



Ruthanne Fuller
Mayor

City of Newton, Massachusetts
Department of Planning and Development
1000 Commonwealth Avenue Newton, Massachusetts 02459

Telephone
(617) 796-1120
Telefax
(617) 796-1142
TDD/TTY
(617) 796-1089
www.newtonma.gov

Barney S. Heath
Director

**MINUTES OF PUBLIC MEETING AND PUBLIC HEARINGS
NEWTON HISTORICAL COMMISSION**

DATE: December 23, 2021

PLACE/TIME: Via Zoom

ATTENDING: Peter Dimond, Chairman Doug Cornelius, Member
Katie Kubie, Member John Rice, Member
Jennifer Bentley-Houston Alt. Valerie Birmingham, Staff

ABSENT: Nancy Grissom, Member Mark Armstrong, Member
Amanda Stauffer Park, Member

The meeting was called to order via Zoom at 7:00 p.m. with Peter Dimond serving as Chair. Voting permanent members were Cornelius, Kubie and Rice. Bentley-Houston was designated to vote as an alternate. Valerie Birmingham acted as Zoom host and the meeting was digitally recorded on the Zoom device.

1. **72 Columbus Street – Proposed Local Landmark Designation (Ward 6)**
Request to designate this property a local landmark

Hannah Haynes, President of the Women's Club of Newton Highlands, presented the club's support of the designation and explained the upkeep work that was occurring at the property.

Staff reported that On September 1, 2021, the Women's Club of Newton Highlands building at this address in Newton Highlands was nominated as a local landmark by its owner, Workshop of Women's Club of Newton.

This structure is important for its contribution as a women's club to this neighborhood during its second round of steady growth in the 1920s. Historically, women's clubs were very popular in Newton's villages. Between the late 19th and the early 20th century, over 60 women's clubs have been documented in Newton. Only two of them, this one in Newton Highlands and one in Newton Centre,

were able to construct their own club houses. Unlike 72 Columbus Street, the women's club house for Newton Centre (1280 Centre Street) is no longer in use for the social function as the club sold the building in 1973. The Highlands club combined many smaller ones and formed in 1916 to support charitable, social, and intellectual causes. According to early documents, the purpose of the club was "The promotion of literacy and educational interests of the community, the development and furtherance of benevolent work, and the establishment and maintenance of a place of meeting." The group began a building fund in 1920 and acquired a lot of land in 1927 on Columbus Street in part through the generosity of Seward W. Jones, who lived at 49 Columbus Street and was father to one of the club's founders, Mabel E. Jones McKay. Prominent architect Edward B. Stratton prepared plans for the Club Workshop, and the permits were pulled in 1927 and construction begin in March of that year. Stratton's design is an example of an early 20th-century building designed in the Colonial Revival and Spanish Eclectic Styles, which exhibits the major architectural tenets of a popular style adapted to diminutive form.

The property is still owned and operated by the Workshop, Inc., consisting of members of the Newton Highlands Women's Club, and in addition to the club's contributions to the community associated with this building, for the last 94 years the building has also lent itself to the community for events such as wedding receptions and public forums. In accordance with the newly drafted Local Landmark Ordinance, at its December 13, 2021, meeting, the Planning Board voted 6 in favor, with 1 abstention (Barney Heath, Director of the Planning Department) to recommend that the Commission designate the property a local landmark.

Mr. Cornelius asked about the genesis for the nomination. Ms. Haynes explained that they were hopeful it would aid in requesting CPA funds to further upkeep the historic property.

Mr. Dimond commented that he felt the property was worthy of the designation. Mr. Rice stated that the program of the women's club has been enormous over time, and that this property was a main anchor of Newton Highlands.

Barney Heath, Director of the Planning and Development Department for the City, represented the Planning Board's recommendation in favor of the designation.

