

City of Newton, Massachusetts

Department of Planning and Development 1000 Commonwealth Avenue Newton, Massachusetts 02459

Telephone (617) 796-1120 Telefax (617) 796-1142 TDD/TTY (617) 796-1089 www.newtonma.gov

Barney S. Heath Director

MINUTES OF PUBLIC MEETING AND PUBLIC HEARINGS **NEWTON HISTORICAL COMMISSION**

DATE: March 7, 2022

PLACE/TIME: Via Zoom

ATTENDING: Peter Dimond, Chairman

Nancy Grissom, Member

John Rice, Member

Valerie Birmingham, Staff

Doug Cornelius, Member Mark Armstrong, Member

Harvey Schorr Alt.

The meeting was called to order via Zoom at 7:00 p.m. with Peter Dimond serving as Chair. Voting permanent members were Cornelius, Grissom, Armstrong and Rice. Schorr was designated to vote. Valerie Birmingham acted as Zoom host and the meeting was digitally recorded on the Zoom device.

8 Central Avenue, NR – Violation of Demolition Delay Ordinance (Ward 2)

Determination by NHC if a violation of the Demolition Delay Ordinance has occurred by the unauthorized demolition of two chimneys

Staff reported that on December 28, 2021, staff was alerted that two chimneys had been demolished at this property, which exceeded the scope of building permits to do work on the interior. Since that time, staff, the Law Department, ISD and the owner have been communicating about the correct process for this work. The owner has submitted documents regarding the chimneys and slate roof, which are included in the packet documents, however the Law Department has advised that a plan of action should follow the Demolition Delay Ordinance's Section 22-57 Non-Compliance and Enforcement and prior practice for resolution of violations caused by unauthorized demolitions. Assistant City Solicitor, Andrew Lee, will be present at Monday's meeting to go over this section with the Commission and a proposed course of action. At this meeting the Commission should first vote whether the building is historically significant, and then whether or not a violation of the Demolition Delay Ordinance occurred. The house is individually listed on the National Register of Historic Places, and the definition of partial demolition extends to "...the removal of architectural elements which define or contribute to the historic character of the building or structure."

Two chimneys remain today, and two were demolished. Of the two that were demolished, one was a large brick chimney centered on the left side slope of the hipped slate roof, facing Crafts Street. Its size and design appeared to mimic those of the two remaining chimneys. The other demolished chimney appeared to be a smaller brick chimney with similar detailing that was located in the very rear of the house. Please note that staff is basing this on the photos below, the left being a google street view image, and is unfortunately at this time unaware of the exact appearance and size of the chimneys.

Amos C. Judkins (1838-1906), a native of Maine, built this large Queen Anne style residence in 1884. He moved to this large corner lot from a house in the same neighborhood at Lowell and Watertown streets. Judkins was in the railroad car wheel manufacturing business in Boston for much of his life, but in his retirement, he played a key role in the development of this section of Newtonville. With John H. Lothrop, who also lived on Central Avenue, he bought large tracts of land in the Crafts/Watertown streets area, which were subdivided into house lots during the late 1880s and 1890s. Judkins Street, located directly across from his home off Crafts Street, was named after him. After his death in 1906, the house reverted to his widow, Mary F. Judkins. Staff recommended that the Commission find this house to be historically significant.

Richard Li, owner of the property, commented that it was his first time working on a historic house and had not been familiar with the procedures. Additionally, Mr. Li commented that he had respect for the rules and will follow any instructions for it to be fixed.

Mr. Dimond asked if the chimneys had been demolished down to the basement. Liyuan Yang, contractor for the project, replied they had been taken down on the first and second floor.

Andrew Thomas, 59 Judkins St, commented that he appreciated that the house was being renovated but was surprised when the chimneys came down, and remarked they were similar architecturally and in ornate detailing to the remaining chimneys.

Mr. Dimond made a motion to find the house at 8 Central Avenue historically significant. Ms. Grissom seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on March 7, 2022, the Newton Historical Commission, by a vote of 6-0:

RESOLVED to find the house at 8 Central Avenue historically significant

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative: Abstained:

Peter Dimond, Chair Doug Cornelius, Member Nancy Grissom, Member Mark Armstrong, Member John Rice, Member Harvey Schorr, Alt. Andrew Lee, Assistant City Solicitor, explained the process for violations in accordance to the Demolition Delay Ordinance. Mr. Schorr asked if restoration was part of the process. Mr. Lee replied that it would be up to the Commission as to what to approve.

