolition Review (Ward 8)

Request to demolish house

The Commission first reviewed this address at their January 28, 2021 meeting. At that time the application was for partial demolition and the Commission voted to preferably preserve the house and waived the demolition delay based on submitted plans. Since that time the applicant has learned, due to a difference in available maps and information, the property is in a flood zone and has rethought their plans, going from a partial to a full demolition. As the scope of work has changed, a new application for full demolition was submitted, and once again the Commission should determine whether the house should be preferably preserved. Please note that as this is an application for full demolition, in the event the NHC once again votes to preferably preserve the house, a waiver request should not be reviewed or waived for a minimum of four months according to the Demolition Delay Ordinance. At the time of the writing of this memorandum, no application had been submitted to the Conservation Commission, however discussions have occurred with the Chief Conservation Planner, and she does expect an application to be submitted to start that process simultaneous to the Demolition Delay process.

Built by owner/builder Herbert Glazier of Newton and designed by Lester Lechter of Boston, this Contemporary Style home was constructed in 1959. Herbert Glazier was still the owner in 1962 when the existing garage was converted to a storage room, and two new garage bays were added to the right side of the house. Longtime owners Marcia P. and Melvin I. Wartel were residents here after Glazier sold. The house is of asymmetrical design located in a neighborhood of largely split-level homes, making this style stand out as somewhat unusual for its micro-neighborhood. Lechter was a prolific architect in Newton who specialized in post-war homes, including Ranch Styles, and split-levels. Lechter designed five other Newton homes in the Split-level style in the late 1950s that are included on MACRIS, and all, or were, located on Baldpate Hill Road: #178, 190, 200, 222, 236. Even when compared to these examples, this house at 17 Brandeis stands out as somewhat unusual. Evidence of the original windows and asymmetry can still be found on the façade. Staff once again recommends the house preferably preserved for architectural integrity.

Administrative Discussion:

- a) Approval of minutes
- b) Discussion of edits to the Commission's Rules and Regulations

The location of this meeting/event is wheelchair accessible and Reasonable Accommodations will be provided to persons with disabilities who require assistance. If you need a Reasonable Accommodation, please contact the city of Newton's ADA/Section 504 Coordinator, Jini Fairley, at least two business days in advance (2 weeks for ASL or CART) of the meeting/event: ifairley@newtonma.gov or (617) 796-1253. The city's TTY/TDD direct line is: 617-796-1089. For the Telecommunications Relay Service (TRS), please dial 711.