Mr. Cornelius made a motion to designate the property at 72 Columbus Street as a local landmark in accordance with Section 22-64 of Newton's ordinances and to adopt items #10, 11 and 12 from the local landmark report as the findings of the Commission. Ms. Kubie seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on December 23, 2021 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 5-0:

RESOLVED to designate the property at 72 Columbus Street as a local landmark in accordance with Section 22-64 of Newton's ordinances and to adopt items #10, 11, and 12 from the local landmark report as the findings of the Commission.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative: Recusal:

Peter Dimond, Chair

Doug Cornelius, Member
Katie Kubie, Member
John Rice, Member
Jennifer Bentley-Houston, Alt.

2. **206-208 Concord Street – Local Landmark Nomination (Ward 4)**

Request to nominate this property for designation as a local landmark

Staff reported that This property came before the NHC at the September 23, 2021 hearing, and was determined to be historically significant which meant it was eligible to be nominated as a local landmark. On October 4, 2021, Councilor Gentile with NHC member Jennifer Bentley-Houston nominated this property as a local landmark. The nomination was first scheduled to be heard by the Commission at its November 18, 2021 hearing, however the owner of the property asked that it be rescheduled as they had a conflict and wanted the opportunity to attend and speak. At this hearing the NHC must vote on whether the property has enough historical significance to authorize staff to prepare a local landmark report for consideration at a future hearing for possible designation of the property as a landmark. The decision must occur at this hearing, and it cannot be rescheduled again to a further date due to time requirements in the newly drafted Local Landmark Ordinance.

At the September hearing staff reported that according to the survey form on file with the state, this pre-Civil War two-family Federal style structure was originally owned by the Kingsbury family and was constructed c. 1830. By 1848 the Crane family took possession of the property, and in 1860, Rebecca Crane (widow of Zenus Allen Crane) is listed as the head of the household and resided in the dwelling through the 1880's. The form continues to note that the Crane family are believed to be members of the same Crane family as Zenus Crane who began his career in Newton Lower Falls, and later established a paper mill in Dalton, MA, and became notable for making paper currency.

Staff has since been able to confirm the relationship as the known elder Zenus Crane was the uncle of this Zenus Crane. Staff is still working to determine if this Zenus Crane himself ever resided in 206-208 Concord Street as he died c. 1845. His widow, and children certainly did until they moved in 1885. According to reports, paper making is a family occupation as Zenus Crane's grandfather, Stephen Crane (father of the known Zenus Crane, whose notable company is still in existence), opened a paper business in 1770. Additionally, this Zenus Crane's father Stephen Crane Jr., worked in a paper mill and naturally his son, Zenus Allen Crane, who resided at the Concord Street address, is listed as a paper manufacturer in the 1860 census. The area of Lower Falls itself also has ties to paper making as according to the Discover Historic Newton Lower Falls brochure, "During the early years of the 19th century, the production of paper emerged as the village's leading industry...The population, wholly dependent upon the mills, steadily increased to 405 inhabitants and 33 dwellings in 1823." With 206-208 Concord Street's estimated construction date being c. 1830, it is possible it was built in response to the flourishing paper business. Additional research conducted by a resident on nearby Swallow Drive is included in the packet docs.

As typical for a building of its age, it has had a number of additions. According to the MACRIS form, an 1880 birds eye map shows a shed roofed rear addition which protrudes past the northwestern end. This addition was later expanded with a gable end, and a one-story addition was then added to the

northwestern end. Additional material changes and loss of original fabric has occurred over the years, however its overall massing has been retained.

Ms. Bentley-Houston referenced the significant number of neighbors who had spoken about the property, and that it was a part of the Newton Lower Falls economy. Further, Ms. Bentley-Houston remarked that she was interested in the property and wanted to learn more information prior to an actual decision is made as to whether to landmark the property.

The item was opened to public comment.

Michael Quinn, owner of the property, commented that they were not happy with the nomination and that they had put a lot of money into the property recently to update it and it was not their intention to demolish the building. Further, Mr. Quinn stated that he had spoken with neighbors in opposition to the nomination, and that several other houses in the area were built at the same time and it was not fair to designate this one property; additionally, it was a large piece of land and it was their intention to develop the property and construct a single family house in the rear, however they had run into a delay due to an encroachment issue. Lastly, Mr. Quinn recognized it was a beautiful area and that added to why they wanted to keep the exterior as it is, and that there were issues with the interior.