Mr. Dimond made amotion to find the house at 8 Central Avenue in violation of the Demolition Delay Ordinance due to the unauthorized demolition of two (2) chimneys. Ms. Grissom seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on March 7, 2022, the Newton Historical Commission, by a vote of 6-0:

RESOLVED to find the house at 8 Central Avenue in violation of the Demolition Delay Ordinance due to the unauthorized demolition of two (2) chimneys

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative: Abstained:

Peter Dimond, Chair

Doug Cornelius, Member

Nancy Grissom, Member

Mark Armstrong, Member

John Rice, Member

Harvey Schorr, Alt.

2. **150 Jackson Road (also known as 55 Walnut Pk) – Partial Demolition Review (Ward 1)**Request to demolish attached convent and chapel structures to construct additions

Staff reported that the brick school building was permitted for construction in November 1964 for the Sisters of Saint Joseph for \$2,000,000 with an attached chapel and convent. The architectural firm is listed as Maginnis, Walsh and Kennedy, located at 126 Newbury Street in Boston. The firm's predecessor, Maginnis and Walsh was created in 1905 by Charles Maginnis and Timothy Walsh, and they were well known as the architects for the new campus for Boston College which began construction in 1908. Eugene F. Kennedy Jr. joined the firm in 1926 and became a senior partner in 1941. The firm continued to design educational and religious buildings into the mid-20th century including Marion Hall (1954), Saint Ann Hall (1961) and Loretto Hall (1963) at Emmanuel College and Sacred Heart Roman Catholic School (1953) in Boston. The successor firm's design style evolved throughout the decades as their mid-century minimalist contemporary designs contradicts the Gothic Revival style designed buildings of the predecessor firm. The contemporary 3-4 story brick building rises from a concrete foundation to a flat roof and encompasses multiple components. Consistently evident are flat covered entries, most supported by rounded columns. Window design ranges from their location, including individual sashes, groups of three with 1-2 vertical panes with a transom, and pairs of three vertical panes, and are mostly aligned vertically and horizontally and some incorporate hopper sash. The former Aquinas College was purchased by the city in 2015, and in 2016, all of the exterior curtain wall and windows were replaced on the classroom, and auditorium/cafeteria wings. Staff recommended preferably preserving the building as a fine example of a mid-century educational structure in Newton designed by a notable firm.

Joshua Morse, Commissioner of Public Buildings, stated that he supported either decision and welcomed the opportunity to present proposed plans independent of the vote, and invited Commissioners to join future design committee meetings and provide constructive feedback.

Mr. Dimond asked about the use. Mr. Morse remarked it would be the new home for the Lincoln Elliot School, and the Pearl Street building would become a swing space. Mr. Morse further went over the scope of demolition and plan at this address.

Mr. Dimond commented that he did not think the building was historic.

There was no public comment.

At a scheduled meeting and hearing on March 7, 2022, Peter Dimond, Chair of the Newton Historical Commission, made a motion to preferably preserve the school at 150 Jackson Road. **There was no motion to second, so the school was not preferably preserved.**

148 Church Street, NR – Partial Demolition Review (Ward 1)

Request to construct additions

Staff reported that this surveyed ca. 1868 Gothic Revival style house is known as the John Benton and Anna Louisa Goodrich house and was built by architect Charles Brigham of Brigham and Sturgis. According to the survey form on file with the state, John Benton Goodrich was born in Fitchburg in 1836. Graduating from Dartmouth College in 1857, he continued his education and earned his law degree in 1859. He married Anna Louisa Woodward of Newton and they moved to Newton with the construction of this house in 1868. Later, Goodrich served as a State Representative from this district in 1869 and 1870 and was the Middlesex County District Attorney from 1872 to 1875. The form goes on to note that this house was designed in the early phase of Charles Brigham's career. He entered into practice with English-trained John Hubbard Sturgis in July, 1866. Brigham believed that Newton would offer many opportunities for architects. Ruminating in April, 1868, Brigham notes that "I want to get a foothold this year in Newton which is a thriving place and would be a profitable field." Of the Goodrich commission, Brigham remarked that it is "a house to cost 6 or 7,000 dollars at Newton for a young lawyer, Mr. Goodrich." The house was completed in about March, 1868 for a total fee charged of \$250. In a letter from January, 1871, almost three years since the completion of the house, Brigham notes that he has written to Goodrich about the long-standing debt of \$125 that was still due. It's unclear whether this debt was ever paid.