Cyrisse Jaffe, 8 Hallron Rd, remarked about Tori Zissman's research on the property and the benefits of pursuing the nomination further as it acknowledges history in a public way. Further, Ms. Jaffe commented on the property's association with industry and the working person, and that it would be beneficial to research the property further.

Robin Welch, abutter, remarked she appreciated the owner's comments and mentioned Tori Zissman's research on the house and neighborhood.

Randall Block, 45 Lafayette Road, provided remarks on behalf of Beverly Hurney, historian for the abutting St. Mary's Church. Remarks went over a history of a connection between the church and the Crane family and that it was fitting to landmark the house with the connection the Crane family has to Newton Lower Falls. Mr. Block on his own account commented on the research by Tori Zissman in regard to the house and the Crane family.

Councilor Wright remarked that there was enough history and information to take the next step and that it did not mean that house would be landmarked.

Mr. Dimond made a motion to accept the local landmark nomination and conduct further study of the property. Ms. Bentley-Houston seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on December 23, 2021, the Newton Historical Commission, by a vote of 5-0

RESOLVED to accept the local landmark nomination and conduct further study of 206-208 Concord Street, to be presented to the NHC for review at a future hearing

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative: Recusal:

Peter Dimond, Chair
Doug Cornelius, Member
Katie Kubie, Member
John Rice, Member
Jennifer Bentley-Houston, Alt.

3. **31 Greenwood Street, LL – Request for Certificate of Appropriateness (Ward 8)**
Request to remove transom and metal divider above front entry slider and install faux transom window – continuation **This item was postponed by the applicant to the 1-27-22 NHC Hearing**
4. **145 Warren Street, LL—Request for Certificate of Appropriateness (Ward 6)**
Request to restore the front bench, replace side windows, alter front façade, construct additional residential units in the rear of the site, install hardscaping including brick pier, terraces and driveway – continuation **This item was postponed by the applicant to the 1-27-22 NHC Hearing**
5. **199 Church Street, NR – Partial Demolition Review (Ward 1)**
Request to construct additions

Staff reported that the property at 199 Church Street is included in the Farlow Kenrick Parks Historic District, which was listed on the National Register of Historic Places in 1982. According to the 2015 survey form on file with the state, the two-story wood framed house with a side gable roof dates to c. 1851. The lot was first created as part of an 1844 subdivision plan of 37 new lots, laid out by Alexander Wadsworth, the engineer who mapped Mt. Auburn Cemetery in 1831. The survey form continues to state that in 1846 John H. Richardson sold the lot to John F. Boyd, a carpenter turned real estate developer, and the deed contained a restriction that a dwelling of not less than two stories be erected within one year set back at least 30 feet from Church Street with only necessary outbuildings. Between 1851 and 1878 the property changed hands a number of times, at which time Albert W. Rice, a dealer in small wares, bought the property and resided in the house for the next 15 years. A rear accessory building is evident on the 1874 atlas, however it appears to have been replaced with the existing carriage house by 1895. By 1906 the house was sold to Addie S. Moore, wife of Louis A Moore, an accountant. The Moore family would continue to own the property for over 70 years until Helene Moore sold it in 1977.

Alterations to the house have occurred to the 19th century structures such as the addition of a 1922 large dormer with a shed roof on the façade, the construction of a box oriel above the front porch on the second floor in 1924, window replacements and the enclosing of the 1917 front piazza which also hid the front entrance and flanking first floor bays, evident on the 1874 atlas. The Greek Revival design is tough to make out but is still evident in the cornice. Even with the changes, staff recommended preferably preserving the house as being part of a cohesive area listed on the National Register of Historic Places, developed in the mid-19th century with other intact Greek Revival designs, and the carriage

Mark Sangiolo, architect for the project, commented that he thought the buildings should be preferably preserved.

Mr. Dimond made a motion to preferably preserve the house and carriage house at 199 Church Street. Ms. Bentley-Houston seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on December 23, 2021, the Newton Historical Commission, by a vote of 5-0:

RESOLVED to preferably preserve the house and carriage house at 199 Church Street

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative: Abstained:

Peter Dimond, Chair
Doug Cornelius, Member
Katie Kubie, Member
John Rice, Member
Jennifer Bentley-Houston, Alt.