Atlases show that additions have been constructed to the wood framed house over time, and at one point there was a front piazza that ran partially along the center and right side of the façade. In 1926, then owner, Warren Marston, permitted the construction of the two-story flat roofed left side addition. Five years later Marston removed the piazza and constructed a 6' x 8'6" vestibule. In 1986 the house was converted from a single to a two-family dwelling, and interior alterations occurred to satisfy the new use. The house continued to be altered throughout the decades including a new gable dormer and roof extension in 2001, and a chimney redesign and roof deck in 2002. The house is part of the Farlow and Kenrick Parks Historic District, which was listed on the National Register of Historic Places in

1982. Even with the alterations, staff recommended preferably preserving the house for its inclusion in a National Register Historic District and evidence of remaining features.

Mark Sangiolo, architect for the project, remarked that he did not oppose it being preferably preserved.

There was no public comment.

Mr. Dimond made a motion to preferably preserve the house at 148 Church Street for its inclusion in a National Register Historic District and evidence of remaining features. Ms. Grissom seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on March 7, 2022, the Newton Historical Commission, by a vote of 6-0:

RESOLVED to preferably preserve the house at 148 Church Street

<u>Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative: Abstained:</u>

Peter Dimond, Chair Doug Cornelius, Member Mark Armstrong, Member Nancy Grissom, Member John Rice, Member Harvey Schorr, Alt.

Mr. Sangiolo went over the proposal with the Commission.

Mr. Armstrong commented that it was a nice project and recommended waiving the delay. Ms. Grissom asked about the wall, and Mr. Sangiolo further went over the proposal. Mr. Schorr asked if any significant rear features would be demolished. Mr. Sangiolo commented that some portion of the house would need to be demolished as part of the addition and showed photos of existing conditions of the rear. Mr. Armstrong remarked that he felt it mitigated the loss of the dormer to be demolished. Mr. Cornelius remarked that it worked pretty well.

There was no public comment.

Mr. Dimond made a motion to waive the demo delay on the house at 148 Church Street based on the submitted plans. Mr. Armstrong seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on March 7, 2022, the Newton Historical Commission, by a vote of 6-0:

RESOLVED to waive the demo delay on the house at 148 Church Street based on the submitted plans.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative: Abstained:

Peter Dimond, Chair Doug Cornelius, Member Mark Armstrong, Member Nancy Grissom, Member John Rice, Member Harvey Schorr, Alt.

4. 70 Bigelow Road – Demolition Review (Ward 2)

Request to demolish house

Staff reported that This c. 1957 Cape Cod style two-story single-family home is constructed in a curved shape with the house facing into the intersection of Crestwood and Bigelow Road and attached two car garage facing Bigelow Road. Designed by Clifford Allbright, the house's original owner is listed as Winifred Robinson, a widow. Allbright trained at MIT before opening his own Boston firm in 1919 which he maintained until he retired in 1953. He is known for his suburban residential work in Weston, Brookline, Newton and Wellesley and for his commercial buildings in Andover and Brookline, townhouse in Boston at 100 Beacon Street. Allbright also designed churches, including St. Peters Episcopal Church in Weston and was a member of the BAC. In 1965, Ms. Robinson permitted the construction of a bow window to the existing kitchen, as well as the installation of a larger window in the living room and dormer. No other building permits were located in the ISD file. The Robinson family continued to own the property until December of last year. Staff recommended preferably preserving the house as a nice example of a 1950s cape in Newton, that was designed to be centrally sited on the lot with consideration to its landscape.

Lucio Trabucco, architect for the project, commented that they had tried looking at additions and that it was difficult to work with the existing footprint. Armando Petruzziello, owner, remarked that it was not possible to save the house.

Mr. Cornelius commented that he agreed with staff's recommendation and that it was one of the nicest capes in the city.

There was no public comment.

Mr. Dimond made a motion to preferably preserve the house at 70 Bigelow Road. Mr. Schorr seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on March 7, 2022, the Newton Historical Commission, by a vote of 5-1:

RESOLVED to preferably preserve the house at 70 Bigelow Road

<u>Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative: Abstained:</u>

Peter Dimond, Chair Doug Cornelius, Member

Mark Armstrong, Member

Nancy Grissom, Member John Rice, Member Harvey Schorr, Alt.

5. 29 Levbert Road – Demolition Review (Ward 8)

Request to demolish house

Staff reported that this single-family house was permitted for construction in 1960, and the application lists the owner, architect, and builder as Nardone Brothers. It appears that the Nardone Brothers began construction at the beginning on the street and worked there way around the bend as they are also listed on the building permits for #s 11-57 Levbert Road from 1959 through 1962. The first known owner of the house was Herman Tritter, who worked in real estate. By 1969, the owner is listed as Alan Grover a dentist, whose family continued to own the property until 1980. In 1990 an addition in the rear right side corner was constructed for a family and dining room. The house does still retain its low slopped asphalt cross roof and faux stone veneer, though on its own, is not an exceptional example of midcentury. However, while Levbert Road has endured changes, this specific part of the road appears to have remained contextually intact as an example of a midcentury subdivision with the houses featuring a similar split level influenced type design. For this reason, staff recommended preferably preserving the house.

Ilya Fuchs, owner, presented photographs and explained to the Commission why he disagreed with staff's recommendation.

Mr. Dimond remarked that he thought this house was different from others around the bend mentioned by the owner.

Mr. Cornelius commented that the house does not stand on its own and that the street has lost context. Mr. Armstrong agreed.

The item was opened to public comment. Anna Horvitz, 21 Levbert Road, commented that she did not think there should be a delay. Richard Horvitz, 21 Levbert Road, remarked that the house could fall down on its own and asked that the new house not be stucco as he preferred traditional styles.

At a scheduled meeting and hearing on March 7, 2022, Mr. Dimond made a motion to preferably preserve the house at 29 Levbert Road. There was no motion to second, so the house was not preferably preserved.

6. 74 Rachel Road – Demolition Review (Ward 8)

Request to demolish house

Staff reported that the mid-century ranch was constructed in 1964 for \$20,000 by Countryside Estates and was designed by local architect, R.I. Williams. The owner of Countryside Estates was Solomon Siegel of Newton Highlands, who also developed nearby 53, 62 and Rachel Road as well as the Andrew Street neighborhood. The first known owner of the house was Erwin Germaise, a manager at Tile Setting. By 1975, the house was occupied by Elio lannuzzi, an anesthesiologist. The only permitted exterior change was the construction of a rear porch in 1983. The house has retained its original design and massing, including its low pitched cross gabled asphalt roof with moderate overhangs and open

front entry covered by the slope of the main roof. Even with the few changes, staff does not think on its own it is a great example of a contemporary style residence and recommended not preferably preserving the house.

Ilya Fuchs, owner, remarked he was also a direct abutter and presented photographs to the Commission.

Mr. Cornelius remarked that he did not think it should be preferably preserved and there was no context. Mr. Dimond agreed.

The item was opened to public comment. Lee Bardin, abutter, remarked that the house itself had no real redeeming qualities and saw no reason why it should be considered to have value. Justin Levine supported the house's demolition.

At a scheduled meeting and hearing on March 7, 2022, Mr. Dimond made a motion to preferably preserve the house at 74 Rachel Road. There was no motion to second, so the house was not preferably preserved.

7. 18 Bonnybrook Road – Waiver Request (Ward 5)

Request to waive demolition delay

Staff reported that the owner of this property will present plans for a replacement structure at this location. This property was preferably preserved on October 28, 2021, and the minimum four-month waiting period has elapsed.

Boris Simkin, representative for the owner, went over the plans with the Commission and remarked that the existing pool would be retained.

Mr. Schorr asked if there was an existing site plan. Mr. Simkin answered there was not. Mr. Dimond asked about the proposed materials. Mr. Simkin commented it would be combination of stucco and brick and showed renderings of the proposed house. Mr. Cornelius remarked that the street was not particularly cohesive and the proposed kind of fits in and was good enough. Mr. Schorr remarked that it was unfortunate to lose a house like the existing. Mr. Armstrong commented about the scale and proportion of the house in comparison to the existing.