Mr. Sangiolo went over the proposed plans with the Commission and commented that the project would require a special permit from the City Council. Further, Mr. Sangiolo remarked that the addition would fill in the rear corner of the house, the ridge would be subservient to the main ridge, have similar siding to the house, and that the plan included the removal of the front encloser on the house and a small residential unit in the carriage house.

Mr. Cornelius asked about the existing rear additions. Mr. Birmingham answered.

Ms. Bentley-Houston asked about the roofline on the first story porch, the windows on the carriage house, and the banding across the house. Mr. Sangiolo clarified the plans and remarked that regarding the windows, the plan was to keep as near to the existing design as possible.

Mr. Dimond asked about the materials. Mr. Sangiolo commented they would match what was there now except for the jiggered shingle pattern as he preferred a fish scale pattern.

Mr. Cornelius commented that it was great and thoughtful proposal. Ms. Kubie agreed.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on December 23, 2021, the Newton Historical Commission, by a vote of 5-0:

RESOLVED to waive the demo delay on 199 Church Street based on approved plans for a right side and rear addition, as well as changes to the front porch, to the house and dormers, fenestration and material changes on the carriage house.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative: Abstained:

Peter Dimond, Chair
Doug Cornelius, Member
Katie Kubie, Member
John Rice, Member
Jennifer Bentley-Houston, Alt.

6. **63 Charlemont Street – Partial Demolition Review (Ward 8)**

Request to construct additions

Staff reported that the one and a half story single-family house was permitted for construction in December 1928 as part of a surveyed neighborhood known as the Charlemont Subdivision, which consists of small, pre- and post-war houses on small lots. The owner is listed on the permit application as Leslie Quinton, and the architect is Howard Cutler. Quinton and Cutler also teamed up to construct 28, 31, 65, 69 and 73 Charlemont Street, as well as 9 Carl Street, between 1927-1929.

The survey form for this area states the following: "The area was platted in 1920 with very small lots. Those around the oval formed by Carl and Charlemont Streets were developed fairly quickly and are characterized by small wood-frame cottages, many of which make few if any stylistic references. All of the houses are quite modest, and most are one story cottages." In 1922, the development was advertised as "A new development where a man of moderate means may build a home in a neighborhood reasonably restricted to create and maintain an agreeable residential Community." The area was developed by Neil McIntosh, a trustee for the Suburban Real Estate Development Company of Boston, which had developed similar areas in Wellesley, Arlington Terrace, Revere and Lake Cochituate Park. A number of builders were active in this subdivision, but few architects.

The first known owner at 63 Charlemont Street was John Conlon, a carpenter who is listed as residing at the address with his family in the 1930 census. The property remained in the Conlon family until 1963. In 1939 a shed roofed dormer on the right side of the front gabled roof was replaced with a larger dormer with a gabled roof. The almost matching dormer on the left side of the roof was added in 1991. In 2015 the Newton Historical Commission preferably preserved the house at 73 Charlemont Street. Staff recommended preferably preserving the house as it has retained its simple vernacular architecture, which was typical for the development, and still evident on that side of Charlemont Street.

Fernando Dalfior, owner of the property, commented that the house was very small, and that the plan was to keep its overall footprint with changes to the rear.

Mr. Cornelius remarked that he did not think there was much there on merit or neighborhood context. Ms. Bentley-Houston disagreed and thought there was neighborhood context. Ms. Kubie agreed with Mr. Cornelius and commented that the neighborhood seemed like a hodge podge and not super cohesive.

Mr. Dimond made a motion to preferably preserve the house at 63 Charlemont Street. Ms. Bentley-Houston seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on December 23, 2021, the Newton Historical Commission, by a vote of 2-3:

RESOLVED to preferably preserve the house at 63 Charlemont Street.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative: Abstained:

Peter Dimond, Chair

Doug Cornelius, Member

Katie Kubie, Member

John Rice, Member

Jennifer Bentley-Houston, Alt.

The motion failed to pass so the house was not preferably preserved.