The item was opened to public comment. Jerry Mahony, 31 Bonnybrook Road, commented that the design was handsome and asked about the proposed square footage, siting, roof material and trees. Mr. Mahony asked about the approval process, to which Ms. Birmingham answered. Laura Foote commented that the design did not fit in well with the neighborhood, it was a loss of an affordable house. Further Ms. Foote remarked about the entry double doors and the preservation of the landscape.

Mr. Dimond made a motion to waive the demo delay on the house at 18 Bonnybrook Road based on the submitted plans. Mr. Cornelius seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on March 7, 2022, the Newton Historical Commission, by a vote of 4-2:

RESOLVED to waive the demo delay on the house at 18 Bonnybrook Road based on the submitted plans.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative: Abstained:

Peter Dimond, Chair

Doug Cornelius, Member Mark Armstrong, Member Nancy Grissom, Member John Rice, Member

Harvey Schorr, Alt.

8. 17 Brandeis Road – Demolition Review (Ward 8)

Request to demolish house

Staff reported that The Commission first reviewed this address at their January 28, 2021 meeting. At that time the application was for partial demolition and the Commission voted to preferably preserve the house and waived the demolition delay based on submitted plans. Since that time the applicant has learned, due to a difference in available maps and information, the property is located in a flood zone and has rethought their plans to go from a partial to a full demolition. As the scope of work has changed, a new application for full demolition was submitted, and once again the Commission should determine whether or not the house should be preferably preserved. Please note that as this is an application for full demolition, in the event the NHC once again votes to preferably preserve the house, a waiver request should not be reviewed or waived for a minimum of four months according to the Demolition Delay Ordinance. At the time of the writing of this memorandum, no application had been submitted to the Conservation Commission, however discussions have occurred with the Chief Conservation Planner, and she does expect an application to be submitted to start that process simultaneous to the Demolition Delay process.

Built by owner/builder Herbert Glazier of Newton and designed by Lester Lechter of Boston, this Contemporary Style home was constructed in 1959. Herbert Glazier was still the owner in 1962 when the existing garage was converted to a storage room, and two new garage bays were added to the right side of the house. Longtime owners Marcia P. and Melvin I. Wartel were residents here after Glazier sold. The house is of asymmetrical design located in a neighborhood of largely split-level homes, making this style stand out as somewhat unusual for its micro-neighborhood. Lechter was a prolific architect in Newton who specialized in post-war homes, including Ranch Styles, and split-levels. Lechter designed five other Newton homes in the Split-level style in the late 1950s that are included on MACRIS, and all, or were, located on Baldpate Hill Road: #178, 190, 200, 222, 236. Even when compared to these examples, this house at 17 Brandeis stands out as somewhat unusual. Evidence of the original windows and asymmetry can still be found on the façade. Staff once again recommended the house preferably preserved for architectural integrity.

Yefim Massarsky, architect for the project, went over the reasoning for the change in scope and design that was discovered during the application process last year. Mr. Massarsky commented that the new design emulates the current house, and the owner would like to be able to demolish the house and rebuild it in the same style.

Mr. Dimond asked if the existing house had a basement. Mr. Massarsky commented that it did, but the new house cannot. Mr. Schorr inquired about backfilling the basement in order to retain the house. Mr. Massarsky and the Commission discussed this suggestion.

Mr. Cornelius commented that the house was quite inequitable and should not be preferably preserved. Mr. Dimond disagreed.

At a scheduled meeting and hearing on March 7, 2022, Mr. Dimond made a motion to preferably preserve the house at 17 Brandeis Road. There was no motion to second, so the house was not preferably preserved.

Administrative Discussion:

a) Discussion of edits to the Commission's Rules and Regulations

The Commission discussed the changes to the Rules and Regulations, specifically how to handle situations when no member seconds a motion to preferably preserve a building or structure. Mr. Armstrong suggested that a member always seconds the motion made by the chair so that the vote could continue and not pass if that would suffice for the Law Department's concern. Mr. Cornelius commented on the addition of no public comment being required for meetings by the Commission whether to accept a local landmark nomination. The Commission did not vote to make any changes and decided to relook at further edits at a future meeting.

The meeting was adjourned by unanimous vote.

Respectfully,

1 Jami Bry, NHC