7. **50 Braeland Avenue – Demolition Review (Ward 6)**

Request to demolish house and detached garage

Staff reported that located close to the Newton Centre T stop, the single-family house was constructed in 1922 for \$4500. The owner on the building permit application is listed as Mrs. C.A. White, and the architect is Hawley Morton. Morton and his wife Amalia had recently purchased the abutting property at 52 Institution Ave (now Herrick Road), and it was the Mortons that subdivided the property in 1921, forming 50 Braeland Avenue. Staying in the family, Amalia Morton, and her husband Hawley, sold the new property on Braeland Avenue to her aunt, Mrs. Alice White and her husband Charles A. As the original architect, and abutting neighbor, Hawley Morton designed an extension in the rear of the house for a dining room in 1929. The following year, in 1930, Morton also designed a detached garage to match the house and be located in the rear of the property.

Hawley Morton was a known local architect, and was associated with nearby 16 Braeland Avenue, and was half of the architecture firm that designed 145 Warren Street, a Newton local landmark. Seventeen of his buildings are listed on MACRIS: thirteen are in Newton, and six of those are listed on the State Register. The Craftsman style house and garage appear to have retained a number of original elements, including the roof's wide eaves and exposed rafter tails, wood multi sash double hung windows, and the garage's original doors. Staff recommended preferably preserving the house and garage for its association with a known local architect and architectural integrity as a vernacular example of the Craftsman style.

Nilesh Patel, owner, remarked that the house was fairly small for today's living and in fairly poor condition. Mr. Patel also commented that the garage was small and in a dilapidated condition, and that nothing jumped up for the property in terms of historic.

Mr. Cornelius commented that it was cluster of very cohesive houses with more interest, but the house does seem to stand on its own; however, he was not so sure about the garage. Mr. Dimond agreed.

Mr. Dimond made a motion to preferably preserve the house at 50 Braeland Avenue. Ms. Kubie seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on December 23, 2021, the Newton Historical Commission, by a vote of 5-0:

RESOLVED to preferably preserve the house at 50 Braeland Avenue

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative: Abstained:

Peter Dimond, Chair

Doug Cornelius, Member

Katie Kubie, Member

John Rice, Member

Jennifer Bentley-Houston, Alt.

Mr. Dimond made a motion to preferably preserve the garage at 50 Braeland Avenue. There was no second to the motion, so the garage was not preferably preserved.

8. **15 Kenmore Street – Demolition Review (Ward 6)**

Request to demolish house

Staff reported that The single-family dwelling at 15 Kenmore Street was permitted for construction in 1939. The owner is listed as R.B. Emery (262 Lake Ave) and the architect is W.J. Freethy from Waban. William John Freethy was a local architect with 61 designs listed on the state's database. In Newton, Freethy designed revival style houses which can be found on Commonwealth Avenue, Dartmouth Street, Highland Street, Woodchester Drive, and Wykeham Road. Five of his Tudor Revival Commonwealth Avenue designs are included in the Day Estate Historic District, which is listed on the National Register of Historic Places. Freethy was born in England and immigrated to the United States as a child. The first owner of 15 Kenmore Street, Ralph B. Emery, an insurance agent, resided at the dwelling with his wife Virginia. The couple continued to reside in the house together until Ralph's death in 1968. In 1972, Virginia sold the property to David Putnam.

Elements of the original Colonial Revival design have been retained since construction such as the symmetrical façade, classical entrance surround with decorative pediment and pilasters, brick veneer on the façade painted white, and the large central chimney also designed to be painted white. The one-story right-side porch was enclosed in 1975 by then owners Roger and Darlene Weinrib. The multi sash double hung windows were replaced with 1/1 double hung windows between 2011-2019. The original building permit plans are included in the packet documents. Staff recommended preferably preserving the house as a fine example of the Colonial Revival style.

Gregg Furie and Clara Filice, owners, commented that they had been exploring the idea of renovating the house and learned of issues that contributed to thinking a renovation was not efficient.

Additionally, Mr. Furie and Ms. Filice remarked that they are interested in making the new house as sustainable as possible and do not prefer to add a lot of square footage; further, that the house was a pretty typical colonial and there were no particularly distinguishing features.

Mr. Cornelius commented that the house was fine, but nothing particularly special and not part of a cohesive set. Mr. Dimond remarked that it was worth preserving and there was context. Ms. Kubie commented that it did add to the context of the neighborhood and gave it a sense of time and place.

Mr. Dimond made a motion to preferably preserve the house at 15 Kenmore Street. Ms. Bentley-Houston seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on December 23, 2021, the Newton Historical Commission, by a vote of 4-1:

RESOLVED to preferably preserve the house at 15 Kenmore Street

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative: Abstained:

Peter Dimond, Chair

Doug Cornelius, Member

Katie Kubie, Member

John Rice, Member

Jennifer Bentley-Houston, Alt.

9. **510 Watertown Street – Demolition Review (Ward 1)**
Request to demolish house and detached garage

Staff reported that though alterations are evident, this side of Watertown Street retains a collection of 19th century wood framed dwellings. According to atlases, the wood framed house which rises from a stone foundation at 510 Watertown Street was constructed between 1886 and 1895 by the Cabot family. Charles D. Cabot was a locally well-known furniture salesman, who also served as an Alderman (now City Councilor) for a number of years. Mr. Cabot moved to Newton with his wife, Alice, from Vermont and is first listed as living on Watertown St in the 1880 census. They owned the property at 510 as early as 1886 and resided throughout the years with their children and boarders. Charles D Cabot died in 1934, and his widow, Alice, continue to reside at the house until her death in 1938.

Prior to his death, Cabot, in 1924 altered the dining room bay window on the left side of the house to be a door that opened to the side porch piazza. In 1946, then owner, Federico Ciolfi, permitted the construction of the detached cement block two car garage in the rear of the right side of the property. By 1947 a building permit lists the property as being used as a two family, and Ciolfi altered the size and closed a window on the first floor. The porch deck was repaired in 2005. Additional changes have occurred including alterations to the siding, replacement windows, and at some point, a small one-story addition was constructed with a shed roof towards the rear of the right side of the house. Unfortunately, its most prominent decorative feature, detailing in the main gable, was removed some time after 1976. However, the massing of the house has been retained, as well as the side bays, chimneys, steeply pitched front gabled roof and front porch which wraps around the left side. Staff recommended preferably preserving the house as it continues to be part of a collection of late 19th century dwellings, which has retained some of its detailing and features. Staff recommended not preferably preserving the garage.

Aleksandr Nemanov, owner, commented that the property had been purchased for his family.

Mr. Cornelius remarked that the house and its age was worth preferably preserving, but not the garage. Ms. Bentley agreed about the garage, and commented that she liked the house, was saddened

by the removal of the decorative features on the gable, and that the house due to its age merits being preferably preserved. Mr. Kubie commented it would be loss to the neighborhood and there was no infill of modern buildings on either side, and there was a cohesiveness of 19th century buildings.

Mr. Dimond made a motion to preferably preserve the garage at 510 Watertown Street. There was no second to the motion, so the garage was not preferably preserved.

Mr. Dimond made a motion to preferably preserve the house at 510 Watertown Street. Ms. Kubie seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on December 23, 2021, the Newton Historical Commission, by a vote of 5-0:

RESOLVED to preferably preserve the house at 510 Watertown Street

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative: Abstained:

Peter Dimond, Chair

Doug Cornelius, Member

Katie Kubie, Member

John Rice, Member

Jennifer Bentley-Houston, Alt.

Administrative Discussion:

a) Discussion of changing language of the Rules and Regulations regarding determinations of historically significant in regard to the Local Landmark Ordinance

The commission discussed the proposed new language as well as comments offered by the Law Department. The Commission decided to continue working on the language after obtaining further comments from the Law Department and no vote was taken. Additionally, the Commission discussed the recent changes to the Demolition Delay Ordinance and recognized the need to update additional sections of the Rules and Regulations to reflect those changes.

b) Minutes from November 4, 2021 hearing.

Minutes from the November 4, 2021 hearing were unanimously approved by those in attendance at the hearing.

The meeting was adjourned by unanimous vote.

Respectfully,

 , NHC